



GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE (BUDGET) MINUTES 20-017

9:30 a.m.

October 29, 2020

Due to COVID-19 and the closure of City Hall, this meeting was held virtually.

Present: Mayor F. Eisenberger, Deputy Mayor L. Ferguson (Chair)
Councillors M. Wilson, J. Farr, N. Nann, S. Merulla, C. Collins,
T. Jackson, E. Pauls, J.P. Danko, B. Clark, M. Pearson, B. Johnson,
A. VanderBeek, J. Partridge

Absent: Councillor T. Whitehead - Personal

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. **2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process (FCS20087) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)**

(Pearson/VanderBeek)

- (d) *That the Hamilton Police Services Board, Hamilton Library Board, Conservation Authorities and Hamilton Beach Rescue Unit target a 2021 tax operating budget guideline, based on an increase of 0%; with any increase beyond that guideline to be provided, with an explanation, to the General Issues Committee for consideration;***

Result: Sub-section (d), As Amended, CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 5, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|-----------------------------------|
| No | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| No | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| No | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| No | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| No | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Absent | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |

Council – November 11, 2020

| | | | |
|--------|---|---------|---|
| Yes | - | Ward 12 | Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 | Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 | Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 | Councillor Judi Partridge |

(Eisenberger/Nann)

- (a) That staff be directed to prepare the 2021 Tax Operating Budget at an increase required to maintain current service levels and report back to the General Issues Committee through the 2021 budget process;

Result: Sub-section (a), CARRIED by a vote of 9 to 3, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| No | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Absent | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| No | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Absent | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| No | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

(Merulla/Partridge)

- (e) That staff be directed to prepare the 2021 Tax Capital Budget with a 0% tax increase for capital financing of discretionary block funded projects;

Result: Sub-section (a), CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 4, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|----------------------------------|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| No | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| No | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| No | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Absent | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| No | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |

| | | | |
|--------|---|---------|---|
| Absent | - | Ward 9 | Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 | Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 | Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 | Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 | Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 | Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 | Councillor Judi Partridge |

(Pearson/VanderBeek)

- (b) That staff be directed to increase user fees towards full cost recovery where it is reasonable to expect that users can afford to pay;
- (c) That for all other user fees, the fee be increased by a rate of 2.0% and that any user fee increases below the guideline be forwarded for consideration with appropriate explanation;
- (f) That staff be directed to prepare the 2021 Rate Supported Budget at a rate increase of 4.28%, in alignment with the long-term financing plan approved in principle; and,
- (g) That the City Clerk forward Report FCS20087, respecting the 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process, to local Members of Parliament, local Members of Provincial Parliament, the Federation of Canadian Municipalities, the Association of Municipalities Ontario and Ontario's Big City Mayors for the purposes of advocating senior levels of government for ongoing financial support related to COVID-19 pressures.

Result: Sub-sections (b), (c), (f) and (g) CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 1, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| No | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Absent | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Absent | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

2. 2019 Municipal Tax Competitiveness Study (FCS20029) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

(Collins/Pearson)

That Report FCS20029, respecting the 2019 Municipal Tax Competitiveness Study, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 0, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Absent | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Absent | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Yes | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Yes | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Absent | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 2)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following change to the agenda:

5. DELEGATION REQUESTS

- 5.1 Arwen Roussell, respecting Report FCS20087 - 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process (Item 7.1 on today's agenda.)

(Eisenberger/Pearson)

That the agenda for the October 29, 2020 General Issues Committee (Budget) meeting, be approved, as amended.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 0, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Absent | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Yes | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Yes | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Absent | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Yes | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Absent | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) COMMUNICATIONS (Item 4)

(i) Correspondence from the Lakewood Beach Community Council respecting the Recommendation to Increase the Rate Budget by 4.28% (Item 4.1)

(Farr/Pearson)

That the correspondence from the Lakewood Beach Community Council, respecting the Recommendation to Increase the Rate Budget by 4.28%, be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.1.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:

| | | |
|-----|---|----------------------------------|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Yes | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Yes | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Yes | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |

| | | | |
|--------|---|---------|---|
| Yes | - | Ward 10 | Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 | Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 | Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 | Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 | Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Absent | - | Ward 15 | Councillor Judi Partridge |

(d) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 5)

(i) Arwen Roussell, respecting Report FCS20087 - 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process (Item 5.1)

(Clark/Danko)

That the delegation request, submitted by Arwen Roussell, respecting Report FCS20087 - 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process, be approved to appear before the General Issues Committee on October 29, 2020.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Yes | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Yes | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Yes | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

(e) PUBLIC HEARINGS / DELEGATIONS (Item 6)

(i) Arwen Roussell, respecting Report FCS20087 - 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process (Item 6.1)

Mr. Arwen Roussell was not present when called upon, and subsequently sent an e-mail during the meeting to withdraw his request.

(f) STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 7)

(i) 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process (FCS20087) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)

Mike Zegarac, General Manager of Finance & Corporate Services, introduced Marc Desormeaux, Senior Economist - Scotiabank.

Mr. Desmoreaux, of Scotiabank, provided an economic update with the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, and answered questions of Committee.

(Clark/Wilson)

That the presentation, respecting an economic updated, provided by Marc Desormeaux, Senior Economist - Scotiabank, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Yes | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Yes | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Absent | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Yes | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

Mike Zegarac, General Manager of Finance & Corporate Services, provided a PowerPoint presentation respecting Report FCS20087, the 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process.

(Pearson/Merulla)

That the presentation, respecting Report FCS20087, the 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Absent | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Yes | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Absent | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Yes | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

(Pearson/VanderBeek)

That the General Issues Committee recess for one-half hour, returning at 1:20 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Yes | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Yes | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Yes | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Yes | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

The General Issues Committee reconvened at 1:20 p.m.

(Partridge/Eisenberger)

That sub-section (d) to Report FCS20087, respecting the 2021 Budget Guidelines, Outlook and Process, be deleted in its entirety and replaced with the following in lieu thereof:

~~(d) That City Council provides a 2021 Tax Operating Budget guideline as it relates to Boards and Agencies and that any increase beyond the guideline be forwarded for consideration with appropriate explanation;~~

(d) That the Hamilton Police Services Board, Hamilton Library Board, Conservation Authorities and Hamilton Beach Rescue Unit target a 2021 tax operating budget guideline, based on an increase of █%; with any increase beyond that guideline to be provided, with an explanation, to the General Issues Committee for consideration;

(Eisenberger/Pearson)

That the 2021 tax operating budget target guidelines, for the Hamilton Police Services Board, Hamilton Library Board, Conservation Authorities and Hamilton Beach Rescue Unit, be set at 2%, to read as follows:

(d) That the Hamilton Police Services Board, Hamilton Library Board, Conservation Authorities and Hamilton Beach Rescue Unit target a 2021 tax operating budget guideline, based on an increase of **2%**; with any increase beyond that guideline to be provided, with an explanation, to the General Issues Committee for consideration;

Result: Amendment DEFEATED by a vote of 5 to 6, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Yes | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| No | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| No | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Yes | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Absent | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Yes | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Absent | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| No | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Absent | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| No | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| No | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| No | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

(Partridge/Nann)

That the 2021 tax operating budget target guidelines, for the Hamilton Police Services Board, Hamilton Library Board, Conservation Authorities and Hamilton Beach Rescue Unit, be set at 0%, to read as follows:

- (d) That the Hamilton Police Services Board, Hamilton Library Board, Conservation Authorities and Hamilton Beach Rescue Unit target a 2021 tax operating budget guideline, based on an increase of **0%**; with any increase beyond that guideline to be provided, with an explanation, to the General Issues Committee for consideration;

Result: Amendment CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 3, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| No | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| No | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Absent | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Absent | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| No | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Absent | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Absent | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

For further disposition of this matter, please refer to Item 1.

(j) NOTICES OF MOTION (Item 10)

Councillor S. Merulla introduced the following Notice of Motion:

(i) Chedoke Creek Budgetary Plan (Item 10.1)

That staff be directed to develop the necessary budgetary plan to address the Chedoke Creek matter, once the investigation has concluded.

(k) **ADJOURNMENT (Item 13)**

(VanderBeek/Partridge)

That there being no further business, the General Issues Committee (Budget) be adjourned at 2:43 p.m.

Result: MOTION CARRIED by a vote of 10 to 0, as follows:

| | | |
|--------|---|---|
| Absent | - | Mayor Fred Eisenberger |
| Yes | - | Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson |
| Yes | - | Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr |
| Yes | - | Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann |
| Absent | - | Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla |
| Yes | - | Ward 5 Councillor Chad Collins |
| Absent | - | Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson |
| Yes | - | Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls |
| Yes | - | Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko |
| Absent | - | Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark |
| Yes | - | Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson |
| Absent | - | Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson |
| Yes | - | Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson, Deputy Mayor |
| Yes | - | Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek |
| Absent | - | Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead |
| Yes | - | Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge |

Respectfully submitted,

Deputy Mayor Lloyd Ferguson
Chair, General Issues Committee

Stephanie Paparella
Legislative Coordinator,
Office of the City Clerk