



City of Hamilton

HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE ADDENDUM

Meeting #: 23-005

Date: May 19, 2023

Time: 12:00 p.m.

Location: Room 264, 2nd Floor, City Hall (hybrid) (RM)
71 Main Street West

Matt Gauthier, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 6437

5. COMMUNICATIONS

- *5.1 Correspondence from Corbett Land Strategies Inc., respecting 9511 Twenty Road W, Hamilton - Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Report PED23136 Proactive Listings for the Municipal Heritage Register

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 10.1.

13. GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS

- *13.3 Ontario Heritage Conference 2023 (no copy)



May 16th, 2023

City of Hamilton
71 Main Street W
2nd Floor, Room 264, City Hall
Hamilton ON L8P 4Y5

| | |
|------------|---|
| TO: | Matt Gauthier Legislative Coordinator clerk@hamilton.ca 905-546-2424 ext. 6437 |
| RE: | 9511 Twenty Road W, Hamilton Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee – Report PED23136 Proactive Listings for the Municipal Heritage Register |

Dear Committee,

Corbett Land Strategies Inc. (CLS) is writing on behalf of Heenco Holdings Inc. for the subject lands located at 9511 Twenty Road West in Hamilton. This letter is in response to Staff Report PED23136, where staff are proposing to list the existing dwelling on site within the Municipal Heritage Registry as the dwelling has been noted to contain cultural heritage value. It is understood the existing dwelling has been inventoried by the City previously.

EXISTING SITE CONDITIONS

The subject lands contain a vacant dwelling and former agricultural field. The site contains one existing dwelling which is described as a one-storey brick house. The site also contains Natural Heritage features such as Core Areas, a Provincially Significant Wetland, Key Hydrologic Features and Linkages.

The existing dwelling is currently vacant and requires extensive repairs to be deemed livable and to meet the Ontario Building Code standards. Due to previous tenant possession, the house was not maintained and some of the original historical attributes of the house may have been compromised.

APPLICATION BACKGROUND

It is important to note that the subject lands contain multiple active development applications. These applications include the following:

- Draft Plan of Industrial Subdivision (25T-201807)
- Joint Official Plan Amendment (UHOPA-18-016) and Zoning By-law Amendment (ZAC-18-040)
- Formal Consultation (FC-21-027) Official Plan Amendment
- Formal Consultation (FC-23-049) Secondary Plan Official Plan Amendment

As stated in the staff report, due to the recent Formal Consultation application (FC-23-049), the City is being proactive when listing properties of cultural heritage value or interest. A property is now required to be listed on the Register prior to a Prescribed Event under the *Planning Act* for a municipality to be able to issue a notice of intention to designate within a 90-day restricted window.

Significant work has been completed to advance these applications and of importance to this Committee, a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) was completed in 2018 by Golder & Associates. Within the report it was recommended to modify the site plan to avoid direct impacts of the built heritage resources and to monitor for vibration impact during construction and to rehabilitate the dwelling for new uses on smaller residential lots.

GARTH STREET EXTENSION

The Garth Street extension has a proposed width of 45.72m, which aligns with the Airport Employment Growth District (AEGD) Secondary Plan and the City’s Transportation Master Plan. Unfortunately, the existing dwelling in question is located partially within the proposed right-of-way alignment, as identified by the City.

CITY’S PRELIMINARY EVALUATION OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST

| Preliminary Evaluation (in accordance with Reg 9/06) | |
|--|------------------------|
| City Category: | Owner Response: |
| <u>Design/ Physical Value</u> 1. The property is a representative example of a late-nineteenth century farmhouse, influenced by the Italianate style of architecture. The two-storey, red brick dwelling features a hip roof with modillion | Understood. |



CORBETT LAND STRATEGIES INC.

VISION • EXPERTISE

| | |
|---|--|
| brackets and segmental arch doors and window openings with stone sills. | |
| 2. The property does not appear to display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit. | Agreed. Due to existing conditions of the site, left by previous tenants, the artistic merit has been further limited. |
| 3. The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement. | Agreed. |
| <u>Historical/ Associated Value</u> | Understood as per the completed CHIA report (2018). |
| 4. The property is associated with the development of the Township of Glanford and the Marshall family. The house itself was owned by William Marshall, the son of Alexander Marshall Sr., who opened a lime quarry, which was in operation until the late 1920s. | |
| 5. The property does not appear to yield, or have the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture. | Agreed. If this building was maintained, it does provide an inherit cultural or community feel to warrant a designated plaque in the future. |
| 6. The property does not appear to demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community. | Agreed, the history of the owner is unknown or the importance clear in terms of historical value. |
| <u>Contextual Value</u> | As the site will host a major piece of infrastructure as per the AEGD Secondary Plan, the location of the house does pose to be challenging to incorporate into the overall design of the community. |
| 7. The property has contextual value as it helps maintain and support the rural character of the area, with its large lot size, deep setback from the road, and its collection of related outbuildings. | |
| 8. The property has contextual value as it is historically and physically linked to its surroundings, which contributes to the rural nature of the property. | |
| 9. The property is not considered to be a local landmark. | Agreed. |



RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preliminary evaluation completed by the City, it was identified that the dwelling lacks sufficient character to be viewed as an historical dwelling. If the building were to be maintained or have existing conditions improved, a significant cost would be required which still may not achieve the intended effects or preserve the heritage objectives. Some of the original character would be lost due to the negligent condition of the house. Also, the history of the house is not entirely clear to the local community and most likely would not warrant a fare to be utilized as a museum.

On behalf of the owner, we recommend that the property not be listed within the Municipal Heritage Registry given the existing conditions of the building, the location within and adjacent to a municipally planned right-of-way and cultural heritage considerations noted above. This is due to the fact that the current proposed land use plan for the area is currently being updated and other changes are being made to preserve and enhance the NHS system. A heritage conservation program is not yet in effect.

Should there be any questions or a need for further information, feel free to reach out to the below.

Sincerely,

John Corbett

John B. Corbett, MCIP, RPP
President
Corbett Land Strategies Inc.
john@corbettlandstrategies.ca
416-806-5164

cc: Heenco Holdings Inc.