

MINUTES 11-007 HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Thursday, July 21, 2011 12:00 p.m., Room 264 Hamilton City Hall

Present: A. Denham-Robinson, Chair

M. Kirk, Co-Vice Chair

Councillors L. Ferguson, M. Pearson, B. McHattie M. Adkins, W. Arndt, C. Lei, S. Nowak, W. Rosart,

P. Wilson

Absent: R. Sinclair – Personal business

K. Wakeman – Personal businessW. Furland – Personal business

Also Present: M. Sergi, Manager, Community Planning and Design

J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner

A. Golden, Heritage Planning Technician

A. Mikkila , Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner – StudentC. Newman, Legislative Assistant, City Clerk's Office

Chair Denham-Robinson called the meeting to order. A member of the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee resigned and the Chair opened the floor to nominations.

(Rosart/Kirk)

That Paul Wilson be appointed to represent the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee on the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee for the 2011-2014 term of Council. **CARRIED**

1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

- 5. ADDED HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS
 - 5.2 Heritage Permit Application HP2011-038 Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act for Erection of Structures at 930 Beach Boulevard (Hamilton) (Ward 5)
- ADDED GENERAL INFORMATION
 - 9.5(c) Hamilton Wentworth District School Board Education Centre Information Sheet

- 9.6 Education & Communication Sub-Committee Minutes, July 6, 2011
- 9.7 Education & Communication Sub-Committee Minutes, July 15, 2011
- 9.8 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee: Year-End Report 2010
- 9.9 Heritage Permit Summary, Q1-Q2

(Adkins/Nowak)

That the agenda be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

None

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item 3)

Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Minutes dated July 16, 2011 (Item 3.1)

Stan Nowak requested that the motion put forward at the June 16, 2011 HMHC meeting, respecting the recommendation to designate the Dundas Post Office be amended to read as follows:

(Nowak/Adkins)

That bullet point two of appendix "B" and "C" listed under Description of Heritage Attributes be amended to read "original buff brick walls circa 1930 and bricked up windows be opened."

(Nowak/Adkins)

That bullet point six of appendix "B" and "C" listed under Description of Heritage Attributes be amended to read "mansard roof lines with slate roof look."

CARRIED

(Adkins/Nowak)

That the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council:

- a) That the designation of 104 King Street West (Dundas), shown in Appendix "A" as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be approved;
- b) That the Statement of Culture Heritage Value or Interest and Description

of Heritage Attributes, attached to Appendix "B" be approved, as amended;

c) That the City Solicitor be directed to take appropriate action to designate 104 King Street West (Dundas), under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix "C" as amended.

Amendment CARRIED

Motion as amended CARRIED

(Kirk/Nowak)

That the Minutes of the June 16, 2011, meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as amended. **CARRIED**

4. DELEGATION REQUESTS/DELEGATIONS/PRESENTATIONS (Item 4)

None

- 5. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 5)
 - (a) Delegated Approvals:
 - (i) Heritage Permit Application (Cockpit Column and Deck Restoration) 600 York Boulevard (Hamilton) Dundurn Castle (Ward 1) (Item 5.1(a))
 - (ii) Heritage Permit Application (Shutter Restoration and Replacement 41 Jackson Street West (Hamilton) Whitehern (Ward2) (Item 5.1(b))
 - (iii) Heritage Permit Application (Replacement of Quarry Tile Patch) 600 York Boulevard (Hamilton) Dundurn Castle (Ward 1) (Item 5.1(c))
 - (iv) Heritage Permit Application (Structural Reinforcement to Sanctuary, Demolition of Sunday School, Removal of Vegetation and Exposure/Protection of Stained Glass Windows) 130 Bay Street South (Hamilton) Former Saint Mark's Anglican Church (Ward 2) (Item 5.1(d))
 - (v) Heritage Permit Application (Photovoltaic Solar Panel Installation) 22 Veevers Drive (Hamilton) Veevers Home (Ward 5) (Item 5.1(e))
 - (vi) Heritage Permit Application (Replacement Windows) 131 St

Clair Avenue (Hamilton) St Clair Avenue Heritage Conservation District (Ward 3) (Item 5.1(f))

- (vii) Heritage Permit Application (Installation of a fire stair and modification to the existing windows for Fire Code compliance) 262 James Street South, Hamilton, Coburn House, By-law No. 86-313 (Ward 2) (Item 5.1(g))
- (viii) Heritage Permit Application (Alterations to the exterior and interior of the Refectory Building to permit the conversion of the former dining hall into a restaurant/bar) 1280 Main Street West, Hamilton, McMaster University Refectory Building, Bylaw 08-002 (Ward 1) (Item 5.1(h))
- (ix) Heritage Permit Application (Restoration of doors on the woodshed) 900 Woodward Avenue, Hamilton, Hamilton Museum of Steam and Technology, By-law No. 84-30 (Ward 4) (Item 5.1(i))

(Adkins/Nowak)

That the delegated approval letters 5.1(a) through 5.1(i), be received.

CARRIED

5.2 Heritage Permit Application HP2011-038 Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act for Erection of Structures at 930 Beach Boulevard (Hamilton) (Ward 5)

Joe Muller gave a brief overview of the report and Council decision. Comments included, but were not limited, to the following:

The proposed building is in the Beach Boulevard heritage conservation district. Mr. Muller reminded the Committee that any construction in the Beach Boulevard heritage conservation district has to be consistent with the Council approved district guidelines. The proposed structure is to be built on a vacant lot. Mr. Muller proceeded to review the plans for the proposed house and the recommendations of the report that was before Committee.

(Adkins/Nowak)

That Heritage Permit Application HP2011-038 be approved for the erection of a new single-detached residence, and attached garage, on the designated property at 930 Beach Boulevard (Hamilton Beach Heritage Conservation District), (Hamilton), subject to the following conditions:

- (a) That the grading, front and side yard setbacks, and building heights shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to final Site Plan approval and/or submission as part of any application for a Building Permit;
- (b) That the detailed specifications of the cladding, windows, doors, and other building materials for the new house and garage shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit;
- (c) That the dimensions and surfacing materials for the new driveway and any walkways, patios, or other hard-surface areas shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to installation;
- (d) That the dimensions, design, and materials for any new fencing and gates shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to installation;
- (e) That as many existing trees as possible shall be retained, and/or that one to three new trees of a minimum caliper of 55mm and of a species consistent with the City of Hamilton's Tree Species and Recommended Use Index shall be planted within one year of occupancy of the new dwelling;
- (f) That a plan depicting the removed, retained, and new trees, including the caliper size, locations, and species shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to any grading or tree removals;
- (g) That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit;
- (h) That construction and site alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than August 31, 2013. If the construction and site alterations are not completed by August 31, 2013, then this approval expires as of that date, and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.
 CARRIED

6. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS (Item 6)

None

7. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 7)

(a) Request to Designate 170 Longwood Road North (Hamilton) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED11096) (Ward 1) (Recommendations approved by Council June 15, 2011) (Item 7.1)

Mr. Muller gave a brief overview of the report and Council decision. Comments included, but were not limited, to the following:

Mr. Muller indicated that this report has been presented to the Planning Committee. The owner of the property is very cooperative with staff, and is interested in designation. If approved by the Heritage Committee the property will be added to the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

(McHattie/Adkins)

- (a) That Report PED11096 respecting Request to Designate 170 Longwood Road North (Hamilton) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act be received;
- (b) That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee concurs with Council's decision that 170 Longwood Road North (Hamilton) be added to the Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

 CARRIED

8. Buildings and Landscapes (Item 8)

(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:

(i) Auchmar Gate House, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L)(R) – M. Adkins

At the May 19, 2011 Municipal Heritage Committee meeting, the Committee requested that a representative from the Culture Division speak to the Committee respecting the moving of Auchmar Gate House. The Director of Culture, Anna Bradford, was in attendance to speak to Committee. Comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

Ms. Bradford indicated that the Gate House is privately owned. Approximately two years ago, the owner of the home offered to donate it to the City. Before taking action or making a recommendation to Council, a study of the property was required. Ms. Bradford indicated that the study was started by Craig Sims,

but was put on hold. While the study was on hold, the building owner revoked the offer to donate the home to the City and City staff was no longer welcomed on the property. Without completing the study, City staff is not sure if the home can be moved. Mr. Sims was asked for his opinion on whether the building could be moved. He felt that it would not be possible.

The Committee discussed the matter. Comments included, but were not limited, to the following:

The Committee asked staff what the owner wants to do with the property and why he revoked the offer to give the building to the City. The belief is that the owner would like to demolish the building because he views it as a liability. The reasons why City staff were no longer allowed on the property are unclear but may be related to problems the owner had with property standards and By-law infractions.

Councillor McHattie was interested in getting more information on the situation and what interaction the owner has had with By-law enforcement.

Mr. Muller indicated that Heritage Staff have also spoken with the owner and the expressed intent to demolish the building, but staff advised that the property is on the City's Register and any notice of intent to demolish would require adequate documentation.

(Adkins/Arndt)

That staff be directed to arrange a meeting with Heritage Planning staff, the owner of Auchmar Gate House, Chair of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, Councillor T. Whitehead and By-law enforcement to discuss issues surrounding the Auchmar Gate House and report back to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

(ii) St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) - M. Kirk

Brush and weeds have been cleared from around the building.

(iii) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – B. McHattie

No update

(iv) Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – W. Arndt

No update

(v) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L)
– M. Adkins

Columbia College may be interested in turning it into a school and residence.

The Committee asked for an update with respect to a heritage designation being placed upon the property. Staff indicated that it is on staff's work program for this year.

(vi) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – W. Rosart

No update

(vii) (Thomas Building) – 46 – 52 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – R. Sinclair

Construction equipment is on site, but to the best of the Committee's knowledge, nothing is planned for the location.

(viii) All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton (L) – A. Denham-Robinson

No update

(ix) Grove Hall, Gateview, Century Manor and surrounding landscape, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (L)(R)(D) – C. Lei

No update

(x) Erland Lee Home and Museum, 552 Ridge Road, Stoney Creek
– K. Wakeman

Ms. Wakeman was not in attendance but had forwarded a message to Chair Denham-Robinson. Two fundraising campaigns have been started to help the property and a group named the "Friends of the Erland Lee" were allowed into the building to check on its condition.

(xi) Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – M. Adkins

No update

(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Concern:

(i) Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton (R) – S. Nowak

No update

(c) Heritage Properties Update:

(i) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – C. LeiWork is still being completed on the front steps.

(ii) Lister Building, 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – B. McHattie

No update

(iii) Treble Hall, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins

The renovation is coming along quite well. The owner will hold a tour of the building for interested HMHC members on Friday July 29, 2011.

9. GENERAL INFORMATION (Item 9)

(i) Heritage Permit Application HP2011-010 Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act for Erection of Structures at 908 Beach Boulevard (Hamilton) (PED11106) (Ward 5) - Planning Committee Report 11-011, Amended by Council June 15, 2011 (Pages 3-4) (Item 9.1)

(Pearson/Ferguson)

That the update regarding City Council's decision respecting 908 Beach Boulevard, be received. CARRIED

M. Adkins, W. Rosart and W. Arndt were opposed to the motion.

(ii) Policy and Design Sub-Committee Minutes dated, June 24, 2011 (Item 9.2)

(Adkins/Nowak)

That the Policy and Design Sub-Committee minutes of June 24, 2011, be received. **CARRIED**

(iii) Amendments to the Requests to Designate Properties Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act: Priorities and the Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (PED11098) (Wards 2, 8, and 11) (Recommendations approved by Council May 25, 2011) (Item 9.3)

(Adkins/Pearson)

That the update respecting report PED11098, be received. **CARRIED**

(iv) Letter by Mr. Robin McKee respecting the Dundas Post Office and Heritage Designation (Item 9.4)

(Adkins/Nowak)

That the letter by Mr. Robin McKee respecting the Dundas Post Office and Heritage Designation, be received. **CARRIED**

- (v) 100 Main Street West, Hamilton (Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board Education Centre) (Item 9.5)
 - (a) Hamilton Spectator (July 11, 2011) "Architecture buffs back 'prettiest building'"(Item 9.1(a))
 - (b) Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) Report 08-001 (Item 2) (Item 9.4(b))
 - (c) Hamilton Wentworth District School Board Education Centre Information Sheet

(Adkins/Nowak)

That 100 Main Street West, Hamilton (Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board Education Centre) be added as a Building of Concern. **CARRIED**

(vi) Education & Communication Sub-Committee Minutes, July 6, 2011 (Item 9.6)

(Pearson/Lei)

That the July 6, 2011 minutes of the Education & Communication Sub-Committee, be received.

(vii) Education & Communication Sub-Committee Minutes, July 15, 2011 (Item 9.7)

(Rosart/Nowak)

That the July 15, 2011 minutes of the Education & Communication Sub-Committee, be received.

(viii) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee: Year-End Report 2010 (Item 9.8)

(Lei/Nowak)

That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year-End Report 2010, be received. CARRIED

(ix) Heritage Permit Summary, Q1-Q2 (Item 9.9)

(Adkins/Pearson)

That the Heritage Permit Summary Q1–Q2, be received. CARRIED

10. NEW BUSINESS

(i) Robin McKee respecting the Dundas Post Office and Heritage Designations (Item 10.1)

Mr. McKee was in attendance and requested to speak to the Committee respecting the letter (item 9.4) he submitted to the Committee.

(Rosart/Nowak)

That Robin McKee be permitted to speak to Committee respecting his letter regarding the Dundas Post Office and Heritage Designations.

CARRIED

Mr. McKee had some concern with respect to the Dundas Post Office heritage designation and how it would affect the potential future designation of his own properties. Mr. Muller indicated that the approval of designation of the Dundas Post Office by the Heritage Committee had no impact on the work program priority of his properties that are on the designation list.

(Pearson/Adkins)

That the delegation by Mr. McKee, be received.

CARRIED

(ii) 13 King Street West, Hamilton, Herbert S. Mills – China Shop (Item 10.2)

Paul Wilson indicated an old store front was rediscovered due to a windstorm which took down a sign that was covering the store front of Herbert S. Mills – Mills China. The City took notice of the fallen sign and noticed some building infractions. The owner received a letter from the City asking them to rectify the problem or clear the property of the building.

Mr. Muller indicated that heritage staff is working on developing a database that will be accessible to all City staff so they can cross reference locations before sending out letters and assist in preventing issues like this from occurring. Councillor Pearson indicated that the City departments use many different computer systems and they do not all match up in one database.

(iii) Heritage Planning Technician (Item 10.3)

Heritage Planning Technician, Alissa Golden, addressed the Committee. She has been hired by the City to work on updating a database of heritage resources within Hamilton's downtown and identifying buildings of historical significance. The HMHC will be consulted on matters relating to heritage before staff moves forward with adding properties to a register.

11. ADJOURNMENT (Item 11)

(Pearson/Arndt)

That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, be adjourned at 2:00 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Alissa Denham-Robinson, Chair Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Christopher Newman Legislative Assistant, City Clerk's Office July 21, 2011