



**City of Hamilton**  
**GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE REVISED**

**Meeting #:** 20-002(g)  
**Date:** February 7, 2020  
**Time:** 9:30 a.m.  
**Location:** Council Chambers, Hamilton City Hall  
71 Main Street West

Stephanie Paparella, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 3993

---

	<b>Pages</b>
<b>1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA</b>	
<b>2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST</b>	
<b>3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING</b>	
*3.1 January 30, 2020	3
<b>4. COMMUNICATIONS</b>	
*4.1 Correspondence from Tom Cooper, Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction, respecting Living Wage	6
*4.2 Correspondence from Councillor Bridget Doherty, City of Kingston, Portsmouth District, respecting Living Wage	7
<b>5. CONSENT ITEMS</b>	
<b>6. STAFF PRESENTATIONS</b>	
6.1 2020 Corporate Financials & Non-Program Revenue Budgets	8
6.2 2020 Council Referred Items	18
*6.2.a Marion Emo, President and CEO Hamilton-Burlington SPCA to speak to the Animal Adoption Program matter (at the request of Council) (no copy)	
6.3 2020 Business Cases	23

**7. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

7.1 Living Wage - School Crossing Guards (HUR20004) (City Wide) 27

7.2 Living Wage (HUR20003-FCS20013) (City Wide) 31

**8. MOTIONS**

**9. NOTICES OF MOTION**

**10. PRIVATE & CONFIDENTIAL**

**11. ADJOURNMENT**



**GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE  
(2020 OPERATING BUDGET)  
MINUTES 20-002(f)**

9:30 a.m.

Thursday, January 30, 2020

Council Chambers

Hamilton City Hall

71 Main Street West

---

**Present:** Mayor F. Eisenberger, Deputy Mayor B. Clark (Chair)  
Councillors M. Wilson, J. Farr, N. Nann, S. Merulla, C. Collins,  
T. Jackson, E. Pauls, J.P. Danko, M. Pearson, B. Johnson,  
A. VanderBeek, J. Partridge

**Absent:** Councillor T. Whitehead – Personal  
Councillor L. Ferguson – Other City Business

---

**THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR INFORMATION:**

**(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Committee Clerk advised of the following change to the agenda:

**3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

3.1 January 29, 2020

**(Pearson/Pauls)**

That the agenda for the January 30, 2020 General Issues Committee (Budget) meeting be approved, as amended.

**Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 0, as follows:**

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson  
 YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko  
 YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark  
 YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger  
 YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead  
 YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson  
 YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson  
 YES - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson

**(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)**

There were no declarations of interest.

**(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)**

**(i) January 29, 2020 (Item 3.1)**

**(Farr/Johnson)**

That the Minutes of the January 29, 2020 General Issues Committee (Budget) meeting be approved, as presented.

**Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 0, as follows:**

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson  
 YES - Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr  
 YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann  
 YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson  
 YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko  
 YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark  
 YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger  
 YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead  
 YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek  
 NOT PRESENT - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson  
 YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson  
 YES - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson

**(d) PRESENTATIONS (Item 6)**

**(i) Healthy & Safe Communities Department 2020 Operating Budget (Item 6.1)**

Paul Johnson, General Manager, Healthy & Safe Communities Department, addressed Committee and provided a PowerPoint presentation respecting the Healthy & Safe Communities Department 2020 Operating Budget.

**(Eisenberger/Partridge)**

That the presentation, respecting the Healthy & Safe Communities 2020 Operating Budget, be received.

**CARRIED**

A copy of the presentation is available on the City's website at [www.hamilton.ca](http://www.hamilton.ca) or through the Office of the City Clerk.

**(e) ADJOURNMENT (Item 8)**

**(Pearson/VanderBeek)**

That, there being no further business, the General Issues Committee (Budget), be adjourned at 11:46 a.m.

**CARRIED**

Respectfully submitted,

Deputy Mayor Brad Clark  
Chair, General Issues Committee

Stephanie Paparella  
Legislative Coordinator  
Office of the City Clerk

# Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction

February 6, 2020

Dear Councillor,

We were pleased to see a discussion on implementing a Living Wage for municipal and Hamilton Public Library employees will be coming back on Friday, February 7<sup>th</sup> during GIC budget deliberations.

As you know, the Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction, Social Planning Council, Workforce Planning Hamilton and Hamilton & District Labour Council have been advocating for Living Wage in Hamilton since 2011 (and in some cases, even earlier). Together, with provincial partners, we helped lead the development of Ontario's Living Wage movement -which now counts more than 30 communities across Ontario. More than 300 employers have signed up and committed to implementing living wage within their organizations. You can read some of their testimonials on the [Ontario Living Wage website](#).

Last year's decision to increase wages of municipal crossing guards to the previous living wage rate of \$15.45 was appreciated; Hamilton's current living wage rate of \$16.45 was calculated and released in November, 2019 through the local leadership of SPRC and in conjunction with the Ontario Living Wage Network's framework that includes Stats Canada data and other relevant measures. We looked at the costs of food, rental housing, transportation and other essential costs for Hamilton families. Living Wage is a local, evidence-based approach to setting wages based on local family costs.



Raising wages for the lowest paid workers in our community is not only the right thing to do, but by helping to end working poverty, significant economic benefits will accrue. When the provincial government raised minimum wage in January 2018, [Ontario saw an increase in employment](#)... More employees had money to spend on goods and services, this in turn helped drive economic growth.

Recently the [City of Kingston signed on as Ontario's 4th certified Living Wage municipality](#). Smaller Ontario municipalities including [Huron County](#), [North Perth](#) and the [City of Cambridge](#) have already committed to implementing living wage for municipal employers. If Hamilton were to make a similar commitment, the municipality would become the largest in Ontario to become a certified Living Wage employer. It would send a strong message to our employees, the community and the province that our City is committed to ending working poverty.

We urge you to continue Hamilton's progress. Let's make Hamilton a Living Wage community in 2020.

Warmest regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Tom Cooper".

Tom Cooper

Director, Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction

**Bridget Doherty**  
**Councillor, City of Kingston, Portsmouth District**  
613-328-5978 | bdoherty@cityofkingston.ca

## AN OPEN LETTER TO HAMILTON CITY COUNCILLORS

Thursday February 6<sup>th</sup>, 2020

Dear fellow Councillors,

I understand Hamilton City Council will be discussing two living wage motions this Friday. We commend you for furthering this important debate and for the City of Hamilton's long standing leadership in tackling poverty.

As you are keenly aware, municipalities across Ontario are facing significant financial challenges, yet we have found that paying employees the local living wage is an investment in our community's future. Paying a living wage to municipal workers sends a strong message about the need to reduce income inequality both within our organization – and outside of it.

Employees who benefit from earning a Living Wage are typically working-age adults in their 30s, 40s and 50s—often helping to support their own families. According to Statistics Canada, the number of low-wage workers has doubled in the last two decades. If municipalities can do their part to reduce that disparity, there can be significant returns: greater productivity, less sick time and far fewer turnovers. Workers who earn more feel valued and, as a result, help us achieve our goals as an organization.

In looking at certification, we found that, like most municipal employers, all of our full-time and most part-time employees were above the current living wage rate. With phased implementation, we will look at bringing the rest up to living wage levels as contracts come up for renewal.

But this is not the only way a city can take a leadership role in poverty reduction. As you are aware, municipalities are also significant purchasers of goods and services and can inspire the private sector to do their part to reduce working poverty. Later this year, the City of Kingston will be looking at **living wage procurement policies that will encourage contractors to pay at least a living wage to their workers.**

Great cities of the 21st century will themselves be good and fair employers. We hope to see the City of Hamilton join Kingston and other municipalities as leaders in this growing decent work movement.

Please reach out to the Ontario Living Wage Network or myself if you require additional resources, or have any questions.

Sincerely,

Bridget Doherty  
Councillor, Councillor, City of Kingston, Portsmouth District

6.1



Hamilton

**2020 PRELIMINARY TAX OPERATING  
BUDGET- CORPORATE FINANCIALS  
& NON PROGRAM REVENUES**

**GIC- FEBRUARY 7, 2020**

**CORPORATE FINANCIALS AND NON PROGRAM REVENUES  
2020 OPERATING BUDGET**



## Approved and Proposed Budget Amendments

<b>APPROVED AMENDMENTS (Jan 17 GIC):</b>		
<b>Department</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Amount (in \$'000s)</b>
Corporate Financials	Partial mitigation of 2020 Operating Impacts of Capital - New Traffic Signals	(327)
<b>PROPOSED AMENDMENTS:</b>		
Corporate Financials	Adjustment for HUC Dividends	(697)
<b>Total Amendments</b>		<b>(1,024)</b>

## Corporate Financials – Corporate Expenditures

\$'000

Category	2019 Restated Budget	2020 Preliminary Budget	Change (\$)	Change (%)
Corporate Initiatives	4,223	7,987	3,764	89.1%
Corporate Pension, Benefits & Contingency	15,345	15,946	602	3.9%
<b>Total Corporate Financials-Expenditures</b>	<b>19,567</b>	<b>23,933</b>	<b>4,366</b>	<b>22.3%</b>

3

# Corporate Financials – Corporate Expenditures

## Cost Drivers \$'000

Category	Item	2019 Restated Budget	2020 Preliminary Budget	Change \$	Change %
Corporate Initiatives	Area Rated Levy	2,242	2,856	615	27%
	Operating Impact of Capital	288	1,991	1,703	592%
	Other Items	1,693	1,611	(82)	5%
	Financial Changes		1,528	1,528	-
<b>Total</b>		<b>4,223</b>	<b>7,987</b>	<b>3,764</b>	<b>89%</b>
Corporate Pensions, Benefits & Contingency	Post-Retirement Benefits & Non-OMERS Pensions	13,026	13,250	224	2%
	Current Employee Benefits	1,280	1,610	330	26%
	Other Items	1,039	1,087	48	5%
<b>Total</b>		<b>15,345</b>	<b>15,946</b>	<b>602</b>	<b>4%</b>
<b>Total: Corporate Financials</b>		<b>19,567</b>	<b>23,933</b>	<b>4,366</b>	<b>22%</b>

4

# Non-Program Revenues -Tax Adjustments

\$'000

Category	Item	2019 Restated Budget	2020 Preliminary Budget	Change \$	Change %
Tax Adjustments	Payments In Lieu	(15,727)	(16,026)	(300)	2%
	Penalties and Interest	(10,500)	(11,000)	(500)	5%
	Right of Way	(3,228)	(3,228)	0	0%
	Senior Tax Credit	587	567	(20)	3%
	Supplementary Taxes	(9,125)	(9,425)	(300)	3%
	Enterprise Grant	500	700	200	40%
	LEED Grant	700	500	(200)	29%
	Veteran's Grant	148	20	(128)	86%
	Other Tax Adjustments	8,367	8,305	(62)	1%
	<b>Total Tax Adjustments</b>	<b>(28,277)</b>	<b>(29,587)</b>	<b>(1,310)</b>	

5

## Non-Program Revenues - Other

### \$'000

Category	Item	2019 Restated Budget	2020 Preliminary Budget	Change \$	Change %
Other Corporate Revenues	HUC Dividend and Other Interest*	(5,300)	(5,300)	-	0%
	Investment Income	(4,100)	(4,100)	-	0%
	Slot Revenues	(5,000)	(5,200)	(200)	4%
	POA Revenues	(2,362)	(2,302)	60	3%
	<b>Total Other Corporate Revenues</b>	<b>(16,762)</b>	<b>(16,902)</b>	<b>(140)</b>	

\*Includes Proposed Budget Amendment

## Non-Program Revenues - Trend Analysis - \$'M

Historical Trends	Actual 2015	Actual 2016	Actual 2017	Actual 2018	Proj Act 2019	Budget 2020	5 Yr Ave 2015-19
<b>Tax Adjustments</b>							
Payment In Lieu	(15.5)	(15.9)	(16.0)	(16.4)	(16.6)	(16.0)	(16.1)
Penalties and Interest	(11.3)	(11.6)	(11.5)	(11.2)	(12.0)	(11.0)	(11.5)
Right of Way	(3.2)	(3.2)	(3.2)	(3.2)	(3.2)	(3.2)	(3.2)
Senior Tax Credit	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6
Supplementary Taxes	(15.0)	(7.9)	(11.2)	(10.4)	(10.5)	(9.5)	(11.0)
Tax Remissions and Write Offs	13.6	15.1	24.5	11.4	9.7	9.7	14.9
<b>Sub Total Tax Adjustments</b>	<b>(30.7)</b>	<b>(22.8)</b>	<b>(16.8)</b>	<b>(29.4)</b>	<b>(32.0)</b>	<b>(29.5)</b>	<b>(26.3)</b>
<b>Corporate Revenues</b>							
POA Revenues	(3.8)	(4.2)	(2.9)	(3.0)	(3.2)	(2.3)	(3.4)
HUC Dividend & Other Interest	(6.2)	(5.5)	(10.3)	(2.6)	(4.8)	(5.3)	(5.9)
Interest Income	(4.1)	(4.1)	(4.1)	(4.1)	(4.1)	(4.1)	(4.1)
Slot Revenues	(5.0)	(5.0)	(5.3)	(5.3)	(5.4)	(5.2)	(5.2)
Provincial Funding	(0.7)	-	-	-	-	-	(0.1)
<b>Sub Total Corporate Revenues</b>	<b>(19.8)</b>	<b>(18.8)</b>	<b>(22.5)</b>	<b>(15.0)</b>	<b>(17.5)</b>	<b>(16.9)</b>	<b>(18.7)</b>
<b>Net Levy</b>	<b>(50.5)</b>	<b>(41.6)</b>	<b>(39.3)</b>	<b>(44.4)</b>	<b>(49.5)</b>	<b>(46.4)</b>	<b>(45.1)</b>

7



Hamilton

**2020 PRELIMINARY TAX OPERATING  
BUDGET  
HAMILTON ENTERTAINMENT  
FACILITIES**

**HAMILTON ENTERTAINMENT FACILITIES  
2020 OPERATING BUDGET**

# Hamilton Entertainment Facilities

	2019 Restated Budget	2020 Preliminary Budget	Change	
	(\$'000s)	(\$'000s)	\$	%
FirstOntario Centre	1,466	1,494	28	2%
FirstOntario Concert Hall	514	505	(9)	2%
Hamilton Convention Centre by Carmen's	476	705	229	48%
Contract Administration	1,457	1,798	341	23%
<b>Total</b>	<b>3,913</b>	<b>4,502</b>	<b>589</b>	





THANK YOU





Hamilton

**2020 PRELIMINARY TAX  
OPERATING BUDGET  
COUNCIL REFERRED ITEMS**

**GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE**

**February 7, 2020**

# 2020 COUNCIL REFERRED ITEMS

- Items previously considered at Council and referred to the budget process for further discussion.

DEPARTMENT	# OF ITEMS	2020 IMPACT		FTE
		\$ GROSS	\$ NET	
Planning & Economic Development	3	135,000	45,000	1.50
Healthy and Safe Communities	3*	781,340	743,340	14.00
Public Works - Tax	3	3,810,000	3,810,000	-
City Manager	2	295,280	295,280	-
Corporate Services	1	-	-	-
Board and Agencies	1	145,000	145,000	-
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>\$ 5,166,620</b>	<b>\$ 5,038,620</b>	<b>15.50</b>

- Results in a 0.5% tax impact.

\*Including one council referred item (CR-10) jointly submitted with City Manager

# 2020 COUNCIL REFERRED ITEMS

#	DEPARTMENT	DETAILS	\$ GROSS	\$ NET	FTE
<b>CR-01</b>	Planning & Economic Development	Cigarette Butt By-law Enforcement Officer (PED18154(a))	45,000	45,000	0.50
<b>CR-02</b>	Planning & Economic Development	Hess Village Paid Duty Policing (PED18081(a))	TBD	TBD	-
<b>CR-03</b>	Healthy and Safe Communities	10 Year Fire Service Delivery Plan	610,420	572,420	14.00
<b>CR-04</b>	Healthy and Safe Communities	Enhancement for CANUSA Funding	10,920	10,920	-
<b>CR-05*</b>	Public Works - Tax	Sidewalk Clearing Program - PW19022 (a) Option 1: Existing Service Option 2: Priority 1 and 2A Roadways - additional \$1.78 M *Option 3: City Wide Roadways - additional \$3.78 M	3,780,000	3,780,000	-

\*Updated gross and net amounts post budget book

3

## 2020 COUNCIL REFERRED ITEMS

#	DEPARTMENT	DETAILS	\$ GROSS	\$ NET	FTE
CR-06	Public Works - Tax	Snow Angels Program - PW19022 (a)	-	-	-
CR-07	City Manager	City Enrichment Fund – Concession BIA	2,730	2,730	-
CR-08*	City Manager	Implement Living Wage: Option 1 Non-Union PT Casuals: \$432,640 Option 2 Non-Union FT Summer Students: \$119,600 Option 3 Unionized Summer Students: \$325,420 One Instalment (Options 1, 2 and 3): \$877,660 <b>*Three Year (2020 - 2022) Phase-In: \$292,550/year</b>	292,550	292,550	-
CR-09	Corporate Services	Establish Climate Change Reserve for Sustainable Funding	TBD	TBD	-

\*Updated gross and net amounts post budget book

4

# 2020 COUNCIL REFERRED ITEMS

## POST BUDGET BOOK

#	DEPARTMENT	DETAILS	\$ GROSS	\$ NET	FTE
<b>CR-10</b>	Healthy and Safe Communities & City Manager	Corporate Goals and Areas of Focus for Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation	160,000	160,000	-
<b>CR-11</b>	Public Works - Tax	Ongoing care and maintenance of the Aviary and birds	30,000	30,000	-
<b>CR-12</b>	Board and Agencies	Parkdale Landing Library Mini Branch	145,000	145,000	-
<b>CR-13</b>	Planning & Economic Development	Animal Adoption Pilot Program	90,000	-	1.00
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>\$5,166,620</b>	<b>\$5,038,620</b>	<b>15.50</b>



Hamilton

**2020 PRELIMINARY TAX  
OPERATING BUDGET  
BUSINESS CASES**

**GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE**

**February 7, 2020**

# 2020 BUSINESS CASES

- 10 Business Cases

DEPARTMENT	# OF ITEMS	2020 IMPACT		
		\$ GROSS	\$ NET	FTE
Planning & Economic Development	3	677,120	252,000	7.50
Healthy and Safe Communities	1	1,039,500	1,039,500	10.00
Public Works - Tax	2	424,270	(89,530)	6.70
City Manager	1	120,000	-	1.00
Corporate Services	2	206,950	-	2.00
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>\$ 2,467,840</b>	<b>\$ 1,201,970</b>	<b>27.20</b>

- Results in a 0.10% tax impact



# 2020 BUSINESS CASES

#	DEPARTMENT	DETAILS	\$ GROSS	\$ NET	FTE
<b>BC-01</b>	Planning & Economic Development	Real Estate - Converting Contract Positions to Permanent	323,620	-	3.00
<b>BC-02</b>	Planning & Economic Development	By-Law Enforcement - Graffiti Management	252,000	252,000	3.50
<b>BC-03</b>	Planning & Economic Development	Animal Services - PED18004(b) Now Council Referred: Dec 11, 2019 Council Minutes 19-022	Council Referred	Council Referred	Council Referred
<b>BC-04</b>	Planning & Economic Development	Transportation Development Review – Converting Contract Position to Permanent	101,500	-	1.00
<b>BC-05</b>	Healthy and Safe Communities	Hamilton Paramedic Service Enhancement (Ambulance)	1,039,500	1,039,500	10.00

# 2020 BUSINESS CASES

#	DEPARTMENT	DETAILS	\$ GROSS	\$ NET	FTE
<b>BC-06</b>	Public Works - Tax	T.O.M - Converting Consultant Inspectors to In-house Permanent Technologist Inspector & Student Inspectors	284,270	(89,530)	4.40
<b>BC-07</b>	Public Works - Tax	Tim Horton's Field - Assistant Stadium Technicians to handle the addition of Forge FC Soccer games	140,000	-	2.30
<b>BC-08</b>	City Manager	HR - Return to Work Services Specialist (funded by Fire)	120,000	-	1.00
<b>BC-09</b>	Corporate Services	Payroll - Enhanced WSIB Payroll Processing Services	100,000	-	1.00
<b>BC-10</b>	Corporate Services	IT - Conversion of an FTE from Temporary to Permanent	106,950	-	1.00
	<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>\$2,467,840</b>	<b>\$1,201,970</b>	<b>27.20</b>



## INFORMATION REPORT

<b>TO:</b>	Mayor and Members General Issues Committee
<b>COMMITTEE DATE:</b>	February 7, 2020
<b>SUBJECT/REPORT NO:</b>	Living Wage - School Crossing Guards (HUR20004) (City Wide) <b>(Outstanding Business List Item)</b>
<b>WARD(S) AFFECTED:</b>	City Wide
<b>PREPARED BY:</b>	Nenzi Cocca (905) 546-2424 Ext. 3924
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Lora Fontana Executive Director Human Resources
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	

### COUNCIL DIRECTION

At the General Issues Committee meeting of March 22, 2019, staff brought forward a report (FCS19017) informing Council of approximate costing to bring all minimum wage employees, which includes the part-time, seasonal and other contract employees, up to a Living Wage rate of \$15.85 per hour.

At that meeting, the General Issues Committee approved the Living Wage rate be applied as follows:

- (a) That City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards be paid a Living Wage effective April 1, 2019, and the cost to be included in the 2019 Operating Budget; and,
- (b) That the Living Wage rate for the City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards be adjusted annually to reflect the cost of living (COLA). This adjustment would be made annually on September 1<sup>st</sup>.

This report provides an update regarding an increase to the Living Wage and options to facilitate the Living Wage initiative for the City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards.

---

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

**SUBJECT: Living Wage - School Crossing Guards  
(HUR20004) (City Wide) - Page 2 of 3**

---

**INFORMATION**

In 2016, the Living Wage rate was reviewed and updated by Living Wage Hamilton and the Living Wage Calculation Workgroup of the Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction. Based on revised local costing and analysis, the rate was increased to \$15.85 per hour. All full time City of Hamilton employees currently earn above the Living Wage rate (with the exception of full time summer students, both unionized and non-unionized). School Crossing Guards are now earning a Living Wage rate of \$15.85 effective April 1, 2019

As part of Living Wage Week this past November, the 2019 Living Wage rates for Hamilton were increased to \$16.45 per hour by the Ontario Living Wage Network. The costing and analysis utilized to determine the Living Wage reflects what a family of four, comprised of two adult earners, who work full time at 37.5 hours per week with two children, need to earn minimally to support the family unit. This Living Wage rate does not take into consideration any savings, retirement planning or debt repayments.

**Financial Impact**

The 2020 Preliminary Tax Supported Budget was submitted to Council in January of this year. Within that budget, a provision is included to increase the School Crossing Guards hourly wage by 1.6% to approximately \$16.104 per hour. The impact of this provision is approximately \$31,400. COLA increases for School Crossing Guards are implemented September 1 of each year, to coincide with the beginning of the school year.

As a result of the new Living Wage rate increase, staff are providing options for the adoption of the \$16.45 per hour rate for the City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards effective January 1, 2020.

Should Council elect to adopt the new Living Wage rate (\$16.45 per hour) effective January 1, 2020, the estimated total cost would be \$74,551. Since the COLA increase (\$16.104 per hour) for School Crossing Guards is already included in the budget (\$31,400), approving a wage rate of \$16.45 would add \$43,200 to the 2020 budget.

The breakdown of costs is illustrated in the table below.

**Table 1** - Estimated cost impact of Living Wage adjustment to \$16.45/hr for School Crossing Guards effective January 1, 2020.

**SUBJECT: Living Wage - School Crossing Guards  
(HUR20004) (City Wide) - Page 3 of 3**

---

<b>Department</b>	<b>2020 Cost Impact</b>
Planning & Economic Development	\$64,268
Benefit Overhead Costs (BOC)	\$10,283
Total Cost from January 1 – December 31, 2020	\$74,551
Current amount in 2020 Budget (\$16.104 per hour, equivalent to 1.6%)	\$31,400
<b>Increase required to 2020 Budget to implement Living Wage of \$16.45 per hour (equivalent to 3.79%)</b>	<b>\$43,200</b>

Should Council elect to implement the new Living Wage (\$16.45 per hour), Council may decide to forgo the 1.6% COLA for September 1, 2020 given that the Living Wage increase is greater than the COLA (equivalent to 3.79%).

For costing purposes, the value of vacation pay or other employer paid benefits (where applicable) were included in the calculation of wage rates for City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards. This is consistent with the calculation of the Living Wage rate. Staff utilized budgeted hours from January 1 to December 31, 2020.

### **Considerations**

Council could choose to maintain the 1.6% COLA increase effective September 1, 2020 instead of applying the 3.79% Living Wage increase effective January 1, 2020. A provision is already included in the 2020 Budget to apply the 1.6% COLA increase for the School Crossing Guards.

Council could choose to approve the 3.79% Living Wage increase effective January 1, 2020 and the 1.6% COLA effective September 1, 2020. This would result in a total increased cost of \$105,941.

Human Resources consulted with the Financial Planning, Administration and Policy Division of the Finance & Corporate Services Department and the Transportation

### **APPENDICES ATTACHED**

Appendix A to Report HUR20004 – City of Hamilton School Crossing Guard Rates

**Existing and Amended Wage Rates and Cost for  
School Crossing Guards**

<b>Salary Grade</b>	<b>Current Hourly Rate</b>	<b>1.6% COLA Amendment (September 1, 2020)</b>	<b>Living Wage Rate Amendment equivalent to 3.79% (January 1, 2020)</b>	<b>Living Wage Rate and 1.6% COLA in 2020</b>
1CG	15.850	16.104	16.45	
<b>Total Cost</b>		<b>\$31,400</b> (already included in 2020 Budget provision)	<b>\$74,551</b> (an additional <b>\$43,200</b> to 2020 budget provision)	<b>\$105,941</b>



## INFORMATION REPORT

<b>TO:</b>	Mayor and Members General Issues Committee
<b>COMMITTEE DATE:</b>	February 7, 2020
<b>SUBJECT/REPORT NO:</b>	Living Wage (HUR20003/FCS20013) (City Wide) <b>(Outstanding Business List Item)</b>
<b>WARD(S) AFFECTED:</b>	City Wide
<b>PREPARED BY:</b>	Nenzi Cocca (905) 546-2424 Ext. 3924 Tom Hewitson (905) 546-2424 Ext. 4159
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Lora Fontana Executive Director Human Resources
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Brian McMullen Director, Financial Planning, Administration and Policy Finance and Corporate Services
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	

### COUNCIL DIRECTION

On March 22, 2019, Council approved the implementation of a Living Wage rate of \$15.85 per hour for City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards, effective April 1, 2019, with the direction that the Living Wage rate for the City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards be adjusted annually to reflect the cost of living.

Council also directed staff to bring back an information report that outlines the following:

- (a) provide a three-year strategy for the City of Hamilton toward becoming a Living Wage Employer.
- (b) consideration in the 2020 Budget cycle to pay Summer Student workers a Living Wage rate of \$15.85 per hour.

---

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

## **SUBJECT: Living Wage (HUR20003/FCS20013) (City Wide) - Page 2 of 7**

---

This report provides an update on the Living Wage rate and provides options to facilitate the adoption of a Living Wage rate for the City of Hamilton's non-union and unionized student positions and the non-union part-time casual employee group with the option for a three-year phased-in plan.

An additional information report regarding School Crossing Guards will be provided to Council regarding a recent increase to the Living Wage.

### **INFORMATION**

In 2016, the Living Wage rate was reviewed and updated by Living Wage Hamilton and the Living Wage calculation workgroup. Based on revised local costing and analysis, the rate was increased from \$14.95 to \$15.85 per hour. All full-time City of Hamilton employees currently earn above the Living Wage rate. Further to Council's approval on March 22, 2019, School Crossing Guards are also earning a Living Wage of \$15.85 per hour.

As part of Living Wage Week this past November, the 2019 Living Wage rates for Hamilton were increased to \$16.45 per hour by the Ontario Living Wage Network. The costing and analysis used to determine this Living Wage reflects what a family of four comprised of two adult earners working full time at 37.5 hours per week with two children would need to earn minimally to support the family unit. This Living Wage rate does not factor in any considerations for savings, retirement planning or debt repayments.

### **Financial Impact**

As a result of the new Living Wage rate increase, staff is providing costing options for the adoption of \$16.45 per hour in one instalment, or through a three-year phased in plan for non-union and unionized summer student positions and positions in the non-union part-time casual employee group.

Should Council elect to adopt the Living Wage rate for the non-union part-time casual staff, amendments would need to be made to the City of Hamilton's existing non-union part-time casual wage schedule. The first five grades (1EK, 1DI, 1DK, 1CK, and 1BK) do not meet the minimum threshold of a Living Wage rate of \$16.45 per hour. Examples of positions within these grades include Dietary Aide, Skate/Arena Monitor, Resident Helper and Snack Bar Clerk. The wage rates for non-union part-time staff would need to be amended to the Living Wage rate and the same percentage increase be applied to the rest of the non-union part-time casual salary schedule (grades 1AK, 1K and 2K) to maintain internal equity in accordance with the City of Hamilton compensation policy and practices. Examples of positions within these grades include Inclusion Counsellor, Office Assistant and Community Health Worker. Maintaining

---

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.



**SUBJECT: Living Wage (HUR20003/FCS20013) (City Wide) - Page 3 of 7**

internal equity ensures employees perceive that they are being compensated in a fair and equitable manner according to the relative value of their roles in an organization.

Should Council decide to adopt a Living Wage rate for summer student workers, amendments would need to be made to the non-union and unionized summer student salary schedules. Their minimum starting rates would be \$16.45 per hour rather than the minimum wage rate of \$14.00 per hour (non-union) and \$14.452 per hour (unionized).

**Considerations**

The following financial analysis should be considered:

- The updated Living Wage rate for Hamilton is \$16.45 per hour, and the previous Living Wage rate for Hamilton was \$15.85 per hour.
- All costings were determined based on the 2020 budget prepared by program divisions. Estimates are based on the assumption that there are no further Living Wage rate revisions over the next 3 years.
- The Hamilton Public Library (HPL) is governed by its own Board and administers its own employee compensation, separate and apart from the City of Hamilton. HPL utilizes the City's male comparator position to meet Pay Equity legislative compliance. Any changes to the non-union part-time casual wage schedule have a direct impact to the Hamilton Public Library's Page positions as they are tied to the City's wage schedule for Pay Equity purposes.

**Financial Analysis & Living Wage Implementation Options**

Should Council elect to adopt a Living Wage for non-union part-time casual staff and non-union and unionized summer student workers in one instalment, one or all the below options could be implemented.

**Option 1 - Non-Union Part-Time Casual Staff**

If Council elects to adopt a Living Wage of \$16.45 per hour for non-union part-time casual staff, the estimated annual cost impact is illustrated in the table below.

**Table 1**

<b>Option 1</b>	<b>\$16.45 per hour – 2020 Cost Impact</b>
<b>City of Hamilton</b>	\$226,616
<b>HPL</b>	\$206,024
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>\$432,640</b>

**SUBJECT: Living Wage (HUR20003/FCS20013) (City Wide) - Page 4 of 7**

---

**Option 2 - Non-Union Full-Time Summer Student Staff**

If Council chooses to implement a Living Wage rate for non-union full-time summer student positions (summer recreation counsellors and swim attendants), the estimated annual cost to implement \$16.45 per hour is estimated to be \$119,600. These summer student positions are hired to work during their regular school, college or university vacation period or they may be occupying a co-operative education position under a co-operative education program.

**Table 2**

<b>Option 2</b>	<b>\$16.45 per hour – 2020 Cost Impact</b>
<b>City of Hamilton</b>	\$108,576
<b>HPL</b>	\$11,024
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>\$119,600</b>

**Option 3 - Unionized Summer Student Staff**

A number of City of Hamilton student classifications fall within the scope of CUPE Local 5167. These summer student positions are hired to work during their regular school, college or university vacation period or they may be occupying a co-operative education position under a co-operative education program. Their rates of pay are based on a percentage of the Local 5167 equivalent, as in the case of Inside Student Workers, who earn a minimum rate of \$14.452 per hour and up to a maximum rate of \$19.156 per hour. Outside Student Workers have a negotiated rate and they earn \$14.452 per hour. Given that these positions fall under CUPE 5167, they will receive the negotiated COLA increase of 1.6% for the next three years.

However, during the last round of bargaining, it was agreed that should Council implement a Living Wage that explicitly applies to student workers, the current wage rate for students will be adjusted accordingly to the prevailing Living Wage rates as established and accepted by Council. The student wage adjustment will not be subject to any annual increases negotiated, relative to the collective agreement nor shall they be treated retroactively for the purposes of any timelines set out in the collective agreement.

If Council chooses to implement a Living Wage rate for unionized full-time summer student workers, the estimated cost impact to implement a Living Wage is \$325,420.

**SUBJECT: Living Wage (HUR20003/FCS20013) (City Wide) - Page 5 of 7****Table 3**

<b>Option 3</b>	<b>\$16.45 per hour – 2020 Cost Impact</b>
<b>City of Hamilton</b>	\$325,420
<b>HPL</b>	\$0
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>\$325,420</b>

The total estimated annual cost from the above three options is summarized in the following table.

**Table 4**

<b>One Instalment</b>	<b>\$16.45 per hour- 2020 Cost Impact</b>
<b>COH Non Union Part Time Staff</b>	\$226,616
<b>COH Non Union Summer Students</b>	\$108,576
<b>COH Unionized Summer Students</b>	\$325,420
<b>COH Total Cost</b>	<b>\$660,612</b>
<b>HPL Non Union Part Time Staff</b>	\$206,024
<b>HPL Non Union Summer Students</b>	\$11,024
<b>HPL Unionized Summer Students</b>	\$0
<b>HPL Total Cost</b>	<b>\$217,048</b>
<b>Grand Total COH &amp; HPL</b>	<b>\$877,660</b>

**Three Year Phase in Plan**

To offset the financial impact, the Living Wage initiative can be phased-in through a three-year plan. The table below illustrates what the estimated cost impact would be for the City and Library to implement a Living Wage of \$16.45 per hour from 2020, 2021 to 2022.

**Table 5**

<b>Three Year Phase-In of \$16.45</b>	<b>2020 Cost Impact</b>	<b>2021 Cost Impact</b>	<b>2022 Cost Impact</b>	<b>Total Cost Impact</b>
<b>Non Union Part Time</b>	\$144,210	\$144,210	\$144,210	<b>\$432,630</b>
<b>Non Union Summer Students</b>	\$39,870	\$39,870	\$39,870	<b>\$119,610</b>
<b>Unionized Summer Students</b>	\$108,470	\$108,475	\$108,475	<b>\$325,420</b>

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

**SUBJECT: Living Wage (HUR20003/FCS20013) (City Wide) - Page 6 of 7**

<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>\$292,550</b>	<b>\$292,555</b>	<b>\$292,555</b>	<b>\$877,660</b>
-------------------	------------------	------------------	------------------	------------------

As the Living Wage rate is set by an external party, staff recommend that any future changes to the Living Wage rate be brought before Council for approval so that the impacts to the internal compensation system can be considered prior to implementation.

Appendix A to Report HUR2003/FCS20013 details the current and amended rates for the non-union part-time, casual employees required to support the Living Wage initiative.

Appendix B to Report HUR2003/FCS20013 details the current and amended rates for non-union and unionized full time summer students required to support the Living Wage initiative.

### **Living Wage in Other Communities**

Staff conducted a survey amongst our municipal comparators: Brampton, Brantford, Burlington, Guelph, London, Mississauga, Oakville, Regions of Niagara, Peel and Waterloo. None of these communities have implemented a Living Wage, nor are there plans to implement a Living Wage rate in the near future.

The City of Cambridge is the only known Ontario municipality that has adopted a Living Wage policy. Their Living Wage rate is \$16.15 per hour. Full-time staff at the City of Cambridge already earn more than \$16.15 per hour. They have adopted a policy to pay part time staff a Living Wage rate. Students are not part of the Living Wage initiative at the City of Cambridge.

### **Relevant Consultation**

Human Resources, Finance, Hamilton Public Library, Healthy & Safe Communities were consulted on the preparation of this report.

A Living Wage survey was conducted amongst our municipal comparators and the City of Cambridge.

### **Alternatives for Consideration**

Based on the above options, Council can elect to implement a Living Wage to none, some or all three groups. In accordance with the Ontario Living Wage Network, the considerations utilized to calculate a Living Wage is based on an hourly wage to support a family unit with two children. Based on this consideration, Council may consider a cost containment measure whereby non-union full-time student positions and unionized student positions can be excluded from the increase, as these students are only employed during the summer and scheduled break.

**SUBJECT: Living Wage (HUR20003/FCS20013) (City Wide) - Page 7 of 7**

---

Council could also consider implementing the previous, lower Living Wage, set at \$15.85 per hour. The cost difference between implement a Living Wage at \$15.85 and \$16.45 is approximately \$33,760.

Alternatively, Council may elect not to apply a Living Wage to the three, aforementioned groups.

**APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED**

Appendix A to Report HUR20003/FCS20013 - Existing and Amended Wage Rates for Impacted Non-Union Part-Time Positions

Appendix B to Report HUR20003/FCS20013 - Existing and Amended Wage Rates for Non-Union & Unionized Full Time Summer Student Positions

### Existing & Amended Wage Rates for Non-Union Part-Time Positions

#### Existing Wage Rates for Non-Union Part-Time Casual Group of Employees

Salary Grade	Hourly Rate (Step 1)	Hourly Rate (Step 2)	Hourly Rate (Step 3)
1EK			14.000
1DI			14.000
1DK			14.000
1CK			14.113
1BK	14.945	15.257	15.568
1AK	16.484	16.828	17.171
1K	18.183	18.562	18.941
2K	24.604	25.116	25.629

#### Amended Wage Rates for Non-Union Part-Time Casual Employees with Living Wage at \$16.45

Salary Grade	Hourly Rate (Step 1)	Hourly Rate (Step 2)	Hourly Rate (Step 3)
1EK			16.450
1DI			16.450
1DK			16.450
1CK			16.583
1BK	17.560	17.926	18.292
1AK	19.369	19.772	20.176
1K	21.366	21.811	22.256
2K	28.909	29.512	30.114

### Existing & Amended Wage Rates for Hamilton Public Library Pages

#### Existing Wage Rates for Hamilton Public Library Pages

Salary Grade	Hourly Rate (Step 2)
3A	14.452

#### Amended Wage Rates for Hamilton Public Library Pages with Living Wage at \$16.450

Salary Grade	Living Wage Rate (Step 2)
3A	16.450

### Existing & Amended Wage Rates for Non-Union Full Time Summer Student Positions

#### Existing Wage Rates for Non-Union Full-Time Summer Students

Salary Grade	Hourly Rate
R5A	14.000
R5B	14.000
R5D	14.500
R8	14.750

#### Amended Wage Rates for Non-Union Full Time Summer Students with Living Wage at \$16.45

Salary Grade	Hourly Rate
R5A	16.450
R5B	16.450
R5D	17.040
R8	17.330

### Existing & Amended Wage Rates for Unionized Full Time Summer Student Positions

#### Existing Wage Rates for Unionized Full Time Summer Students

Salary Grade	Hourly Rate
25	14.452

#### Amended Wage Rates for Unionized Full Time Summer Students with Living Wage at \$16.45

Salary Grade	Hourly Rate
25	16.450