

City of Hamilton GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE ADDENDUM

Meeting #: 21-017

Date: September 8, 2021

Time: 9:30 a.m.

Location: Due to the COVID-19 and the Closure of City

Hall (CC)

All electronic meetings can be viewed at:

City's Website:

https://www.hamilton.ca/councilcommittee/council-committeemeetings/meetings-and-agendas

City's YouTube Channel:

https://www.youtube.com/user/InsideCityofHa

milton or Cable 14

Stephanie Paparella, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 3993

5. COMMUNICATIONS

*5.1. Correspondence respecting Item 8.1 - Hamilton Light Rail Transit (LRT) Project Memorandum of Understanding (PED21176/CM21012/LS21034)

Recommendation: Be received and referred to consideration of Item 8.1.

- *5.1.a. Keanin Loomis, President and CEO, Hamilton Chamber of Commerce
- *5.1.b. Gabriel Nicholson
- *5.2. Correspondence respecting Item 10.3 Hamilton Tax Increment Grant 540 King Street East, Hamilton (PED21140(a)/LS21033) (Ward 3)

Recommendation: Be received and referred to consideration of Item 10.3.

*5.2.a. ACORN Canada

6. DELEGATION REQUESTS

- *6.1. Respecting Item 8.1 Hamilton Light Rail Transit (LRT) Project Memorandum of Understanding (PED21176/CM21012/LS21034)
 - *6.1.a. Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton
 - *6.1.b. Karl Andrus, Hamilton Community Benefits Network
- *6.2. Respecting Item 10.3 Hamilton Tax Increment Grant 540 King Street East, Hamilton (PED21140(a)/LS21033) (Ward 3):
 - *6.2.a. Marie Alcaide Video Presentation
 - *6.2.b. Chris Martinez Video Presentation
 - *6.2.c. Paula Groves Video Presentation
 - *6.2.d. Elizabeth Ellis Video Presentation

10. DISCUSSION ITEMS

*10.4. Farmers' Markets - Rent Relief and Governance Comparators (PED21158) (City Wide)

(DEFERRED from the August 9, 2021 GIC)

13. GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS

- *13.1. Amendments to the Outstanding Business List
 - *13.1.a. Items to be removed:
 - *13.1.a.a. Assessing COVID Related Financial Impacts on LocalFarmers' Markets

(Addressed at the July 5, 2021 GIC as Item 7.2 - Report PED21141)

- *13.1.a.b. Feasibility of Creating a Technology Hub

 (Addressed at the August 9, 2021 GIC as Item 10.1 Report PED21109)
- *13.1.a.c. Farmers' Markets Rent Relief and Governance Comparators (Addressed on this agenda as Item 10.4 Report PED21158)

*13.1.a.d. Public and Stakeholder Consultation

(Addressed at the August 4, 2021 Special GIC as Item 8.1 - Report PED17010(I))

*13.1.a.e. Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) for the Hamilton Light Rail Transit Project

(Addressed as Item 8.1 on this agenda - Report PED21176/CM21012/LS21034)

- *13.1.a.f. Hamilton Tax Increment Grant 540 King Street East, Hamilton (Addressed on this agenda as Item 10.4 Report PED21140)
- *13.1.a.g. Hate Related Symbols

 (Addressed at the August 9, 2021 GIC as Item 8.2 Report CM19006(e))
- *13.1.b. Proposed New Due Dates:
 - *13.1.b.a. CityLab Pilot Update

Current Due Date: September 8, 2021

Proposed New Due Date: October 6, 2021

*13.1.b.b. Code of Conduct for Council-AppointedCitizen Members of External Boards and Agencies

Current Due Date: August 9, 2021

Proposed New Due Date: October 6, 2021

*13.1.b.c. Airport Employment Growth District (AEGD) Wastewater

Servicing Update and Capacity Allocation Policy

Current Due Date: September 8, 2021

Proposed New Due Date: November 3, 2021

*13.1.b.d. Synapse Life Sciences Consortium Funding Update

Current Due Date: September 8, 2021

Proposed New Due Date: October 20, 2021

*13.1.b.e. Protection of Privacy

Current Due Date: August 9, 2021

Proposed New Due Date: November 17, 2021

*13.1.b.f. Correspondence from Lisa Burnside, CAO, Hamilton Conservation Authority-Hamilton Conservation Authority Board of Directors resolution related to acquisition of lands owned by the City of Hamilton, 263 Jerseyville Road West

Current Due Date: August 9, 2021

Proposed New Due Date: October 20, 2021

14. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

*14.8. Potential Major Event Hosting (PED21177/PW21053) (City Wide)

Pursuant to Section 9.1, Sub-sections (i) and (k) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021 and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (i) and (k) of the *Ontario Municipal Act*, 2001, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to a trade secret or scientific, technical, commercial, financial or labour relations information, supplied in confidence to the municipality or local board, which, if disclosed, could reasonably be expected to prejudice significantly the competitive position or interfere significantly with the contractual or other negotiations of a person, group of persons, or organization; and, a position, plan, procedure, criteria or instruction to be applied to any negotiations carried on or to be carried on by or on behalf of the municipality or local board.

*14.9. Red Hill Valley Parkway Inquiry Update (LS19036(f)) (City Wide)

Pursuant to Section 9.1, Sub-sections (e), (f), (i) and (k) of the City's Procedural Bylaw 21-021 and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (e), (f), (i) and (k) of the *Ontario Municipal Act*, 2001, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to litigation or potential litigation, including matters before administrative tribunals, affecting the municipality or local board; advice that is subject to solicitor-client privilege, including communications necessary for that purpose; a trade secret or scientific, technical, commercial, financial or labour relations information, supplied in confidence to the municipality or local board, which, if disclosed, could reasonably be expected to prejudice significantly the competitive position or interfere significantly with the contractual or other negotiations of a person, group of persons, or organization; and, a position, plan, procedure, criteria or instruction to be applied to any negotiations carried on or to be carried on by or on behalf of the municipality or local board.



September 7, 2021

Re: Item 8.1 – Hamilton Light Rail Transit (LRT) Project Memorandum of Understanding

Dear Members of the General Issues Committee,

As President and CEO of the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce, Hamilton's oldest institution at 176 years old, I have the privilege of speaking for our 1,000+ members that employ over 75,000 people in our community. The Chamber would like to take this opportunity to express our steadfast support for the Committee's adoption of the Hamilton LRT Project Memorandum of Understanding as presented to further strengthen our local economy and begin work on this long-awaited, transformational investment for our community.

With the federal government's contribution to this project announced earlier this year, it is essential to begin construction on the 14-kilometre B-Line LRT as soon as possible. The development it will catalyze and the jobs it will create will be crucial to the Hamilton region's post-pandemic recovery. As well, it is important to begin planning the additional investments required to complete the full implementation of Hamilton's future rapid transit network, commonly referred to as the BLAST Network.

Our long-standing advocacy of the Hamilton B-Line LRT project meets a number a critical city-building opportunities and priorities identified by our membership. It is just one of many opportunities in Hamilton's near future that will help sustain the exciting renewal of this great Canadian city.

B-Line LRT is the first step in the Council-approved five-line, 25-year transit vision called BLAST that will see efficient transit reaching all corners of the city. The B-Line will be the spine of Hamilton's future transit system, improving local transit options and modalities, and reduce congestion. Moreover, the transformative potential of this major infrastructure investment will provide 7,000 jobs for Hamilton and neighbouring municipalities, that will in turn boost our economic recovery.

The Hamilton LRT project will also completely modernize all Hamilton taxpayer-owned underground infrastructure along an important 14-km swath of the city. Usually out-of-



sight, out-of-mind, we were reminded not too long ago just how important underground infrastructure is to the foundation and functionality of our city.

Finally, this is about bringing more tax revenue into the City's coffers. The growth we've already seen in the Lower City is primarily based on the promise of LRT. And it's just the start. We don't have to look much further than Kitchener-Waterloo to see the development that this type of transit unlocks. In fact, the province estimates that one dollar of investment in LRT generates seven dollars in return. Over the course of a 40-year lifespan, that's not at all unrealistic for Hamilton.

With the vast benefits provided by the LRT, it is no wonder why over the past decade there has been an overwhelming demonstration of support, not just from the Hamilton Chamber Commerce, but from a broad coalition of businesses, labour unions, public health professionals, environmental groups, educational institutions and many others who have the foresight to understand the impact that this higher-order, modern transportation system will have for the city, for the province and for our country.

After more than a decade of planning and politics, we have come to a critical moment. We heard loudly and clearly from both provincial and federal governments that their \$3.4 billion investment deal is for the only shovel ready project that exists in Hamilton: B-Line LRT.

We would like to commend all of our community partners for their long-standing advocacy for this transformative, community-building project. Additionally, we would like to congratulate members of the General Issues Committee, as well as City Staff, for their work to date on this major infrastructure project and look forward to the adoption of a memorandum of understanding to get shovels in the ground as soon as possible.

Sincerely,

Keanin Loomis, President & CEO

Hamilton Chamber of Commerce

From: Gabriel Nicholson

Sent: September 6, 2021 10:54 PM

To: Office of the Mayor < <u>mayor@hamilton.ca</u>>; <u>clerk@hamilton.ca</u>; Ward 1 Office

<ward1@hamilton.ca>; Farr, Jason <Jason.Farr@hamilton.ca>; Nann, Nrinder

< Nrinder. Nann@hamilton.ca >; Merulla, Sam < Sam. Merulla@hamilton.ca >; Collins, Chad

<<u>Chad.Collins@hamilton.ca</u>>; Jackson, Tom <<u>Tom.Jackson@hamilton.ca</u>>; Pauls, Esther

<<u>Esther.Pauls@hamilton.ca</u>>; Ward 8 Office <<u>ward8@hamilton.ca</u>>; Clark, Brad <<u>Brad.Clark@hamilton.ca</u>>; Pearson, Maria <<u>Maria.Pearson@hamilton.ca</u>>; Johnson, Brenda

<a href="

; Variation.ca; Whitehead, Terry ; Partridge, Judi

<Judi.Partridge@hamilton.ca>

Subject: LRT MOU

Hello, My June 16th prediction was correct - We are going to reduce service for many Hamiltonians to justify giving some Hamiltonians the gold carpet treatment.

Can we answer the question - How exactly does a federal funding program which specifies 40% funding to provincially owned projects slide the extra 10% (in this case \$340 million dollars) to Hamilton for the provincially owned LRT? It's weird no one wants to answer that question, especially in light of the connection between the Infrastructure minister who had to extort the province to come to the table and our wonderful city.

It's odd that after months have passed no one can state exactly what the 'numerous conditions' to get the funding are. It's a great precedent. It's sure as that if a kid was offered a free car with numerous conditions, 100 times out of 100 the response would be "well don't accept it until you know all the conditions".

The MOU is missing things:

Who is paying for insurance? This is a multi million dollar yearly cost and Metrolinx does not state they'll happily cover it.

In the MOU a couple of things should be added -

- 1)Metrolinx knows and understands they will only accept a bid package that contains
- A) a current MOU with ATU 107. (the ridiculous argument has been made that if we were to go ahead and build it, if the operator didn't choose ATU 107 for driver representation, well then we would just boycott it. When you mess with the bus union you're messing with the buses for the entire city of Hamilton)
- B) a delineation of how Projectco will be providing 7000 local high paying jobs to Hamiltonians. (as this is a main selling point from members of your table, we should ensure truth)
- C) that Hamilton will retain Naming Rights for all stops and that all the members of the table who vote in the affirmative for this project should have a stop named after them. Hamiltonians deserve to remember always why their city is on track for #1 unaffordability, bus service was reduced to many, taxes are skyrocketing and homeless people are camping on trains because we were so far off the mark on ridership projections that they may as well ride it so at least it's not empty 95% of the day.

best regards,
Gabriel Nicholson



September 7th 2021

Written submission - 10.3 Hamilton Tax Increment Grant - 540 King Street East, Hamilton

On July 8th 2019 and July 5th 2021 ACORN delegated to the General Issues Committee to ask Council not approve city grants to Malleum.

Malleum renovicted ACORN members at 160 Sherman Ave N and 1083 Main St E and repeatedly offered low ball buyout offers to ACORN members at 41-43 Albert St. We also received complaints from 540 King St E and 293 Kenilworth Ave N. At 160 Sherman Ave N, 1083 Main St E and 41-43 Albert St tenants reported deliberate neglect of the properties during Malleum ownership.

Hamilton is in a housing crisis. ACORN urges City Council to prioritize tenant protections and preserving existing market affordable housing stock over investor profit, increasing property tax revenue for the city and neighbourhood "revitalization" that displaces and excludes low and moderate income residents.

Renoviction is contributing to the Hamilton housing crisis. The city is currently not in a position to replace every affordable unit lost to renoviction. With the waitlist for subsidized housing standing at over 5000+ households, if tenants are housed - we need to ensure they keep their housing. Displaced tenants cannot afford the high rents if they need to re-enter the market.

Buyouts are a popular tactic used by landlords. They are only used in buildings with the motive to get tenants to give up their rent controlled apartments. There is a perception that buyouts could be a benefit for tenants already thinking of moving. ACORN does not see this small benefit cross out the negative impact of the tactic overall. Buyouts can be preferred by landlords because it is quicker and cheaper than giving tenants a N13 notice which can take months to go to the Landlord and Tenant Board for a hearing and ultimately give the tenant the right to return to their unit at the same rent.

As stated on their website, Malleum is a "private equity firm..that grows capital through active, value-add real estate investing". As stated on their website, their strategy is 1) Acquisitions - "Patient and timely acquisitions at attractive prices" 2) Construction Management - "Significant experience in renovations and development" 3) Property Management - "Active asset management with property management, marketing, and legal expertise" and Monetization "Rapid return of capital and an attractive return profile".

In other words, they seek to purchase buildings that are either vacant or have tenants paying under market rent. They specialize in property management to pressure tenants to give up their affordable rent controlled units and dodge repair / pest control requests. They renovate the building to look "nice" and then deliver a huge return to their investors when new tenants with the ability to pay move in.

ACORN did agree to meet with Malleum in January 2020 to discuss our concerns. We proposed the company adopt a no tenant displacement policy for when they buy buildings with existing tenants.

They pitched us on an initiative where they would invest \$100,00 in building affordable housing. Our board declined to endorse their idea and said that stopping what they were doing would have a greater impact in protecting affordable housing in Hamilton.

Since that meeting, Malleum has sold two of the buildings we shared evidence for. 41-43 Albert St & 1083 Main St E. As we share in our submission, marketing for both properties emphasized the amount of vacant units and opportunity to get higher rents in currently occupied units. We can only assume this is proposing using predatory tactics to force out current tenants in order to re-rent out the units at higher rents.

ACORN is disappointed that staff are recommending for Council to proceed with giving Malleum a grant for renovations at 540 King St E. This particular building was known as an affordable rental and like many buildings across Hamilton had outstanding property standards issues. This should be a reason for Hamilton to implement a strong proactive property standards enforcement program, as ACORN has been advocating for years. We should not accept that any building with repair issues is justification to displace all existing tenants. Hamilton needs legislation to ensure landlords are keeping their property in good repair and disincentivize renoviction.

Malleum stood to benefit from the previous landlord initiating low ball buyouts prior to their purchasing of 540 King St E. As ACORN heard from tenants at the building, the landlord announced that he was selling the building and everyone had to go. Despite Malleum's submission, we do not believe that if any remaining tenants wanted to keep their tenancy that this would have been what Malleum wanted. Malleum bought the building in November 2018 and by June 2019 it was completely empty. Rents at the building went from \$825 plus hydro in 2018 and is now listed for September 2021 rent as starting at \$1,475. To low and moderate income tenants in the neighborhood, this is not a positive impact in the community.

While we cannot rewrite the history of 540 King St E, moving forward the city needs to focus on local policy to prevent this from happening at other buildings. The City of Hamilton needs to ensure tenants are not living in substandard housing conditions and that when new ownership takes over a building, landlords are prevented from displacing existing tenants.

Providing a grant to Malleum for renovations at 540 King St E goes against important work the city has done this year in protecting tenants. In 2021, City Council unanimously approved expanding the tenant defense fund to cover renoviction, expanded the city's property standards to cover more health and safety issues tenants face, mandated COVID health and safety rules for high rise apartments and passed the pilot for landlord licensing. Housing staff have already been directed this year to develop a framework for Hamilton to have a comprehensive anti-renoviction strategy. Stopping city funds to investment firms that are drivers of the problem needs to be part of this.

ACORN looks forward to continuing to work with Council and staff to address the housing crisis and find local solutions.

Thank you.

ACORN Hamilton

Contact: 905-393-5734 / hamilton@acorncanada.org / 1031 Barton St E Suite 210

Submitted on Thursday, September 2, 2021 - 9:51am Submitted by anonymous user: 162.158.126.119 Submitted values are:

==Committee Requested==

Committee: General Issues Committee

==Requestor Information== Name of Individual: Ian Borsuk

Name of Organization: Environment Hamilton

Contact Number: 9055157956

Email Address: iborsuk@environmenthamilton.org

Mailing Address: 51 Stuart Street Hamilton, ON

Reason(s) for delegation request: I would like to speak to the

General Issues Committee on September 8th regarding item 8.1 (LRT

MOU).

Submitted on Friday, September 3, 2021 - 12:08pm Submitted by anonymous user: 172.70.126.215 Submitted values are:

==Committee Requested==

Committee: General Issues Committee

==Requestor Information==

Name of Individual: Karl Andrus

Name of Organization: Hamilton Community Benefits Network

Contact Number: 289-214-7636 Email Address: karlandrus@hcbn.ca

Mailing Address: 342 James St N. UPPER, Hamilton, Ontario

Reason(s) for delegation request:

To speak to Item - > Hamilton Light Rail Transit (LRT) Project

Memorandum of

Understanding (PED21176/CM21012/LS21034)
Will you be requesting funds from the City? No
Will you be submitting a formal presentation? No



Moving Forward – Beyond the Debate

8. STAFF PRESENTATIONS

8.1 Hamilton Light Rail Transit (LRT) Project Memorandum of Understanding (PED21176/CM21012/LS21034)



The <u>Hamilton Community Benefits Network</u> (HCBN) is a collective made up of representatives from the ACORN Hamilton, Hamilton-Brantford Building Trades, the Immigrant Working Centre, the Hamilton District Labour Council, the YWCA, Hamilton Food Share, Environment Hamilton local neighbourhood associations, unions and many more organizations that envision an inclusive, thriving city in which all residents have equitable opportunities to contribute to building healthy communities and a prospering economy.

















































Congress of Union





























G. The Province continues to recognize the critical importance of building affordable housing near transit stations and maximizing high quality jobs and benefits for communities adjacent to or affected by the Project. The Province will work with the City and community stakeholders to endeavour to determine how best to support these goals of affordable housing and community benefits as part of transit project delivery.

_



Leveraging the Hamilton LRT to maximum Community Gain through a Signed CBA.

- Affordable Housing is a must. The often discussed Waterloo ION LRT generated only 11 units of affordable housing on the whole corridor
- Employment Opportunities must be leveraged to lift marginalized into career paths -> Both Professional, Administrative and Technical as well as Union Changes
- Local arts employment must be considered for all project art opportunities
- Community Input on the changes happening directly in there neighbourhood is a must
- Small Business support and communication/planning, especially racialized and women own businesses
- Finally it is incumbent on this council to pass inclusionary zoning on the Transit Oriented Development corridor to leverage the development boom along the line.

Submitted on Friday, September 3, 2021 - 8:21am Submitted by anonymous user: 172.70.126.227 Submitted values are:

==Committee Requested==

Committee: General Issues Committee

==Requestor Information==

Name of Individual: Marie Alcaide Name of Organization: ACORN

Contact Number

Email Address: hamilton@acorncanada.org

Mailing Address:

Reason(s) for delegation request: Submit pre recorded video delegation for Weds Sept 8 GIC meeting on issue 10.3 Grant to

Malleum.

Submitted on Friday, September 3, 2021 - 8:23am Submitted by anonymous user: 172.70.126.227 Submitted values are:

==Committee Requested==

Committee: General Issues Committee

==Requestor Information==

Name of Individual: Chris Martinez

Name of Organization:

Contact Number:

Email Address: hamilton@acorncanada.org

Mailing Address:

Reason(s) for delegation request: To submit pre recorded video

for Weds Sept 8 GIC meeting on 10.3 Grant to Malleum

Submitted on Saturday, September 4, 2021 - 8:41am Submitted by anonymous user: 172.70.42.93 Submitted values are:

==Committee Requested==

Committee: General Issues Committee

==Requestor Information==

Name of Individual: Paula Groves Name of Organization: ACORN

Contact Number:

Email Address: hamilton@acorncanada.org

Mailing Address:

Reason(s) for delegation request: Submit pre recorded video delegation for weds GIC meeting to speak to Malleum grant.

Submitted on Sunday, September 5, 2021 - 8:08pm Submitted by anonymous user: 172.70.130.113 Submitted values are:

==Committee Requested==

Committee: General Issues Committee

==Requestor Information==

Name of Individual: Elizabeth Ellis

Name of Organization: ACORN Hamilton

Contact Number: Email Address: Mailing Address:

Reason(s) for delegation request: Submit pre recorded video for

Sept 8 GIC meeting to speak to Malleum grant. Will you be requesting funds from the City? No Will you be submitting a formal presentation? No



INFORMATION REPORT

ТО:	Mayor and Members General Issues Committee	
COMMITTEE DATE:	August 9, 2021	
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Farmers' Markets - Rent Relief and Governance Comparators (PED21158) (City Wide)	
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide	
PREPARED BY:	Raymond Kessler (905) 546-2425 Ext. 7019 Cyrus Tehrani (905) 546-2424 Ext. 2261	
SUBMITTED BY:	Norm Schleehahn Director, Economic Development Planning and Economic Development Department	
SIGNATURE:	Malu	

COUNCIL DIRECTION

At the meeting of the General Issues Committee on February 17, 2021, in response to the public hearing / delegation of Shane Coleman, Hamilton Farmers' Market Stallholder Association, respecting Rent Relief for the Hamilton Farmers' Market, staff were directed to report back to GIC with a review of comparator municipalities such as Kitchener-Waterloo, London, Mississauga and Cambridge with respect to rent relief for their farmer's markets and market governance.

INFORMATION

In response to this direction, staff contacted comparator municipalities asking for information related to the impact to the COVID-19 pandemic on their local farmer's market operations and what, if any, related relief programs may have been provided to minimize the impact to market vendors and/or stallholders. In addition to general questions around typical operations to level set potential differences between markets, specific questions were asked about rent relief, fee deferrals and COVID-19 related expenses, as well as what type of governance model the market operates under.

Municipalities that contributed to the information summarized in this report include Brantford, Guelph, Kitchener, St. Catharines and Toronto. London and Cambridge were

SUBJECT: Farmers' Market - Rent Relief and Governance Comparators (PED21158) (City Wide) - Page 2 of 6

also contacted but did not respond to the survey at the time this report was written. In total, seven comparator municipalities were contacted, with five municipalities providing responses.

Survey Response Summary – General Market Context

Responding municipalities with indoor markets ranged in size from approximately 48 to over 80 permanent stalls, with outdoor markets being less than 40 stalls. Appendix "A" to Report PED21158 – Markets Overview provides a comparative overview of the markets surveyed.

All outdoor market areas, plus the St. Catharines Farmers' Market indoor area, are setup/tear down market day operations. The Hamilton Farmers' Market has approximately 53 permanent stalls with 48 currently occupied.

Hours of operation range from being open only one-day per week, on a Saturday, to being open on the weekend plus a day or two during the week (typically Tuesday and/or Thursday). All markets are closed on Sunday and Monday. The Hamilton Farmers' Market days of operation are Tuesday, Thursday, Friday and Saturday. Only Toronto has a market open on a Wednesday, and also has a Sunday Antique Market. Responses did not indicate seasonal adjustments to hours of operation, except for outdoor markets that are not operational in the off-season.

All but the St. Catharines Farmers' Market, which charge their vendors monthly or biannually for stall holders (guarantees the same spot), have annual vendor / stallholder rental agreements ranging from one-year in length to five-years in Toronto. Rental rates can be impacted by the size of the stall at the Kitchener Market to the location and use of the stall at the Toronto market. The license contracts with the Hamilton Farmers' Market are currently one-year in length and renewed annually. The Hamilton Farmers' Market Corporation Board (HFMC) is reviewing stallholder agreement lengths.

Although not a lot of detail around market governance was provided in response to the survey, information collected indicates that governance varies from market to market, but all are operated directly by the City, except for Hamilton. Only the Kitchener market runs without a Board or Advisory/Executive Committee of some sort, with the Brantford Farmers Market Vendor Association operating only as an advisory body. Hamilton Farmers' Market is currently governed by the Hamilton Farmers' Market Corporation and its board is made up of a combination of Citizen and Stallholder/Vendor Board members as well as a Council Representative.

The Hamilton Farmers' Market - Sole Voting Member (City Council) has previously approved a third-party consultant engagement to review Hamilton Farmers' Market Governance and Operating Model, which is in progress.

SUBJECT: Farmers' Market - Rent Relief and Governance Comparators (PED21158) (City Wide) - Page 3 of 6

Survey Response Summary – Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic

In response to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on local markets' operations, the following specific questions were asked:

- 1. Did you close indoor market operations for any duration during the COVID-19 pandemic? If yes, provide a brief overview of when closed, when re-opened, and any reductions in operating hours, if applicable;
- Outline any COVID-19 related rent relief provided directly to your indoor vendors/stallholders and outline what form and estimate value of relief was provided? Be as specific as possible as to the nature and type of relief and duration for which that relief was/is being provided;
- 3. Have you deferred any fees/rents or similar to vendor/stallholders? If yes briefly outline the nature or value of those deferrals? and,
- 4. Has your market incurred any one-time related COVID-19 pandemic expenses? Please briefly outline and estimate cost, identifying who covered those costs.

The City of Toronto was the only responding municipality that did not close as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. All other responding municipalities closed their markets during the first wave of infections. For some markets, this was a short closure i.e. March – May/June of 2020 while the indoor market in Guelph did not reopen until September of 2020. The Hamilton Farmers' Market remained open throughout the COVID-19 pandemic though the HFMC Board approved reducing some of the operating hours of the market due to reduced visitor traffic to the market due to the pandemic and stay at home Provincial orders. The Hamilton Farmers' Market was closed between January 5, 2021, to January 19, 2021, due to ventilation system upgrades for previously planned capital upgrades to the facility. Fees were prorated for 2021 to exclude closure days related to ventilation system upgrade. Certain non-essential vendor product groups (i.e. Artisans – four stallholders) were not able to open due to Provincial restrictions at various stages of the pandemic during 2020 and 2021 as per Provincial frameworks and requirements. Stallholders not able to open due to provincial restrictions did not receive rent abatement for those mandated closures. All markets were required to follow all public health guidelines for their region that would have been in effect.

Responses related to rent relief (Questions #2 and #3 above) and one-time COVID-19 related expenses (Question #4 above) can be found in Table 1 – Rent Relief Summary and Table 2 – One-Time COVID-19 Related Expenses below.

SUBJECT: Farmers' Market - Rent Relief and Governance Comparators (PED21158) (City Wide) - Page 4 of 6

Table 1 - Rent / Fee Relief Summary

Municipality	Rent / Fee Relief		
Brantford	Rent was not charged when market was closed; and,		
	Did not defer any fees.		
Guelph	Rent was not charged when market was closed;		
	Indoor market reopened in September, with no fees until		
	November when regular rentals fees resumed;		
	Vendors were not charged for any safety equipment (i.e. sneeze		
	guards, customer order windows etc.); and,		
	Did not defer any fees.		
Hamilton	HFMC approved an optional six-month interest free deferral of		
	2020 fees (note: 13 vendors requested deferral) allowing for		
	repayment by December 31, 2021, in alignment to City of		
	Hamilton's City Wide COVID-19 Occupancy Framework; and,		
	Stallholders provided details via Market Stallholders/Vendor Newsletter on Covernment support programs is a Consider.		
	Newsletter on Government support programs i.e. Canadian Emergency Rent Subsidy (CERS), Canadian Emergency Wage		
	Subsidy (CEWS) and Canadian Emergency Business Account		
	(CEBA).		
Kitchener	Rent was not charged when market was closed;		
	• June of 2020 – 85% rent discount;		
	July to October of 2020, rent was increased by 15% each month to		
	incrementally return to normal rates;		
	Market vendors and/or stallholders were encouraged to take		
	advantage of Federal relief programs with market staff available to		
	assist with applications (service was not utilized). If ineligible for		
	relief through existing programs, market would provide 25%		
	reduction in rent if proof in ineligibility provided (note: no vendors		
	requested this support); and,		
	Did not defer any fees.		
St. Catharines	• Interest was frozen on balances owing from March to July of 2020;		
	Stall fees were required on the first day of reopening and discounts		
	were applied to support public health measures i.e. appropriate		
	distancing if additional stalls required;		
	• Full rates for 2021 spring/summer market season; and,		
Toronto	Fees were only deferred for one vendor due to leaving the market. Offered rept deferred. Devised ever the term of the existing leave.		
10101110	 Offered rent deferral. Payback over the term of the existing lease or extend leases by a term that would enable payback; 		
	· ·		
	 In exceptional circumstances, worked with individual tenants on addressing financial difficulties; and, 		
	addressing initiation difficulties, and,		

SUBJECT: Farmers' Market - Rent Relief and Governance Comparators (PED21158) (City Wide) - Page 5 of 6

Municipality	Rent / Fee Relief	
	Post-CERS, tenants directed to seek relief through CERS with only	
	any unsubsidized portion remaining eligible for deferral.	

Table 2 – One-Time COVID-19 Related Expenses

Municipality	One-Time COVID-19 Related Expenses	
Brantford	Stall dividers and all COVID-19 related signage and floor stencils.	
Guelph	 Material and staffing costs that were COVID related (i.e. building of customer order windows) were split between the operation budget and a general COVID-19 City fund. 	
Hamilton	 As part of the federal-provincial Safe Restart Agreement, the City of Hamilton allocated \$144,652 in 2020 to offset COVID-19 related operating costs and financial pressures (i.e. Personal Protective Equipment (PPE), additional cleaning and security staff to facilitate screening); 2021 additional COVID-19 related costs to date (May 31, 2021) are \$44,876; and, 	
IZitala an an	• \$30 K in additional marketing budget from reserves for 2021.	
Kitchener	 \$150 K in extra staffing for COVID-19 screening, directional markings; and, Separate clean costs at approximately \$200 K - \$300 K. 	
St. Catharines	 Purchasing of hand sanitizer stations, traffic cones, safety vests, a-frame signage; and, Costs estimated at \$3 K. 	
Toronto	PPE and staff costs related to supporting programs and implementing public health measure/provincial measures.	

The survey results demonstrate that every municipality, as did the City of Hamilton, provided (and continue to provide) its market with one-time financial support for COVID-19 expenses. Similarly, each municipality provided a degree of relief for the fees/rent during this pandemic period – some by way of interest-free deferral of outstanding fees/rent due to be paid out over time, and some by way of not collecting fees during a period of closure. In summary, each municipality surveyed has taken its own path toward the nature and degree of support it has provided its vendor community and/or its market as a whole. This was not an unanticipated outcome of the survey results as the operations, nature, and contractual nature of each market's relationship to its' vendors is unique.

SUBJECT: Farmers' Market - Rent Relief and Governance Comparators (PED21158) (City Wide) - Page 6 of 6

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report PED21158 - Markets Overview

RK,CT/sd

Appendix "A" Markets Overview

Municipality	Model	Operations [1]
Brantford	 Directly city staff operated; and, Vendor association acts advisory body. 	 48 indoor stalls – permanent; Open Fridays (9 a.m 2 p.m.) and Saturdays (7 a.m 2 p.m.); Annual stall agreement; and, Variety of farmer and food types of vendors.
Guelph	 Directly city staff operated; and, Executive committee acts as advisory body. 	 80 indoor booths – permanent; Also, outdoor (8 months of year) spots; Open Saturdays, 7 a.m. – noon; Annual booth agreements based on daily fee rate; and, Farmers, food resellers, prepared food sales, arts and crafts, and other NFP/organizations.
Hamilton	Hamilton Farmers' Market Corporation operated.	 55 indoor stalls and market carts; Open Tuesdays, Thursdays, Fridays (8 a.m 6 p.m.) and Saturdays (7 a.m 5 p.m.) year-round; Annual stall licence fees based on stall size and location; and, Produce/fruit, meat/poultry/eggs, cheese/deli, seafood, bakeries/coffee, grocery/prepared foods, florist, artisan, and VQA wine.
Kitchener	Directly city staff operated.	 50 indoor booths plus 10 food hall (mezzanine) – permanent; Also, outdoor spots; Food hall open Tuesday-Friday, 10:30 a.m. – 3 p.m.; Market and food hall open Saturdays (7 a.m 2 p.m.) year-round; Annual agreement based on booth size; and, Produce/flowers, deli/dairy/seafood, bakeries, prepared foods, pantry items.
St. Catharines	Directly city staff operated; and,Market sub- committee.	 74 stands (enclosed pavilion) – not permanent; Open Tuesday, Thursday (8 a.m. – 2 p.m.), Saturday, 6 a.m. – 2 p.m. yearround;

Appendix "A" to Report PED21158 Page 2 of 2

Municipality	Model	Operations [1]
		 Monthly and Bi-Annual stand agreements based on a daily fee rate plus monthly marketing and hydro fees, plus annual vendor association fee; and, Meat, eggs, cheese, fruits, vegetables,
		flowers, baked goods, prepared foods, handcrafts, other.
Toronto	 Directly city staff operated; and, Advisory committee. 	 63 South Market (permanent) plus 43 North Market (non-permanent) stands; Also, outdoor stalls and market carts; South Market open Tuesday - Thursday (8 a.m6 p.m.), Friday (8 a.m 7 p.m.), Saturday (5 a.m 5 p.m.) year-round; Farmers Market (North Market) open Saturday, 5 a.m 3 p.m., year-round; Antique Market (North Market) open Sunday, 5 a.m 3 p.m., year-round; Standard 5-year semi-gross and % rent commercial lease for South Market vendors, plus annual permit fee for Farmers Market - various rates based on size, location, type of vendor; and, Meat, eggs, cheese, fruits, vegetables, flowers, baked goods, prepared foods, handcrafts, other.

^[1] Represents regular operations – excludes any alterations due to COVID-19