THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REPORTED FOR THE CONSIDERATION OF COUNCIL:

1. Coordinated Provincial Plan Review (Greenbelt Plan and Niagara Escarpment Plan Boundary Review) - City of Hamilton Comments (PED15078(a)) (City Wide) (Item 4.1)

   (Collins/Pearson)

   (a) That the Public Consultation Summary Report, prepared by Dillon Consulting, summarizing the comments received from the City-hosted consultation events on the Greenbelt Boundary Review and attached as Appendix “A”, be received and forwarded to the Province to be considered as additional citizen input on the Coordinated Provincial Plan Review;

   (b) That the City of Hamilton requests the Province:

       (i) to revise the applicable Greenbelt Plan policies in order to allow municipalities to request changes to Greenbelt Plan designations and boundaries at the conclusion of a municipal comprehensive review, provided the review is completed in accordance with the Provincial Policy Statement (2014), the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe and meets the goals and objectives of the
Provincial Policy Statement and all other applicable Provincial Plans;

(ii) to defer any decisions on potential changes to the Greenbelt Plan boundaries in the City of Hamilton to allow the City to complete a municipal comprehensive review which will include a full assessment of the opportunities and constraints:

1. to determine the amount and location of land (both non-employment and employment) required to meet the 2031 to 2041 Growth Plan forecasts;

2. to identify appropriate lands to add to the Whitebelt area, in the event that additional land is required for an urban boundary expansion to meet targets and based on the principles of cost effective, complete and healthy communities; and,

3. to identify appropriate lands to be added to the Greenbelt Plan area;

(c) That upon completion of the municipal comprehensive review, City Council request the Province to revise the Greenbelt Plan boundaries prior to the City adopting the Official Plan Amendment relating to Growth Plan conformity and implementation of the Municipal Comprehensive Review.

(d) That notwithstanding Recommendations (b) and (c), as part of the current Coordinated Provincial Plan Review, the City of Hamilton requests the Province to give consideration to the following modifications to Greenbelt Plan Protected Countryside area as follows:

1. remove the Lower Stoney Creek lands (104 ha) and the lands north of Parkside Drive, east of Centre Road in Waterdown (28 ha) from the Greenbelt Plan, as shown on Appendix “B”, identified in Greenbelt Plan Boundary Review Report prepared by Dillon Consulting, and attached as Appendix “C”; and,

   (ii) add the lands south of Twenty Mile Creek, east of Miles Road, north of Airport Road, and west of Trinity Church Road (approximately 430 ha) to the Greenbelt Plan;

(e) That City Council reconfirms Recommendation 22 from Report PED15078, Item 8 of Planning Committee Report 15-010 approved by Council on June 24, 2015, that requests the Province to work with Hamilton staff to further revise the Natural Heritage System map to reflect the core areas and natural heritage system of the City;
(f) That the City of Hamilton requests the Province to consider amendments to the Niagara Escarpment Plan as follows:

(i) to redesignate the lands located on Jerseyville Road East, south of Robert E. Wade Park from “Rural Escarpment” to “Urban Area”, as shown on the attached map marked as Appendix “D”;

(ii) to redesignate the lands located at 294 and 296 York Road from “Rural Escarpment” to “Urban Area”, as shown on the attached map marked as Appendix “E”; and,

(iii) to add the lands located on the Mountain Brow into the Niagara Escarpment Plan Open Space System (NEPOSS), as shown on the attached map marked as Appendix “F”, which would allow the City to undertake a Management Strategy / Plan for the lands to address maintenance, views from the Brow among other matters;

(g) That the City Clerk be directed to forward Report PED15078(a) to the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing and that the recommendations of this Report are to be considered the City of Hamilton’s formal supplementary comments on the Coordinated Provincial Plan Review;

(h) That staff be directed to inform all property owners whose properties are being proposed for either inclusion or removal from the Greenbelt, and;

(i) That upon finalization of the Provincial Coordinated Plan Review, that staff be directed to incorporate the existing site specific Highway Commercial zoning permissions in By-law No. 3692-92 for the property located at No. 1375-1381 Highway 8 (Stoney Creek) in Zoning By-law 05-200 be retained.

Amendment CARIED
Main Motion as Amended CARRIED

FOR THE INFORMATION OF COMMITTEE:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes:

ADDED DELEGATION REQUESTS

3.1 Marco Marchionda, Marcasa Homes Inc. respecting 1364 Barton Street, Stoney Creek
3.2 Paul D. Smith, Conservation and Education Director, Hamilton Naturalists' Club, Hamilton

3.3 Franz Kloibhofer, A. J. Clark and Associates Limited, regarding lands located at the northwest quadrant of Upper Centennial and Mud Street (former Hamilton Speedway)

3.4 Toula Nessinis, Weston Consulting, respecting property located at 451 Carlisle Road

3.5 Taras Kulyk, respecting 0 Parkside Drive lot

3.6 Georgina Beattie, Winona, Ontario

ADDED WRITTEN COMMENTS

4.1(ii) Dr. Tom Nugent, 6 Grandview Avenue, Stoney Creek

4.1(iii) A.J. Cameracci, URBEX Engineering Limited, respecting 2047128 Ontario Inc. (1125 Fletcher Road) and 1297705 Ontario Inc. (1130 Fletcher Road).

4.1(iv) Susan Rosenthal, Davies Howe Partners LLP, respecting comments on behalf of Twenty Road East Landowners Group.

4.1(v) Marissa Biebert, 1317 Highway #8, Winona

4.1(vi) Deborah Ligas, 151 Huntingwood Ave., Dundas

4.1(vii) Dan Popper, 2275 Golf Club Road, Hannon

4.1(viii) Paula and Joe Restivo, 2 Tristan Court, Flamborough

4.1(ix) Kathleen Dryden, 940 Tollgate Place, Burlington

4.1(x) Dave Pitblado, P & L Livestock Limited, Burlington

4.1(xi) Joanne Cothran, 285 Nisbet Boulevard, Waterdown

4.1(xii) Georgina Beattie, Winona

4.1(xiii) Sarah Knoll, GSP Group, respecting 588 Fiddler Green Road, Ancaster
4.1(xiv) Teresa DiFalco, President, Fruitland-Winona-Stoney Creek Community Association

4.1(xv) Gord McNulty, 1604-75 Queen Street North, Hamilton

4.1(xvi) Nancy Frieday, Wellings Planning Consultants Inc., respecting 3727 Highway Six Inc. and 1906342 Ontario Inc., 3727, 3737 and 3751 Highway 6

4.1(xvii) Nancy Frieday, Wellings Planning Consultants Inc., respecting 513, 531 and 545 Dundas Street East and 518 Parkside Drive, Flamborough

4.1(xix) Wellenreiter & Wellenreiter, Barristers, Solicitors & Notaries Public, respecting 513, 531, and 545 Dundas Street East and 518 Parkside Drive

4.1(xx) Drazen Kostelski, 286 Glen Hill Drive, Whitby

4.1(xxi) Recommendations from the Agriculture and Rural Affairs Committee (Referred from December 1, 2015 Planning Committee meeting.)

ADDED REGISTERED SPEAKERS

3. Don MacLean, 68 – 151 Gateshead Crescent, Stoney Creek

4. Dave Braun, Braun Nursery Limited, Mount Hope

5. Dale Smith, Airport Road, Mount Hope

6. Drew Spoelstra, Guyatt Road, Binbrook

7. Jamie Bethune, Twenty Road, Mount Hope

8. Roy Shuker, Ridge Road, Stoney Creek

9. Lynda Lukasik, Environment Hamilton

10. Michael Curley, 131 Ridge Road, Stoney Creek

11. Michael Crough and John Ariens of IBI Group

12. Tony/Sam Spadafora, 3 Switzer Crescent, Binbrook

13. John B. Corbett, Corbett Land Strategies, on behalf of 324, 354, 364 and 372 Garner Road
14. Sarah Knoll and/or Glenn Scheels, GSP Group Inc., on behalf of property at the Northwest corner of Barton Street and Fifty Road, Stoney Creek

15. Carlo Silvestri, 445 Crerar Drive, Hamilton, regarding the addition of their 69 acres property on Trinity Church Road to lands identified as Area 4 – North Twenty Mile Creek

16. Susan Yazdani, 1407-33 Robinson Street, Hamilton, respecting urban sprawl and the Greenbelt


(Pasuta/Green)
That the Agenda for the December 3, 2015 meeting of the Special Planning Committee be approved, as amended. CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

None.

(c) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 3)

(A. Johnson/Collins)
That the following delegation requests be approved to address Committee at this meeting:

3.1 Marco Marchionda, Marcasa Homes Inc. respecting 1364 Barton Street, Stoney Creek

3.2 Paul D. Smith, Conservation and Education Director, Hamilton Naturalists' Club, Hamilton

3.3 Franz Kloibhofer, A. J. Clark and Associates Limited, regarding lands located at the northwest quadrant of Upper Centennial and Mud Street (formerly Hamilton Speedway)

3.4 Toula Nessinis, Weston Consulting, respecting property located at 451 Carlisle Road

3.5 Taras Kulyk, respecting 0 Parkside Drive lot

3.6 Georgina Beattie, Winona, Ontario CARRIED
(d) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 4)

(i) Coordinated Provincial Plan Review (Greenbelt Plan and Niagara Escarpment Plan Boundary Review) - City of Hamilton Comments (PED15078(a)) (City Wide) (Item 4.1)

Joanne Hickey-Evans, Manager, Planning Policy and Zoning By-Law Reform, provided an overview of the report with the aid of a PowerPoint presentation. A copy has been uploaded onto the City’s website.

(Green/Conley)
That the staff presentation be received. CARRIED

Registered Speakers

1. Dr. Tom Nugent, 9 Grandview Avenue, Stoney Creek

Dr. Nugent addressed Committee. He referred to his written submission of which copies were distributed. A copy is also available for viewing on the City’s website.

He requested that the City propose removal of his property from the Greenbelt which he contends was included by the Province in error. He agrees with the concept of the Greenbelt but has issues with the process.

2. Ed Fothergill, Fothergill Planning & Development Inc., on behalf of Mr. and Mrs. Bartel, 623 Shaver Road

Ed Fothergill addressed Committee and indicated that he is speaking on behalf of his clients, Mr. and Mrs. Bartel of 623 Shaver Road.

He referred to his written submission which was printed in the agenda. He indicated that his clients’ property is in Part A of Area 1. They request that their land not be inserted into the Greenbelt, although it is currently being farmed.

3. Don MacLean, 68 – 151 Gateshead Crescent, Stoney Creek

Don MacLean addressed Committee and he indicated that he has issues with the process. His comments included but were not limited to the following:
• This process is to expand the Greenbelt – it’s not for slicing pieces out for future growth;
• The fruit growing lands in the Stoney Creek area should remain in the Greenbelt;
• Staff are reneging on an OMB decision regarding this area and are trying to reverse it;
• The planners are not working on behalf of the public;
• The staff report admits that they did not do the required work;
• How were the lands selected?
• This goes against Vision 20/20 and lands have been chopped out of the Greenbelt;
• The report ignores the relation between the Greenbelt and climate change;
• The Greenbelt limits sprawl and protects against flooding;
• The Greenbelt ensures food security and protection against flooding;
• We can’t keep sacrificing our agriculture land.

4. Dave Braun, Braun Nursery Limited, Mount Hope

Dave Braun was not in attendance.

5. Dale Smith, Airport Road, Mount Hope

Dale Smith addressed Committee and indicated that he is a member of the Agriculture and Rural Affairs Committee. His comments included but were not limited to the following:

• His family farms 303 hectares of land in Mount Hope;
• Some land is owned and some is rented;
• One property is being considered to be put into the Greenbelt and he is supportive;
• The maps provided by Dillon Consulting are not complete and are very confusing to follow;
• The Greenbelt was put in place to give the farmers the right to farm;
• Farmers are stewards of the land;
• Class 2 and 3 are the best soil and they can be found in the Hamilton area;
• Class 7 is the poorest as it is rocky;
• Some lands being recommended for removal from the Greenbelt for future development have the best class of soil; they are along the Twenty Mile Creek;
• He is not against development or growth but we must be smart in selecting which land is suitable for development;
• The residents like eating local food.

Dale Smith responded to questions from Committee.

6. **Drew Spoelstra, Guyatt Road, Binbrook, Chairman of the Agriculture and Rural Affairs Advisory Committee**

Drew Spoelstra addressed Committee and read from a prepared statement a copy of which was submitted for the official record. A copy is available for viewing on the City’s website. His comments included but were not limited to the following:

• Members of his family operate three successful farm businesses on Guyatt Road;
• It is some of the most productive land in southern Ontario;
• Agriculture contributes over $34 billion to the Gross Domestic Product (GDP);
• However, Ontario’s most important industry is at risk;
• Large tracts of farmland are currently being lost;
• This is not sustainable;
• Concerned with proposal to remove lands from the Greenbelt particularly the fertile land along the Twenty Mile Creek;
• Farms should not compete with the urban boundary.

7. **Jamie Bethune, Twenty Road, Mount Hope**

Jamie Bethune was not in attendance.

8. **Roy Shuker, Ridge Road, Stoney Creek**

Roy Shuker was not in attendance.

9. **Lynda Lukasik, Environment Hamilton**

Lynda Lukasik addressed Committee as a representative of Environment Hamilton. Her comments included but were not limited to the following:

• They have fundamental concerns with the process used and the staff recommendations;
• She is taken aback by the size of the lands being recommended for removal;
Special Planning Committee  December 3, 2015  
Minutes 15-020  
Page 10 of 17

- These are not minor changes;
- How was the removal of these areas justified?
- Is there any planning justification?
- One of the staff recommendations is to revise the Greenbelt Policies to allow municipalities to request changes;
- Currently, the Province reviews the Greenbelt every 10 years;
- Opening up to municipalities will cause more frequent municipal attempts to pull land out;
- Also, the staff recommendations regarding the removal of lands are being made without a comprehensive review;
- Farmland in lower Stoney Creek should not be removed;
- Why remove lands which are currently farmed as specialty crops?

Lynda Lukasik responded to questions from Committee.

10  Michael Curley, 131 Ridge Road, Stoney

Michael Curley read from a prepared statement and copies were distributed. A copy is available for viewing on the City’s website. He is against removing lands form the Greenbelt. He suggests we stick to the status quo and review the matter more thoroughly.

11  Michael Crough and John Ariens of IBI Group

John Ariens and Michael Crough addressed Committee with the aid of a PowerPoint presentation. Copies of the hand-out were distributed. A copy is available for viewing on the City’s website.

Their comments included but were not limited to the following:

- This is our first opportunity to have input into the Greenbelt;
- IBI Group was retained by landowners in both the Lower Stoney Creek area and Waterdown;
- Their clients’ lands are those referred to in recommendation (d)(i) of the staff report;
- These are not viable farming parcels;
- They support the staff report and ask that Committee approve the staff recommendations, particularly (d)(i).
12 Sam Spadafora, 3 Switzer Crescent, Binbrook

Sam Spadafora addressed Committee and indicated that he came unprepared to speak as he didn’t realize that his request was to address Committee but he posed the following two questions:

- What part of the Alfrida area has been designated for future growth?
- When will the comprehensive review recommended in the staff report take place?

His Ward Councillor Brenda Johnson will obtain the answers from staff on his behalf.

13 John B. Corbett, Corbett Land Strategies, on behalf of 324, 354, 364 and 372 Garner Road

John Corbett was not in attendance.

14 Sarah Knoll and/or Glenn Scheels, GSP Group Inc., on behalf of property at the Northwest corner of Barton Street and Fifty Road, Stoney Creek

Sarah Knoll of GSP Group Inc. addressed Committee and read from two letters, copies of which were distributed and are available for viewing on the City’s website.

Her first letter was on behalf of her clients Avatar International/1800615 Ontario Inc. (S. Manchia and A. DiCenzo) in support of recommendation (d) of the staff report to remove lands located at the N/W corner of Barton Street and Fifty Road from the Greenbelt.

Her second letter was on behalf of her client DiCenzo Construction Limited regarding lands which are a portion of municipal address 658 Highway 8, Stoney Creek. She requested they be removed from the Greenbelt and redesignated from Escarpment Protection Area to Urban Area within the Niagara Escarpment Plan.

15 Carlo Silvestri, 445 Crerar Drive, Hamilton, regarding the addition of their 69 acres property on Trinity Church Road to lands identified as Area 4 – North Twenty Mile Creek

Carlo Silvestri read from a prepared statement. Copies were distributed and a copy is available for viewing on the City’s website.
He indicated that he is speaking on behalf of his family who are owners of 1033301 Ontario Inc. and own a 69 acre parcel of land on Trinity Road, Binbrook. He requested that the Committee make a boundary adjustment to Area 4 and support removal of the land from the Greenbelt.

16  **Susan Yazdani, 1407-33 Robinson Street, Hamilton, respecting urban sprawl and the Greenbelt**

Susan Yazdani, indicated that she has decided not to address Committee but she did submit written submissions to the Committee Clerk for the official record. A copy is available for viewing on the City’s website.

17  **Nancy Frieday, Wellings Planning Consultants Inc., Burlington**

Nancy Frieday of Wellings Planning Consultants Inc. addressed Committee and indicated that she is speaking to two different matters for which she submitted two delegation requests.

The first issue is with respect to 513, 531, and 545 Dundas Street East and 518 Parkside Drive, Flamborough. She submitted a letter dated December 1, 2015 from Wellings Planning Consultants Inc., regarding this matter.

Nancy Frieday requested that Recommendation (b)(ii) of the staff report be amended to include the words “Niagara Escarpment Plan” after the words Greenbelt Plan as per the aforementioned letter.

The second issue she spoke to is with respect to her clients 3727 Highway Six Inc. and 1906342 Ontario Inc., owners of lands located at 3727, 3737 and 3751 Highway 6. She submitted a copy of a letter from Wellings Planning Consultants Inc., regarding this matter.

She requested that the lands known as 3727, 3737 and 3751 Highway 6 be considered for removal from the Greenbelt Plan either as part of the Municipal Comprehensive Review, or immediately as part of the current Greenbelt Plan Review, as per comments in the letter dated December 1, 2015 from Wellings Planning Consultants Inc.

Nancy Frieday submitted to the Clerk a bullet point summary of her comments with attached maps regarding these issues for the public record.
18 Marco Marchionda, Marcasa Homes Inc. respecting 1364 Barton Street, Stoney Creek

Marco Marchionda was not in attendance.

19 Paul D. Smith, Conservation and Education Director, Hamilton Naturalists’ Club, Hamilton

Paul Smith of the Hamilton Naturalists’ Club read from a prepared statement and a copy was submitted for the public record and is available for viewing on the City’s website.

- He expressed concerns with apparent omissions or errors in the information provided during the Public Information sessions specifically regarding a block of land in Upper Stoney Creek;
- The importance of the natural lands is understated;
- They don’t understand the rush to remove the proposed parcels of land;
- Other lands in the Greenbelt and in the Niagara Escarpment Plan recommended for removal in the staff report were not included in the Public Information sessions;
- The Hamilton Naturalists’ Club requests that Committee approve a combination of Options 4 (defer until the comprehensive review) and 5 (grow the Greenbelt) as outlined in the staff report.

20 Franz Kloibhofer, A. J. Clark and Associates Limited, regarding lands located at the northwest quadrant of Upper Centennial and Mud Street (former Hamilton Speedway)

Franz Kloibhofer addressed Committee with the aid of a PowerPoint Presentation on behalf of his clients who own lands located at the northwest quadrant of Upper Centennial and Mud Street (the former Hamilton Speedway Park)

He requested removal of sub areas B and C from the Greenbelt as the subject lands are not actively farmed and are immediately adjacent to the urban boundary and the Alfrida development area.

21 Toula Nessinis, Weston Consulting, respecting property located at 451 Carlisle Road

Toula Nessinis read from a letter and copies were distributed. A copy is available for viewing on the City’s website. She indicated that Weston Consulting is the agent for the owners of 451 Carlisle
Road, Hamilton. They agree with recommendations (b)(i)(ii), (c) and (e) of the staff report. They request that the lands at 451 Carlisle Road be included in the Carlisle Rural Settlement Area.

22 Taras Kulyk, respecting 0 Parkside Drive lot

Taras Kulyk addressed Committee and indicated when he purchased the lands at 309 and 311 Parkside Drive many years ago there was no Greenbelt Legislation. There was a beautiful large house on the property and he has a large family. Since then the address has changed to Parkside Drive. He asked that the lands be removed from the Greenbelt along the proposed east-west bypass.

23 Georgina Beattie, 1375 - 1381 of Highway 8, Winona

Georgina Beattie addressed Committee and her comments included but were not limited to the following:

- Has great concerns regarding the number of people who were not advised of this meeting especially the ones that will be removed from the Greenbelt;
- The report does not state clearly that there are currently no municipal services in Block B in Lower Stoney Creek;
- There are 10 acres of land that would be potentially new development;
- In her opinion, Block B does not qualify;
- She asked for clarification regarding the following statement on page 14 of the Report: “Planning Committee approved the removal of part of the lands in Block B, but Council deferred the request until such time as staff had completed a review of the Greenbelt Plan boundaries and reported back to Council on said review”;
- The Dillon Consulting report is lacking;
- She supports Option 4 in the report.

(B. Johnson/Pasuta)
That all the delegations be received          CARRIED

(Green/Conley)
That all the written comments be received.          CARRIED

Staff responded to questions from staff.
Motion #1:

(Green/Johnson)
That all areas identified for potential addition to the Greenbelt Plan be added into the Greenbelt Plan Boundary including riverbeds (Option 5 of the staff Report)

This motion was DEFEATED on the following standing recorded vote:

Yeas: Green, A. Johnson
Total: 2
Nays: Conley, Pearson, Pasuta, Collins B. Johnson and Partridge
Total: 6
Absent: Farr
Total: 1

Motion #2:

(Collins/Pearson)
That the staff recommendations be approved.

This motion was LOST on a tie vote.

Councillor Green indicated that he wished to be recorded as OPPOSED to this motion.

Motion #3:

(Collins/Pearson)
That staff recommendation (d)(ii) be deleted in its entirety and replaced with the following therein in order to extend the boundary of Block A2 to Mile Road, to read as follows:

(ii) add the lands between Twenty Mile Creek and Airport Road, west and east of Nebo Road (231 ha) to the Greenbelt Plan, as shown on Appendix “B”, identified in Greenbelt Plan Boundary Review Report prepared by Dillon Consulting, and attached as Appendix “C”;

(ii) add the lands south of Twenty Mile Creek, east of Miles Road, north of Airport Road, and west of Trinity Church Road (approximately 430 ha) to the Greenbelt Plan;

Amendment CARRIED
Motion #4:
Chair Partridge relinquished the Chair to move the following motion:

(Partridge/Collins)
That the lands in the Waterdown node (Block R5) be removed from the Greenbelt to facilitate the construction of the overpass.

CARRIED

Councillors Green and A. Johnson indicated that they wished to be recorded as OPPOSED to this motion.

Motion #5:

(Johnson/Pearson)
That Blocks B and C be removed from the Greenbelt and the existing uses on the property located at 1375-1381 Highway 8, Winona be retained on a site specific basis.

Amendment CARRIED

Councillors Green and A. Johnson indicated that they wished to be recorded as OPPOSED to this motion.

Motion #6:

(Collins/Pasuta)
That the staff recommendations respecting the Municipal Comprehensive Review be approved.

CARRIED

Motion #7:

(Pearson/Pasuta)
That Block R1A known as the Ed Smith Lands be removed from the Greenbelt.

CARRIED

Councillors Green, A. Johnson and B. Johnson indicated that they wished to be recorded as OPPOSED to this motion.
Motion #8:
(B. Johnson/A. Johnson)
That the following subsection (h) be added:

(h) That staff be directed to inform all property owners whose properties are being proposed for either inclusion or removal from the Greenbelt.

Amendment CARRIED

For final disposition of this matter refer to Item 1.

(e) ADJOURNMENT (Item 13)
(Pearson/Collins)
There being no further business, that the Planning Committee be adjourned at 2:35 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor J. Partridge
Chair, Planning Committee

Ida Bedioui
Legislative Co-ordinator
Office of the City Clerk