

City of Hamilton HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGECOMMITTEE ADDENDUM

Meeting #: 22-005

Date: May 13, 2022

Time: 9:30 a.m.

Location: Due to the COVID-19 and the Closure of City

Hall (CC)

All electronic meetings can be viewed at:

City's Website:

https://www.hamilton.ca/council-committee/council-committee-meetings/meetings-and-agendas

City's YouTube Channel:

https://www.youtube.com/user/InsideCityofHa

milton or Cable 14

Loren Kolar, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 2604

7. CONSENT ITEMS

- *7.2. Inventory and Research Working Group Meeting Notes March 28, 2022
- *7.3. Heritage Permit Applications Delegated Approvals
 - *7.3.a. Heritage Permit Application HP2022-008 Proposed Alteration of Lobby and Rooftop Addition at 127 Hughson Street North (Ward 2), By-law No. 20-217
 - *7.3.b. Heritage Permit Application HP2022-009: Proposed Alteration of the Windows and Trim at 256-258 MacNab Street North (Ward 2), By-law No. 89-176

7.2

Inventory & Research Working Group (IRWG)

Meeting Notes

March 28, 2022 (6:00pm-8:00pm) City of Hamilton WebEx Virtual Meeting

Present: Janice Brown (Chair); Rammy Saini (Secretary); Lyn Lunsted; Graham

Carroll; Alissa Denham-Robinson; Chuck Dimitry

Staff Present: Amber Knowles (Cultural Heritage Planner); Chloe Richer (Cultural

Heritage Planner); Stacey Kursikowski (Cultural Heritage Planner); Ken

Coit, Manager, Heritage & Urban Design

Regrets: Jim Charlton; Brian Kowalesicz; Alissa Golden (Heritage Project

Specialist)

NOTES

1. Chair's Remarks

Welcome to all.

2. Declarations of Interest None.

3. Review and Approval of Meeting Notes – February 28 and March 18, 2022
Both sets of meeting notes were approved by general consensus.

4. Staff Presentation – Amber Knowles: Coppley Building, 56 York Blvd, Designation

Amber gave a presentation on the above property. This property has been protected by a Notice of Intention to Designate (NOID) for 40 years, but the designation by-law was never passed. The draft by-law was written in 1979 and does not meet the value statement and heritage attribute requirements under the current *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff have moved forward with a Cultural Heritage Assessment report to provide the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and/or Interest and Heritage Attributes for an updated NOID and designation by-law to replace the expiring NOID. Unlike the 1979 NOID, which only protected a couple of facades of the stone building, this new NOID and designation by-law will allow for more attributes of the two buildings that exist on the property to be protected.

The IRWG discussed the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and/or Interest and the heritage evaluations from the report and recommends that the report re-address and rework the statement that the property is not a landmark. Arguing the building is not a landmark because it is not the biggest building on the block is a misunderstanding of how a landmark should be defined. 56 York Blvd is one of the last remaining buildings with that character in the neighbourhood, which arguably makes it a landmark. The statements are also missing key features within the attribute entries. The importance of the courtyard, for example, is mentioned in the document but is not reflected in the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and/or Interest. The IRWG also feel the interior features deserve another

conversation: are there features, such as some of the cast iron pillars, that remain in good shape and should be noted in the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and/or Interest? Chuck noted that the opening of the windows could also be reflected in the Statement in order to ensure they are not filled in over time. Lastly, Graham noted there is a factual error on page 25: Rastrick is wrongly credited with the design of the Custom House.

5. Staff Presentation - Chloe Richer: 265 Mill St. Waterdown, Cummer House

The IRWG reviewed the Heritage Evaluation and Statement of Significance from the February 2022 Cultural Heritage Assessment (CHIA) on 265 Mill Street South. This is a revised document from a CHIA that was received last year. The property is being reviewed as it requires a zoning by-law amendment to adapt the original house to a Montessori school for pre-school and elementary school-aged children. Staff and the IRWG see no issue with an adaptive reuse of the property, however, they do have some concerns regarding the Heritage Evaluation and Statement of Significance that they reviewed.

The original report outlined how the property met 5 of 9 criteria under Ont. Reg. 9/06, but was given feedback on how some of the criteria was only partially met. The new, revised report has omitted the partial criteria and now only recognizes 2 of the 9 criteria being met, neither of which meets the Design or Physical Value attributes criteria. This property has also been noted as a designation candidate as part of the Waterdown Inventory that was recently completed by staff.

The IRWG was surprised that the report does not recognize any **Design or Physical Value** of the property. It was agreed that the property is representative if not an early example of Georgian style and that it demonstrates a high degree of craftmanship. The report only mentions the interior staircase with respect to craftsmanship and has excluded other elements, such as the exterior. The IRWG also had some questions regarding where the stone would have been derived as there were two limestone quarries within a short distance of the property, meaning building materials themselves may have come locally.

With regards to **Historical or Associative Value**, the IRWG disagree that the landscape design by Dunington-Grubb is insufficient to demonstrate historical/associative value. Pictures show the landscape and the report itself notes that these were notable Landscape Architects. The IRWG also disagreed with the **Contextual Value** as both the first and third criteria are clearly met: the property is one of the earliest houses in Waterdown (built 1846), especially given its size and the stone construction; and the community itself recognizes the property as a landmark. The IRWG further agreed that some interior attributes are missing, including the crown moulding, ceiling medallions, interior plaster, wainscotting, and baseboards. The IRWG would also like to see a note on the early single-storey addition being retained.

In addition to wanting the above items noted in the CHIA Report, IRWG members are recommending that 265 Mill Street South be added to the staff work plan for heritage designation as the property meets the requirements under regulation 9/06. This recommendation was approved by all members during the meeting and sent to the Heritage Committee's April 1st meeting separately as a special recommendation.

6. Discussion – Early Designations: Ken Coit and All

Ken Coit gave the IRWG an overview of the work involved for updating the 230+ by-laws

from pre-2002 and the 102. There's arguably a decade's worth of work here, so Ken is hoping to come up with some criteria to help triage the work. To help prioritize the work as requests are made, Ken proposes the following as potential criteria:

- Is owner friendly to designation or want it to be designated?
- Is owner willing to pay for research to get designation? If so, why not support that property?

The IRWG brainstormed the following as additional criteria that could be taken into consideration:

- Is the property under threat (i.e. is there an emergency)?
- Is the property in an area that is under pressure to change?
- Who owns the building (i.e. filter out Municipal properties)?
- Is their public or community interest? This could include council interest.
- Is the building vacant?
- Was there a change to ownership?
- Is there development pressure?

There is a lot of work to do, and it can't be completed immediately so some guidelines will allow us to get through the work in an efficient manner. Ken will take these suggestions to staff as they map out their workflows.

1. Meeting Note Secretary

A new notetaker is needed for the IRWG as Rammy has stepped down from this role. A potential solution would be to alternate who takes notes each meeting. Janice noted that she will have to step down as Chair if she is ultimately tasked with note-taking (slight aside: I'm sure we won't let that happen...we need Janice!).

2. New Business

None.

3. Meeting Adjourned: 8:05 PM

4. **Next Meeting:** April 25, 2022



Mailing Address: 71 Main Street West Hamilton, Ontario Canada L8P 4Y5 www.hamilton.ca Planning and Economic Development Department
Planning Division

71 Main Street West, 4th Floor, Hamilton, Ontario, L8P 4Y5

Phone: 905-546-2424, Ext. 1291

Fax: 905-540-5611

FILE: HP2022-008

May 4, 2022

Christienne Uchiyama LHC Heritage Planning and Archaeology Inc. 837 Princess Street, Suite 400 Kingston, ON K7L 1G8 7.3(a)

Re: Heritage Permit Application HP2022-008

Proposed alteration of lobby and rooftop addition at 127 Hughson Street North (Ward 2), By-law No. 20-217

Please be advised that pursuant to By-law No. 05-364, as amended by By-law No. 07-322, which delegates the power to consent to alterations to designated property under the *Ontario Heritage Act* to the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, Heritage Permit Application HP2022-008 is approved for the designated property at 127 Hughson Street North, in accordance with the submitted Heritage Permit Application for the following alterations:

- A one-storey addition on top of the existing building to accommodate a new rooftop restaurant space that will add an additional 4.4 m to the height of the structure:
- Repairs to the entryway door, east elevation; and,
- Reorientation and integration of marble staircase into a new staircase with four additional concrete steps at the base. The existing wood and brass railing in to be integrated or replicated into a code-compliant railing.

Subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any Application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- b) Implementation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than April 30, 2024. If the alterations are not completed by April

Re: Heritage Permit Application HP2022-008: Proposed alteration of lobby and rooftop addition at 127 Hughson Street North (Ward 2), By-law No. 20-217

30, 2024, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton;

- c) The Applicant to integrate the timber beams back into the lobby space;
- d) The Applicant to work with staff to provide options to integrate the 'F' Firth Brothers logo into the lobby space in a way in which it will be visible; and,
- e) The Applicant to provide design details on the replicated railing in the lobby space.

Please note that this property is designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and that this permit is only for the above-noted alterations. Any departure from the approved plans and specifications is prohibited, and could result in penalties, as provided for by the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The terms and conditions of this approval may be appealed to the Ontario Land Tribunal within 30 days of your receipt of this permit.

The issuance of this permit under the *Ontario Heritage Act* is not a waiver of any of the provisions of any By-law of the City of Hamilton, the requirements of the *Building Code Act*, the *Planning Act*, or any other applicable legislation.

We wish you success with your project, and if you have any further questions please feel free to contact Chloe Richer, Cultural Heritage Planner, at 905-546-2424 ext. 7163, or via email at Chloe.Richer@hamilton.ca.

Yours truly

Steve Robichaud, MCIP RPP

Director of Planning and Chief Planner

cc: Chloe Richer, Cultural Heritage Planner
Chantal Costa, Plan Examination Secretary
Lisa Low, Administrative Assistant II, Building Division
Tamara Reid, Supervisor-Operations and Enforcement
Loren Kolar, Legislative Coordinator
Councillor Jason Farr (Ward 2)

HERITAGE PERMIT DELEGATED AUTHORITY REPORT - HP2022-008

ADDRESS: 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton

Owner: Robert Knuth, Ladir Developments Ltd.

Applicant / Agent: Christienne Uchiyama, CAHP, LHC Heritage Planning and

Archaeology Inc.

Description of proposed alterations:

- A one-storey addition on top of the existing building to accommodate a new rooftop restaurant space that will add an additional 4.4 m to the height of the structure:
- Repairs to the entryway door, east elevation; and,
- Reorientation and integration of marble staircase into a new staircase with four additional concrete steps at the base. The existing wood and brass railing is to be integrated or replicated into a code-compliant railing.

Reasons for proposed alterations:

• To renovate the existing building to include a rooftop restaurant and reorient the staircase to meet business needs.

Documentation submitted with Application:

- 127 Hughson Street North Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment;
- Concept plans; and,
- Context renderings/floor plans.

Staff assessment:

Key factors in the evaluation of alterations affecting a heritage building or its setting are the consideration of:

- "displacement effects" (those adverse actions that result in the damage, loss or removal of valued heritage features); and,
- "disruption effects" (those actions that result in detrimental changes to the setting or character of a heritage feature).

In the consideration of any Heritage Permit Application, staff must assess the impact of the displacement and disruption effects on the heritage resource, particularly in relation to the heritage attributes mentioned in the Designation By-law, in this case By-law No. 20-217.

The Applicant proposes to construct a one-storey addition on top of the existing building to accommodate a new rooftop restaurant space (which will add an additional 4.4 m to the height of the structure), repair the entryway door (east elevation) and to reorient and integrate the marble staircase into a new staircase with four additional concrete steps at

the base. The existing wood and brass railing in to be integrated or replicated into a code-compliant railing.

Moderate "disruption effects" are expected to the heritage context of the property, as the changes to the property are extensive, particularly to the Art Deco aesthetic of the split-level foyer, which will be updated to a more industrial aesthetic. However, key heritage features (the timber beams, the 'F' Firth Brothers logo and a replicated railing in the lobby space) will be retained or replicated due to the additional approved conditions recommended by the Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee and staff. Regarding the repairs to the entrance, east elevation, the colour is to remain dark to match the existing wood and brick exterior, glass is to be bevelled to match presumed original glass in the transom and sidelites, and wood that cannot be repaired is to be replicated and replaced.

There will be minimal "displacement effects" to the subject property as a result of this work, as many of the affected heritage features will be preserved in a way that does not cause any damage and maintains the heritage value (e.g., the timber rafters were previously removed from their original context and should be reinstated, and the 'F' Firth Brothers logo will be retained though it should be made visible). The existing wooden handrailing will be removed, however, it will be replicated and duplicated to maintain the wood and brass elements while meeting Building Code requirements.

Staff are supportive of the Application as there will be minimal displacement effects though moderate disruption effects. Through the additional conditions, key heritage features of the split-level foyer will be retained and/or reinstated, and the wooden handrailing will be replicated.

Key dates:

Sub-committee meeting date: April 19, 2022 Notice of Complete Application: April 20, 2022

Sub-committee comments and advice:

The Sub-committee considered the Application and passed the following motion:

(Ritchie/Priamo)

That the Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee advises that Heritage Permit Application HP2022-008 be approved as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any Application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- b) Implementation/installation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than April 30, 2024. If the alterations are not completed

by April 30, 2024, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton;

- c) The Applicant to integrate the timber beams back into the lobby space;
- d) The Applicant to work with city staff to provide options to integrate the 'F' Firth Brothers logo into the lobby space in a way in which it will be visible; and,
- e) The Applicant to provide design details on the replicated railing in the lobby space.

CARRIED

Final Recommendation:

That the Applicant be advised that Heritage Permit Application HP2022-008 is approved in accordance with the submitted Application, subject to the following conditions:

- a) That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any Application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- b) Implementation/installation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than April 30, 2024. If the alterations are not completed by April 30, 2024, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton;
- c) The Applicant to integrate the timber beams back into the lobby space;
- d) The Applicant to work with city staff to provide options to integrate the 'F' Firth Brothers logo into the lobby space in a way in which it will be visible; and,
- e) The Applicant to provide design details on the replicated railing in the lobby space.

Approval:		
Staff Approval:	Chloe Richer	
	Chloe Richer, MCIP RPP, CAHP Cultural Heritage Planner	SPM/MGR Initials

Authorized:

Steve Robidhaud, MCIP RPP Director of Planning and Chief Planner

Description of Heritage Attributes (By-law No. 20-217)

Description of Heritage Attributes

The Cultural Heritage Value or interest of the property resides in the four storey east section of the structure, built in 1929.

Key heritage attributes associated with the split level foyer include:

- The use of marble, brass and wood;
- . The marble and pebble tile Firth Brothers 'F' logo at the top of the stairs; and,
- The timber rafters with dentils and decorative supports.

Key heritage exterior attributes of the 1929 east section of the building associated with the façade include:

- Vernacular interpretation of Art Deco style architecture;
- Red brick construction and polychrome brick façade;
- · Brick pilasters:
- The multi-panelled windows with operable openings together with the locations, configuration, size, scale, and shape of these window openings which reinforce the industrial character of the building;
- Brick work, including a double herringbone pattern and soldier courses with squareshaped stone insert;
- Decorative and symmetrical use of stone throughout the brickwork, including at the top and bottom of the brick pilasters;
- Flat roof with a pair of decorative parapets with centrally placed stone 'F's';
- Defined main entrance with stone lintel, pilasters, and dentils;
- Decorative brickwork above the main entrance; and,
- Large rectangular transom and sidelights openings found at the front door.



Mailing Address: 71 Main Street West Hamilton, Ontario Canada L8P 4Y5 www.hamilton.ca Planning and Economic Development Department
Planning Division

71 Main Street West, 5th Floor, Hamilton, Ontario, L8P 4Y5

Phone: 905-546-2424, Ext. 1202

Fax: 905-540-5611

FILE: HP2022-009

April 26, 2022

Kathy Stacey Architectural Solutions Inc. 224 Hatt Street, Dundas ON L9H 2G8 7.3(b)

Re: Heritage Permit Application HP2022-009:

Proposed Alteration of the Windows and Trim at 256-258 MacNab Street

North (Ward 2), By-law No. 89-176

Please be advised that pursuant to By-law No. 05-364, as amended by By-law No. 07-322, which delegates the power to consent to alterations to designated property under the *Ontario Heritage Act* to the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, Heritage Permit Application HP2022-009 is approved for the designated property at 256-258 MacNab Street North in accordance with the submitted Heritage Permit Application for the following alterations:

- Restoration of wood elements of the front façade dutchman patches and replication (exact replica) where required – utilizing same species of lumber as currently exists;
- Replacement of non-original storm windows with custom wood two-light arched windows, single pane – constructed using traditional mortise and tenon joinery and linseed oil glazing putty; and,
- Attachment of a scaffold system to the building, with a minimum of two anchors set into the mortar line between the bricks.

Subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any Application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- b) That the Applicant submit designer specifications for the replacement storm windows prior to the commencement of any alterations to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner; and,

Re: Heritage Permit Application HP2022-009: Proposed alteration of the windows and trim at 256-258 MacNab Street North (Ward 2), By-law No. 89-176

c) Implementation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than April 30, 2025. If the alterations are not completed by April 30, 2025, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.

Please note that this property is designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and that this permit is only for the above-noted alterations. Any departure from the approved plans and specifications is prohibited, and could result in penalties, as provided for by the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The terms and conditions of this approval may be appealed to the Ontario Land Tribunal within 30 days of your receipt of this permit.

The issuance of this permit under the *Ontario Heritage Act* is not a waiver of any of the provisions of any By-law of the City of Hamilton, the requirements of the *Building Code Act*, the *Planning Act*, or any other applicable legislation.

We wish you success with your project, and if you have any further questions please feel free to contact Stacey Kursikowski, Cultural Heritage Planner, at 905-546-2424 ext. 1202, or via email at Stacey.Kursikowski@hamilton.ca

Yours truly,

Steve Robichaud, MCIP RPP

Director of Planning and Chief Planner

CC:

Stacey Kursikowski, Cultural Heritage Planner Chantal Costa, Plan Examination Secretary Bob Nuttall, Acting Manager, Building Inspections Tamara Reid, Supervisor-Operations and Enforcement Loren Kolar, Legislative Coordinator Lisa Kelsey, Legislative Coordinator Councillor Jason Farr

HERITAGE PERMIT DELEGATED AUTHORITY REPORT - HP2022-009

ADDRESS: 256-258 MacNab Street North, Hamilton

Owner: Sonja De Pauw-Morgan and David Morgan

Applicant / Agent: Kathy Stacey

Description of proposed alterations:

- Restoration of wood elements of the front façade dutchman patches and replication (exact replica) where required – utilizing same species of lumber as currently exists;
- Replacement of non-original storm windows with custom wood two-light arched windows, single pane – constructed using traditional mortise and tenon joinery and linseed oil glazing putty; and,
- Attachment of a scaffold system to the building, with a minimum of two anchors set into the mortar line between the bricks.

Reasons for proposed alterations:

 To restore wood elements and windows on the front façade resulting from deterioration and rot.

Documentation submitted Application:

- Overview of proposed work;
- Images of areas to be restored; and,
- Photographs of underlying rot and impacted areas.

Staff assessment:

Key factors in the evaluation of alterations affecting a heritage building or its setting are the consideration of:

- "displacement effects" (those adverse actions that result in the damage, loss or removal of valued heritage features); and,
- "disruption effects" (those actions that result in detrimental changes to the setting or character of a heritage feature).

In the consideration of any Heritage Permit Application, staff must assess the impact of the displacement and disruption effects on the heritage resource, particularly in relation to the heritage attributes mentioned in the Designation By-law, in this case By-law No. 89-176.

The Applicant proposes to restore the wood elements of the front façade (dutchman patches and replication (exact replica) where required – utilizing same species of lumber as currently exists); Replace the non-original storm windows with custom wood two-light arched windows, single pane – constructed using traditional mortise and tenon joinery and linseed oil glazing putty and attach a scaffold system to the building, with a minimum of two anchors set into the mortar line between the bricks.

Minimal "disruption effects" are expected to the heritage context of the property, as the areas of the property being altered include deteriorating wood elements as a result of water infiltration that will be restored or replaced with traditional materials and replicated profiles, which will preserve the heritage features of the property for the future.

There will be minimal "displacement effects" to the subject property as a result of this work, as the heritage attributes of the property will be maintained through the use of traditional craftsmanship, materials and replicated profiles.

Staff are supportive of the Application as there will be minimal disruption and displacement effects. The restoration and replacement of the heritage attributes deteriorated by water infiltration will incorporate traditional craftsmanship and materials to replicate profiles to match existing and remaining to ensure longevity and maintain the designated features of the property.

Key dates:

Sub-committee meeting date: April 19, 2022 Notice of Complete Application: April 11, 2022

Sub-committee comments and advice:

The Sub-committee considered the Application and passed the following motion:

(Burke/Carroll)

That the Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee advises that Heritage Permit Application HP2022-009 be approved as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any Application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- b) That the Applicant submit designer specifications for the replacement storm windows prior to the commencement of any alterations; and,
- c) Implementation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than April 30, 2025. If the alterations are not completed by April

30, 2025, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.

CARRIED

Final Recommendation:

That the Applicant be advised that Heritage Permit Application HP2022-009 is approved in accordance with the submitted Application, subject to the following conditions:

- a) That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any Application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- b) That the Applicant submit designer specifications for the replacement storm windows prior to the commencement of any alterations to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner; and,
- c) Implementation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than April 30, 2025. If the alterations are not completed by April 30, 2025, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.

Approval:		
Staff Approval:	Sykhl.	Ken signed by signed by service Coit 1.3655 -0409
	Stacey Kursikowski, MCIP RPP Cultural Heritage Planner	MGR Initials
Authorized:	Eland and	
	Steve Robichaud, MCIP RPP Director of Planning and Chief Planner	

Reasons for Designation (By-law No. 89-176)

Of particular importance to the preservation of 256-258 MacNab Street North is the street facade, including the carriage entrance, the ornate wooden bays, the dormers, bargeboard, original doorways and windows, and roofs and chimneys (but excluding the later porch additions).