



City of Hamilton
AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE
AGENDA

Meeting #: 24-007
Date: April 18, 2024
Time: 9:30 a.m.
Location: Council Chambers
Hamilton City Hall
71 Main Street West

Tamara Bates, Legislative Coordinator (905) 546-2424 ext. 4102

1. **CEREMONIAL ACTIVITIES**
2. **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**
(Added Items, if applicable, will be noted with *)
3. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**
4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**
 - 4.1 February 22, 2024
 - 4.2 April 4, 2024 - Special
5. **COMMUNICATIONS**
6. **DELEGATION REQUESTS**
7. **DELEGATIONS**
8. **STAFF PRESENTATIONS**
9. **CONSENT ITEMS**
 - 9.1 Report of the 2023 Remuneration and Expenses as Required under Section 284 of the Municipal Act (FCS24019)

Members of the public can contact the Clerk's Office to acquire the documents considered at this meeting, in an alternative format.

10. DISCUSSION ITEMS
11. MOTIONS
12. NOTICES OF MOTION
13. GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS
14. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

14.1 Closed Minutes - February 22, 2024

14.2 Auditor General Reporting of Serious Matters to Council (Case #73367)
(AUD24003)

Pursuant to Section 9.3, Sub-sections (a) and (f) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021, as amended, and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (a) and (f) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to the security of the property of the City or a local board and advice that is subject to solicitor-client privilege, including communications necessary for that purpose.

15. ADJOURNMENT



AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MINUTES 24-004

9:30 a.m.

February 22, 2024

Council Chambers

Hamilton City Hall

Present: Councillors T. Hwang (Chair), J. Beattie, B. Clark, C. Kroetsch, M. Spadafora, M. Tadeson, and A. Wilson

Absent with

Regrets: Councillor M. Wilson – Personal

Also

Present: Mayor Horwath
Councillors C. Cassar, J.P. Danko, T. McMeekin and N. Nann

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. **Accounts Payable Special Investigation (Fraud and Waste Report #65357) (AUD24001) (Item 8.1)**

(Clark/A. Wilson)

- (a) That the Management Responses as detailed in Appendix "A" to Report AUD24001 be approved; and
- (b) That the General Manager of Finance and Corporate Services be directed to implement the management responses (attached as Appendix "A" to Report AUD24001) and report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee by August 2024 on the nature and status of actions taken in response to the special investigation report.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

2. CONSENT ITEMS (Items 9.1 and 9.2)

(A. Wilson/Spadafora)

That the following Consent Items, be received:

- (a) Grants Sub-Committee - Clerk's Report (February 12, 2024) (Item 9.1)
- (b) City Enrichment Fund Community Consultation Update (GRA23003(c)) (City Wide) (Item 9.2)

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

3. 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback (FCS23103(a)) (Item 10.1)

(Spadafora/A. Wilson)

That Report FCS23103(a), respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

4. 2023 City Enrichment Fund Update (GRA24001) (City Wide) (Item 11.1)

(A. Wilson/Tadeson)

That the overall 2023 City Enrichment Fund surplus (Appendix "A" attached to Report GRA24001), in the amount of \$134,710 be transferred to the City Enrichment Fund Reserve # 112230.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch

YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

5. Auditor General Reporting of Serious Matters to Council (Case #71958) (AUD24002) (Item 15.1)

(A. Wilson/Clark)

- (a) That Report AUD24002, respecting Auditor General Reporting of Serious Matters to Council (Case #71958), be received; and,
- (b) That Report AUD24002, respecting Auditor General Reporting of Serious Matters to Council (Case #71958), remain confidential.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 5 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

6. Corporate Services Department Organizational Structure Changes (FCS24015) (City Wide) (Added Item 15.2)

(A. Wilson/Tadeson)

- (a) That the direction provided to staff in closed session, be approved; and,
- (b) That Report FCS24015 and Appendices, respecting Corporate Services Department Organizational Structure Changes, remain confidential until approved by Council.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 5 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 2)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

10. PUBLIC MEETINGS

- 10.1(a) Registered Delegations
 - 10.1(a)(d) Toni Wodzicki, Broccolini Real Estate Group
 - 10.1(a)(e) Steve Malovic, Flamborough Power Centre / iConnect Community
 - 10.1(a)(f) Julie Sergi, Realtors Association of Hamilton Burlington
 - 10.1(a)(g) Shwaan Hutton, Development Collective
 - 10.1(a)(h) Adam Lambros, Panattoni
 - 10.1(a)(i) Steven Dejonckheere, Slate Asset Management
 - 10.1(a)(j) Peter Appleton
 - 10.1(a)(k) Greg Dunnett, Hamilton Chamber of Commerce
 - 10.1(a)(l) Don McLean, Hamilton 350 Committee
 - 10.1(a)(m) Robert Howe, Goodmans LLP
 - 10.1(a)(n) Karl Andrus, Hamilton Community Benefits Network
 - 10.1(a)(o) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton
 - 10.1(a)(p) Don Robertson
- 10.1(b) Written Submissions
 - 10.1(b)(b) Andrew Eldebs, Cachet Developments (Binbrook) Inc.
 - 10.1(b)(c) Steven Dejonckheere, Slate Asset Management
 - 10.1(b)(d) Ryan Millar, Emblem
 - 10.1(b)(e) Peter Banting
 - 10.1(b)(f) Cathy McPherson
 - 10.1(b)(g) Elizabeth and Les Birchall
 - 10.1(b)(h) Lida Holt
 - 10.1(b)(i) Victoria Koch
 - 10.1(b)(j) Lara Stewart
 - 10.1(b)(k) Kris Gadjanski
 - 10.1(b)(l) Theresa McCuaig and Family
 - 10.1(b)(m) Christina Salamon
 - 10.1(b)(n) Gord and Angie McNulty
 - 10.1(b)(o) Rachelle Letain
 - 10.1(b)(p) Jeffrey Sindall
 - 10.1(b)(q) Cheryl Tigchelaar

10.1(b)(r) Kira McDermid
10.1(b)(s) Lois Corey
10.1(b)(t) Carolyn VanHoevelaak
10.1(b)(u) Patrick Denninger, Denninger's
10.1(b)(v) Marie Covert
10.1(b)(w) Nancy Chater
10.1(b)(x) Caroline Neufeld
10.1(b)(y) Ruth Frager
10.1(b)(z) Robert Wakulat, Courage Co-Lab Inc.
10.1(b)(aa) Alan Leela and Shamil Jiwani, Vantage
Developments
10.1(b)(ab) Emil Jadanski
10.1(b)(ac) Melissa "Molly" Heppner
10.1(b)(ad) Allyn Walsh
10.1(b)(ae) Jan W. Jansen
10.1(b)(af) Katie West
10.1(b)(ag) Erica Hall
10.1(b)(ah) Laurianne Munezero
10.1(b)(ai) Ron Ballentine
10.1(b)(aj) Suzanne Cooper
10.1(b)(ak) Laurel Imeson
10.1(b)(al) Justin Mamone and Paul Brown, Paul
Brown & Associates
10.1(b)(am) Susan Wortman
10.1(b)(an) Melissa Smith
10.1(b)(ao) Julie Richer
10.1(b)(ap) Michael Krasic, Coletara Development
10.1(b)(aq) David Lloyd
10.1(b)(ar) Marwan Zahra, Belmont Equity Partners
10.1(b)(as) Kim Beckman and Shwaan Hutton,
Development Collective
10.1(b)(at) Nonni Iler
10.1(b)(au) Elizabeth Knight
10.1(b)(av) Aarthi Thaya, Rice Group
10.1(b)(aw) Sue Markey
10.1(b)(ax) Rick Johnson
10.1(b)(ay) Aaron Collina, Movengo Corporation
10.1(b)(az) Gabriel DeSantis, DeSantis Homes
10.1(b)(ba) Daniel Guizzetti, Empire Communities
10.1(b)(bb) Marcus Gagliardi, Cachet Homes
10.1(b)(bc) John B. Corbett, Corbett Land Strategies
Inc.

15. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

15.2 Corporate Services Department Organizational Structure
Changes (FCS24015) (City Wide)

CHANGES TO THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA

That Item 11.1 respecting the 2023 City Enrichment Fund Update (GRA24001) (City Wide), be moved up on the agenda, to be considered immediately following Item 9.2, City Enrichment Fund Community Consultation Update (GRA23003(c)) (City Wide)

(Tadeson/Spadafora)

That the agenda for the February 22, 2024 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting, be approved, as amended.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting (Item 4.1)

(Clark/Spadafora)

That the Minutes of the February 8, 2024 meeting, be approved, as presented.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(d) STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 8)

(i) Accounts Payable Special Investigation (Fraud and Waste Report #65357) (AUD24001) (Item 8.1)

Brigitte Minard, Deputy Auditor General, and Ken Froese and Grace Lau, Delta Consulting, addressed Committee respecting the Accounts Payable Special Investigation (Fraud and Waste Report #65357) (AUD24001), with the aid of a presentation.

(A. Wilson/Beattie)

That the presentation from Brigitte Minard, Deputy Auditor General, and Ken Froese and Grace Lau, Delta Consulting, respecting the Accounts Payable Special Investigation (Fraud and Waste Report #65357) (AUD24001), be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1.

(e) PUBLIC MEETINGS (Item 10)

(i) 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback (FCS23103(a)) (Item 10.1)

The Chair advised that pursuant to Section 12 of the *Development Charges Act, 1997*, the public meeting respecting Item 10.1 is being held to present and obtain public input on the City's proposed 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback. The Chair further advised that notice of the public meeting was published in the Hamilton Spectator on January 17, 2024 and on the City's website, inviting interested parties to make representations at today's meeting. Any person in attendance was able make representation.

Gary Scandlan and Erik Karvinen, Watson and Associates, addressed Committee respecting the 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback, with the aid of a presentation.

(Tadeson/Kroetsch)

That the presentation from Gary Scandlan and Erik Karvinen, Watson and Associates, respecting the 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(ii) Registered Delegations (Item 10.1(a))

The following Registered Delegations addressed the Committee respecting the 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback:

- (a) Michelle Diplock, West End Home Builders Association (Item 10.1(a)(a))
- (b) Veronica Green, Slate Asset Management (Item 10.1(a)(b))
- (c) Alan Leela, Vantage Developments (Item 10.1(a)(c))
- (d) Steve Malovic, Flamborough Power Centre / iConnect Community (Added Item 10.1(a)(e))
- (e) Julie Sergi, Realtors Association of Hamilton Burlington (Added Item 10.1(a)(f))
- (f) Shwaan Hutton, Development Collective (Added Item 10.1(a)(g))
- (g) Adam Lambros, Panattoni (Added Item 10.1(a)(h))
- (h) Steven Dejonckheere, Slate Asset Management (Added Item 10.1(a)(i))
- (i) Peter Appleton (Added Item 10.1(a)(j))
- (j) Greg Dunnett, Hamilton Chamber of Commerce (Added Item 10.1(a)(k))
- (k) Don McLean, Hamilton 350 Committee (Added Item 10.1(a)(l))
- (l) Robert Howe, Goodmans LLP (Added Item 10.1(a)(m))
- (m) Karl Andrus, Hamilton Community Benefits Network (Added Item 10.1(a)(n))
- (n) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton (Added Item 10.1(a)(o))
- (o) Don Robertson (Added Item 10.1(a)(p))
- (p) Toni Wodzicki, Broccoli Real Estate Group (Added Item 10.1(a)(d))

(iii) Non-Registered Delegations (Added Item 10.1(a)(q))

The following Non-Registered Delegates addressed the Committee respecting the 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback:

- (a) James Webb (Added Item 10.1(a)(q))

(A. Wilson/Tadeson)

That the following Registered and Non-Registered Delegations respecting the 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback, be received:

- (a) Michelle Diplock, West End Home Builders Association (Item 10.1(a)(a))
- (b) Veronica Green, Slate Asset Management (Item 10.1(a)(b))
- (c) Alan Leela, Vantage Developments (Item 10.1(a)(c))
- (d) Steve Malovic, Flamborough Power Centre / iConnect Community (Added Item 10.1(a)(e))
- (e) Julie Sergi, Realtors Association of Hamilton Burlington (Added Item 10.1(a)(f))
- (f) Shwaan Hutton, Development Collective (Added Item 10.1(a)(g))
- (g) Adam Lambros, Panattoni (Added Item 10.1(a)(h))
- (h) Steven Dejonckheere, Slate Asset Management (Added Item 10.1(a)(i))
- (i) Peter Appleton (Added Item 10.1(a)(j))
- (j) Greg Dunnett, Hamilton Chamber of Commerce (Added Item 10.1(a)(k))
- (k) Don McLean, Hamilton 350 Committee (Added Item 10.1(a)(l))
- (l) Robert Howe, Goodmans LLP (Added Item 10.1(a)(m))
- (m) Karl Andrus, Hamilton Community Benefits Network (Added Item 10.1(a)(n))
- (n) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton (Added Item 10.1(a)(o))
- (o) Don Robertson (Added Item 10.1(a)(p))
- (p) Toni Wodzicki, Broccolini Real Estate Group (Added Item 10.1(a)(d))
- (q) James Webb (Added Item 10.1(a)(q))

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(iv) Written Submissions (Item 10.1(b))

(A. Wilson/Tadeson)

That the following Written Submissions respecting the 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback, be received:

- (a) Brandon Donnelly and Veronica Green, Slate Asset Management (Item 10.1(b)(a))
- (b) Andrew Eldebs, Cachet Developments (Binbrook) Inc. (Added Item 10.1(b)(b))
- (c) Steven Dejonckheere, Slate Asset Management (Added Item 10.1(b)(c))
- (d) Ryan Millar, Emblem (Added Item 10.1(b)(d))
- (e) Peter Banting (Added Item 10.1(b)(e))
- (f) Cathy McPherson (Added Item 10.1(b)(f))
- (g) Elizabeth and Les Birchall (Added Item 10.1(b)(g))
- (h) Lida Holt (Added Item 10.1(b)(h))
- (i) Victoria Koch (Added Item 10.1(b)(i))
- (j) Lara Stewart (Added Item 10.1(b)(j))
- (k) Kris Gadjanski (Added Item 10.1(b)(k))
- (l) Theresa McCuaig and Family (Added Item 10.1(b)(l))
- (m) Christina Salamon (Added Item 10.1(b)(m))
- (n) Gord and Angie McNulty (Added Item 10.1(b)(n))
- (o) Rachelle Letain (Added Item 10.1(b)(o))
- (p) Jeffrey Sindall (Added Item 10.1(b)(p))
- (q) Cheryl Tigchelaar (Added Item 10.1(b)(q))
- (r) Kira McDermid (Added Item 10.1(b)(r))

- (s) Lois Corey (Added Item 10.1(b)(s))
- (t) Carolyn VanHoevelaak (Added Item 10.1(b)(t))
- (u) Patrick Denninger, Denninger's (Added item 10.1(b)(u))
- (v) Marie Covert (Added Item 10.1(b)(v))
- (w) Nancy Chater (Added Item 10.1(b)(w))
- (x) Caroline Neufeld (Added Item 10.1(b)(x))
- (y) Ruth Frager (Added Item 10.1(b)(y))
- (z) Robert Wakulat, Courage Co-Lab Inc. (Added Item 10.1(b)(z))
- (aa) Alan Leela and Shamil Jiwani, Vantage Developments (Added Item 10.1(b)(aa))
- (ab) Emil Jadanski (Added Item 10.1(b)(ab))
- (ac) Melissa "Molly" Heppner (Added Item 10.1(b)(ac))
- (ad) Allyn Walsh (Added Item 10.1(b)(ad))
- (ae) Jan W. Jansen (Added Item 10.1(b)(ae))
- (af) Katie West (Added Item 10.1(b)(af))
- (ag) Erica Hall (Added Item 10.1(b)(ag))
- (ah) Laurianne Munezero (Added Item 10.1(b)(ah))
- (ai) Ron Ballentine (Added Item 10.1(b)(ai))
- (aj) Suzanne Cooper (Added Item 10.1(b)(aj))
- (ak) Laurel Imeson (Added Item 10.1(b)(ak))
- (al) Justin Mamone and Paul Brown, Paul Brown & Associates (Added Item 10.1(b)(al))
- (am) Susan Wortman (Added Item 10.1(b)(am))
- (an) Melissa Smith (Added Item 10.1(b)(an))
- (ao) Julie Richer (Added Item 10.1(b)(ao))
- (ap) Michael Krasic, Coletara Development (Added Item 10.1(b)(ap))

- (aq) David Lloyd (Added Item 10.1(b)(aq))
- (ar) Marwan Zahra, Belmont Equity Partners (Added Item 10.1(b)(ar))
- (as) Kim Beckman and Shwaan Hutton, Development Collective (Added Item 10.1(b)(as))
- (at) Nonni Iler (Added Item 10.1(b)(at))
- (au) Elizabeth Knight (Added Item 10.1(b)(au))
- (av) Aarthi Thaya, Rice Group (Added Item 10.1(b)(av))
- (aw) Sue Markey (Added Item 10.1(b)(aw))
- (ax) Rick Johnson (Added Item 10.1(b)(ax))
- (ay) Aaron Collina, Movengo Corporation (Added Item 10.1(b)(ay))
- (az) Gabriel DeSantis, DeSantis Homes (Added Item 10.1(b)(az))
- (ba) Daniel Guizzetti, Empire Communities (Added Item 10.1(b)(ba))
- (bb) Marcus Gagliardi, Cachet Homes (Added Item 10.1(b)(bb))
- (bc) John B. Corbett, Corbett Land Strategies Inc. (Added Item 10.1(b)(bc))

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(A. Wilson/Clark)

That the public meeting be closed.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson

YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 3.

(Tadeson/Clark)

That the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee recess from 2:57 p.m. to 3:30 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(f) PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL (Item 15)

(Wilson/Tadeson)

That the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee move into Closed Session, pursuant to Section 9.3, Sub-sections (a), (b) and (f) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021, as amended, and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (a), (b) and (f) of the *Ontario Municipal Act*, 2001, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to the security of the property of the City or a local board; personal matters about an identifiable individual, including City or local board employees and advice that is subject to solicitor-client privilege, including communications necessary for that purpose.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 5 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(i) Auditor General Reporting of Serious Matters to Council (Case #71958) (AUD24002) (Item 15.1)

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 5.

**(iii) Corporate Services Department Organizational Structure Changes
(FCS24015) (City Wide) (Added Item 15.2)**

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 6.

(g) ADJOURNMENT (Item 15)

(A. Wilson/Tadeson)

That, there being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee, be adjourned at 5:18 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 5 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor Tammy Hwang, Chair
Audit, Finance and Administration
Committee

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk



**AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE
(SPECIAL)
MINUTES 24-005**

**1:30 p.m.
April 4, 2024
Council Chambers
Hamilton City Hall**

Present: Councillors T. Hwang (Chair), J. Beattie, B. Clark, M. Spadafora, M. Tadeson, A. Wilson, and M. Wilson

**Absent with
Regrets:** Councillor C. Kroetsch – City Business

**Also
Present:** Councillor J.P. Danko

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

3. COMMUNICATIONS

- 3.1 Julie Sergi, Realtors Association of Hamilton and Burlington, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 6.1 (a).

- 3.2 Ryan Miller, Emblem, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 6.1 (a).

- 3.3 Alan Leela and Shamil Jiwani, Vantage Developments, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 6.1 (a).

- 3.4 Michael Krasic, Coletara Development, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 6.1 (a).

- 3.5 Marwin Zahra, Belmont Equity, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 6.1 (a).

4. DELEGATION REQUESTS

- 4.1 Michelle Diplock, West End Home Builders Association, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update (for today's meeting)

(Spadafora/Clark)

That the agenda for the April 4, 2024 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee (Special) meeting, be approved, as amended.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) COMMUNICATIONS (Item 3)

(Spadafora/Tadeson)

That the following Communications Items, be received and referred to the consideration of Item 6.1 (a).

- (i) Julie Sergi, Realtors Association of Hamilton and Burlington, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update (Added Item 3.1)
- (ii) Ryan Miller, Emblem, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update (Added Item 3.2)
- (iii) Alan Leela and Shamil Jiwani, Vantage Developments, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update (Added Item 3.3)
- (iv) Michael Krasic, Coletara Development, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update (Added Item 3.4)
- (v) Marwin Zahra, Belmont Equity, respecting Proposed Amending Motion to Item 3 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee Report 24-004, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-Law Update (Added Item 3.5)

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(d) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 4)

- (i) **Michelle Diplock, West End Home Builders Association, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update (for today's meeting) (Added Item 4.1)**

(Tadeson/Spadafora)

That the Delegation Request from Michelle Diplock, West End Home Builders Association, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update, be approved for today's meeting.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(e) DELEGATIONS (Item 5)

- (i) Michelle Diplock, West End Home Builders Association, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update (for today's meeting) (Added Item 5.1)**

Michelle Diplock, West End Home Builders Association, addressed Committee respecting the 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update.

(Spadafora/Tadeson)

That the Delegation from Michelle Diplock, West End Home Builders Association, respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update, be received and referred to the consideration of Item 6.1(a).

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

Chair Hwang relinquished the Chair to Vice-Chair Spadafora.

(f) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 6)

- (i) 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback (FCS23103(a)) - Referred from Council, March 27, 2024 (Item 6.1)**

(1) **(Hwang/Tadeson)**

That Report FCS23103(a), respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback, be received.

(2) **(Hwang/Spadafora)**

That Report FCS23103(a), respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update – Open House Feedback, **be amended**, as follows:

(a) That Report FCS23103(a), respecting 2024 Development Charges Background Study and By-law Update - Open House Feedback, be received;

(b) ***That staff be directed to include, within the 2024 Development Charges By-law Report to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee on May 2, 2024:***

(i) ***an analysis for the possibility of exempting City Development Charges for non-profit Daycare Centres operating under the Child Care and Early Years Act, 2014;***

(ii) ***an analysis of the City Development Charge rate that would be applicable to buildings constructed on municipally owned lands and operated or managed by TradePort International Corporation (TradePort) under the terms of the Airport Lease between the City and TradePort within the Airport Employment Growth District compared to similar airports such as Kitchener and London; and***

(c) ***That staff be directed to include, within the 2024 Development Charges By-law Report to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee on May 2, 2024, an analysis for the possibility of the following scenarios for the first year of the Development Charge By-laws prior to moving to Staff Recommended rate and policy changes:***

(i) ***maintain the current City Development Charges rates, adjusted for indexing, along with the 40% exemption for Residential development Downtown Community Project Area, the 37% exemption for all Industrial development, and maintaining the 50% expansion exemption for detached industrial expansions;***

(ii) ***updating the City Development Charges Rates but maintaining the current 40% exemption for Residential development Downtown Community Project Area, the 37% exemption for all Industrial***

development, and maintaining the 50% expansion exemption for detached industrial expansions; and

- (iii) the financial impact to the tax levy in the first year as well as the long-term financial economic uplift should either of these scenarios be adopted by Council.*

Result: Main Motion, As Amended, CARRIED by a vote of 5 to 2, as follows:

NO - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
NO - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

Councillor Hwang assumed the Chair.

(g) ADJOURNMENT (Item 7)

(Spadafora/M. Wilson)

That, there being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee (Special), be adjourned at 2:46 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora


Respectfully submitted,

Councillor Tammy Hwang, Chair
Audit, Finance and Administration
Committee

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk



INFORMATION REPORT

TO:	Chair and Members Audit, Finance and Administration Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	April 18, 2024
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Report of the 2023 Remuneration and Expenses as Required under Section 284 of the <i>Municipal Act</i> (FCS24019) (City Wide)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Bev Neill (905) 546-2424 Ext. 6274
SUBMITTED BY:	Shelley Hesmer, Acting Director Financial Services and Taxation and Corporate Controller Corporate Services Department
SIGNATURE:	

COUNCIL DIRECTION

N/A

INFORMATION

Under the *Municipal Act, 2001*, the Treasurer must submit to Council before the 31st of March each year, an itemized statement of the remuneration and expenses paid to each Member of Council and citizen appointees to various local boards in the preceding year.

Appendix "A" of Report FCS24019 provides the remuneration and expenses paid to the Mayor and Members of Council in respect to their services as a member of Council or any other body, including a local board, to which the member has been appointed by Council or on which the member holds office by virtue of being a member of Council.

Appendix "B" of Report FCS24019 provides the expense details by the Mayor and Members of Council in respect to their services as a member of Council.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

**SUBJECT: Report of the 2023 Remuneration and Expenses as Required under
Section 284 of the Municipal Act (FCS24019) (City Wide) - Page 2 of 2**

In 2024, staff of Financial Services will complete a review of the by-law respecting the remuneration of the Mayor and Members of Council. Staff will also complete a review of best practices for reporting of remuneration and expenses of the Mayor and Members of Council.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report FCS24019 – 2023 Remuneration Summary

Appendix "B" to Report FCS24019 – 2023 Expense Details of Council

BN/dt

City of Hamilton

2023 SUMMARY

	Remuneration	Expenses	Total
	\$	\$	\$
Members of Council	1,807,369.36	18,820.48	1,826,189.84
Conservation Authorities	26,470.09	2,627.48	29,097.57
Hamilton Police Services	38,337.24	417.12	38,754.36
Hamilton Public Library	-	768.49	768.49
Committee of Adjustment / Land Division Committee	42,800.00	13,031.89	55,831.89
Trade License Board	6,387.50	-	6,387.50
Hamilton Utilities Corporation	276,770.00	-	276,770.00
Association of Municipalities	-	-	-
CityHousing Hamilton	-	1,516.45	1,516.45
Hamilton Farmer's Market	-	-	-
Alectra	143,500.00	-	143,500.00
Royal Botanical Gardens	-	-	-
Total	\$2,378,896.10	\$37,181.91	\$2,378,816.10

City of Hamilton

(a) Remuneration paid pursuant to Section 284 of the *Municipal Act* and By-law 07-248. Expenses paid pursuant to Section 283 (1), (2) and (3) of the *Municipal Act*.

<u>Council Member</u>	<u>Remuneration *</u>	<u>Expenses</u>	
		<u>Council Representation (AMO, FCM etc.)</u>	<u>Other (Mileage, Community Events etc.)</u>
	\$	\$	\$
A. Horwath	212,392.27	8,515.50	1,717.29
A. Wilson	106,285.46	-	-
B. Clark	106,285.46	-	65.00
C. Kroetsch	106,285.46	-	-
C. Cassar	106,285.46	-	333.36
E. Pauls	101,786.66	-	-
J. Beattie	106,285.46	-	72.22
** J. Danko	107,888.39	-	902.27
M. Tadeson	106,285.46	694.95	2,078.27
M. Francis	106,285.46	-	311.43
M. Wilson	106,285.46	-	-
M. Spadafora	106,285.46	-	757.00
N. Nann	106,285.46	1,237.20	-
** T. Hwang	109,876.52	-	206.89
T. McMeekin	106,285.46	-	872.32
T. Jackson	106,285.46	-	1,056.78
Total	\$1,807,369.36	\$10,447.65	\$8,372.83

*Actual Remuneration Paid

**Retro from 2022

Expense Notes

Mayor Horwath - Expenses include attendance at the OBCM / AGM Conference, FCM Conference & Trade Show, Sister City Visit (Racamulto Sicily, Italy) AMO Conference

Councillor Nann - Expenses include attendance at the FCM Conference

Councillor Tadeson - Expenses include attendance at the ROMA Conference

City of Hamilton

(b) Conservation Authorities

Remuneration and expenses paid pursuant to Section 284 of the Municipal Act. The Conservation Authority pays the expenses below directly to the appointees.

Hamilton Conservation Authority

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
J. Beattie	675.00	214.60
D. Bowman	975.00	127.60
J. Cimba	675.00	187.92
C. Cessar	1,050.00	49.30
B. Clark	4,466.67	334.54
L. Di Cesare	825.00	124.12
M. Francis	525.00	102.66
C. Janzen	600.00	97.44
B. McHattie	600.00	85.26
S. Moccio	5,833.33	238.96
M. Spadafora	225.00	6.96
W. Terryberry	1,350.00	102.08
M. Topalovic	450.00	55.68
A. Wilson	1,200.00	-
M. Wilson	1,350.00	-
Total	\$20,800.00	\$1,727.12

Grand River Conservation Authority

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
M. Adili	-	-
A. Wilson	578.57	-
Total	\$587.57	\$ -

Conservation Halton

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
J. Di Maio	-	-
Z. Jawed	-	-
A. Wilson	-	-
M. Wilson	-	-
J. Partridge	-	-
T. McMeekin	-	-
C. Kroetsch	-	-
Total	\$ -	\$ -

Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
S. Beattie	456.60	128.10
M. Tadeson	837.10	322.08
Total	\$1,293.70	\$450.18

City of Hamilton

Niagara Escarpment Commission

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
M. Francis	4,248.00	-
Total	\$4,248.00	\$ -

(c) Hamilton Police Services Board

Remuneration and expenses paid pursuant to Section 284 of the Municipal Act and By-law 01-039.

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u> **
	\$	\$
A. Horwath	-	-
E. Pauls	-	-
C. Kroetsch	-	-
M. Athulathmudali	6,497.94	-
P. Mandy	12,872.34	417.12
R. Elms	9,132.24	-
A. Bennink	9,132.24	-
A. Menezes	702.48	-
Total	\$38,337.24	\$417.12

**

Expenditures authorized by the Hamilton Police Services Board and funded from the Police Services Board budget.

(d) Hamilton Public Library Board

Remuneration and expenses paid pursuant to Section 284 of the Municipal Act and By-laws 1-74 and 01-038.

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
N. Van Velzen	-	768.49
Total	\$ -	\$768.49

(e) Committee of Adjustment / Land Division Committee

Remuneration and expenses paid pursuant to Section 284 (1) of the Municipal Act and By-laws 01-049 and R98-030.

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
M. Dudzic	3,500.00	482.00
L. Gaddy	4,000.00	1,579.52
N. Mieczko	5,500.00	1,306.36
D. Serwatak	5,500.00	3,885.44
Dale Smith	3,250.00	1,581.76
Dale M. Smith	1,250.00	-
Marg. Smith	5,500.00	1,625.32
B. Charters	5,250.00	-
M. Switzer	4,500.00	2,100.52
T. Lofchik	4,550.00	470.97
Total	\$42,800.00	\$13,031.89

City of Hamilton

(f) Trade License Board

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
R. Lalli	1,750.00	-
M. Marsalla	787.50	-
B. Nuttall	1,575.00	-
C. Atchinson	875.00	-
G. Penko	787.50	-
M. Reiley	612.50	-
Total	\$6,387.50	\$ -

(g) Hamilton Enterprises Holding Corporation

<u>Board Member</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
C. Wessel	12,850.00	-
E. DiDonato	26,900.00	-
G. McCamus	36,900.00	-
J. Kamula	40,100.00	-
L. Tugman	52,500.00	-
T. Hwang	16,475.00	-
A. Ventresca	13,250.00	-
T.Thoma	26,900.00	-
Total	\$225,875.00	\$ -

Hamilton Utilities Corporation

<u>Board Member</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
E. DiDonato	9,625.00	-
C. Wessel	5,213.00	-
L. Tugman	16,550.00	-
T. Hwang	7,058.00	-
J. Kamula	7,625.00	-
G.McCamus	4,825.00	-
Total	\$50,895.00	\$ -

City of Hamilton

(h) Association of Municipalities of Ontario

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
T. Hwang	-	-
Total	\$ -	\$ -

(i) CityHousing Hamilton Corporation

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
J. Aird	-	-
N. But	-	-
T. Hwang	-	-
T. Jackson	-	-
C. Kroetsch	-	-
A. Harris	-	-
N. Nann	-	1,494.85
P. Reid	-	21.60
A. Wilson	-	-
Total	\$ -	\$1,516.45

(j) Hamilton Farmer's Market

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
J. Beattie	-	-
A. Carlisle	-	-
C. Kroetsch	-	-
M. LaRose	-	-
L. Lukasik	-	-
J. Myers	-	-
A. Reiser	-	-
Total	\$ -	\$ -

(k) Alectra Utilities

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
S. Donnelly	83,500.00	-
A. Horwath	60,000.00	-
Total	\$143,500.00	\$ -

(l) Royal Botanical Gardens

<u>Appointee</u>	<u>Remuneration</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
	\$	\$
C. Cassar	-	-
A. Wilson	-	-
Total	\$ -	\$ -

Mayor Andrea Horwath

2023	Total Expense \$	# of Attendees	ProRated Expense \$
Meeting Expense - West End Diner - Jan 5/23	52.21	2	26.11
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Jan 27/23	54.95	2	27.48
Women of Distinction Awards - YWCA - Feb 27/23	200.00	2	100.00
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Mar 10/23	65.13	2	32.57
Rotary Club Event - Apr 2023	63.04	2	31.52
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Apr 21/23	110.47	4	27.62
Emmanuel House Dinner - May 4/23	150.00	1	150.00
Meeting Expense - The Judge - May 5/23	151.33	11	13.76
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - May 9/23	72.00	3	24.00
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - May 23/23	70.50	2	35.25
Meeting Expense - May 29/23	35.64	1	35.64
Meeting Expense - ETT Bread Bar - May 30/23	121.09	6	20.19
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Jun 2/23	65.00	2	32.50
Meeting Expense - Pizzaiolo - Jun 5/23	44.94	6	7.49
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Jun 23/23	29.00	1	29.00
Meeting Expense - ETT Bread Bar - Jun 26/23	62.38	2	31.19
Meeting Expense - Bread Bar James - Jul 28/23	86.98	5	17.40
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Aug 2/23	64.80	2	32.40
BAM Rotary Club Event - Aug 11/23	160.00	1	160.00
Meeting Expense - A&W - Aug 24/23	32.27	2	16.14
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Oct 3/23	61.84	2	30.92
Meeting Expense - Conversate - Oct 3/23	230.52	2	115.26
Harvest Dinner - Oct 12/23	175.00	1	175.00
Meeting Expense - Plank Augusta - Oct 19/23	56.02	2	28.01

Mayor Andrea Horwath (Continued)

2023	Total Expense \$	# of Attendees	ProRated Expense \$
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Dec 5/23	65.44	2	32.72
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Dec19/23	64.44	2	32.22
Meeting Expense - The Hamilton Club - Dec 20/23	64.44	2	32.22
Meeting Expense - ETT Bread Bar Dec21/23	232.61	9	25.85
OBCM AGM / Conference			
Kitchener, ON			
Apr 19-21, 2023			
Accommodation	444.22		
Per Diem	40.00		
Parking	52.00		536.22
FCM Annual Conference and Trade Show			
Toronto, ON			
May 24-27, 2023			
Registration	1,118.70		
Per Diem and Meal	163.63		
Parking	166.11		1,448.44
Sister City Visit			
Racalmuto Sicily, Italy			
Jun 30 - Jul 14, 2023			
Transportation - Air	2,952.49		
Accommodation	859.20		
Per Diem	1,060.66		4,872.35
Bloomberg Training			
New York City, New York			
Jul 14 - 15, 2023			
Transportation - Air			
Accommodation	394.84		394.84
Per Diem			
AMO Conference			
London, ON			
Aug 20 - 23, 2023			
Registration	966.16		
Transportation - Car	38.08		
Accommodation	434.37		
Per Diem and Meals	219.88		1,658.49
TOTAL			\$10,232.79

Councillor Wilson - Ward 1

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
NIL	-		-
TOTAL	\$ -		\$ -

Councillor Kroetsch - Ward 2

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
NIL	-		-
TOTAL	\$ -		\$ -

Councillor Nann - Ward 3

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
FCM Annual Conference and Trade Show Toronto, ON May 24-28, 2023 Registration	1,118.70		
Per Diem	110.00		
Transportation	8.50		1,237.20
TOTAL	\$ 1,237.20		\$ 1,237.20

Councillor Hwang - Ward 4

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Mileage	185.64		185.64
Meeting Expense - The Judge - May 5/23	13.76	1	13.76
Meeting Expense - Pizzaiolo - Jun 5/23	7.49	1	7.49
TOTAL	\$ 206.89		\$ 206.89

Councillor Francis - Ward 5

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Mileage	178.16		178.16
Meeting Expense - The Judge - May 5/23	13.76	1	13.76
Stoney Creek Chamber of Commerce - Citizen of the Year Gala - May 18/23	195.00	3	65.00
Meeting Expense - Barangas - Jul 14/23	88.14	4	22.04
Meeting Expense - Brewers Blackbird - Aug 3/23	97.42	3	32.47
TOTAL	\$ 572.48		\$ 311.43

Councillor Jackson - Ward 6

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Trenholme Bocce - Dinner/Dance Fundraiser - Feb 4/23	100.00	1	100.00
Women of Distinction Awards - YWCA - Feb 27/23	150.00	1	150.00
Bishop's Charities Dinner - Feb 28/23	150.00	2	75.00
Jazz Up - Good Shepherd Centres - Mar 6/23	350.00	2	175.00
HMCS Star Centennial Ball - Mar 1/23	300.00	2	150.00
Meeting Expense - Brown Barrel - Apr 6/23	101.10	2	50.55
Meeting Expense - The Judge - May 5/23	13.76	1	13.76
Meeting Expense - Barangas - Jul14/23	88.14	4	22.04
Meeting Expense - Symposium - Aug 13/23	56.78	2	28.39
Autumn Stroll - Ancaster Rotary - Aug 20/23	247.62	2	123.81
Meeting Expense - Brown Barrel - Sep 19/23	36.45	2	18.23
Cancer Assistance Program Gala - Nov 9/23	150.00	1	150.00
TOTAL	\$ 1,743.85		\$ 1,056.78

Councillor Pauls - Ward 7

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
NIL	-		-
TOTAL			
	\$ -		\$ -

Councillor Danko - Ward 8

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Women of Distinction Awards - YWCA - Feb 27/23	300.00	2	150.00
Showcase of Hearts - Mar 30/23	150.00	2	75.00
Chief's Gala Dinner - Mar 31/23	300.00	2	150.00
AGH Gala - May 27/23	350.00	2	175.00
Meeting Expense - Jun 30/23	6.84	2	6.84
Meeting Expense - Jul14/23	88.14	4	22.04
Liuna Station - Sicilia Canta - Nov 22/23	300.00	1	300.00
Meeting Expense - Nov 29/23	46.78	2	23.39
TOTAL			
	\$ 1,541.76		\$ 902.27

Councillor Clark - Ward 9

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Stoney Creek Chamber of Commerce - Citizen of the Year Gala - May18/23	\$65.00	1	65.00
TOTAL			
	\$ 65.00		\$ 65.00

Councillor Beattie - Ward 10

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Meeting Expense - The Judge - May 5/23	13.76	1	13.76
Meeting Expense - Brewers Blackbird - Aug 3/23	97.42	3	32.47
Meeting Expense - Kelsey's - Sep 26/23	51.98	2	25.99
TOTAL	\$ 163.16		\$ 72.22

Councillor Tadeson - Ward 11

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Mileage	2,056.72		2,056.72
ROMA Conference - Toronto - Jan 22-24/23 Registration	694.95		694.95
Meeting Expense - The Judge - May 5/23	13.76	1	13.76
Meeting Expense - Pizzaiolo - Jun 5/23	7.49	1	7.49
TOTAL	\$ 2,772.92		\$ 2,772.92

Councillor Cassar - Ward 12

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Mileage	319.60		319.60
Meeting Expense - The Judge - May 5/23	13.76	1	13.76
TOTAL	\$ 333.36		\$ 333.36

Councillor Wilson - Ward 13

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
NIL	-		-
TOTAL	\$ -		\$ -

Councillor Spadafora - Ward 14

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Rev. J.C. Holland Awards - Feb 18/23	85.00	1	85.00
Women of Distinction Awards - YWCA - Feb 27/23	150.00	1	150.00
Chief's Gala - Mar 13/23	150.00	1	150.00
Meeting Expense - Pizzaiolo - Jun 5/23	7.49	1	7.49
Negev Gala Dinner - Jun 6/23	250.00	1	250.00
Meeting Expense - Barangas - Jul 14/23	88.14	4	22.04
Meeting Expense - Brewers Blackbird - Aug 3/23	97.42	3	32.47
Food4Kids Breakfast Gala - Nov 21/23	300.00	5	60.00
TOTAL	\$ 1,128.05		\$ 757.00

Councillor McMeekin - Ward 15

2023	<u>Total Expense</u> \$	<u># of Attendees</u>	<u>ProRated Expense</u> \$
Mileage	747.32		747.32
Outstanding Business Achievement Awards - Apr5/23	125.00	1	125.00
TOTAL	\$ 872.32		\$ 872.32