

HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE REPORT 18-005 12:00 p.m. May 10, 2018 Room 264, 2nd Floor Hamilton City Hall

71 Main Street West

Present: Councillors A. Johnson and M. Pearson

A. Denham-Robinson (Chair), W. Arndt, D. Beland, G. Carroll,

K. Garay, M. McGaw, T. Ritchie, and K. Stacey

Absent with

Regrets: Councillors J. Partridge – Personal, R. Sinclair and T. Wallis

THE HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE PRESENTS REPORT 18-005 AND RESPECTFULLY RECOMMENDS:

- 1. Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton under Part IV of theOntario Heritage Act (Ward 3) (PED18089) (Item 8.1)
 - (a) That the designation of 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (Former Cathedral Boys' High School), shown in Appendix "A" to Report PED18089, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be approved;
 - (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "A" to Report 18-005, be approved;
 - (c) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (Former Cathedral Boys' High School) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED18089.
- 2. Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes March 19, 2018 (Item 8.2)

(Stacey/Ritchie)

That the Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes of March 19, 2018, be received, and no action taken.

3. Inventory & Research Working Group Meeting Notes - March 26, 2018 (Item 8.3)

(a) 170 Longwood Road North, Hamilton

- (i) That property at 170 Longwood Road North, Hamilton, be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act; and
- (ii) That the designation include glass structures at the rear of the building and on the second floor as well as make specific reference to the interior features of the property outlined in the Cultural Heritage Assessment.

(b) 1401 King Street East, Hamilton (Grace Anglican Church)

That the property known as Grace Anglican Church, located at 1401 King Street East, Hamilton, be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

(c) 224 Robina Road, Ancaster

That the property located at 224 Robina Road, Ancaster, be added to the City's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest as it represents an excellent example of a mid-century modern residence designed and owned by Stanley Roscoe who was architect for the Hamilton City Hall.

(d) 2235 Upper James Street, Glanbrook

That the property located at 2235 Upper James Street, Glanbrook, be added to the City's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest as it represents a scarce example of a pre-Confederation masonry Regency cottage.

(e) 3600 Guyatt Road, Glanbrook

That the property located at 3600 Guyatt Road, Glanbrook be excluded from the City's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

(f) 6 Webster Falls Road, Dundas

That the property known as Springdale and located at 6 Webster Falls Road, Dundas be added to the City's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest as well as the staff work plan for designation.

4. Policy & Design Working Group Meeting Notes - April 16, 2018 (Added Item 8.5)

That the Policy & Design Working Group Meeting Notes of April 16, 2018, be received.

5. Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's involvement in a Places of Faith Resource Event (Item 9.1)

WHEREAS, Hamilton has witnessed the closure and demolition of numerous places of faith (many historic structures) across the city in the past decade;

WHEREAS, places of faith are found to be vulnerable properties as the City of Hamilton witnesses record-setting levels of growth in recent years; and,

WHEREAS, the mandate of the Committee is to advise and assist Council on all matters related to programs and activities to increase public awareness and knowledge of heritage conservation issues and other cultural heritage conservation measures;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's collaboration on Places of Faith Resource Events in Hamilton, in partnership with the National Trust for Canada, and Faith and the Common Good, be approved.

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk advised the Committee of the following changes to the agenda:

1. ADDED DELEGATION REQUESTS

- 4.1 Jim Long, Diocese of Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089) (for today's meeting)
- 4.2 Peter Lampman, Good Shepherd, Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation toDesignate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089) (for today's meeting)
- 4.3 Megan Hobson, Heritage Consultant, respecting Item 8.2, Policy and Design Working Group Notes and the property at 122 Augusta Street, Hamilton (for today's meeting)

2. ADDED DISCUSSION ITEMS

8.5 Policy & Design Meeting Notes - April 16, 2018

The Agenda for the May 10, 2018 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee was approved, as amended.

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

A. Denham-Robinson declared an interest in Item 8.2, Policy and Design Working Group Notes, as she works for the architectural firm involved with the property at 122-126 Augusta Street.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)

(i) April 19, 2018 (Item 3.1)

That the Minutes of the April 19, 2018 meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee were approved, as presented.

(d) DELEGATION REQUEST (Item 4)

(i) Jim Long, Diocese of Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089) (for today's meeting) (Added Item 4.1)

The delegation request from Jim Long, Diocese of Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089), was approved, for today's meeting.

(ii) Peter Lampman, Good Shepherd, Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089) (for today's meeting) (Added Item 4.2)

The delegation request from Peter Lampman, Good Shepherd, Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089), was approved, for today's meeting.

(iii) Megan Hobson, Heritage Consultant, respecting Item 8.2, Policy and Design Working Group Notes and the property at 122 Augusta Street, Hamilton (for today's meeting) (Added Item 4.3)

The delegation request from Megan Hobson, Heritage Consultant, respecting Item 8.2, Policy and Design Working Group Notes and the property at 122 Augusta Street, Hamilton, was approved, for today's meeting.

(e) DELEGATIONS (Item 6)

(i) Jim Long, Diocese of Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089) (Added Item 6.1)

Jim Long, Diocese of Hamilton, addressed the Committee regarding Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089), and expressed concerns regarding the recommendation to designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton.

The delegation from Jim Long, Diocese of Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089) was received.

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1.

(ii) Peter Lampman, Good Shepherd, Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089) (Added Item 6.2)

Peter Lampman, Good Shepherd, addressed the Committee regarding Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089), and expressed concerns regarding the recommendation to designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton.

The delegation from Peter Lampman, Good Shepherd, Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089), was received.

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1.

(iii) Megan Hobson, Heritage Consultant, respecting Item 8.2, Policy and Design Working Group Notes and the property at 122 Augusta Street, Hamilton (Added Item 6.3)

Ms. Hobson addressed the Committee respecting Item 8.2, Policy and Design Working Group Notes and the property at 122 Augusta Street, Hamilton, and advised that if the Committee determined that she was not required to speak to the item, she would not speak.

The Committee determined that the delegation from Megan Hobson, Heritage Consultant, respecting Item 8.2, Policy and Design Working Group Notes and the property at 122 Augusta Street, Hamilton, was not required.

(f) DISCUSSION ITEM (Item 8)

(i) Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089) (Item 8.1)

Chelsey Tyers, Cultural Heritage Planner, distributed copies of a presentation and addressed the Committee respecting the Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089). The presentation has been included in the official record and are available at www.hamilton.ca.

The presentation respecting the Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (PED18089), was received.

A motion was put forward regarding Report PED18089, Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton, that it be TABLED, to allow staff to separate the heritage attributes of the 1928 section and 1951 section of the property, and report back to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

The motion was DEFEATED on the following Standing Recorded Vote:

Yeas: A. Johnson, K. Garay

Total: 2

Nays: W. Arndt, D. Beland, G. Carroll, A. Denham-Robinson, C. Dmitry,

M. McGaw, T. Ritchie, K, Stacey

Total: 8

Absent: J. Partridge, R. Sinclair, T. Wallis

Total: 3

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1.

(ii) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Terms of Reference Review (Item 8.4)

The discussion respecting the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Terms of Reference Review, was DEFERRED to the June 21, 2018 meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

(g) MOTION (Item 9)

(i) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's involvement in a Places of Faith Resource Event (Item 9.1)

A. Denham-Robinson relinquished the Chair to introduce a motion respecting Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's involvement in a Places of Faith Resource Event.

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 5.

A. Denham-Robinson assumed the Chair.

(h) GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 11)

(i) Buildings and Landscapes (Item 11.2)

That the following updates be received:

- (a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes (RED):
 (Red = Properties where there is a perceived immediate threat
 to heritage resources through: demolition; neglect; vacancy;
 alterations, and/or, redevelopment)
 - (i) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) A. Johnson No report.
 - (ii) Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (R) M. McGawStaff will be meeting with the Diocese to discuss plaquing of the property.
 - (iii) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) M. McGawNo report.
 - (iv) Century Manor, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (D) K. Garay

 Jeremy Parsons provided an update on the status of the property and the recent sale, noting that the new owners intend to maintain and adaptively reuse Century Manor.
 - (v) Beach Canal Lighthouse (D) J. PartridgeNo report.
 - (vi) 18-22 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) K. StaceyNo report.
 - (vii) 24-28 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) K. StaceyNo report.
 - (viii) 1 St. James Place, Hamilton (D) K. StaceyNo report.

(ix) 2 Hatt Street, Dundas – K. StaceyNo report.

(x) James Street Baptist Church, 98 James Street South, Hamilton (D) – A. Denham-RobinsonNo report.

- (b) Buildings and Landscapes of Interest (YELLOW):

 (Yellow = Properties that are undergoing some type of change, such as a change in ownership or use, but are not perceived as being immediately threatened)
 - (i) Delta High School, 1284 Main Street East, Hamilton (D) D. Beland

No report.

(ii) St. Giles United Church, 85 Holton Avenue South (L) – D. Beland

No report.

- (iii) 2251 Rymal Road East, Stoney Creek (R) C. DimitryNo report.
- (iv) Former Valley City Manufacturing, 64 Hatt Street, Dundas –K. Stacey

No report.

(v) St. Joseph's Motherhouse, 574 Northcliffe Avenue, Dundas - K. Stacey

The property has been conditionally sold.

(vi) Coppley Building, 104 King Street West; 56 York Blvd., and 63-76 MacNab Street North – G. Carroll

Staff have submitted the a request to MLE.

(vii) 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) - M. McGaw

Jeremy Parsons advised that Council approved the recommendation to designate the property at its meeting on May 9, 2018.

Planning – June 5, 2018

(c) Heritage Properties Update (GREEN): (Green = Properties whose status is stable)

(i) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

No report.

- (ii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) K. GarayNo report.
- (iii) Jimmy Thompson Pool, 1099 King Street E., Hamilton (R) T. Ritchie

No report.

- (iv) Treble Hall, 4-12 John Street North, Hamilton (R) T. RitchieNo report.
- (v) 104 King Street West, Dundas (Former Post Office) K. Stacey

Staff have been directed to follow-up with the applicant for a presentation to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

(d) Heritage Properties Update (black): (Black = Properties that HMHC have no control over and may be demolished)

(i) Auchmar Gate House, Claremont Lodge 71 Claremont Drive (R) – K. Garay

No report.

(ii) Verbal Updates respecting the Around the Bay Race: Restoration and Commemoration of Historic Route Markers (no copy) (Item 11.2)

The matter respecting the Verbal Updates respecting the Around the Bay Race: Restoration and Commemoration of Historic Route Markers was deferred to the June 21, 2018 meeting due to time constraints.

(i) ADJOURNMENT (Item 12)

There being no further business, the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, be adjourned at 1:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alissa Denham-Robinson, Chair Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Loren Kolar Legislative Coordinator Office of the City Clerk 378 Main Street East, Hamilton (Former Cathedral Boys' School)

STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST AND DESCRIPTION OF HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES

Description of the Designated Property

The heritage designation applies to the entire roughly L-shaped property at the southeast corner of Main Street East and Emerald Street South. The heritage designation recognizes both the school built in 1928 and the memorial wing built in 1951. The designation focuses on the front, east, and west facades of the 1928 building, the Emerald Street South facade of the 1951 wing and selected interior features.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The former Cathedral Boys' High School stands as the first purpose-built school for privately funded Catholic high school education in Hamilton. The building of the school in 1928 represents a major accomplishment of the Catholic Diocese of Hamilton, which was established in 1856, and a milestone in the development of separate school education at the secondary level. The school demonstrates the ability of Hamilton's Catholic population in the early twentieth century to fund the building of their own separate high school as beautiful and up-to-date as the publicly funded secondary schools.

For Cathedral Boys' High School, the Diocese chose the same architectural firm who had designed Delta Collegiate Institute for the public school board four (4) years earlier. Cathedral Boys' High School at 378 Main Street East takes its place in a trio of landmark schools built along Main Street East between 1918 and 1928 – Memorial Public School at 1175 Main Street East by Gordon Hutton in 1918, Delta Collegiate Institute at 1284 Main Street East by Gordon Hutton and William Souter in 1923-24, and Cathedral Boys' High School at 378 Main Street East also by Hutton & Souter in 1928. They share similarities in the design of their front facades, but each is unique. All garnered attention in the architectural press.

The front, east, and west facades of the 1928 building epitomize the architectural style frequently labelled Tudor Gothic in the early twentieth century and now known as Modern Gothic, Collegiate Gothic or Neo-Gothic. Over a steel frame, rock-faced Credit Valley sandstone laid in broken courses is used for the body of the facades; and ashlar Indiana limestone provides the trim. The stone carving on the facades, but especially on the front facade, is of the highest order. The stone plaque bearing the name, Cathedral School, and Christian cross carved in stone and called a botonée or cathedral cross identify the school and relate to its origins in a room in St. Mary's Parish School which first offered high school education for boys in 1912. St. Mary's Parish held the cathedral of the Diocese at the time. The exceptional quality of the building's stonework extends

Appendix "A" HMHC Report 18-005 May 10, 2018 PED18089 Page 2 of 4

as far as to the facades' uppermost windows whose pointed hood-moulds end in a variety of bosses.

The 1928 building was designed with three (3) entrances – a ceremonial entrance on the front facade and everyday entrances on the east and west facades. The pointed-arched entrances on the east and west are placed in projecting vestibules; and the pointed arch on the front serves as the portal to an entry porch, which is recessed from the front facade and almost wholly enclosed. In addition to the imposing portal, the architects have created a solemn space inside the entry porch by the use of a marble staircase, marble wainscotting, vaulted ceiling, pendant ceiling lamp, and oak-and-glazed double doors at the top of the staircase. Exquisite attention to detail is shown even at the level of the doors' escutcheons whose motifs of pointed arches keep with the school's Modern Gothic style.

The 1951 wing, also built to a high standard, memorializes students who had attended the school and died in the First or Second World War – a poignant tribute to young Canadians whose lives were cut short by war. The west facade of the wing complements the west facade from 1928 by maintaining the same height and perpetuating the rhythm of tripartite windows. The window bays framed in limestone contain window sash consisting of fixed glass block uppers and operable clear glass lowers. The entrance bay is identified in the 1951 facade through its distinctive columnar window filled with glass block, its stone cornice and cross, and its well-detailed entrance. Together, the 1928 west facade in Modern Gothic style and the Modern 1951 west facade make an impressive sweep along Emerald Street South. Commanding the street corner, the school is a landmark in the Stinson neighbourhood.

Inside, the 1951 wing retains its mid-twentieth century character essentially in the stairwell and staircase design, ground-floor lobby whose floor is laid artistically in terrazzo, north-south corridor that organizes internal circulation through the wing, and basement cafeteria-auditorium. The interior of the 1928 building combines features from the original construction, alterations at the time when the wing was added in 1951 and fire safety interventions of unknown date. The early twentieth century character of the 1928 building survives in the stairwell and staircase design, aspects of the east-west corridor, corridor doorways, and basement gymnasium.

Description of Heritage Attributes

Front, East and West Facades of 1928 Building

Heritage attributes are replete on the front (north), east and west facades and include:

- the setback from Main Street East, the terraced rise up from the street and the front entrance walk of flat stone landings and low stone walls;
- rock-faced Credit Valley sandstone walls laid in broken courses, Indiana limestone trim and all stone carvings;

Appendix "A" HMHC Report 18-005 May 10, 2018 PED18089 Page 3 of 4

- the symmetrical front facade consisting of an entrance bay in the middle, two (2) windowed bays to either side of the entrance bay and a pedimented blind bay at either end of the building;
- the front entrance pointed-arched portal with its embrasure, carved spandrels and wrought-iron gate;
- the buttresses to either side of the portal and their wall-mounted lamps and carved crests;
- the ceremonial entry porch, recessed from the front facade and almost wholly enclosed, and its marble staircase, marble wainscotting, vaulted ceiling decorated with a plaster relief in a pattern of grape vines and Tudor roses, and pendant ceiling lamp;
- the front entrance doorway composed of oak-and-glazed double doors with their door handles and escutcheons and a border of sidelights and transom light;
- the projecting vestibules on the building's east and west sides with their pointedarched doorways;
- all window openings on the basement, ground and uppermost floors and original sash where it exists; and,
- the parapets and their battlements at both the main roof line and at the vestibules' roof line.

West Facade of 1951 Wing

Heritage attributes are found across all six bays of the wing's west facade and include:

- the buff brick wall;
- limestone trim expressed as the grid-like frame around windows, stringcourses, the cornice atop each end bay, and roof line coping;
- windows with their fixed glass block uppers and operable clear glass lowers; and,
- the entrance bay at the building's southwest corner, featuring double doors, transom light, embrasure beside the doors, wall-mounted lamps and columnar window filled with glass block.

Appendix "A" HMHC Report 18-005 May 10, 2018 PED18089 Page 4 of 4

1928 Building Interior

Heritage attributes that are accessible to visitors and remain from the 1928 construction include:

- the east and west stairwells and staircases (but not the replacement fire doors);
- the terrazzo floor laid in a checkerboard pattern on the ground-floor east-west corridor;
- the front vestibule with its checkerboard terrazzo floor and wood-framed opening into the east-west corridor;
- the wood-framed transom light across the north-south corridor where it meets the east-west corridor:
- five-panelled oak corridor doorways each with a glazed panel and transom light; and.
- the six-panelled double doors to the gymnasium, industrial window sash emitting natural light into the gymnasium, the proscenium arch for the stage and ceiling trusses over the gymnasium space.

1951 Wing Interior

Heritage attributes that are accessible to visitors and capture the mid-twentieth century character of the 1951 construction include:

- the stairwell and staircase in the wing's southwest corner and the entrance to each floor that has double doors in a wall made of glass blocks;
- the ground-floor lobby's terrazzo floor and baseboard, rounded corners, and operable steel sash window with bronze hardware and travertine marble sill;
- the terrazzo floor and baseboard for the ground-floor north-south corridor and the metal-and-glass frame across the corridor; and,
- the cafeteria-auditorium in the basement, featuring a terrazzo floor in a checkerboard pattern, black mastic baseboard, circular posts with black mastic base trim, fixed glass block and operable clear glass windows, an operable steel sash window, and a short staircase in the room's southeast corner leading outdoors to the schoolyard.