



City of Hamilton

HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Meeting #: 20-001
Date: January 16, 2020
Time: 12:00 p.m.
Location: Room 264, 2nd Floor, City Hall
71 Main Street West

Loren Kolar, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 2604

1. APPOINTMENT OF 2020 CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

Pursuant to Section 5.2 of the City of Hamilton's Procedural By-Law 18-270 as amended by Council on December 11, 2010

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

(Added Items, if applicable, will be noted with *)

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

4.1 December 19, 2019

5. COMMUNICATIONS

6. DELEGATION REQUESTS

7. CONSENT ITEMS

7.1 Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes

7.1.a July 15, 2019

7.1.b October 21, 2019

7.1.c November 18, 2019

8. PUBLIC HEARINGS / DELEGATIONS
9. STAFF PRESENTATIONS
10. DISCUSSION ITEMS
11. MOTIONS
12. NOTICES OF MOTION
13. GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS

13.1 Buildings and Landscapes

This list is determined by members of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee. Members provide informal updates to the properties on this list, based on their visual assessments of the properties, or information they have gleaned from other sources, such as new articles and updates from other heritage groups.

13.1.a Endangered Buildings and Landscapes (RED)

(Red = Properties where there is a perceived immediate threat to heritage resources through: demolition; neglect; vacancy; alterations, and/or, redevelopment)

- (i) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – T. Ritchie
- (ii) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – C. Dmitry
- (iii) Century Manor, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (D) – G. Carroll
- (iv) Beach Canal Lighthouse and Cottage (D) – R. McKee
- (v) 18-22 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) – W. Rosart
- (vi) 24-28 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) – W. Rosart
- (vii) 2 Hatt Street, Dundas (R) – K. Burke
- (viii) James Street Baptist Church, 98 James Street South, Hamilton (D) – J. Brown
- (ix) 828 Sanatorium Road – G. Carroll
- (x) 120 Park Street, Hamilton – R. McKee
- (xi) 398 Wilson Street, Hamilton – C. Dimitry

13.1.b Buildings and Landscapes of Interest (YELLOW)

(Yellow = Properties that are undergoing some type of change, such as a change in ownership or use, but are not perceived as being immediately threatened)

(i) Delta High School, 1284 Main Street East, Hamilton (D) – D. Beland

(ii) 2251 Rymal Road East, Stoney Creek (R) – B. Janssen

(iii) Former Valley City Manufacturing, 64 Hatt Street, Dundas – K. Burke

(iv) St. Joseph's Motherhouse, 574 Northcliffe Avenue, Dundas (R) (ND) – W. Rosart

(v) Copley Building, 104 King Street West; 56 York Blvd., and 63-76 MacNab Street North (NOI) – G. Carroll

(vi) 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) (NOI) – C. Dimitry

(vii) Dunington-Grubb Gardens, 1000 Main Street East (within Gage Park) – D. Beland

(viii) 1 St. James Place, Hamilton (D) – J. Brown

(ix) St. Clair Blvd. Conservation District – D. Beland

(x) 51 Herkimer Street, Hamilton – J. Brown

(xi) 52 Charlton Avenue West, Hamilton – J. Brown

(xii) 292 Dundas Street, Waterdown – L. Lunsted

13.1.c Heritage Properties Update (GREEN)

(Green = Properties whose status is stable)

(i) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

(ii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – R. McKee

(iii) Treble Hall, 4-12 John Street North, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

(iv) 104 King Street West, Dundas (Former Post Office) – K. Burke

(v) 45 Forest Avenue, Hamilton – G. Carroll

(vi) 125 King Street East, Hamilton – T. Ritchie

13.1.d Heritage Properties Update (BLACK)

14. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

15. ADJOURNMENT



Hamilton

HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE

MINUTES 19-010

12:00 p.m.

December 19, 2019

Room 264, 2nd Floor

Hamilton City Hall

71 Main Street West

Present: Councillor M. Pearson
A. Denham-Robinson (Chair) D. Beland, J. Brown, K. Burke, G. Carroll, C. Dimitry (Vice-Chair), B. Janssen, L. Lunsted, R. McKee, T. Ritchie and W. Rosart

THE FOLLOWING ITEM WAS REFERRED TO THE PLANNING COMMITTEE FOR CONSIDERATION:

- 1. Summary of Events Leading to Proposed Demolition of the Former Hanrahan's Hotel located at 80 and 92 Barton Street East (PED19240) (Ward 2) (Item 7.4)**

(Ritchie/Carroll)

That the Report PED19240, respecting a Summary of Events Leading to Proposed Demolition of the Former Hanrahan's Hotel located at 80 and 92 Barton Street East (Ward 2), be received.

CARRIED

- 2. Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year in Review, 2019 (PED19241) (City Wide) (Item 7.5)**

(Brown/Janssen)

That Report PED19241 respecting a Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year in Review, 2019, be received.

CARRIED

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CEREMONIAL ACTIVITIES (Item 1)

There were no ceremonial activities.

(b) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 2)

The Clerk advised the Committee of the following changes:

6. DELEGATION REQUESTS

- 6.1 Dr. Sarah Sheehan, respecting an Update on the Campaign to Save the Former Hotel Hanrahan, 80-92 Barton Street East, Hamilton (for today's meeting)

7. CONSENT ITEMS

7.6 Heritage Permit Applications - Delegated Approvals

7.6.a Heritage Permit Application HP2019-039: Proposed addition at 41 Mill Street, Waterdown (Ward 15) (By-law No. 96-34-H)

7.6.b Heritage Permit Application HP2019-042: Proposed completion) (By-law No. 06-011)

7.6.c Heritage Permit Application HP2019-043: Proposed repointing and stone repairs at 121 St. Clair Avenue, Hamilton (Ward 3) (By-law 86-125)

(Beland/Carroll)

That the Agenda for the December 19, 2019 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(c) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations.

(d) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) November 21, 2019 (Item 4.1)

(Burke/Janssen)

That the Minutes of the November 21, 2019 meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

(e) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 6)

- (i) Dr. Sarah Sheehan, respecting an Update on the Campaign to Save the Former Hotel Hanrahan, 80-92 Barton Street East, Hamilton (for today's meeting) (Added Item 6.1)**

(Beland/Carroll)

That the Delegation Request from Dr. Sarah Sheehan, respecting an Update on the Campaign to Save the Former Hotel Hanrahan, 80-92 Barton Street East, Hamilton, be approved, for today's meeting.

CARRIED

(f) CONSENT ITEMS (Item 7)

- (i) Ministry of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and Culture Industries Decision Respecting the Guide to Cultural Heritage Resources in the Land Use Planning Process 2017 Draft (Item 7.1)**

(Brown/Rosart)

That the Ministry of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and Culture Industries Decision Respecting the Guide to Cultural Heritage Resources in the Land Use Planning Process 2017 Draft, be received.

CARRIED

- (ii) Inventory and Research Working Group Meeting Notes - October 28, 2019 (Item 7.2)**

(Beland/Ritchie)

That the Inventory and Research Working Group Meeting Notes of October 28, 2019, be received.

CARRIED

- (iii) Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes - September 16, 2019 (Item 7.3)**

(Janssen/Brown)

That the Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes of September 16, 2019, be received.

CARRIED

- (iv) Summary of Events Leading to Proposed Demolition of the Former Hanrahan's Hotel located at 80 and 92 Barton Street East (PED19240) (Ward 2) (Item 7.4)**

(Ritchie/Beland)

That staff be directed to invite the developer of the property located at 80 and 92 Barton Street East, to speak to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee respecting their proposed plans for the property.

CARRIED

(v) Heritage Permit Applications - Delegated Approvals (Added Item 7.6)

- (i) Heritage Permit Application HP2019-039: Proposed addition at 41 Mill Street, Waterdown (Ward 15) (By-law No. 96-34-H) (Added Item 7.6.a)
- (ii) Heritage Permit Application HP2019-042: Proposed completion) (By-law No. 06-011) (Added Item 7.6.b)
- (iv) Heritage Permit Application HP2019-043: Proposed repointing and stone repairs at 121 St. Clair Avenue, Hamilton (Ward 3) (By-law 86-125) (Added Item 7.6.c)

CARRIED

(f) DELEGATIONS (Item 8)

- (i) Dr. Sarah Sheehan, respecting an Update on the Campaign to Save the Former Hotel Hanrahan, 80-92 Barton Street East, Hamilton (Added Item 8.1)**

Dr. Sarah Sheehan addressed the Committee respecting an Update on the Campaign to Save the Former Hotel Hanrahan, 80-92 Barton Street East, Hamilton, with the aid of a handout.

(Ritchie/Pearson)

That the Delegation from Dr. Sarah Sheehan, respecting an Update on the Campaign to Save the Former Hotel Hanrahan, 80-92 Barton Street East, Hamilton, be received.

CARRIED

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Items 1 and (f)(iv)

The handout is available at www.hamilton.ca, and through the Office of the City Clerk.

(g) GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 13)

- (i) Buildings and Landscapes (Item 13.1)**

(Ritchie/Brown)

That the property located at 80 and 92 Barton Street East (Hanrahan Hotel), be added to the Heritage Properties Update List (BLACK), and that T. Ritchie report to the Committee on its status.

CARRIED

(Brown/Ritchie)

That the following updates be received:

(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes (RED):

(Red = Properties where there is a perceived immediate threat to heritage resources through: demolition; neglect; vacancy; alterations, and/or, redevelopment)

- (i) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – T. Ritchie
- (ii) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – C. Dmitry
- (iii) Century Manor, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (D) – G. Carroll
- (iv) Beach Canal Lighthouse and Cottage (D) – R. McKee
- (v) 18-22 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) – W. Rosart
- (vi) 24-28 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) – W. Rosart
- (vii) 2 Hatt Street, Dundas (R) – K. Burke
- (viii) James Street Baptist Church, 98 James Street South, Hamilton (D) – J. Brown
- (ix) 828 Sanatorium Road – G. Carroll

The back door and portico have been enclosed.

- (x) 120 Park Street, Hamilton – R. McKee
- (xi) 398 Wilson Street, Hamilton – C. Dimitry

(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Interest (YELLOW):

(Yellow = Properties that are undergoing some type of change, such as a change in ownership or use, but are not perceived as being immediately threatened)

- (i) Delta High School, 1284 Main Street East, Hamilton (D) – D. Beland
- (ii) 2251 Rymal Road East, Stoney Creek (R) – B. Janssen
- (iii) Former Valley City Manufacturing, 64 Hatt Street, Dundas – K. Burke
- (iv) St. Joseph's Motherhouse, 574 Northcliffe Avenue, Dundas (R) (ND) – W. Rosart
- (v) Copley Building, 104 King Street West; 56 York Blvd., and 63-76 MacNab Street North (NOI) – G. Carroll

- (vi) 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) (NOI) – C. Dimitry
- (vii) Dunington-Grubb Gardens, 1000 Main Street East (within Gage Park) – D. Beland
- (viii) 1 St. James Place, Hamilton (D) – J. Brown
- (ix) St. Clair Blvd. Conservation District – D. Beland
- (x) 51 Herkimer Street, Hamilton – J. Brown
- (xi) 52 Charlton Avenue West, Hamilton – J. Brown
- (xii) 292 Dundas Street, Waterdown – L. Lunsted

**(c) Heritage Properties Update (GREEN):
(Green = Properties whose status is stable)**

- (i) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie
- (ii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – R. McKee
- (iii) Treble Hall, 4-12 John Street North, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie
- (iv) 104 King Street West, Dundas (Former Post Office) – K. Burke
- (v) 45 Forest Avenue, Hamilton – G. Carroll
- (vi) 125 King Street East, Hamilton – T. Ritchie

(d) Heritage Properties Update (black):

(Black = Properties that HMHC have no control over and may be demolished)

- (i) Auchmar Gate House, Claremont Lodge 71 Claremont Drive (R) – R. McKee
- (ii) 80 and 92 Barton Street East (Hanrahan Hotel) – T. Ritchie

For further disposition, refer to Items 1 and (f)(iv)

CARRIED

(g) ADJOURNMENT (Item 15)

(Carroll/Ritchie)

That, there being no further business, the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, be adjourned at 1:07 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Alissa Denham-Robinson, Chair
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Loren Kolar
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk

MEETING NOTES
POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP

Monday July 15, 2019

3:00 pm

Hamilton City Hall, Room 222

Attendees: K. Stacey, W. Rosart, L. Lunsted, B. Janssen, C. Priamo

Regrets: C. Dimitry, K. Stacey, A. Denham-Robinson

Also Present: M. Brunton

THE POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP PRESENTS NOTES FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE WITH RESPECT TO:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None

(c) REVIEW OF PAST MEETING NOTES

N/A

(d) CULTURAL HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT – 323 Rymal Rd East, Hamilton

The CHIA report was reviewed by the Policy and Design Working Group of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee on July 15, 2019. Their comments are summarized below:

- (i) Evaluation of Gothic Revival – As part of the 9/06 evaluation of the subject property, the house is noted not to be a rare example of a Gothic Revival Style house in Hamilton. The working group would like to see additional photographic documentation to support this conclusion and a

**POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP
MEETING NOTES****July 15, 2019
Page 2 of 3**

further evaluation of the subject property compared to more local Gothic Revival Style house examples, exploring whether the house is a rare example of a Gothic Revival Style house in the context of the 'mountain' area of Hamilton. To help address this question, the Working Group would like to see a visual comparison of other Gothic Revival Style houses within Hamilton to see how 323 Rymal Road East compares.

- (ii) Impact of Alterations – The report documents multiple alterations to the Gothic Revival Style house are documented throughout the report, concluding that the house has a fair level of integrity of the house. The Working Group would like a further defined definition or description of what 'fair level of integrity' means? For example, it is the house no longer considered to be Gothic Revival Style? Do any of the changes add value to the integrity of the property?
- (iii) Adaptive Reuse Options - The working group would like to see more options for adaptive reuse of the building or considerations of incorporating the existing building in to the proposed development; and
- (iv) Commemorative Options – With the properties connection to the Young family, the working group would like to see commemoration options for the site. Such as an informative historical plaque or ways to incorporate design elements from the existing house into the proposed development.

The Policy and Design request to review the revised report.

(e) Documentation and Salvage Report – 555 Sanatorium Rd, Hamilton

The Policy and Design Working group was satisfied with the report, but had a few questions about the landscape plan, an existing memorial and storage of salvaged material. Staff will provide a verbal update for these questions.

(f) Documentation and Salvage Report – 213 Wilson Street East, Ancaster

The Policy and Design Working group was satisfied with the report as submitted.

**POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP
MEETING NOTES**

**July 15, 2019
Page 3 of 3**

(g) DISCUSSION

**(i) Selection of Working Group Chair / Vice-Chair / Co-Chairs / Secretary
and Overview of Roles & Responsibilities**

K.Stacey provided an overview of her experience as Chair.

Due to low attendance, role election will be completed at the Policy and Design meeting in September.

(h) OTHER BUSINESS

None

(i) ADJOURNMENT

The Policy & Design Working Group Meeting adjourned at approx. 5:00 pm.

Next meeting date: Monday August 2019
Rm. 222

MEETING NOTES
POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP

Monday October 21, 2019

3:00 pm

Hamilton City Hall, Room 222

Attendees: A. Denham Robinson, L. Lunsted, R. McKee, C. Priamo, B. Janssen,

Regrets: R. Rosart, C. Dimitry, K. Stacey

Also Present: M. Brunton, D. Addington, G. MacPherson

THE POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP PRESENTS NOTES FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE WITH RESPECT TO:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

A Denham Robinson for 206-208 King Street West

(c) REVIEW OF PAST MEETING NOTES

(i) July 15, 2019:

Sanitorium Road, staff update:

The tuberculosis (Inuit) monument remains, it is not on the property
Items are being stored onsite in containers

(ii) September 16, 2019:

Working Group Roles and Responsibilities:

Positions will be in place for one year. The roles will be looked at
again in July 2020

Designation Plaquing Policy

In 2015 this responsibility moved to Cultural Heritage under Christopher Redford. The location of this program was looked at again in 2017 and it remained in place (see PED15193(s)). Staff will invite C. Redford to talk to the Policy & Design Working Group to discuss details, budget and responsibilities of this program.

(d) OTHER BUSINESS**(i) 206-208 King Street West**

North-East corner of King St. & Caroline. This property has been inventoried but not registered or designated. The Policy & Design Working Group agrees with the received CHIA report.

(ii) 20 East Avenue South - St. Patrick's School

The school was built in 1912 with additions in 1951 and 1972 The building has been inventoried but is not registered or designated. The Policy & Design Working Group agrees with the received CHIA report for St. Patrick's school.

The drawings in the CHIA show that landscaping on the west side of the church is proposed to be changed to incorporate a new driveway which will impact the streetscape. The Church property is separate but would it be possible to look at the entire site as one? Staff will look into this.

(e) ADJOURNMENT

The Policy & Design Working Group Meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Next meeting date: Monday November 18, 2019 3:00 pm
Rm. 222

MEETING NOTES
POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP

Monday November 18, 2019

3:00 pm

Hamilton City Hall, Room 222

Attendees: R. Rosart, C. Dimitry, A. Denham Robinson, L. Lunsted, R. McKee, B. Janssen,

Regrets: C. Priamo KStacey

Also Present: M. Brunton, D. Addington, G. MacPherson

THE POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP PRESENTS NOTES FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE WITH RESPECT TO:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

Addendum: Golder (Consultant) Response regarding 323 Rymal Road East, Hamilton

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None

(c) REVIEW OF PAST MEETING NOTES

October 21, 2019:

Notes approved.

**POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP
MEETING NOTES****November 18, 2019
Page 2 of 2****(d) DISCUSSION ITEMS****(i) Golder (Consultant) Response regarding 323 Rymal Road East, Hamilton**

The Working Group had several comments on the Golder Response:

- The report indicates that the house is not unique and gives several examples of other houses. We are not sure if all of the houses cited in the report as being of the same vintage and style still exist, since the photos are from 1984. We are requesting an update on the photos and current status of the houses cited.
- Do any of the alterations impact the 'integrity' of the house
- Are there options for adaptive reuse
- The address under the photo on page 2 should read Rymal Road East, not West
- In view of the questions concerning the report, the Group agreed to postpone approval of the Golder Report pending their answers to our questions.

(e) NEW BUSINESS**(i) 311 Rymal Road, Hamilton**

Separate questions were raised by C. Dimitry regarding the house directly next door to the west (311 Rymal Road) as it appears to be of a similar vintage. It was not included in this report and does not appear to be included in the inventory.

Action Item: C. Dimitry will take photos of the 311 Rymal Road property, along with several others mentioned in the report to see if they still exist. Should the P&D Working group decide that more research is needed, the properties will be referred to the Inventory & Research Working Group for follow up.

(f) ADJOURNMENT

The Policy & Design Working Group Meeting adjourned at 3:50 pm.

Next meeting date: Monday December 16, 2019 3:00 pm
Rm. 222