



City of Hamilton

PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT & RETENTION COMMITTEE AGENDA

Meeting #: 21-002
Date: June 29, 2021
Time: 3:30 p.m.
Location: Due to the COVID-19 and the Closure of City Hall

All electronic meetings can be viewed at:
 City's YouTube Channel:
<https://www.youtube.com/user/InsideCityofHamilton>

Tamara Bates, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 4102

	Pages
1. APPOINTMENT OF VICE-CHAIR	
2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA	
(Added Items, if applicable, will be noted with *)	
3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST	
4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING	
4.1. September 11, 2019	5
5. COMMUNICATIONS	
5.1. Resignation of Members	
5.1.a. Dr. Dennis DiValentino	11
Recommendation: To be received.	
5.1.b. Dr. Brittany Julian	13
Recommendation: To be received.	

5.2.	Appointment of New Member - Dr. Jason Profetto	15
	Recommendation: To be received.	
5.3.	Physician Recruitment and Retention Program Staff Resignation	17
	Recommendation: To be received.	
6.	DELEGATION REQUESTS	
7.	CONSENT ITEMS	
7.1.	Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee Minutes	
7.1.a.	May 23, 2018	19
7.1.b.	April 23, 2019	23
7.1.c.	October 7, 2019	27
7.1.d.	November 12, 2019	31
7.1.e.	February 25, 2020	35
7.2.	Appointment of a new physician practicing in Hamilton within five years of their graduation from residency	37
8.	PUBLIC HEARINGS / DELEGATIONS	
9.	STAFF PRESENTATIONS	
10.	DISCUSSION ITEMS	
10.1.	Key Performance Indicators and Physicians by Community Report	39
10.2.	Budget and Cash Flow Reports	43
10.3.	Revisions to Terms of Reference - Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee	47
10.4.	Physician Recruitment and Retention Program Review	53
11.	MOTIONS	
12.	NOTICES OF MOTION	

13. GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS**14. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL****14.1. Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee Closed Minutes**

Pursuant to Section 9.1, Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021 and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including City or a local board employees and labour relations or employee negotiations.

14.1.a. October 7, 2019

Pursuant to Section 9.1, Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021 and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including City or a local board employees and labour relations or employee negotiations.

14.1.b. November 12, 2019

Pursuant to Section 9.1, Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021 and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including City or a local board employees and labour relations or employee negotiations.

14.1.c. February 25, 2020

Pursuant to Section 9.1, Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021 and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including City or a local board employees and labour relations or employee negotiations.

14.2. Proposed Contract Revisions - Physician Recruitment Coordinator and Practice Advisor

Pursuant to Section 9.1, Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021 and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (b) and (d) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including City or a local board employees and labour relations or employee negotiations.

15. **ADJOURNMENT**



Hamilton

PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION STEERING COMMITTEE MINUTES 19-001

Wednesday, September 11, 2019

2:00 p.m.

**Room 192, Hamilton City Hall
71 Main Street West, Hamilton**

Present: Councillors T. Whitehead (Chair)
Dr. D. DiValentino (Vice-Chair), Councillor A. VanderBeek,
K. Loomis, Dr. B. Julian, Dr. S. Kinzie

**Absent
with Regrets:** Mayor F. Eisenberger – City Business, Councillor S. Merulla –
City Business

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO THE BOARD OF HEALTH FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. Appointment of Chair and Vice-Chair (Item 1)

(VanderBeek/Loomis)

- (a) That Councillor Whitehead be appointed as Chair of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee for the balance of the 2018-2022 term of Council; and
- (b) That Dr. DiValentino be appointed as Vice-Chair of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee for the balance of the 2018-2022 term of Council or until a successor is appointed by Council.

CARRIED

**2. Physician Recruitment and Retention Terms of Reference Review –
REVISED (Item 10.1)**

(VanderBeek/Loomis)

That the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee Terms of Reference, be received.

CARRIED

3. Key Performance Indicators, Current Statistics, Physicians by Community, and Conferences and Events (Item 10.2)

(VanderBeek/Loomis)

That the Key Performance Indicators, Current Statistics, Physicians by Community, and Conferences and Events summaries, be received.

CARRIED

4. Budget and Cash Flow (Item 10.3)

(Kinzie/DiValentino)

(a) That the Year 16 (2019) Budget for December 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019, be received; and,

(b) That the Cash Flow Statement for December 1, 2018 to November 30, 2019, be received;

CARRIED

5. Review of Position of Director, Physician Retention (Item 11.1)

(DiValentino/Kinzie)

that the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, the General Manager, Healthy and Safe Communities, and the Executive Director, Human Resources and Organizational Development, or their designates, be asked to participate in the meetings of the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee, as required, to review the position of Director, Physician Retention.

CARRIED

6. Funding Update (Item 13.1)

(Kinzie/DiValentino)

That Jane Walker, Councillor Whitehead, and Keanin Loomis meet with Rob Maclsaac, President and CEO, Hamilton Health Sciences, to discuss securing funding for the Physician Recruitment Program.

CARRIED

7. Contract Renewal (Item 14.1)

(Loomis/Kinzie)

(a) That Jane Walker's resignation from the position of Director, Physician Recruitment, effective November 22, 2019, be received; and,

(b) That the Terms and Conditions of Employment for the Director, Physician Recruitment contract between the Employee and the City of Hamilton and the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce, be received.

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 2)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following change to the agenda:

1. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 10)

10.2 Key Performance Indicators, Current Statistics, Physicians By Community, and Conferences and Events

Page two of the Conferences and Events Report was included in error and is being withdrawn.

(Loomis/VanderBeek)

That the agenda for the September 11, 2019 meeting of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) June 22, 2018 (Item 4.1)

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the Minutes of the June 22, 2018 meeting of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

(ii) Clerk's Report – May 29, 2019 (Item 4.2)

(VanderBeek/Kinzie)

That the Clerk's Report – May 29, 2019 be received, as presented.

CARRIED

(d) REVIEW OF POSITION OF DIRECTOR, PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT (Item 11.1)

(DiValentino/Kinzie)

That the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee meet to:

- (a) begin work to fill the position of Director, Physician Recruitment as soon as possible, including, but not limited to, examining the logistics of the hiring process, exploring the possibility of converting the position to a permanent position, and taking into consideration the realities and challenges associated with the role; and,
- (b) to discuss the position of the Physician Recruitment Coordinator and the realities and challenges associated with converting the position into a long-term contract or permanent position.

For further disposition of this matter, please refer to Item 5.

(e) GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 13)

(i) Funding Update (Item 13.1)

Jane Walker, Director, Physician Recruitment, addressed the Committee respecting updates to funding sources.

(Kinzie/DiValentino)

That the Funding Update respecting funding opportunities for the Physician Recruitment program, be received.

CARRIED

(f) PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL (Item 14)

(i) Contract Renewal (Item 14.1)

The Committee determined that discussion of Item 14.1, respecting the Contract Renewal for a Director, Physician Recruitment was not required, as the Director of Physician Recruitment has submitted her resignation, so the matter was addressed in Open Session.

For further disposition of this matter, please refer to Item 7.

(g) ADJOURNMENT (Item 15)

(Loomis/DiValentino)

That there being no further business, the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee meeting be adjourned at 3:12 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully Submitted,

Councillor Whitehead, Chair
Physician Recruitment and
Retention Steering Committee

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk

From:
To: [Bates, Tamara](#)
Cc: info@hamiltondoctors.ca
Subject: RE: Hamilton Academy of Physicians Representative on Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee (City of Hamilton) - URGENT
Date: December 16, 2020 11:34:07 AM

Good morning, Tamara,

Thank you for reaching out. I confirm that Dr. Dennis DiValentino is no longer a formal representative for the Hamilton Academy of Medicine as his term has ended. I will bring this to our next Executive Committee meeting and hope to find a replacement for Dr. DiValentino.

From: Brittany J
To: [Bates, Tamara](#)
Subject: Re: Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee
Date: April 15, 2021 3:03:54 PM

Hi Tamara

Sending you an update - I was able to find a physician to take over my practice so I will be moving back to Nova Scotia due to family reasons. A very difficult decision as I love my practice and the Hamilton community (but family comes first). Therefore, I am unfortunately resigning from the Steering Committee effective May 31, 2021.

Thank you

Dr. Brittany Julian

|

From:
To: [Bates, Tamara: "Jason Profetto"](#)
Subject: Hamilton Academy of Physicians Representative on Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee
(City of Hamilton)
Date: April 29, 2021 7:40:14 AM

Good Morning, Tamara,

I'd like to introduce you to Dr. Jason Profetto, the new HAM rep. for the physician recruitment and retention steering committee.

Take care,

Jessica

Jessica Wooder, MCM
Executive Director
Hamilton Academy of Medicine

5.3

March 26, 2021

Mr. Keanin Loomis
President & CEO, Hamilton Chamber of Commerce

Dear Mr. Loomis,

Please accept this letter as my notice of resignation from my position as Physician Recruitment Coordinator at Hamilton Physicians. As per my contract, I am providing Hamilton Physicians with three weeks' written notice. My last day of work in the office will be Friday, April 9, and I would like to use my accumulated vacation time for the week of April 12 – 16th.

I'd like to thank the Physician Recruitment & Retention Committee for the opportunity to work in this position with Hamilton Physicians for the last three years. It has been a pleasure getting to know many of the physicians in the community, and I'm very appreciative of the experience I've gained through my time here.

Please let me know how I can be of assistance in this transition.

Sincerely,

Julia Hayes



M I N U T E S

WORKING GROUP
OF THE
PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION STEERING COMMITTEE

Friday, May 25, 2018 at 10:00 a.m.
Hamilton City Hall – Councillors' Boardroom
71 Main Street West, Hamilton

Present: Councillor T. Whitehead (Chair), Mr. Keanin Loomis, Dr. Dennis DiValentino and Dr. Sarah Kinzie

Absent: None

Also Present: Jane Walker, Director, Physician Recruitment & Retention and Julia Hayes, Physician Recruitment Coordinator.

1. Management Committee Agenda

1.1. Agenda for May 25, 2018 and minutes of May 30, 2017.

The agenda was submitted for the working group's approval. K. Loomis/D. DiValentino moved and seconded the acceptance of the agenda and the May 30, 2017 minutes. Approved.

1.2. The committee welcomes Julia Hayes, the new physician recruitment coordinator who started April 16, 2018.

2. KPI Report (Key Performance Indicators)

2.1. Quarterly Report

Recruiting in the suburbs or any area outside of the core continues to be challenging as new physicians are not able to set up practices in the payment model that they were trained in. A short speech was delivered at the Economic Summit on April 13, 2018 requesting the Ministry (MOHLTC) to approve FHOs in all of Hamilton. Discussions have been held with the LHIN however to date no new FHOs have been approved.

J. Walker noted that 2017 saw 26 new recruits (18 permanent and 8 locum) but 26 family physicians left Hamilton so we saw our total number of physicians stay static at 342. Recruiting continues to be a competitive environment with demand for physicians often exceeding supply, experienced throughout the country except for the GTA.



We've had a good start to 2018, 13% of our workforce age 65+ (46), which has come down only slightly from last year. On to good news – almost 25% fully one-quarter of our physicians are under 40 – a huge improvement from 2007 when only 1 in 10 were under 40.

Overall, we should have 389 family physicians and with around 312 permanent physicians, we have a shortage of 77. To cope with an increasing population and to ensure a vibrant economy, more family physicians are needed. J. Walker expects approximately 25 family physicians to leave in 2018.

2.2. Current Statistics

2017 saw our overall number of physicians stay static as we recruited as many physicians who left.

Requested info from last meeting for 2017:

- the number (25) and percent (7%) of physicians who are locums;
- Male (162) vs. females (180);
- the % of McMaster graduates we attract (of 35 graduates in 2017, 26 are McMaster grads that I've met or spoken with. 10 have committed to locum in practices here - 38%)

In 2018, we're at 343 physicians, but one-quarter are now under 40. Shortages still loom as older physicians retire and population grows.

J. Walker also presented a graph of the family physicians ages over the last 8 years.

2.3. KPI Summary

26 new recruits in 2017 (18 permanent and 8 locum) and 10 (7 perm and 3 locum) so far in 2018. There are many retirements upcoming. Expect 25 total by end of year.

2.4. Physicians by Community

26 new recruits in 2017 (18 permanent and 8 locum) and 10 (7 perm and 3 locum) so far in 2018. Updated stats on the number of physicians in each of the six communities making up Hamilton were provided as requested at the last meeting.

Move to accept all the KPI by K. Loomis/D. DiValentino. Approved.

3. Budget and Cashflow Year 14 2017

3.1. 2017 Cash Flow - Final

Final numbers presented.

3.2. 2017 Budget to Actual Comparison - Final

Final numbers are in. The program spent \$63,219 less than budgeted in 2017 almost entirely in savings for support staff.

3.3. 2018 Cash Flow

The program has spent \$33,229 to the end of February.

3.4. 2018 Budget to Actual Comparison

The program has spent \$33,229 to the end of February, \$17,719 less than budgeted.



4. Conference, Event and Presentation Report for 2017 and 2018.

A brief review of the conferences and presentations was given.

5. Other Business

5.1. Board of Health

5.1.1. Motion from May 21, 2015 (letter attached for review/adjustment)

5.1.2. Motion from September 19, 2016

The letter sent to MOHLTC was re-visited given the upcoming election. Revisit the motion at the June Steering Committee meeting.

5.2. Funding

J. Walker reported that funding commitment is over for HHS, St. Joseph's Healthcare, HFHT and McMaster Faculty of Health Sciences. Clr. Whitehead wants JW to recheck, and send him an email. Done. Dr. Kinzie to speak with DFM about renewed funding of \$15,000 (in two installments of \$7,500 each). Dr. DiValentino reported that he has had discussions with HAM and tentatively may be able to commit funds if needed.

5.3. New Space

Clr. Whitehead made a motion at council requesting space for the PR&R program at Public Health but they indicated they only have cubicle space not an office which is unsuitable for the private and confidential recruitment work. The City is in discussions with McMaster University about assuming more space at DBHSC. Dr. Kinzie to revisit space at DFM perhaps at the Inch Lab. The HFHT has offered space although there are concerns that older physicians may not be interested in meeting to discuss retirement plans where others will see them, eroding ability to ensure confidentiality. The HAM is discussing new space options too.

5.4. Other Business

K. Loomis wants to ensure that the accounting and ending balance in the program is correct. He'd like to be assured that there are internal checks. Clr. Whitehead said that City accounting has been involved with the program since its inception preparing cash flow statements, processing expenses and providing advice on the process. Clr. Whitehead to investigate if Charles Brown at the City is involved with the auditing of the program as it should have been included with other audits of City programs and what, if any, steps are required. Done.

6. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 11:00 a.m.



M I N U T E S
WORKING GROUP
OF THE
PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION STEERING COMMITTEE

Tuesday, April 23, 2019 at 2:30 p.m.
DBHSC
100 Main Street West, Hamilton

Present: Dr. Dennis DiValentino and Dr. Sarah Kinzie

Absent: Councillor T. Whitehead (Chair), Mr. Keanin Loomis

Also Present: Jane Walker, Director, Physician Recruitment & Retention and Julia Hayes, Physician Recruitment Coordinator.

Quorum was not achieved, but the members decided to move ahead with discussion of the items without voting.

1. Management Committee Agenda

1.1. Agenda for April 23, 2019 and minutes of May 23, 2018.

The agenda was reviewed.

2. KPI Report (Key Performance Indicators)

2.1. Annual Report

J. Walker noted that 2018 was a successful year in that 25 family physicians were recruited to Hamilton (17 Permanent and 8 locums). However, with 28 physicians leaving practice (half retired, half moved to other communities), we saw a net drain of 3 physicians and ended the year with 343 family physicians.

A move to the new DBHSC at the end of January 2019 to be closer to residents and to physicians has worked out well (J. Walker worked out a two year contract with DFM and Dr. O'Byrne of Faculty of Health Sciences) and an increase in the number of meetings with residents has already been noted. Two to three requests are coming in weekly by McMaster DFM residents to review contracts for those not staying in Hamilton, adding to our work load but offering a significant benefit to McMaster residents as nothing like this is offered at any other Ontario university.



Many thanks to the Hamilton Academy of Medicine for supporting the program with office space since 2004. J. Walker continues to check-in with the Academy to ensure the program is kept up-to-date with new developments.

Several themes continue to play out with recruitment and retention:

1. Retiring physicians in Hamilton continue to sell their practices while physicians in Niagara and Brantford Regions can take over a practice for free. Prices have decreased in Burlington as a result of increased competition for family physicians.
2. Recruiting in the suburbs or any area outside of the core continues to be challenging as new physicians are not able to set up practices in the payment model (FHO or FHO-FHT) that they were trained in. (Only some of the lower City is designated as high needs by MOHLTC and thus new graduates are eligible to join FHOs. None of the suburbs or upper areas of Hamilton are designated high needs.)
3. Follow-up to a letter sent to then Minister of Health Hoskins (October 13, 2017) was re-sent to Minister Elliott (September 24, 2018). A reply was received by the City November 6, 2018 stating that the Ministry collaborates with the LHIN to determine areas of high need. While J. Walker has had numerous and on-going discussions with Dr. J. Everson at the LHIN surrounding this issue, to date, no new postal codes have been added.
4. Recruiting continues to be a competitive environment with new grads receiving multiple offers of positions.
5. New graduates from Canadian medical schools continue to seek positions in group FHO-FHTs and are less likely to choose solo practices. Of the 17 new permanent physicians in 2018, 6 were solo practices none of which were taken by Canadian graduates. We are very thankful to the IMGs (international medical graduates) who took over these practices. 33% of all practices in Hamilton are solo practices, which disproportionately represent older practices.
6. Currently, 13% of our workforce is 65+ so many retirements are expected over the next few years. However, almost 30% of our workforce is under 40, a huge improvement from 2007 when only 1 in 10 were under 40.

With 389 family physicians needed in our City and 311 permanent physicians practicing, we still have a shortage of 78, primarily on the mountain and in the suburbs. The lower part of the City is still by and large well served. J. Walker expects a minimum of 20 family physicians to leave in 2019.

2.2. Current Statistics

2018 saw our overall number of physicians decline slightly as three more physicians left than started. There has been a steady improvement in the overall distribution of ages of physicians since inception of the program. Given that 45 family physicians over age 65 are still practicing, we can expect many more retirements over the next several years.

2.3. KPI Summary

25 new recruits in 2018 (17 permanent and 8 locum) and 8 (6 perm and 2 locum) so far in 2019. There are many retirements upcoming, with approximately 20 expected by the end of the year.



2.4. **Physicians by Community**

Updated stats on the number of physicians in each of the six communities making up Hamilton were provided. Ancaster, Flamborough, Glanbrook, Hamilton Mountain and Stoney Creek all continue to experience a shortage of family physicians (78 total).

3. **Budget and Cashflow Year 15 2018**

3.1. **2018 Cash Flow - Final**

Final numbers presented.

3.2. **2017 Budget to Actual Comparison - Final**

Final numbers are in. The program spent \$43,630 less than budgeted in 2018 almost entirely in savings for support staff.

3.3. **2019 Cash Flow**

The program has spent \$66,337 to the end of February.

3.4. **2019 Budget to Actual Comparison**

The program has spent \$66,337 to the end of February, \$3,500 less than budgeted.

4. **Conference, Event and Presentation Report for 2019.**

A brief review of the conferences and presentations expected in 2019 was provided.

5. **Other Business**

5.1. **Funding**

J. Walker reported that she obtained funding from HHS and McMaster for 2018. She also obtained funding from St. Joseph's for 2019. Requests to the Hamilton FHT will be made shortly. S. Kinzie to investigate funding from DFM.

5.2. **New Space**

J. Walker and J. Hayes moved into their new office space in DBHSC in late January 2019. A revamping of office furniture will be necessary to facilitate productivity and ergonomics.

5.3. **Contract**

J. Walker noted her contract expires November 23, 2019. Discussion by S. Kinzie and D. DiValentino about the importance of recruitment to the local economy. D. DiValentino stressed the need to have the program exist indefinitely given the number of retirements upcoming over the next several years. He recommends that J. Walker and J. Hayes be permanent employees with the City of Hamilton and not contract employees in recognition of the importance of medical care of its' citizens and to the broader economy.

5.4. **Other Business:**

5.4.1. **Board of Health: Response to Letter from September 24, 2018 to Honourable Christine Elliott, Minister of Health**

The Mayor of the City of Hamilton sent a letter to the Honourable Christine Elliott on September 24, 2018 regarding the entry of new physicians into FHOs. A response by MOHLTC received November 6, 2018 suggested that we contact the LHINs should changes in the high needs area be warranted. While the LHINs have been contacted many times in the past, because of restructuring at the LHIN, a discussion to hold off



on contacting the LHIN again regarding the designation until news or announcements are made as to the LHINs role was held.

5.4.2. Resident Engagement

S. Kinzie requested that J. Walker track contributions made to DFM residents, especially those not intending to stay in Hamilton to ensure equity of funding contribution. Are there standard questions that residents ask that can be packaged for an educational piece for them for instance? S. Kinzie is on a national committee developing e-modules to improve practice management education of residents.

5.4.3. HFAM

A new family medicine organization has been formed by Dr. Tammy Packer, Chief HHS and St. Joseph's to represent all family physicians in Hamilton. D. DiValentino is on the board along with 8 or so colleagues including academic and community. The purpose is the re-engage physicians and those working in the hospitals especially in regards to transitional care and as they look toward the formation of Ontario Health Teams.

6. Adjournment

The discussion ended at 3:30 p.m.

7.1(c)



**WORKING GROUP
OF THE
PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION STEERING COMMITTEE
MINUTES 19-002**

Monday, October 7, 2019 at 1:00 p.m.
Room 222, 2nd Floor
Hamilton City Hall
71 Main Street West, Hamilton

Present: Dr. Dennis DiValentino (Vice-Chair), Mr. Keanin Loomis, and Dr. Sarah Kinzie

Absent with Regrets: Councillor T. Whitehead (Chair) - Personal

Also Present: Lora Fontana, Executive Director, Human Resources and Organizational Development
Paul Johnson, General Manager, Healthy and Safe Communities
Karen Leslie, Acting Manager, Finance and Administration
Dr. Elizabeth Richardson, Medical Officer of Health
Mike Zegarac, General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services
Tamara Bates, Legislative Coordinator
Jane Walker, Director, Physician Recruitment & Retention

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 2)

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the agenda for the October 7, 2019 meeting, be approved.

CARRIED

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

4.1 May 23, 2019

(Kinzie/Loomis)

That the minutes of the May 23, 2018, be approved.

CARRIED

4.2 April 23, 2019

(Kinzie/Loomis)

That the minutes of the April 23, 2019, be received.

CARRIED

4. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 10)

(i) Physician Recruitment and Retention Program and Staff (Item 10.1)

- (a) Physician Recruitment and Retention Program and Staff (Item 10.1(a))
- (b) Physician Recruitment Coordinator Job Description (Item 10.1(b))

(ii) Comparators for Position of Director, Physician Recruitment (Item 10.2)

- (a) Recruiter Position Comparators (Item 10.2(a))
- (b) Job Descriptions from other Municipalities (10.2(b))
 - 1. Halton (Item 10.2(b)(a))
 - 2. Niagara (Item 10.2(b)(b))

The Working Group discussed these items together.

Jane Walker provided the Working Group with an updated version of the information respecting the responsibilities and necessary skillset for the position of Director, Physician Recruitment.

Members discussed stewardship of the program and of information gathered to assist the program staff.

The Director, Physician Recruitment is paid by the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce, but the payroll is funded by the City of Hamilton annually through capital funding. The program is operated through the partnership of the City, the Chamber of Commerce, and the Hamilton Academy of Medicine. The terms of the partnership are closely linked to the terms of the Director's contract, such that the partnership is renewed along with the contract. It was emphasized that if the City were to adopt the program, and the position, Human Resources would have to advise Council on details of the partnership as a whole and specifically related to partnership commitments, budget, and so on. It was noted that historically, the hospitals have been willing to enter into multi-year contracts, but are becoming increasingly reticent to make capital commitments further than they can forecast.

Members heard that the position is very much self-directed, and should continue to be so, but some increased oversight is needed. A discussion will be needed to determine whether the position would still be able to function as it has been to date if it had to follow all the rules and regulations required by the City. It was noted that the needs of the position (and by extension of the program) and the requirements of the City, might not be conducive to a good fit. Some physician recruitment roles are not within the municipality, because the municipality may not be the best place for that position.

Members heard that there have been a number of discussions over the years about the Director, Physician Recruitment position becoming a position within the City. At the time the program was started, it was felt that physician recruitment was primarily a concern of the Chamber of Commerce.

It was suggested that the Family Health Team may be an appropriate place for the position to be housed in the future, but today the Family Health Team represents approximately 60 of Hamilton's 300 doctors. Other partnerships can and should be explored. The introduction of the Ontario Health Team must also be considered.

Members discussed the need to fill the Director, Physician Recruitment in the short term. As it stands, the program will be unstaffed by mid December 2019 for a one-year period. It was estimated that it would take approximately six months to train a new person to take on the role. At the suggestion of hiring an agency to fill the recruitment role in the short term, members heard that this could be possible, but it is anticipated that it would be very difficult to find an agency that has this capacity. Members heard that there may be some private firms that could assist in short term, but they would have a very different focus than what is required for the position.

In response to questions related to leaving the position vacant for the year, members heard that the danger is losing the relationship building aspect of the role, meaning there will not be an opportunity to build relationships with new graduates. The ability to keep track of who is retiring and where the holes will be as a result will also be hampered if the role is left vacant. A large number of physicians are retiring in 2020 and those would be lost and the City would fall below its quota if the recruitment position were to remain vacant for the next year.

The members agreed that there is not enough time to make any changes to the position; it would take some time to evaluate the pros and cons of bringing the position into the City, to identify any new partners, and to

implement any changes. The focus right now must be on filling the role in the short term.

It was suggested that the best way to find a suitable replacement in the short term would be to use the available networks to identify someone who has the appropriate qualifications.

Members asked Jane to put together some information about the immediate, short-term needs of the program to bring to the next meeting. Jane can also make inquiries within her network to identify potential candidates.

5. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee move into Closed Session to discuss Item 10.1(a), pursuant to Section 8.1, Sub-section (b) of the City's Procedural By-law 18-270, and Section 239(2), Sub-section (b) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including municipal or local board employees.

CARRIED

6. ADJOURNMENT

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That there being no other business, the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee, be adjourned at 2:38 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. Dennis DiValentino
Vice-Chair, Working Group of the Physician
Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk

7.1(d)



**WORKING GROUP
OF THE
PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION STEERING COMMITTEE
MINUTES 19-003**

Tuesday, November 12, 2019 at 2:00 p.m.
Room 222, 2nd Floor
Hamilton City Hall
71 Main Street West, Hamilton

Present: Councillor T. Whitehead (Chair), Mr. Keanin Loomis, and Dr. Sarah Kinzie

Absent with Regrets: Dr. Dennis DiValentino (Vice-Chair), - Personal

Also Present: Lora Fontana, Executive Director, Human Resources and Organizational Development
Paul Johnson, General Manager, Healthy and Safe Communities
Karen Leslie, Acting Manager, Finance and Administration
Tamara Bates, Legislative Coordinator
Jane Walker, Director, Physician Recruitment and Retention

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 1)

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the agenda for the October 7, 2019 meeting, be approved.

CARRIED

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 2)

2.1 October 7, 2019

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the minutes of October 7, 2019, be approved.

CARRIED

3. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 3)

3.1 Update on Short Term Needs and Proposed Transition Plan

3.2 Physician Recruitment Coordinator Job Description

These items were discussed together.

**Working Group of the Physician Recruitment
and Retention Steering Committee
Minutes 19-003**

**November 12, 2019
Page 2**

Members were provided with an overview of the short-term needs of the program, which include providing advice to residents, assisting physicians with locums, as well as attending some upcoming conferences.

In response to questions, the Working Group heard that there are two organizations in Ontario that provide recruitment services for physicians. MDSearch were slow in responding to enquiries; their services are very expensive and do not include follow up after introduction.

Members were reminded of the discussion at the last meeting surrounding the issues related to the Director, Physician Recruitment and Retention becoming a position within the City of Hamilton. It was noted that the concerns are related more to time and fit than to money. It is necessary to ensure that the program can still function the way it needs to within the City, given the various policies and procedures that would need to be followed. The position may be more compatible with the Ontario Health Team.

Members agreed that there is a need to have both a short- and a long-term plan in place. It was suggested that in the immediate short term, someone could be employed to answer phones and keep the office running. Other members indicated that keeping the program working well would require someone with experience in the field.

Jane Walker reported that she has identified some individuals who may be good candidates who could fill the Physician Recruitment Coordinator role in the short term.

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee move into Closed Session at 2:31 p.m. to discuss Items 3.1-3.2 and 4.1-4.2, pursuant to Section 8.1, Sub-section (b) of the City's Procedural By-law 18-270, and Section 239(2), Sub-section (b) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including municipal or local board employees.

CARRIED

3. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 3) (CONTINUED)

- 3.1 Update on Short Term Needs and Proposed Transition Plan
- 3.2 Physician Recruitment Coordinator Job Description

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the Update on Short-Term Needs and Proposed Transition Plan, be received.

CARRIED

**Working Group of the Physician Recruitment
and Retention Steering Committee
Minutes 19-003**

**November 12, 2019
Page 3**

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the Physician Recruitment Coordinator Job Description, be received.

CARRIED

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the Executive Director, Human Resources, be directed to facilitate the hiring of a temporary Physician Recruitment Coordinator.

CARRIED

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the current Director, Physician Recruitment's contract be extended from November 23, 2019 to December 17, 2019 to provide consulting services during the temporary Physician Recruitment Coordinator's transition period.

CARRIED

4. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL (Item 4)

4.1 Closed Session Minutes of October 7, 2019

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the Closed Session minutes of October 7, 2019, be approved and remain confidential.

CARRIED

4.2 Prospective Candidates

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the information on Prospective Candidates, be received.

CARRIED

6. ADJOURNMENT

(Kinzie/Loomis)

That there being no other business, the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee, be adjourned at 3:18 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor Terry Whitehead
Chair, Working Group of the Physician
Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk

7.1(e)



**WORKING GROUP
OF THE
PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION STEERING COMMITTEE
MINUTES 20-001**

Tuesday, February 25, 2020 at 11:00 a.m.
Room 192, 1st Floor
Hamilton City Hall
71 Main Street West, Hamilton

Present: Councillor T. Whitehead (Chair), Mr. Keanin Loomis, and Dr. Sarah Kinzie

Absent with Regrets: Dr. Dennis DiValentino (Vice-Chair) - Personal

Also Present: Tamara Bates, Legislative Coordinator
Jane Walker, Director, Physician Recruitment and Retention

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 1)

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the agenda for the February 25, 2020 meeting, be approved.

CARRIED

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 2)

(i) November 19, 2019 (Item 2.1)

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the minutes of November 19, 2019, be approved.

CARRIED

(Loomis/Kinzie)

That the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee move into Closed Session at 11:15 a.m. to discuss Items 3.1 and 3.2, pursuant to Section 8.1, Sub-section (b) of the City's Procedural By-law 18-270, and Section 239(2), Sub-section (b) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including municipal or local board employees.

CARRIED

**Working Group of the Physician Recruitment
and Retention Steering Committee
Minutes 20-001**

**February 25, 2020
Page 2**

3. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL (Item 3)

(i) Closed Session Minutes of November 19, 2019 (Item 3.1)

(Kinzie/Loomis)

That the Closed Session minutes of November 19, 2019, be approved and remain confidential.

CARRIED

(ii) New Hire Letter of Offer/Contract (Item 3.2)

(Kinzie/Whitehead)

That the New Hire Letter of Offer/Contract, be approved and remain confidential.

CARRIED

4. ADJOURNMENT (Item 4)

(Kinzie/Loomis)

That there being no other business, the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee, be adjourned at 11:38 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor Terry Whitehead
Chair, Working Group of the Physician
Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk

From: brad.hamiltonphysicians.ca
To: [Bates, Tamara](#)
Subject: Candidate for Physician and Recruitment Steering Committee
Date: June 23, 2021 3:44:07 PM

Good Afternoon Members of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee,

In response to the upcoming vacancy related to Dr. Julian's departure, I am happy to announce that Dr. Brendan Singh has agreed to put his name forward for appointment to the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee.

Dr. Singh completed his Residency at McMaster in 2019, and will be taking over a FHO-FHT practice in East Hamilton (where he is currently practicing as a locum) this July. After having the pleasure of working closely with Brendan over the past year he was kind enough to express his interest in participating on this Committee, and I think that his enthusiasm and attention to detail would be a great addition to our team!

I look forward to speaking with you all at our meeting next week, and thank you for your time.

Brad

[Brad van den Heuvel](#)
Recruitment Coordinator/Practice Advisor



David Braley Health Sciences Centre (DBHSC)
100 Main Street West
5th Floor, Room 5002/C
Hamilton ON L8P 1H6
Ph: 905-546-2424 ext.3542

[e-mail: brad@hamiltonphysicians.ca](mailto:brad@hamiltonphysicians.ca)
www.hamiltonphysicians.ca



KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

YEAR TO YEAR
to Nov 30, 2020

FAMILY PHYSICIANS						
Year	New Contacts	New Recruits	New Recruits Perm vs. Locum		Retained	Total Family Physicians
2005 - Year 2	37	17	Perm -	12	1	345
			Locum -	5		
2006 - Year 3	42	17	Perm -	13	5	341
			Locum -	4		
2007 - Year 4	79	19	Perm -	11	3	340
			Locum -	8		
2008 - Year 5	110	20	Perm -	12	1	331
			Locum -	8		
2009 - Year 6	97	18	Perm -	8	1	332
			Locum -	10		
2010 - Year 7	100	19	Perm -	12	1	345
			Locum -	7		
2011 - Year 8	141	26	Perm -	19	7	349
			Locum -	7		
2012 - Year 9	93	29	Perm -	22	7	365
			Locum -	7		
2013 - Year 10	82	24	Perm -	19	1	367
			Locum -	5		
2014 - Year 11	98	20	Perm -	15	17	352
			Locum -	5		
2015 - Year 12	122	24	Perm -	13	10	351
			Locum -	11		
2016 - Year 13	68	20	Perm -	14	24	346
			Locum -	6		
2017 - Year 14	46	27	Perm -	20	18	351
			Locum -	7		
2018 - Year 15	114	25	Perm -	17	25	348
			Locum -	8		
2019 - Year 16	88	31	Perm -	20	30	351
			Locum -	11		
2020 - Year 17	36	27	Perm -	12	11	358
			Locum -	15		
GRAND TOTAL	1353	363			162	

Total Permanent Family Physicians = 239

Total Locum Family Physicians = 124



Number of Physicians by Community				
as of January 12, 2021				
Community	Census 2016 Population	MOH doc:pop	Actual # of Permanent Physicians in Community	Shortage
Ancaster	40,560	29	20	9
Dundas	24,285	18	22	-4
Flamborough	42,655	31	21	10
Glanbrook	29,860	22	1	21
Hamilton	330,090	239	218	21
<i>Lower</i>	176,815	128	141	-13
<i>Upper</i>	153,275	111	77	34
Stoney Creek	69,470	50	41	9
Total	536,920	389	323	66

Prepared by Brad van den Heuvel
January 12, 2021

PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT & RETENTION PROGRAM
YEAR 17 (2020) BUDGET TO ACTUALS COMPARISON
For the Period December 1, 2019 to November 30, 2020

Updated - January 4, 2021

Includes Actuals up to Nov 30, 2020.

	Year 17 BUDGET	Year 17 ACTUALS	Year 17 VARIANCE (under)/over
	Dec 1/19 to Nov 30/20	Dec 1/19 to Nov 30/20	Dec 1/19 to Apr 30/20
Balance Carried Forward	\$ 373,090.98	\$ 373,090.98	\$ -
<u>Revenue</u>			
City of Hamilton	\$ 75,000.00	\$ 75,000.00	\$ -
McMaster University	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ -
St. Joseph's Healthcare	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 20,000.00
Hamilton Health Sciences	\$ 20,000.00	\$ -	\$ (20,000.00)
Dept of Family Medicine	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ -
Hamilton Family Health Team	\$ 25,000.00	\$ -	\$ (25,000.00)
	\$ 180,000.00	\$ 155,000.00	\$ (25,000.00)
<u>Operating Expenses</u>			
Wages & Benefits	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 147,351.00	\$ (2,649.00)
Office Expenses	\$ 7,673.00	\$ 6,990.26	\$ (682.74)
Printing / Communications	\$ 234.00	\$ 223.87	\$ (10.13)
Travel Expenses	\$ 1,705.00	\$ 260.98	\$ (1,444.02)
Promotional Items	\$ 527.00	\$ -	\$ (527.00)
Events /Meals/Functions	\$ 423.00	\$ -	\$ (423.00)
Community Visit Program	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Medical Conferences & Job Fairs	\$ 5,878.00	\$ 803.33	\$ (5,074.67)
Advertising / Public Relations	\$ 1,468.00	\$ 252.51	\$ (1,215.49)
	\$ 167,908.00	\$ 155,881.95	\$ (12,026.05)
Net - Funding Surplus (Shortfall)	\$ 385,182.98	\$ 372,209.03	\$ (12,973.95)

In-kind contributions

McMaster University Dept. of Family Medicine	\$ 5,000.00
Hamilton Chamber of Commerce	\$ 15,000.00
Total In-kind Contribution	\$ 20,000.00

Note

Expenses & revenues based on information received as of the date of update.

**PHYSICIAN RECRUITMENT & RETENTION PROGRAM
LTD CASH FLOW STATEMENT
For the Period December 1, 2019 to November 30, 2020**

Run Date: 31Dec2020

	Jun/04 - Nov/19 (actuals)	Dec-19 (actuals)	Jan-20 (actuals)	Feb-20 (actuals)	Mar-20 (actuals)	Apr-20 (actuals)	May-20 (actuals)	Jun-20 (actuals)	Jul-20 (actuals)	Aug-20 (actuals)	Sep-20 (actuals)	Oct-20 (actuals)	Nov-20 (actuals)	Total
BEGINNING BALANCE	-	\$ 373,091	\$ 351,132	\$ 341,848	\$ 333,939	\$ 321,324	\$ 354,178	\$ 340,298	\$ 330,837	\$ 302,750	\$ 290,352	\$ 307,803	\$ 295,752	373,091
REVENUE														
City of Hamilton	915,800.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	75,000.00	75,000.00
McMaster University - Cust# 102644	316,668.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	25,000.00	0.00	0.00	25,000.00
Department of Family Medicine - Cust# 107777	122,749.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	7,500.00	0.00	7,500.00	-7,500.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	7,500.00	15,000.00
Hamilton Health Sciences - Cust # 111058	418,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
St. Joseph's Hospital - Cust# 101131/104587	357,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	40,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	40,000.00
St.Peters Hospital	30,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Hamilton Community Foundation	5,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Hamilton Family Health Team - Cust# 114291	150,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Human Resource Development Canada	90,669.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Hamilton Physicians - Dec/15 overpayment	10,349.02	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Consulting	400.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
TOTAL REVENUES	2,416,635.02	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	47,500.00	0.00	7,500.00	-7,500.00	0.00	25,000.00	0.00	82,500.00	155,000.00
OPERATING EXPENSES														
Wages & Benefits	1,409,785.54	12,305.05	7,569.87	7,568.59	7,569.22	7,653.07	7,534.86	7,534.86	20,251.94	5,901.93	0.00	1,320.18	-660.09	84,549.48
Support Staff	346,513.33	9,185.99	1,535.67	-0.14	4,312.10	6,901.92	6,258.27	6,258.27	0.00	6,368.25	6,368.25	9,245.34	6,368.25	62,802.17
Office Expenses	82,067.31	377.68	178.08	340.90	503.08	91.58	65.03	3,135.04	270.57	50.88	377.72	1,350.88	248.82	6,990.26
Printing & Communications	29,557.15	0.00	0.00	0.00	223.87	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	223.87
Travel Costs	47,515.10	1.49	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	21.61	32.42	64.84	0.00	0.00	54.16	86.46	260.98
Promotional Packages	22,673.64	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Events, Functions & Meals	14,060.84	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Community Visit Program	1,109.45	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Medical Conferences & Job Fairs	66,970.99	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	803.33	0.00	0.00	803.33
Advertising/Public Relations	23,290.69	89.09	0.00	0.00	6.10	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	77.13	0.00	80.19	0.00	252.51
TOTAL OPERATING EXPENSES	2,043,544.04	21,959.30	9,283.62	7,909.35	12,614.37	14,646.57	13,879.77	16,960.59	20,587.35	12,398.19	7,549.30	12,050.75	6,043.44	155,882.61
ENDING BALANCE	373,090.98	351,131.68	341,848.06	333,938.71	321,324.34	354,177.77	340,298.00	330,837.41	302,750.06	290,351.86	307,802.56	295,751.81	372,208.37	372,208.37

*NOTE: Physician Recruitment & Retention Program holds \$10,000 as a float provided by the City of Hamilton (Acct: 11515-000100)

-372,209.84
(1.47)

NOTE: Pending Invoices	0	-
Total:	-	-



Terms of Reference
(Updated ~~December 19, 2018~~, 2021)

10.3

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 18 pt, Bold

Formatted: Right

Official Name:

Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee

Purpose:

The Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee was formed in 2002 to address the critical shortage of family physicians in the City of Hamilton. The economic well-being of the city is intricately linked with the health of its people and this committee recognizes that family physicians are one of the cornerstones of the health care system. The first Physician Recruitment Specialist was hired November 23, 2004 to develop and implement the strategic plan.

Formatted: Font: Italic

The Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee reports through the Board of Health.

Formatted: Font: Italic

Formatted: Font: Italic

Members/Composition:

1. A representative from the Hamilton Academy of Medicine (preferably a family physician)
2. A representative from the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce
3. ~~4.~~ ~~Two~~ ~~Three~~ City of Hamilton Councillors
- ~~54.~~ A representative from the Department of Family Medicine, McMaster University
- ~~65.~~ A new physician practicing in Hamilton within five years of their graduation from residency.

Formatted: Font: Italic

Formatted: Font: Italic

Formatted: Font: Italic

Formatted: Font: Italic

~~*One member of the Steering Committee is chosen to be Chair and one Vice-Chair. These two individuals should sit on the Working Group.*~~

Formatted: Font: Italic, Strikethrough

A Chair and Vice-Chair of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee shall be elected for the Term of Council (4 years) or until such time as a successor is appointed.

Formatted: Font: Italic

The Chair and Vice-Chair of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee may be members of the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Steering Committee.

10.3

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 18 pt, Bold

Formatted: Right

Term of Membership:

The City of Hamilton Councillors will be appointed for the term of Council.

The representatives from the Hamilton Academy of Medicine; the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce; the Department of Medicine, McMaster University; and the new physician practicing in Hamilton within five years of their graduation from residency will be appointed for a minimum of two years, for a maximum of four years, with the Minimum of two years with members preferably retiring from the group-Physician Recruitment & Committee on a rotating basis to ensure continuity and to capture experience.

Formation Details:

To be updated annually.

To be accessible, to review and to provide support and guidance to the Director, Physician Recruitment Specialist on issues including performance, budget, funding, conferences/events, contracts, economic climate, Ministry and OMA policies, and local factors influencing and challenging physician recruitment.

Deliverables:

To put forward reports and make recommendations to the Board of Health.

Resources and Budget:

In ~~2017~~2021, revenue is ~~\$190,000~~\$180,000 with an annual expense budget of

Governance:

Quorum is 4 out of ~~6-7~~ members. ~~-Voting for acceptance of minutes, budgets, reports.~~

Communications Support:

Meetings are held in-person at City Hall at the Call of the Chair, and the City Clerk's Division will provide legislative support and be responsible for the administrative costs of operating the Committee meetings, and organized by the current Legislative Coordinator. ~~Meetings are organized at least one month in advance with materials for the meeting distributed two weeks prior.~~

Relationship with Working Group

The Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee is responsible for providing the overall direction for the Physician Recruitment & Retention Program.

10.3

The *Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee* are updated by the Working Group *of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee*.

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 18 pt, Bold

Formatted: Right

10.3

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 18 pt, Bold

Formatted: Right

Terms of Reference
(Updated _____, 2021)

Official Name:

**Working Group of the Physician Recruitment
& Retention Steering Committee**

PurposeMandate:

The Working Group *of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee* was formed to provide the operational support for the *Physician Recruitment & Retention programProgram*.

Members/Composition:

~~From the~~*The Working Group of the* Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering ~~be comprised of;~~ four *voting* members *of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee, as follows;are chosen, to include: one City councillor and*

- 1. the representative from the Hamilton Academy of Medicine;*
- 2. the representative from the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce;*
- 3. one City of Hamilton Councillor; and*
- 4. the representative from the Department of Family Medicine, McMaster University.*

Term of Membership:

~~Minimum of two years. Preferably members retire from the group on a rotating basis to~~
~~The City of Hamilton Councillor will be appointed for the term of Council.~~

The representatives from the Hamilton Academy of Medicine; the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce and the Department of Family Medicine, McMaster University, will be appointed for a minimum term of two years with the members preferably retiring from the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee on a rotating basis to ensure continuity and to capture experience.

Formation Details:

To be updated twice annually at a time convenient for the members.

To be accessible, to review and to provide support and guidance to the *Director,* Physician Recruitment ~~Specialist~~ on issues including performance, budget, funding, conferences/events, contracts, economic climate, Ministry and OMA policies, and local factors influencing physician recruitment.

10.3

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 18 pt, Bold

Formatted: Right

To provide the operational details for implementation of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee.

~~To propose motions to be brought forward to the Steering Committee for discussion and~~
Deliverables:

To put forward updates, reports and recommendations to the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee on matters pertaining to physician recruitment.

Resources and Budget:

In ~~2016~~2021, revenue was ~~\$190,000~~\$180,000 with an annual expense budget of Director, Physician Recruitment & Retention is given permission for all expenses under \$5,000.

Expenses over ~~that amount~~\$5,000 are to be discussed and approved at a Working Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee meeting.

Governance:

Quorum is 3 ~~out of~~ the 4 members. ~~Voting is held for acceptance of minutes, budgets~~

CommunicationsSupport:

Meetings of the Working Group of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee will be ~~are~~ held in-person at the call of the Chair, with staff of the Physician Recruitment and Retention Office providing legislative support. ~~and organized by the PR&R office typically via email.~~

~~If meetings are to be held at City Hall, the~~ City Councillors staff are responsible for are held at City Hall.

~~Meetings are organized at least one month in advance. Special meetings of the Steering Committee will be called should~~ Should a situations arise ~~requiring that Group's more~~ immediate attention, ~~information or requests are made via phone conference or other means with a quorum present. As much as possible, issues are brought to the attention of the Working Group at an in-person meeting.~~

Relationship with Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee

The Working Group of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Steering Committee brings forward information on an as required basis or on an annual basis ~~a yearly basis unless needed more often.~~

10.3

~~Prepared by Jane Walker August 18, 2017. Amended September 12, 2017 by the~~

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 18 pt, Bold

Formatted: Right

10.4

Proposed options for Hamilton Physicians Program Structure Prepared by Brad van den Heuvel & Julia Hayes

In 2020, Jane Walker retired from her position as Director of Physician Recruitment & Retention, and Julia Hayes left her position as Physician Recruitment Coordinator for a one-year maternity leave. In March 2020, Brad van den Heuvel was hired as the Physician Recruitment Coordinator & Practice Advisor to cover the duties of the Recruitment Coordinator, as well as take on the operational duties of the program following the departure of the Director.

As employment contracts for both Brad and Julia are currently up for renewal, the Working Group needs to determine the future structure of the Physician Recruitment & Retention Program. The following options have been put together for consideration by the Working Group.

Option 1: Two Recruitment Specialists (4 Days/week each) - Recommended

The Recruitment Specialists would work collaboratively to share operational oversight of the program and responsibility for providing updates to the Working Group/Steering Committee. They would share responsibility for presentations to stakeholders, requests for funding, and physician recruitment and retention efforts. Both Recruitment Specialists would report to the Working Group.

Pros:

1. Potential to maintain current staff, which will retain existing knowledge and experience
2. Reduced cost as compared to option 2 (salary open to negotiation)
3. Allows for greater program flexibility (i.e. signing authority, attendance at presentations/recruitment events is not limited to one person's schedule)
4. Sustainable workload - It was previously determined that 2 staff providing a total of 8 days per week is required to meet the operational demands of the program

Cons:

1. Lacks a single point of accountability for program oversight
2. Change from the way the program previously operated and as a result, an adjustment to some processes would be required

Option 2: Director & Recruitment Coordinator (4 days/week each)

This option aligns with how program was structured prior to Jane's departure. The Director oversees all program operations and funding, and provides updates to the Working Group/Steering Committee. The Director is responsible for presentations to stakeholders and leads physician recruitment and retention. The Recruitment Coordinator provides support to the Director and also supports recruitment and retention efforts. The Director reports to the Working Group/Committee, and the Recruitment Coordinator reports to the Director.

Pros:

1. Aligns with the previous structure of the program
2. Maintains a single point of accountability for program oversight
3. The Director sets the long-term strategic direction of the program

Cons:

1. Cost to program: The salary for the Director, based on comparators in other jurisdictions, would account for a large portion of the annual budget, leaving little to no funding for the Coordinator position and operational expenses without an increase to funding or running a deficit.
2. Administrative workload: Hiring a new Director would require members from the Working Group to draft & post the advertisement publicly, as well as source and interview potential candidates. There would also be costs associated with the hiring process (i.e. job advertisements) and the new Director would require training while being integrated into the program.
3. Potential loss of knowledge and experience – This option would result in the loss of at least one member of existing staff and the knowledge and connections that they have built in the community.

Option 3: One Recruitment Specialist and One Recruitment Coordinator (4 days/week each)

The Recruitment Specialist handles operational oversight of the program and responsibility for providing updates to the Working Group/Steering Committee as well as presentations to stakeholders, in addition to supporting recruitment and retention efforts. The Recruitment Coordinator provides support to the Recruitment Specialist and also supports recruitment and retention efforts. The Recruitment Specialist and Recruitment Coordinator both report to the Working Group.

Pros:

1. Reduced cost compared to other options, although the Recruitment Specialist would require increased compensation due to additional responsibilities and duties
2. Sustainable workload
3. Maintains single point of accountability for program oversight
4. Similar structure to program prior to Jane's departure (with slightly different title and duties). Allows Recruitment Specialist to gain experience in a role similar to that of a Director prior to transitioning

Cons:

1. The Recruitment Specialist manages the day-to-day operations of the program and short-term direction, but not the long-term strategic direction. The Specialist may eventually wish to transfer into Director role due to similarities, which would result in an increased cost to the program
2. Less flexibility (i.e. if Recruitment Specialist is on vacation, presentations cannot be booked and expenses cannot be submitted)