

#### **City of Hamilton**

#### HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE ADDENDUM

Meeting #:	23-011
Date:	November 28, 2023
Time:	12:00 p.m.
Location:	Room 264, 2nd Floor, City Hall (hybrid) (RM)
	71 Main Street West

Aleah Whalen, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 6436

#### 8. STAFF PRESENTATIONS

\*8.1 Introduction to Cultural Heritage Planning - Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Member Orientation

Presentation attached.

\*8.2 Recommendation to Designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, known as Birch Lawn, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED23241) (Ward 12)

Presentation attached.

\*8.3 Recommendation to Designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, former Ancaster Carriage Company Factory, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED23192) (Ward 12)

Presentation attached.

#### 9. CONSENT ITEMS

- 9.3 Delegated Approval: Heritage Permit Applications
  - \*j. Heritage Permit Application HP2023-052: Installation of a Municipal Heritage Plaque at 289 Dundas Street East, Dundas (Ward 15) (By-law No. 22-139)



# Introduction to Cultural Heritage Planning

HMHC Member Orientation November 28, 2023

> PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN

Alissa Golden, Cultural Heritage Program Lead

### **Presentation Overview**

- Role of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
- Heritage Planning in Ontario
- Understanding Heritage Status
  - Inventoried properties
  - Registered properties ("listed")
  - Designated properties (and Heritage Conservation Easements)
- Heritage Permits
- Proactive Heritage Work
- Financial Incentives





### Administration

- Heritage Municipal Heritage Committee
  - Established under the Ontario Heritage Act
  - Follows the term of Council
  - 7 citizen members, 1 Councillor member
  - Meet monthly (hybrid)
  - Meeting agenda published one week before the meeting
  - Chair runs the meeting
  - Assisted by the Legislative Coordinator (Clerks)
  - Public meeting that is also live streamed and recorded/archived
  - Delegations see "Request to Speak to a Committee of Council" online



### The Role of Heritage Committee

- To *advise* and *assist* City staff and Council:
  - on all matters relating to the designation of property, the review of heritage permit applications and other cultural heritage conservation measures under Parts IV and V of the Ontario Heritage Act.
  - in the preparation, evaluation and maintenance of a list of properties and areas worthy of conservation.
  - on any other matters relating to the conservation of listed properties or areas of cultural heritage value or interest.
  - on programs and activities to increase public awareness and knowledge of heritage conservation issues.



### The Role of Heritage Committee (con't)

- To prepare, by the 31st day of January each year, an **annual report** of the previous year's activities.
- To participate, where possible, on at least one of the following: Inventory and Research, Policy and Design, Education and Communication, Heritage Permit Review SubCommittee.
- To participate, where possible in other external groups and/or stakeholder committees.
- To participate, where possible in heritage events and activities, such as the Annual Hamilton Municipal Heritage Recognition Awards.







PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN

#### Planning & Economic Development Department

Jason Thorne, General Manager

#### **Planning Division**

Stephen Robichaud, Director & Chief Planner

#### Heritage & Urban Design Section

Ken Coit, Director

Cultural Heritage Planning Team

Alissa Golden, Program Lead

Emily Bent, Cultural Heritage Planner

Meg Oldfield, Cultural Heritage Planner

Cultural Heritage Planner (Vacant)

Scott Dickinson, Heritage Planning Technician

Heritage Planning Technician (Vacant)

Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner (Student)



PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN

### The Role of Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee

- To advise the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, Cultural Heritage planning staff, and the Director of Planning on the consideration of **Heritage Permit** applications to:
  - alter designated heritage properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.
  - alter properties within a Heritage Conservation District designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.



### The Role of Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District Advisory Committee\*

 To act as a sounding board for residents within the Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District to preview and comment on the acceptability of changes proposed within the District, including Heritage Permit applications under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act, through the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee.



## HMHC Working Groups

- Policy and Design: serves to advise on matters primarily under the Planning Act, Environmental Assessment Act and the Niagara Escarpment Planning and Development Act, including the review of Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment reports
- **Inventory and Research**: serves to advise on matters relating to preparation of inventory and research material, including the review of Cultural Heritage Evaluation reports
- Education and Communication: serves to advise on matters relating to celebration of cultural heritage matters, etc. (HMHC Awards)





## Heritage Planning in Ontario

- Municipalities are tasked with ensuring that *significant cultural heritage resources are conserved* (*Planning Act*, Provincial Policy Statement).
- The Ontario Heritage Act (the Act) is the main tool available to municipalities to accomplish this goal.
  - **Protection**: designation and heritage easements; manage physical changes through the **Heritage Permit** process
  - **Recognition**: listing non-designated properties on the Municipal Heritage Register; interim protection from demolition (60-days notice)
- Other appliable legislation includes: Environmental Assessment Act, Greenbelt Act, Niagara Escarpment Planning and Development Act, Funeral, Burial and Cremation Services Act



## **Cultural Heritage Resources**



# Archaeology

Artifacts, archaeological sites, and marine sites



# Built Heritage

Buildings, structures, monuments, installations or remains



# Cultural Heritage Landscapes

Groupings of structures, space, archaeological sites and natural elements



PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN

### What is Heritage Conservation?

- Understanding and respecting
- Preventative maintenance
- Minimal intervention
- Managing change, not preventing it

### General Rule:

Repair rather than replace original features and avoid permanent damage to historic materials or construction measures.



## Why Conserve Heritage Buildings?

- Connects us to our past
- Sense of place and identity
- Traditional materials: repairable and reusable
- Historic neighbourhoods: resilient, walkable
- The greenest building is the one already built
- Heritage is a public good

"Don't it always seem to go, that you don't know what you've got till it's gone." – Joni Mitchell



## What is a "Heritage" Building?

A building may have heritage value or interest if it:

- Is a community landmark
- Was designed by, or related to, a significant person in the community, province or country
- Demonstrates a high degree of craftsmanship or artistry
- Is representative of, or contributes to, the character of a community
- Is related to an important event in the history of the city or the development of a neighbourhood



## **Understanding Heritage Status**



Municipal Heritage Register

> Designated Properties

### **SURVEYED** (6,972)

Database of Information, No Legal Status

### **SCREENED** (2,348)

Official Register of Heritage Properties, Recognition with Minimal Protection

### **EVALUATED & PROTECTED** (649)

Designation under *Ontario Heritage Act*, Recognition and Protection by By-law and / or Easement



PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN

### What is the Inventory?





PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN





PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN

### What is the Register?

- Heritage conservation management tool under the OHA
- Administrative record consisting of:
  - Properties designated under Parts IV and V of the Ontario Heritage Act
  - Non-designated properties identified by Council as being of heritage interest ("listed")
- Non-designated properties are "listed" on the Register to:
  - Help prioritize future designations
  - Provide interim protection from demolition
- Strategic approach to listing (post-Bill 23)
  - Monthly proactive listing reports
  - "Prescribed events"
  - 2-year expiries, and 5-year restriction on re-listing after expiry



### **Interim Protection for Listed Properties**

- "Notice of Intention to Demolish" (required by OHA)
  - Separate from the Building Permit process
- Cannot prevent demolition, but delays it 60 days
- Gives CHP staff time to discuss alternatives to demo, possibly designate to void demo permit
- Building Permit to Demolish cannot be issued until end of 60-day notice period (confirmed by CHP staff)







## What is Designation?

- Protection for significant heritage properties by By-law
  - Part IV Individual Properties
  - Part V Heritage Conservation Districts
- Identifies value and attributes
- Framework for managing change (Heritage Permits)







### Designation serves to:

- Recognize the importance of a property to a community
- Identify and protect the cultural heritage value of a property
- Encourage good stewardship and conservation
- Promote knowledge and understanding about the property and the development of the community



## Criteria for Part IV Designation (Ontario Regulation 9/06)

- Must meet **two** of the criteria to be eligible for designation
- 9 criteria, broken into 3 categories:
  - Design / Physical Value
  - Historical / Associative Value
  - Contextual Value



### Part IV Designation Process





PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN

## **Designated Properties in Hamilton**

- **291** (and counting) individually designated properties
- **349** properties in seven Heritage Conservation Districts
  - Beach Boulevard (Hamilton)
  - Cross-Melville (Dundas)
  - Durand-Markland (Hamilton)
  - MacNab-Charles (Hamilton)
  - Mill Street (Flamborough)
  - St. Clair Avenue (Hamilton)
  - St. Clair Boulevard (Hamilton)







### Heritage Conservation Easement Agreements

- May be negotiated between an owner and:
  - The municipality
  - The Ontario Heritage Trust
- Approvals required for alterations to heritage attributes
- Similar to designation
- Most are also designated, a few only have an easement





### **Applicable Law for Building Permits**

Heritage Status	Applicable Law
Inventoried	No applicable law for OBC
"Listed" - Registered (Non-Designated)	60-day delay from demolition (Section 27, <i>Ontario</i> <i>Heritage Act</i> ); No applicable law regarding "alterations"
Designated (Part IV, V) and/or Heritage Easement	Heritage Permit approval may be required before a Building Permit can be issued





### What are Heritage Permits?

- Owners of designated properties are required to get Council approval prior to making certain physical changes
- Managed through the **Heritage Permit** process (no cost to apply)
- Ensure proposed changes do not adversely impact the identified heritage value and attributes
- Possible effects / impacts:
  - Displacement: changes resulting in damage, loss or removal of identified heritage attributes/values
  - Disruption: actions resulting in detrimental changes to the setting or character of the designated property



## When is a Heritage Permit Required?

### • Part IV – Individually Designated Properties

- When there is any potential impact to the identified heritage value and attributes in the designation by-law (post-2005)
- When there is any potential impact to the "reasons for designation" (pre-2005)

### • Part V – Heritage Conservation District Properties

- When changes are proposed to the exterior of buildings and landscapes in the district visible from the public right-of-way
- When demolition or removal of a building or structure is proposed
- When the construction of a new building or structure is proposed
- As required by the Heritage Conservation District Plan





## When is a Heritage Permit Required?

- Typically, when there is any potential impact to the identified heritage value and attributes
- For example:
  - Significant additions
  - Demolition of buildings or structures
  - Masonry cleaning and repointing
  - Replacement of historic fabric or identified features
  - Installation of dormers, skylights, etc.
  - Installation of signage to a designated façade
  - Installation of temporary/removable storm windows and doors
  - Painting of previously unpainted masonry
  - Removal of architectural decorative details
  - Major landscaping





### Heritage Permit Administration

- All permits reviewed by HPRS for advice
- Decision required in 90 days, but most permits are processed within a month (consent, consent with conditions, refuse)
- Alteration permits are typically approved by the Director of Planning (delegated authority of Council)
  - Delegated approval letters included on HMHC agenda for information
- Council approval required for certain applications (cannot be delegated):
  - Demolition of a heritage attribute or building on a Part IV property
  - Demolition or new building construction on a Part V property
  - Refusal of an application
  - Disagreement between staff and HPRS/HMHC on recommendation



### **Conditions of Heritage Permit Approval**

#### Standard Conditions

- Minor changes to the approval submitted to the satisfaction of staff
- 2-year permit expiry

### Other Condition Examples:

- Obtaining other required approvals prior to commencing works (e.g. *Planning Act* applications, City Forestry, etc.)
- Final design or material details submitted to the satisfaction of staff
- Final methodology or scope of repair work submitted to satisfaction of staff
- Masonry repair or repointing in conformity with the City's Masonry Restoration Guidelines



### **Proactive Heritage Work**

- Public List of Candidates for Part IV Designation
  - Includes 60 high-priority properties for review by January 1, 2025
  - Identifying new designation candidates (e.g. prescribed events)
- Development of a Heritage Conservation District Strategy and Work Plan
  - Preliminary HCD Study list:
    - Gore Park, King Street East, Hamilton
    - Waterdown Village, Flamborough
    - Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton
    - Ancaster Village, Wilson Street East, Ancaster
    - Charlton-Hughson-Forest-John Block, Hamilton
    - James Street North, Hamilton
    - Mineral Springs Road, Ancaster
    - Strathcona Neighbourhood, Hamilton
- Ongoing Melville Street HCD Study (Dundas)







#### PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN




#### PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT HERITAGE AND URBAN DESIGN

## **Financial Incentives**

- Development Charge Exemption for the Adaptive Reuse of Heritage Properties
- Hamilton Heritage Property Grant Program (HHPGP)
- Hamilton Heritage Conservation Grant Program (HHCGP)
- Hamilton Community Heritage Fund Loan Program (HCHF)

The City also offers a variety of other financial incentive programs that can be used in conjunction with the heritage-specific funding programs.



37

## Thank you!

## For more information:

Heritage Planning: www.hamilton.ca/heritageplanning Public Heritage Mapping: www.map.hamilton.ca/heritagemap Designation: www.hamilton.ca/heritagedesignation Heritage Permits: www.hamilton.ca/heritagepermits Register: www.hamilton.ca/municipalheritageregister Built Heritage Inventory: <u>www.hamilton.ca/heritageinventory</u> Heritage Grants and Loans: www.investinhamilton.ca





#### CITY OF HAMILTON PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT Planning Division

TO:	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	November 28, 2023
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, known as Birch Lawn, under Part IV of the <i>Ontario</i> <i>Heritage Act</i> (PED23241) (Ward 12)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 12
PREPARED BY:	Scott Dickinson (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7167 Alissa Golden (905) 546-2423 Ext. 1202
SUBMITTED BY:	Anita Fabac Acting Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	Atotabu

#### RECOMMENDATION

That the City Clerk be directed to give notice of Council's intention to designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED23241, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23241, subject to the following:

- (a) If no objections are received to the notice of intention to designate in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to introduce the necessary by-law to designate the property to be of cultural heritage value or interest to City Council;
- (b) If an objection to the notice of intention to designate is received in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to report back to Council to allow Council to consider the objection and decide whether or not to withdraw the notice of intention to designate the property.

#### SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23241) (Ward 12) -Page 2 of 6

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This Report recommends designation of the significant built heritage resource located at 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, known as Birch Lawn, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The subject property is currently listed on the City's Municipal Heritage Register (Register). Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property using *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and determined that it has sufficient cultural heritage value or interest to warrant designation, as per the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23241.

#### Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 5

#### FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: N/A

- Staffing: N/A
- Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and considered by Council before either withdrawing the notice of intention to designate or passing a designation by-law. Once a designation by-law has been passed, any further objection would be heard before the Ontario Land Tribunal.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the *Act*.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)).

The City of Hamilton also provides financial incentive programs, including development charge exemption and heritage grants and loans, to assist in the adaptive re-use and continued conservation of properties once they are designated.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

#### SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23241) (Ward 12) -Page 3 of 6

#### HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property located at 176 Wilson Street East, Hamilton, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED23241, is comprised of a two-storey brick building constructed circa 1881. The subject property was first surveyed for potential heritage interest in the 1970s.

Between 1976 and 1985, the Ancaster Local Architectural Conservation Advisory Committee (former Heritage Committee) conducted an inventory of properties of potential heritage interest across the community. In 1978, as part of that inventory, a heritage research report was prepared for the subject property. A copy of the report "Fraser House: 176 Wilson Street" was utilized in the writing of this Report (see the Research Sources attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED23241).

In 2020, the subject property was listed on the Municipal Heritage Register (Register) and was added to staff's designation workplan for further research and assessment of the property. As a result of the recent *Bill 23* changes to the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the former staff workplan for designation was rescinded and replaced with a new public list of Candidates for Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (see Report PED22211(a)), at which time 176 Wilson Street East was reprioritized for review for designation by January 1, 2025.

In a letter dated July 10, 2023, Cultural Heritage Planning staff notified the property owner of the changes to the City's heritage designation process and the reprioritization of staff's review of the property for designation. In a subsequent letter dated October 18, 2023, staff advised the owner of the recommendation to designate the property, provided them with a copy of the proposed Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and advised them of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting date that the recommendation would be considered. On October 24, 2023, the property owners called staff with their concerns that designation of their property might increase their insurance rates or complicate the sale of the property.

#### POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The Recommendation of this Report is consistent with Provincial and Municipal legislation, policy and direction, including:

- Determining the cultural heritage value or interest of a property based on design/physical value, historical/associative value and contextual value criteria (*Ontario Heritage Act, Ontario Regulation 9/06*);
- Ensuring significant built heritage resources are conserved (*Provincial Policy Statement*, 2020, Sub-section 2.6.1); and,

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

#### SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23241) (Ward 12) -Page 4 of 6

• Designating properties of cultural heritage value under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Urban Hamilton Official Plan, Section B.3.4.2.3).

#### **RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

#### External

• Property Owner.

In addition, Planning staff have emailed the Ward Councillor (Councillor C. Cassar) for Ward 12 and provided an overview of the reasons for designation and the process for designating a property.

#### ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of significant cultural heritage resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality can manage change to a property through the Heritage Permit process to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained.

Section 29(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets two or more of the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest prescribed in *Ontario Regulation 9/06*, as amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22*, which identifies nine criteria in three broad categories: Design / Physical Value; Historical / Associative Value; and, Contextual Value. The evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the subject property was completed by Cultural Heritage Planning staff based on a site visit of the exterior of the property conducted on August 28, 2023 (see photographs attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED23241) and available primary and secondary research sources (attached as Appendix "D" to PED23241). As outlined below, based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation, it was determined that the subject property meets four of the nine criteria contained in *Ontario Regulation 9/06* in all three categories.

#### **Design / Physical Value**

1. The two-storey brick dwelling located at 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, known historically as 'Birch Lawn', was constructed circa 1881. A small sympathetic addition was constructed on the southern side by the mid-to-late-twentieth century. The property has design or physical value as it is a representative example of the Italianate style of architecture as applied to a private dwelling. The features typical of the Italianate style include its: truncated hip roof (that once supported iron cresting); wide projecting eaves supported by paired wooden brackets; projecting

Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully. OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner. OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged

#### SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23241) (Ward 12) -Page 5 of 6

three-sided two-storey front and side bays with polygonal roofs; and decorative elements in dichromatic brick, including prominent quoins, broken pediment hoods over windows and ornamental panels under prominent eaves.

- 2. The property displays a high degree of craftsmanship, as evidenced by dichromatic decorative brickwork which ornaments the chimney, corners, windows and eaves.
- 3. The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

#### Historical / Associative Value

- 4. The property does not have direct association with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to the community.
- 5. The property does not yield or have the potential to yield information that contributes to understanding a community or culture.
- 6. The property does not demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community.

#### **Contextual Value**

- 7. The property is important in supporting the character of the historic village of Ancaster. A large, former farmhouse, the property marks one of the entrances into the village core of Ancaster.
- 8. The property is historically linked to its surroundings being in its original location on the historic Wilson Street transportation corridor.
- 9. The property is not considered to be a landmark.

Staff have determined that 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster is of cultural heritage value or interest sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and recommend designation according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23241.

#### ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may decide to designate property or decline to designate property.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

#### SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23241) (Ward 12) -Page 6 of 6

#### **Decline to Designate**

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant cultural heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's financial incentives for heritage properties, including development charge exemption and grant and loan programs. Designation alone does not restrict the legal use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or been demonstrated to affect its resale value. However, designation does allow the municipality to manage change to the heritage attributes of a property through the Heritage Permit process. Staff does not consider declining to designate any of the properties to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

#### APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report PED23241 – Location Map Appendix "B" to Report PED23241 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 – Photographs Appendix "D" to Report PED23241 – Research Sources

SD/AG/sd

#### Appendix "A" to Report PED23241 Page 1 of 1



#### STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST AND DESCRIPTION OF HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES

#### **Description of Property**

The 0.125-hectare property municipally-addressed as 176 Wilson Street East is comprised of a two-storey brick dwelling constructed circa 1881. The property is located on the southeastern side of Wilson Street East, opposite the intersection of Wilson Street East and Dalley Drive, in the community of Ancaster in the City of Hamilton.

#### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest**

The two-storey brick dwelling located at 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, known historically as 'Birch Lawn', was constructed circa 1881. A small sympathetic addition was constructed on the southern side by the mid-to-late-twentieth century. The property has design or physical value as it is a representative example of the Italianate style of architecture as applied to a private dwelling, displaying a high degree of craftsmanship in its construction. Contextually, the property is important in supporting the character of the historic village of Ancaster and is historically linked to its surroundings. It is located on the historic Wilson Street transportation corridor and still marks the western entrance into the core, though now surrounded by modern construction.

#### **Description of Heritage Attributes:**

Key attributes that embody the design/physical value of the property as being representative of the Italianate style or architecture and demonstrating a high degree of craftsmanship, include:

- The front (north) and side (east and west) elevations and roofline of the twostorey brick building, including its:
  - Truncated hip roof with wide projecting eaves and paired decorative wooden brackets;
  - Single stack corbelled brick chimney to the east;
  - Projecting three-sided two-storey bays to the front (north) and side (east) with polygonal roofs;
  - Segmentally-arched window openings with decorative buff brick broken pediment hoods, stone lug sills and one-over-one hung wood windows with storms;
  - Front door with segmentally-arched opening with buff brick voussoirs and transom; and,
  - Dichromatic brick work including buff brick quoining, paneling under the projecting eaves and chimney detailing.

Key attributes that embody the contextual value of the property as a supporting feature of the historical character of Wilson Street East include its:

• Location fronting onto Wilson Street East at the eastern entrance into Ancaster Village.

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 1 of 5

#### Photographs

All images taken by City of Hamilton Staff on August 28, 2023.



Image 1: Front (northern) elevation, from the west

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 2 of 5



Image 2: Front (northern) elevation, from the east, showing the projecting bay in the side (east) elevation

Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 3 of 5



Image 3: Wilson streetscape looking from the west



Image 4: Wilson streetscape looking from the west, demonstrating the setback of property

Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 4 of 5



Image 5: Wilson streetscape looking east into Ancaster Village, subject property obscured from view due to setback



Image 6: Detail of chimney and truncated hip roof

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 5 of 5



Image 9: Close up showing the projecting bay to the east, the paired brackets below the eave, dichromatic brickwork, wood windows with storms and front door with transom

#### Appendix "D" to Report PED23241 Page 1 of 1

#### **Research Sources**

John Richards in the 1871 Census." *Ancestry*. Accessed June 19, 2023. https://www.ancestrylibrary.com/discoveryuicontent/view/287298:7922?tid=&pid=&queryId=3030c2fde0cefa3ba24acb574cd4a860& \_phsrc=qEP79&\_phstart=successSource

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Wentworth County Directory 1883*. Accessed June 19, 2023. https://www.canadiana.ca/view/oocihm.8\_00033\_2/1

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Wentworth County Directory 1886*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://www.canadiana.ca/view/oocihm.8\_00033\_3/1</u>

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Farmers' and business directory for 1891*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780595\_p1</u>

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Farmers' and business directory for 1892/1893*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780596\_p7</u>

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Farmers' and business directory for 1894*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780597\_p6</u>

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Farmers' and business directory for 1895*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780604\_p1</u>

"Ancaster's Heritage" Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1973

"Fraser House by Frances Pinch" Ancaster LACAC 1978

#### Appendix "A" to Report PED23241 Page 1 of 1



#### STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST AND DESCRIPTION OF HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES

#### **Description of Property**

The 0.125-hectare property municipally-addressed as 176 Wilson Street East is comprised of a two-storey brick dwelling constructed circa 1881. The property is located on the southeastern side of Wilson Street East, opposite the intersection of Wilson Street East and Dalley Drive, in the community of Ancaster in the City of Hamilton.

#### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest**

The two-storey brick dwelling located at 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, known historically as 'Birch Lawn', was constructed circa 1881. A small sympathetic addition was constructed on the southern side by the mid-to-late-twentieth century. The property has design or physical value as it is a representative example of the Italianate style of architecture as applied to a private dwelling, displaying a high degree of craftsmanship in its construction. Contextually, the property is important in supporting the character of the historic village of Ancaster and is historically linked to its surroundings. It is located on the historic Wilson Street transportation corridor and still marks the western entrance into the core, though now surrounded by modern construction.

#### **Description of Heritage Attributes:**

Key attributes that embody the design/physical value of the property as being representative of the Italianate style or architecture and demonstrating a high degree of craftsmanship, include:

- The front (north) and side (east and west) elevations and roofline of the twostorey brick building, including its:
  - Truncated hip roof with wide projecting eaves and paired decorative wooden brackets;
  - Single stack corbelled brick chimney to the east;
  - Projecting three-sided two-storey bays to the front (north) and side (east) with polygonal roofs;
  - Segmentally-arched window openings with decorative buff brick broken pediment hoods, stone lug sills and one-over-one hung wood windows with storms;
  - Front door with segmentally-arched opening with buff brick voussoirs and transom; and,
  - Dichromatic brick work including buff brick quoining, paneling under the projecting eaves and chimney detailing.

Key attributes that embody the contextual value of the property as a supporting feature of the historical character of Wilson Street East include its:

• Location fronting onto Wilson Street East at the eastern entrance into Ancaster Village.

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 1 of 5

#### Photographs

All images taken by City of Hamilton Staff on August 28, 2023.



Image 1: Front (northern) elevation, from the west

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 2 of 5



Image 2: Front (northern) elevation, from the east, showing the projecting bay in the side (east) elevation

Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 3 of 5



Image 3: Wilson streetscape looking from the west



Image 4: Wilson streetscape looking from the west, demonstrating the setback of property

Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 4 of 5



Image 5: Wilson streetscape looking east into Ancaster Village, subject property obscured from view due to setback



Image 6: Detail of chimney and truncated hip roof

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23241 Page 5 of 5



Image 9: Close up showing the projecting bay to the east, the paired brackets below the eave, dichromatic brickwork, wood windows with storms and front door with transom

#### Appendix "D" to Report PED23241 Page 1 of 1

#### **Research Sources**

John Richards in the 1871 Census." *Ancestry*. Accessed June 19, 2023. https://www.ancestrylibrary.com/discoveryuicontent/view/287298:7922?tid=&pid=&queryId=3030c2fde0cefa3ba24acb574cd4a860& \_phsrc=qEP79&\_phstart=successSource

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Wentworth County Directory 1883*. Accessed June 19, 2023. https://www.canadiana.ca/view/oocihm.8\_00033\_2/1

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Wentworth County Directory 1886*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://www.canadiana.ca/view/oocihm.8\_00033\_3/1</u>

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Farmers' and business directory for 1891*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780595\_p1</u>

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Farmers' and business directory for 1892/1893*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780596\_p7</u>

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Farmers' and business directory for 1894*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780597\_p6</u>

"John Richards, Ancaster" *Farmers' and business directory for 1895*. Accessed June 19, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780604\_p1</u>

"Ancaster's Heritage" Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1973

"Fraser House by Frances Pinch" Ancaster LACAC 1978

PED23241



## Recommendation to Designate 176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster

November 28, 2023 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

> Planning and Economic Development Planning Division, Heritage and Urban Design

Scott Dickinson, Cultural Heritage Planning Technician



## **176 Wilson Street East**





Planning and Economic Development Planning Division, Heritage and Urban Design

## Background

- June 2020 Property listed on Municipal Heritage Register and designation work plan
- February 2023 Re-Prioritized for Designation by January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025





Planning and Economic Development Planning Division, Heritage and Urban Design

## Recommendation for Designation Under Part IV of the OHA

176 Wilson Street East, Ancaster

Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria (4 of 9)

- Design / Physical (Criteria #1, 2)
- Contextual (Criteria #7, 8)



Design / Physical Value

- 1. The property is a **representative example** of Italianate architecture.
- 2. The property is considered to **display a high degree** of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- 3. The property is <u>not</u> considered to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

## Heritage Evaluation Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria





## Heritage Evaluation Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria

## Historical / Associative Value

- 4. The property does <u>not</u> have direct associations with ideas, events or persons of significance.
- 5. The property is <u>not</u> considered to have the potential to yield information that contributes to the understanding of a community or culture.
- 6. The property is <u>not</u> considered to demonstrate the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist significant to the community



## Heritage Evaluation Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria

## **Contextual Value**

- 7. The property helps **support** the historic character of Wilson Street East and Ancaster.
- 8. The property is historically linked to its surroundings.
- 9. The property is <u>not</u> considered to be a local landmark.





Planning and Economic Development Planning Division, Heritage and Urban Design

# Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (Summary)

The property located at 176 Wilson Street East is a two-storey brick dwelling constructed circa 1881. It is a **representative example** of Italianate architecture and displays **a high degree of craftsmanship**.

The property **helps support** the character of Wilson Street East and Ancaster, and is **historically** linked to its surroundings



## Description of Heritage Attributes (Summary)

- Front (north) and side (east and west) exterior elevations and roofline, including its:
  - Hip roof with projecting eaves and decorative wooden brackets;
  - Brick chimney;
  - Front and side projecting bays with polygonal roofs;
  - Window openings with decorative brick hoods, stone lug sills;
  - Hung wood windows with storms;
  - o Front door with transom; and,
  - o Dichromatic brick work.
- Location fronting onto Wilson Street East.






# QUESTIONS?



# THANK YOU



#### CITY OF HAMILTON PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT Planning Division

то:	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	November 28, 2023
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, former Ancaster Carriage Company Factory, under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (PED23192) (Ward 12)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 12
PREPARED BY:	Scott Dickinson (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7167 Alissa Golden (905) 546-2423 Ext. 1202
SUBMITTED BY:	Anita Fabac Acting Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

#### RECOMMENDATION

That the City Clerk be directed to give notice of Council's intention to designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED23192, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23192, subject to the following:

- (a) If no objections are received to the notice of intention to designate in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to introduce the necessary by-law to designate the property to be of cultural heritage value or interest to City Council;
- (b) If an objection to the notice of intention to designate is received in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to report back to Council to allow Council to consider the objection and decide whether or not to withdraw the notice of intention to designate the property.

## SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, former Ancaster Carriage Company Factory, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23192) (Ward 12) - Page 2 of 6

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This Report recommends designation of the significant built heritage resource located at 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, known as the former Ancaster Carriage Company Factory, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The subject property is currently listed on the City's Municipal Heritage Register (Register). Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property using *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and determined that it has sufficient cultural heritage value or interest to warrant designation, as per the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23192.

#### Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 6

#### FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: N/A

- Staffing: N/A
- Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and considered by Council before either withdrawing the notice of intention to designate or passing a designation by-law. Once a designation by-law has been passed, any further objection would be heard before the Ontario Land Tribunal.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the *Act*.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)).

The City of Hamilton also provides financial incentive programs, including development charge exemption and heritage grants and loans, to assist in the adaptive re-use and continued conservation of properties once they are designated.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

## SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, former Ancaster Carriage Company Factory, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23192) (Ward 12) - Page 3 of 6

#### HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property located at 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED23192, is comprised of a two-storey stone industrial building constructed in 1885. The subject property was first surveyed for potential heritage interest in the 1970s.

Between 1976 and 1985, the Ancaster Local Architectural Conservation Advisory Committee (former Heritage Committee) conducted an inventory of properties of potential heritage interest across the community. In 1980, as part of that inventory, a heritage research report was prepared for the subject property. A copy of the report "The Carriage Works: 241 -245 Wilson Street" was utilized in the writing of this Report (see the Research Sources attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED23192).

In 2020, the subject property was listed on the Municipal Heritage Register (Register) and was added to staff's designation workplan for further research and assessment of the property. As a result of the recent *Bill 23* changes to the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the former staff workplan for designation was rescinded and replaced with a new public list of Candidates for Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (see Report PED22211(a)), at which time 241 Wilson Street East was reprioritized for review for designation by January 1, 2025.

In a letter dated July 10, 2023, Cultural Heritage Planning staff notified the property owner of the changes to the City's heritage designation process and the reprioritization of staff's review of the property for designation. In a subsequent letter dated October 18, 2023, staff advised the owner of the recommendation to designate the property, provided them with a copy of the proposed Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and advised them of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting date that the recommendation would be considered.

#### POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The Recommendation of this Report is consistent with Provincial and Municipal legislation, policy and direction, including:

- Determining the cultural heritage value or interest of a property based on design/physical value, historical/associative value and contextual value criteria (*Ontario Heritage Act, Ontario Regulation 9/06*);
- Ensuring significant built heritage resources are conserved (*Provincial Policy Statement*, 2020, Sub-section 2.6.1); and,
- Designating properties of cultural heritage value under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Urban Hamilton Official Plan, Section B.3.4.2.3).

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

## SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, former Ancaster Carriage Company Factory, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23192) (Ward 12) - Page 4 of 6

#### **RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

#### External

• Property Owner.

In addition, Planning staff have emailed the Ward Councillor (Councillor C. Cassar) for Ward 12 and provided an overview of the reasons for designation and the process for designating a property.

#### ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of significant cultural heritage resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality can manage change to a property through the Heritage Permit process to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained.

Section 29(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets two or more of the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest prescribed in *Ontario Regulation 9/06*, as amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22*, which identifies nine criteria in three broad categories: Design / Physical Value; Historical / Associative Value; and, Contextual Value. The evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the subject property was completed by Cultural Heritage Planning staff based on a site visit of the exterior of the property conducted on August 28, 2023 (see photographs attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED23192) and available primary and secondary research sources (attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED23192). As outlined below, based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation, it was determined that the subject property meets 5 of the 9 criteria contained in *Ontario Regulation 9/06* in all three categories.

#### Design / Physical Value

- 1. The two-storey stone structure located at 241 Wilson Street, Ancaster was constructed in 1885. The property has design or physical value as it is a representative example of a vernacular stone structure of the sort used to house nineteenth-century industry. It is an L-shaped building with a cross gable roof, several single stack brick chimneys, segmentally-arched windows with stone voussoirs in an irregular pattern, broken-course rubble stone walls with corner quoins; and a stone foundation.
- 2. The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

#### SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, former Ancaster Carriage Company Factory, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23192) (Ward 12) - Page 5 of 6

3. The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

#### Historical / Associative Value

- 4. The property has historical value as it is associated with the theme of nineteenthcentury industry in Ancaster. On this site the entrepreneurial Egleston brothers Alonzo (1823 -1879) and Harris (1809-1896) operated a machine shop from a frame building, one of their many enterprises located in Ancaster. This property was sold to Ancaster lawyer Edward Kenrick (1850-1925), who operated his Ancaster Carriage Company, first in a wooden frame building, and then in the current stone structure, constructed in 1885 after a fire destroyed the earlier wooden premises. Kenrick was himself a prominent Ancasterian having a fiftyyear career in the village. The property had a very short career as an industrial building, as the Ancaster Carriage Company began winding up its affairs after only a few years of occupancy. By 1900, the property was divided into several residential units and an Oddfellow's Hall. This mix of building use has continued to the present day.
- 5. The property has the potential to yield information that contributes to understanding Ancaster as a community. This property had a very short life as an industrial building as the Ancaster Carriage Company closed after only inhabiting the property for fifteen years. After 1900, the property was adapted to a variety of uses, including apartments, meeting halls and various professional and retail uses. It is an example of how the community has changed, and how existing buildings have adapted to serve newfound needs.
- 6. The property does not demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community.

#### **Contextual Value**

7. The property is important in defining the character of the area. Several modern buildings now surround 241 Wilson Street East, all of which have been built in a very sympathetic manner with compatible stone exteriors. The property's nature as a nineteenth-century industrial building is supported by these newer structures and gives the viewer a strong sense that this part of Ancaster was once home to industry. Being across the street from St. John's Anglican Church positions this property as being part of the core of Ancaster. This was not an isolated factory site, but one quite close to where Ancasterians lived and prayed.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

## SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, former Ancaster Carriage Company Factory, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23192) (Ward 12) - Page 6 of 6

- 8. The property is visually and historically linked to its surroundings, being at the edge of the Ancaster Village core and along the historic Wilson Street transportation corridor, close to a number of other nineteenth-century structures.
- 9. The property is not considered to be a local landmark.

Staff have determined that 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster is of cultural heritage value or interest sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and recommend designation according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23192.

#### ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may decide to designate property or decline to designate property.

#### **Decline to Designate**

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant cultural heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's financial incentives for heritage properties, including development charge exemption and grant and loan programs. Designation alone does not restrict the legal use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or been demonstrated to affect its resale value. However, designation does allow the municipality to manage change to the heritage attributes of a property through the Heritage Permit process. Staff does not consider declining to designate any of the properties to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

#### APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report PED23192 – Location Map Appendix "B" to Report PED23192 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 – Photographs Appendix "D" to Report PED23192 – Research Sources

SD/AG/sd

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

#### Appendix "A" to Report PED23192 Page 1 of 1



#### STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST AND DESCRIPTION OF HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES

#### **Description of Property**

The 0.5 hectare property municipally-addressed as 241 Wilson Street East is comprised of a circa 1885 two-storey stone building of a vernacular style. The property is also comprised of a modern building constructed in 2007 in a sympathetic style, municipallyaddressed as 253 Wilson Street East. The property is located on the northwestern side of Wilson Street East, at the intersection of Wilson Street East and Halston Street, in the community of Ancaster in the City of Hamilton.

#### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest**

The circa 1885 two-storey stone structure located at 241 Wilson Street East has physical value as it is a representative example of a vernacular stone nineteenth-century industrial building. The historical value of the property lies in its association with nineteenth-century industry in Ancaster and the Ancaster Carriage Company, who originally constructed it in 1885. The Ancaster Carriage Company was owned by Edward Kenrick (1850-1925), prominent Ancaster lawyer. The property is also connected to the Egleston Brothers, who were responsible for much of Ancaster's nineteenth-century industry.

This property defines the historic former industrial character of this section of Wilson Street East in the core of the village of Ancaster and is visually and historically linked to its surroundings. The sympathetic new structures on either side of the property enhance for the viewer the sense that this was an industrial space, that Ancaster was once home to a variety of manufacturers and enterprises.

#### **Description of Heritage Attributes:**

Key attributes that embody the physical value of the property as a representative vernacular nineteenth-century stone industrial building and its association with early Ancaster industry, including the Ancaster Carriage Company, include:

- The front (south) and side (west and east) elevations and roofline of the twostorey circa 1885 stone building, including its:
  - L-shaped plan;
  - Cross-gable roof with projecting eaves;
  - Single stack corbelled red brick chimneys;
  - Broken-coursed rubble stone walls with corner cut-stone quoins;
  - Segmentally-arched window and door openings with stone voussoirs and stone lug sills;
  - Side (east) entrance with transom; and,
  - Stone foundation.

Key attributes that embody the contextual value of the property as a defining feature of the historical character of Wilson Street East in the core of the village of Ancaster include its:

- Location fronting onto Wilson Street East; and,
- Visibility of three exterior walls from the public right of way.

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 1 of 11

#### Photographs

All photographs taken by City of Hamilton staff on August 28, 2023, unless otherwise noted.



Image 1: View of property looking west



Image 2: View of property looking northeast

Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 2 of 11



Image 3: West side elevation



Image 4: Detail of west elevation and yard

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 3 of 11



Image 5: South elevation of property



Image 6: West end of south elevation

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 4 of 11



Image 7: East end of south elevation



Image 8: Close up of east end of south elevation

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 5 of 11



#### Image 9: East side elevation



Image 10: Masonry detail on west elevation

Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 6 of 11



Image 11: Balcony detail on south elevation



Image 12: Roofline detail on south elevation

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 7 of 11



Image 13 and 14: Masonry details of the eastern gable of the south elevation

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 8 of 11



Images 15 and 16: Masonry details on east elevation

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 9 of 11



Image 17: Modern infill located at 253 Wilson Street East, on the subject property



Image 18: Modern infill located at 231 Wilson Street East, to west of the property

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 10 of 11



Image 19: Subject property circa 1940 (Hamilton Public Library, Local History and Archives)



Image 20: Wilson Street circa 1909, looking north with subject property in the background (Hamilton Transit History)

#### Appendix "C" to Report PED23192 Page 11 of 11



Image 21: Ancaster Fire Insurance Map 1886, revised 1897 showing the stone building in blue (Library and Archives Canada)

#### Appendix "D" to Report PED23192 Page 1 of 2

#### Research Sources

"Edward Kenrick, 1850-1925" *Who's Who and Why, Vol.* 6-7. Accessed June 20, 2023. https://books.google.ca/books?id=dy9if3Yix8UC&pg=RA4-PA903&dq=whos+who+and+why+edward+kenrick&hl=en&newbks=1&newbks\_redir=0 &sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwjm\_Jf0y6qAAxXTj4kEHSJ3A6cQ6AF6BAgNEAI#v=onepage&q= %20edward%20kenrick&f=false

"Edward Kenrick" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1879.* Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780567\_p2</u>

"Edward Kenrick; Ancaster Carriage Company" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1883.* Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780568\_p2</u>

"Edward Kenrick; Advertisement for Ancaster Carriage Company" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1884-1885.* Accessed June 20, 2023.

"Edward Kenrick; Ancaster Carriage Company" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1885-1886.* Accessed June 20, 2023.

"Edward Kenrick; Ancaster Carriage Company" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1887.* Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780603\_p6</u>

"Edward Kenrick; Ancaster Carriage Company" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1888.* Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780592\_p6</u>

"Edward Kenrick; Ancaster Carriage Company" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1889.* Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780593\_p8</u>

"Edward Kenrick; Ancaster Carriage Company" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1891*. Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780595\_p1</u>

"Edward Kenrick" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1892-1893.* Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780596\_p7</u>

"Edward Kenrick" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1894.* Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780597\_p6</u> "Edward Kenrick" *Farmers' and Business Directory for the County of Wentworth, 1895.* Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://central.bac-</u> lac.gc.ca/.item?op=pdf&id=e010780604 p1

"The Carriage Works, prepared by Carolyn Hawley" Ancaster LACAC 1980.

"Ancaster's Heritage" Ancaster Township Historical Society, 1973

Ancaster Fire Insurance Map, November 1885 revised to April 1897. Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>https://recherche-collection-search.bac-lac.gc.ca/eng/home/record?app=fonandcol&IdNumber=3810246</u>

"HRER #305 at the Ancaster stop in 1908". The Brantford and Hamilton Electric Railway, Hamilton Transit History. Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>http://www.trainweb.org/hamtransithist/BH.html</u>

241 Wilson Street, circa. 1940. Hamilton Public Library; Local History and Archives. Accessed June 20, 2023. <u>http://preview.hpl.ca:8080/Sites/#1697569314793\_16</u>

PED23192



## Recommendation to Designate 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster (Former Ancaster Carriage Works)

November 28, 2023 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

> Planning and Economic Development Planning Division, Heritage and Urban Design

Scott Dickinson, Cultural Heritage Planning Technician

### 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster (Former Ancaster Carriage Works)





## Background

- June 2020 Property listed on Municipal Heritage Register and designation work plan.
- March 2023 Prioritized for Designation by January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2025





## Recommendation for Designation Under Part IV of the OHA

### 241 Wilson Street East, Ancaster

Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria (5 of 9)

- Design / Physical (Criteria #1)
- Historical / Associative (Criteria #4, 5)
- Contextual (Criteria #7, 8)





## Heritage Evaluation

### Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria

## Design / Physical Value

- 1. The property is a **representative example** of nineteenth century industrial architecture.
- 2. The property is <u>not</u> considered to display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- 3. The property is <u>not</u> considered to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.





## Heritage Evaluation

Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria

### Historical / Associative Value

- 4. The property has direct associations with Edward Kenrick, the Egleston brothers and the Ancaster Carriage Works.
- 5. The property is considered to have the potential to yield information that contributes to the understanding of a community or culture.
- 6. The property is <u>not</u> considered to demonstrate the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist significant to the community



## Heritage Evaluation

Ontario Regulation 9/06 Criteria

## **Contextual Value**

- 7. The property helps **define** the historic character of Wilson Street and Ancaster.
- 8. The property is visually and historically linked to its surroundings.
- 9. The property is <u>not</u> considered to be a local landmark.





## Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (Summary)

The property located at 241 Wilson Street East is comprised of a two-storey stone structure built in 1885. It is representative of an industrial building constructed in a vernacular style.

The property is directly associated with industrialists **Edward Kenrick** and **Harris and Alonzo Egleston**, and the **Ancaster Carriage Works**.

The property **defines** the character of Wilson Street East, and is **visually and historically** linked to its surroundings.



## Description of Heritage Attributes (Summary)

- Front (south) and side (east and west) elevations and roofline of the 1885 two-storey stone structure including its:
  - o L-shaped plan;
  - Cross-gable roof with projecting eaves;
  - Single stack corbelled red brick chimneys;
  - Broken-coursed rubble stone walls with corner cut-stone quoins;
  - Segmentally-arched window and door openings with stone voussoirs and stone lug sills;
  - Side (east) entrance with transom ; and,
  - $\circ$   $\,$  Stone foundation.

s

- Contextual attributes, including its:
  - Location fronting onto Wilson Street East
  - Visibility of three exterior walls from public right of way





# QUESTIONS?



# THANK YOU



Mailing Address: 71 Main Street West Hamilton, Ontario Canada L8P 4Y5 www.hamilton.ca Planning and Economic Development Department Planning Division 71 Main Street West, 5th Floor, Hamilton, Ontario, L8P 4Y5 Phone: 905-546-2424, Ext. 1258 Fax: 905-540-5611

November 22, 2023

FILE: HP2023-052

Gord Carson 289 Dundas Street East Waterdown, ON L0R 2H0

#### Re: Heritage Permit Application HP2023-052: Installation of a Municipal Heritage Plaque at 289 Dundas Street East, Dundas (Ward 15) (By-law No. 22-139)

Please be advised that pursuant to By-law No. 05-364, as amended by By-law No. 07-322, which delegates the power to consent to alterations to designated property under the *Ontario Heritage Act* to the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, Heritage Permit Application HP2023-052 is approved for the designated property at 289 Dundas Street East, Waterdown, in accordance with the submitted Heritage Permit Application for the following alterations:

- Installation of a cast-metal oval designation plaque to be secured to the brick façade of the building beside the front entrance, including:
  - Drilling two holes into the brick façade, to be located in the existing mortar joints; and,
  - Affixing the plaque with non-rusting anchors and screws with antivandalism measures.

#### Subject to the following conditions:

- a) That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations; and,
- b) That implementation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than November 30, 2025. If the alterations are not completed by November 30, 2025, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.

#### Re: Heritage Permit Application HP2023-052: Installation of a Municipal Heritage Plaque at 289 Dundas Street East, Dundas (Ward 15) (By-law No. 22-139) -Page 2 of 2

Please note that this property is designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and that this permit is only for the above-noted alterations. Any departure from the approved plans and specifications is prohibited, and could result in penalties, as provided for by the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The terms and conditions of this approval may be appealed to the Ontario Land Tribunal within 30 days of your receipt of this permit.

The issuance of this permit under the *Ontario Heritage Act* is not a waiver of any of the provisions of any By-law of the City of Hamilton, the requirements of the *Building Code Act*, the *Planning Act*, or any other applicable legislation.

We wish you success with your project, and if you have any further questions, please feel free to contact Meg Oldfield, Cultural Heritage Planner, at 905-546-2424 ext. 7163 or via email at Meg.Oldfield@hamilton.ca.

Yours truly,

Anita Fabac Acting Director of Planning and Chief Planner

cc: Meg Oldfield, Cultural Heritage Planner Chantal Costa, Plan Examination Secretary Aleah Whalen, Legislative Coordinator Councillor Ted McMeekin, Ward 15