



City of Hamilton

PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT & RETENTION COMMITTEE

Meeting #: 19-001
Date: September 11, 2019
Time: 2:00 p.m.
Location: Room 192, 1st Floor
71 Main Street West

Tamara Bates, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 4102

	Pages
1. APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR	
2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA	
(Added Items, if applicable, will be noted with *)	
3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST	
4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING	
4.1 June 22, 2018	3
4.2 Clerk's Report - May 29, 2019	7
5. COMMUNICATIONS	
6. DELEGATION REQUESTS	
7. CONSENT ITEMS	
8. PUBLIC HEARINGS / DELEGATIONS	
9. STAFF PRESENTATIONS	
10. DISCUSSION ITEMS	
10.1 Physician Recruitment and Retention Terms of Reference Review - REVISED	9

10.2 Key Performance Indicators, Current Statistics, Physicians by
Community, and Conferences and Events 13

10.3 Budget and Cash Flow 21

11. MOTIONS

12. NOTICES OF MOTION

13. GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS

13.1 Funding Update (no copy)

14. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

14.1 Contract Renewal (distributed under separate cover)

Pursuant to Section 8.1, Sub-Section (b) of the City's Procedural By-Law 18-270, and Section 239(s), Sub-Section (b) of the Ontario Municipal Act, 2001, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal information about identifiable individuals, including municipal employees or local board employees.

15. ADJOURNMENT



Hamilton

PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT & RETENTION COMMITTEE

MINUTES 18-001

Friday, June 22, 2018

9:00 a.m.

**Room 264, Hamilton City Hall
71 Main Street West, Hamilton**

Present: Councillor T. Whitehead (Chair)
Dr. D. DiValentino (Vice-Chair), Councillors S. Merulla and D. Conley, K. Loomis, Dr. B. Julian, Dr. S. Kinzie

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO THE BOARD OF HEALTH FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. Annual Report (Item 8.1)

(i) Key Performance Indicators, Current Statistics and Physicians by Community (Item 8.1 (a))

(Merulla/Conley)

That the Key Performance Indicators, Current Statistics and Physicians by Community, be received.

CARRIED

(ii) Budget and Cash Flow (Item 8.1 (b))

(Whitehead/Loomis)

(a) That the Year 14 (2017) Budget for December 1, 2016 to November 30, 2017, be received;

(b) That the Year 15 (2018) Budget for December 1, 2017 to March 31, 2018, be received;

(c) That the Cash Flow Statement for December 1, 2016 to November 30, 2017, be received;

(d) That the Cash Flow Statement for December 1, 2017 to November 30, 2018, be received.

CARRIED

(iii) **Conference, Events and Presentation Report – Summary (Item 8.1 (c))**

(Whitehead/Loomis)

(a) That the Conference, Event and Presentation Report – Summary (December 2016 – November 2017), be received; and,

(b) That the Conference, Events and Presentation Report – Summary (December 2017 – November 2018), be received.

CARRIED

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) **APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Committee Clerk advised of the following change to the agenda:

1. CONSENT ITEMS (Item 5)

5.1 Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee Minutes dated May 30, 2017

(Conley/Merulla)

That the agenda for the June 22, 2018 meeting of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Committee be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(b) **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)**

None.

(c) **APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)**

(i) **September 12, 2017 (Item 3.1)**

(Merulla/Conley)

That the Minutes of the September 12, 2017 meeting of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Sub-Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

(d) CONSENT ITEMS (Item 5)

- (i) Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee Minutes – May 30, 2017 (Added Item 5.1)**

(Merulla/Loomis)

That the Minutes for the May 30, 2017 meeting of the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

(e) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)

- (i) Annual Report (Item 8.1 (a, b, c))**

Jane Walker, Director, Physician Recruitment, addressed the Committee regarding the Key Performance Indicators, Current Statistics, Physicians by Community, Budget and Cash Flow, and Conference, Event and Presentation Report – Summary.

The Committee directed the Director of Physician Recruitment to investigate the feasibility of partnering with McMaster University to create a list of residents without a doctor.

For disposition of this matter, see Item 1.

(f) GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 11)

- (i) Allowing New Graduates into the Family Health Organization/Family Health Team (Item 11.1)**

(Merulla/Whitehead)

That the Committee re-affirm their direction for the Director of Physician Recruitment to schedule a meeting with the new Minister of Health and Long-Term Care, Mayor Eisenberger, Donna Cripps, CEO of the Hamilton Niagara Haldimand Brant Local Health Integration Network, and Councillor T. Whitehead, Chair of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee to discuss allowing new graduates into Family Health Organization/Family Health Teams.

CARRIED

(Whitehead/Conley)

That the Director of Physician Recruitment be directed to write a letter to the Ontario Medical Association (OMA) supporting their negotiation efforts with the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care to increase flexibility for new doctors entering Family Health Organizations across Ontario.

CARRIED

(g) ADJOURNMENT (Item 13)

(Merulla/Loomis)

That there being no further business, the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee meeting be adjourned at 9:33 a.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully Submitted,

Councillor T. Whitehead, Chair
Physician Recruitment &
Retention Committee

Lisa Chamberlain
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk



**City of Hamilton
PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION STEERING
COMMITTEE**

Clerk's Report 19-001

2:30 p.m.

Wednesday, May 29, 2019

Room 264

Hamilton City Hall

71 Main Street West

Pursuant to Section 3.6(4) of the City of Hamilton's Procedural By-law 18-270 at 3:01 p.m. the Committee Clerk advised those in attendance that quorum had not been achieved within 30 minutes after the time set for the Governance Review Sub-Committee, therefore, the Clerk noted the names of those in attendance and the meeting stood adjourned.

Present:

Councillor S. Merulla
Councillor T. Whitehead
Dr. D. DiValentino
Dr. S. Kinzie

Respectfully submitted,

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk



Terms of Reference

Official Name:

Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee

Purpose:

The Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee was formed in 2002 to address the critical shortage of family physicians in the City of Hamilton. The economic well-being of the city is intricately linked with the health of its people and this committee recognizes that family physicians are one of the cornerstones of the health care system. The first Physician Recruitment Specialist was hired November 23, 2004 to develop and implement the strategic plan.

Members/Composition:

1. A representative from The Hamilton Academy of Medicine (preferably a family physician)
2. A representative from The Hamilton Chamber of Commerce
3. 4. 5. Three City of Hamilton Councillors
6. The Mayor of the City of Hamilton
7. A representative from the Department of Family Medicine, McMaster University
8. A new physician practicing in Hamilton within five years of their graduation from residency.

One member of the Steering Committee is chosen to be Chair and one Vice-Chair. These two individuals should sit on the Working Group.

Term of Membership:

Minimum of two years with members preferably retiring from the group on a rotating basis to ensure continuity and to capture experience.

Formation Details:

To be updated annually.

To be accessible, to review and to provide support and guidance to the Physician Recruitment Specialist on issues including performance, budget, funding, conferences/events, contracts, economic climate, Ministry and OMA policies, and local factors influencing and challenging physician recruitment.

Deliverables:

To put forward reports and make recommendations to the Board of Health.

Resources and Budget:

In 2017, revenue is \$190,000 with an annual expense budget of \$190,000.

Governance:

Quorum is 4 5 out of 8 members. Voting for acceptance of minutes, budgets, reports.

Communications:

Meetings are held in-person at City Hall and organized by the current Legislative Assistant **Coordinator**. Meetings are organized at least one month in advance with materials for the meeting distributed two weeks prior.

Relationship with Working Group

The Steering Committee is responsible for providing the overall direction for Physician Recruitment & Retention. They are updated by the Working Group.

Official Name:

Working Group of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee

Purpose:

The Working Group was formed to provide the operational support for the program.

Members/Composition:

From the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee, four members are chosen, to include: one City councillor and representatives from the Hamilton Academy of Medicine, the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce and the Department of Family Medicine, McMaster University. Typically the chair and vice-chairs of the Steering committee are selected to sit on the Working Group and also chair/vice-chair the Working Group.

Term of Membership:

Minimum of two years. Preferably members retire from the group on a rotating basis to ensure continuity and to capture experience.

Formation Details:

To be updated twice annually at a time convenient for the members.

To be accessible, to review and to provide support and guidance to the Physician Recruitment Specialist on issues including performance, budget, funding, conferences/events, contracts, economic climate, Ministry and OMA policies, and local factors influencing physician recruitment.

To provide the operational details for implementation of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee.

To propose motions to be brought forward to the Steering Committee for discussion and then to the Board of Health.

Deliverables:

To put forward updates, reports and recommendations to the Steering Committee on matters pertaining to physician recruitment.

Resources and Budget:

In 2016, revenue was \$190,000 with an annual expense budget of \$190,000. The Director, Physician Recruitment & Retention is given permission for all expenses under \$5,000. Expenses over that amount are to be discussed and approved at a Working Group meeting.

Governance:

Quorum is 3 out of 4 members. Voting is held for acceptance of minutes, budgets and reports.

Communications:

Meetings are held in-person and organized by the PR&R office typically via email. If meetings are to be held at City Hall, the City Councillors staff are responsible for organizing the room. Meetings are organized at least one month in advance. Should situations arise requiring more immediate attention, information or requests are made via phone conversations, conference calls and/or emails. As much as possible, issues are brought to the attention of the Working Group at an in-person meeting.

Relationship with Steering Committee

The Working Group brings forward information on a yearly basis unless needed more often.

Prepared by Jane Walker August 18, 2017. Amended by Hamilton City Council September 27, 2017.



KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

YEAR TO YEAR

to September 1, 2019

FAMILY PHYSICIANS						
Year	New Contacts	New Recruits	New Recruits Perm vs. Locum		Retained	Total Family Physicians
2005 - Year 2	37	17	Perm -	12	1	345
			Locum -	5		
2006 - Year 3	42	17	Perm -	13	5	341
			Locum -	4		
2007 - Year 4	79	19	Perm -	11	3	340
			Locum -	8		
2008 - Year 5	110	20	Perm -	12	1	331
			Locum -	8		
2009 - Year 6	97	18	Perm -	8	1	332
			Locum -	10		
2010 - Year 7	100	19	Perm -	12	1	345
			Locum -	7		
2011 - Year 8	141	26	Perm -	19	7	349
			Locum -	7		
2012 - Year 9	93	29	Perm -	22	7	365
			Locum -	7		
2013 - Year 10	82	24	Perm -	19	1	367
			Locum -	5		
2014 - Year 11	98	20	Perm -	15	17	352
			Locum -	5		
2015 - Year 12	122	24	Perm -	13	10	351
			Locum -	11		
2016 - Year 13	68	20	Perm -	14	24	346
			Locum -	6		
2017 - Year 14	46	27	Perm -	20	18	346
			Locum -	7		
2018 - Year 15	114	25	Perm -	17	25	345
			Locum -	8		
2019 - Year 16	67	27	Perm -	18	29	352
			Locum -	9		
GRAND TOTAL	1296	332			150	

Total Permanent Family Physicians = 225

Total Locum Family Physicians = 107



Current Statistics Summary to September 1, 2019

	2007 Nov	2008 Nov	2009 Nov	2010 Nov	2011 Nov	2012 Nov	2013 Nov	2014 Nov	2015 Nov	2016 Nov	2017 Nov	2018 Nov	2019 Sept
Total Family Physicians	340	331	332	345	349	365	367	352	351	346	345	343	352
Average Age	52	52	52	52	51	52	52	51	50	51	50	51	49
Physicians in their 20's and 30's	35	51	52	57	63	71	81	74	81	76	84	88	98
Physicians in their 40's	95	88	85	87	81	75	75	80	72	73	73	77	79
Physicians in their 50's	109	112	115	120	122	119	122	112	114	103	96	94	88
Physicians 60 - 64	66 (aged 60- 69)	60 (aged 60- 69)	57 (aged 60- 69)	31	36	50	49	48	49	53	51	47	45
Physicians 65 - 69	-	-	-	27	27	22	21	20	21	24	27	24	28
Physicians 70 plus	15	20	23	23	20	28	19	18	14	17	14	13	14

**Note: For planning purposes, some of the newer physician's ages are best guess estimates.*



Number of Physicians by Community				
as of September 1, 2019				
Community	Census 2016 Population	MOH doc:pop	Actual # of Permanent Physicians in Community	Shortage
Ancaster	40,560	29	20	9
Dundas	24,285	18	23	-5
Flamborough	42,655	31	20	11
Glanbrook	29,860	22	1	21
Hamilton	330,090	239	225	14
<i>Lower</i>	<i>176,815</i>	<i>128</i>	<i>139</i>	<i>-11</i>
<i>Upper</i>	<i>153,275</i>	<i>111</i>	<i>86</i>	<i>25</i>
Stoney Creek	69,470	50	33	17
Total	536,920	389	322	67

Prepared by Jane Walker
August 19, 2019



CONFERENCES, EVENTS & PRESENTATIONS (YEAR 16)
December 2018 - November 2019
 to June 30, 2019

Date	Organization	Event Name/Purpose	Location	Budgeted Cost	Actual Cost (to date)
December 18, 2018	Dept. of Family Medicine	Presentation to R2 residents	David Braley Health Sciences Centre	\$ 20.00	\$ 35.00
January 22, 2019	Hamilton Family Health Team	Board presentation	HFHT office - 123 James St. North	\$ 10.00	\$ 5.00
January 30, 2019	Hamilton Academy of Medicine	Clinical Day	Hamilton Convention Centre	\$ 100.00	\$ 20.00
February 20, 2019	Dept. of Family Medicine	McMaster R1 Resident Day	David Braley Health Sciences Centre	\$ -	\$ -
March 7, 2019	Hamilton Family Health Team	Succession Planning	HFHT office - 123 James St. North	\$ 20.00	\$ 5.00
April 24 - 26, 2019	CASPR	Canadian Association of Staff Physician Recruiters	Collingwood, ON	\$ 3,000	\$ 2,788.00
May 8, 2019	Technology & Future of Healthcare	Dr. DiValentino & Dr. Tytus	Hamilton Convention Centre	\$ 3,500	\$ 3,040.00
October 2019	Hamilton Family Health Team	Succession Planning	HFHT office - 123 James St. North	\$ 20.00	
November 2019	Ontario College of Family Physicians	Annual Scientific Assembly	Toronto Convention Centre, Montreal	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 785.00
TOTAL CONFERENCE COSTS				\$ 10,670.00	\$ 6,678.00

Date	Event	Cost	Invoice	Amount		
Jan-13	Clinical Day	Parking	122	\$	9.00	
Feb-13	FMF 2013	1/4 booth cost	123	\$	2,620.28	
Feb-13	Models in Primary Care	Mileage - Jane	123	\$	12.48	
		Mileage - Brenda	123	\$	18.72	
		Mileage - 3 docs	123	\$	13.52	\$ 44.72
Mar-13	CASPR	Registration	124	\$	423.62	
	CASPR	Flight	124	\$	867.65	\$ 1,291.27
Apr-13		Table Throw	125	\$	300.86	
May-13	ASA51	Registration	126	\$	1,695.00	
Oct-13	FMF 2013	Booth	131	\$	286.84	\$ 2,907.12
Oct-13	Research Day	Mileage - Brenda	131	\$	5.82	
	Research Day	Parking - Brenda	131	\$	11.00	\$ 16.82
Nov-13	ASA51	Hotel	132	\$	375.86	
	ASA51	Dinner	132	\$	61.98	
	ASA51	Mileage	132	\$	40.56	\$ 1,735.56
						\$ 6,743.19

PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT & RETENTION PROGRAM
YEAR 16 (2019) BUDGET TO ACTUALS COMPARISON
For the Period December 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019

Updated - August 20, 2019

Includes Actuals up to June 30, 2019

	Year 15 BUDGET	Year 15 BUDGET	Year 15 ACTUALS	Year 15 VARIANCE under/(over)
	Dec 1/18 to Nov 30/19	Dec 1/18 to June 30/19	Dec 1/18 to June 30/19	Dec 1/18 to June 30/19
Balance Carried Forward	\$ 428,186	\$ 428,186	\$ 428,186	0
<u>Revenue</u>				
City of Hamilton	75,000	75,000	0	-75,000
McMaster University	25,000	25,000	0	-25,000
St. Joseph's Healthcare	20,000	20,000	20,000	0
Hamilton Health Sciences	20,000	20,000	0	-20,000
Dept of Family Medicine	15,000	15,000	7,500	-7,500
Hamilton Family Health Team	25,000	25,000	0	-25,000
	\$ 180,000	180,000	27,500	-152,500
<u>Operating Expenses</u>				
Wages & Benefits	127,151	74,171	71,043	3,128
Support Staff	52,226	30,465	29,545	920
Office Expenses	7,956	4,641	5,716	(1,075)
Printing / Communications	2,229	1,300	234	1,066
Travel Expenses	6,131	3,576	1,493	2,083
Promotional Items	2,122	1,238	100	1,138
Events /Meals/Functions	530	309	149	160
Community Visit Program	520	303	-	303
Medical Conferences & Job Fairs	8,524	4,972	5,179	(207)
Advertising / Public Relations	2,122	1,238	791	447
	\$ 209,510	122,214	\$ 114,250	\$ 7,964
Net - Funding Surplus (Shortfall)	\$ 398,676	\$ 485,972	\$ 341,436	

In-kind contributions

Hamilton Academy of Medicine	2,333
Hamilton Chamber of Commerce	15,000
Total In-kind Contribution	17,333

Note

Expenses & revenues based on information received as of the date of update.

**PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT & RETENTION PROGRAM
LTD CASH FLOW STATEMENT
For the Period December 1, 2018 to November 30, 2019**

Run Date: Aug-19-19

	Jun/04 - Nov/19 (actuals)	Dec/18 (actuals)	Jan/19 (actuals)	Feb/19 (actuals)	Mar/19 (actuals)	Apr/19 (actuals)	May/19 (actuals)	Jun/19 (actuals)	Jul/19 (pending)	Aug/19 (pending)	Sep/19 (pending)	Oct/19 (pending)	Nov/19 (pending)	Total
BEGINNING BALANCE	-	\$ 428,186	\$ 414,766	\$ 393,347	\$ 398,283	\$ 381,849	\$ 370,360	\$ 354,970	\$ 341,436	\$ 366,436	\$ 366,436	\$ 366,436	\$ 366,436	428,186
REVENUE														
City of Hamilton	840,800	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
McMaster University - Cust# 102644	291,668	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Department of Family Medicine - Cust# 107777	107,749	-	-	-	-	7,500	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7,500
Hamilton Health Sciences - Cust # 111058	418,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
St. Joseph's Hospital - Cust# 101131	357,000	-	-	20,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	20,000
St.Peters Hospital	30,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Hamilton Community Foundation	5,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Hamilton Family Health Team - Cust# 114291	125,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	25,000	-	-	-	-	25,000
Human Resource Development Canada	90,669	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Hamilton Physicians - Dec/15 overpayment	10,349	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Consulting	400	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
TOTAL REVENUES	2,276,635	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 20,000	\$ -	\$ 7,500	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 25,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	52,500
OPERATING EXPENSES														
Wages & Benefits	1,287,791	8,955	14,103	9,589	9,589	9,606	9,606	9,596	-	-	-	-	-	71,043
Support Staff	291,321	3,944	5,908	3,939	3,939	3,939	3,939	3,939	-	-	-	-	-	29,545
Office Expenses	74,394	153	1,052	702	90	2,081	1,637	-	-	-	-	-	-	5,716
Printing & Communications	29,323	-	112	-	122	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	234
Travel Costs	45,810	89	116	834	29	413	11	-	-	-	-	-	-	1,493
Promotional Packages	22,147	-	-	-	-	-	100	-	-	-	-	-	-	100
Events, Functions & Meals	13,638	149	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	149
Community Visit Program	1,109	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Medical Conferences & Job Fairs	61,093	130	-	-	2,666	2,383	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5,179
Advertising/Public Relations	21,823	-	127	-	-	568	97	-	-	-	-	-	-	791
TOTAL OPERATING EXPENSES	1,848,449	\$ 13,420	\$ 21,418	\$ 15,064	\$ 16,435	\$ 18,989	\$ 15,390	\$ 13,535	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	114,250
ENDING BALANCE	428,186	\$ 414,766	\$ 393,347	\$ 398,283	\$ 381,849	\$ 370,360	\$ 354,970	\$ 341,436	\$ 366,436	\$ 366,436	\$ 366,436	\$ 366,436	\$ 366,436	366,436

*NOTE: Physician Recruitment & Retention Program holds \$10,000 as a float provided by the City of Hamilton (Acct: 11515-000100)

ok at 20/08/2019

NOTE: Pending Invoices

HP inv232R	437
Total:	<u>437</u>