

CITY OF HAMILTON**PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT**
Environment and Sustainable Infrastructure Division

TO: Chair and Members Public Works Committee	WARD(S) AFFECTED: WARD 9
COMMITTEE DATE: October 3, 2011	
SUBJECT/REPORT NO: Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan (PW11071) - (Ward 9 with City Wide Implications)	
SUBMITTED BY: Gerry Davis, CMA General Manager Public Works Department	PREPARED BY: Mark A. Kosiuk (905) 546-2424, Extension 2331
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

That the updated 2011 Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan, as shown attached in Appendix "A" of Report PW11071, be approved as the official policy document for the management and development of this park.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This policy document is required as it is the mandate of the Niagara Escarpment Commission (NEC) and Ministry of Natural Resources (MNR) to ensure the updated Master Plan will establish effective policy guidelines for long term protection, development and management of the park related to the natural and cultural heritage features and functions of the natural space.

This Master Plan update balances the cultural heritage and natural heritage resources with competing interests on the site through the preparation of an overall improvement plan.

The Master Plan reflects the City's Strategic Plan through several objectives that include: intent to protect the cultural and natural features of this National Historic Site, the natural environment of the Niagara Escarpment, to maintain and develop high quality opportunities for cultural heritage and natural heritage interpretation, recreation, discovery and enjoyment of the Niagara Escarpment by Ontario's residents and visitors

to the City. The goal then of this Master Plan is to protect, conserve, interpret and present the site to a wide range of users.

Key recommendations of this Master Plan are:

- To protect, conserve, and interpret the evolution of the site and the Battle of Stoney Creek, June 5-6, 1813, a pivotal battle in the War of 1812-1814 marking the furthest advance of the American troops in the Province of Upper Canada.
- To protect, conserve, and interpret the commemorative work (the Monument and Gage House) by the Women's Wentworth Historical Society under the guidance of Sara Calder, the great grand-daughter of James and Mary Gage.
- To conserve and interpret the significant cultural heritage resources on the site including the restoration of the 1920's Dunington-Grubb landscape design on the east side of the park (recommended in the 1993 Battlefield Park Master Plan by Taylor Hazell currently under construction).
- To add a new interpretive building on the west side of the park to be the centre of public education with respect to the War of 1812-14.
- To enhance public programming generally in the park including the annual Re-enactment of the Battle of Stoney Creek.
- To plan in the long-term renewed health and ecological diversity of the forest and manage impacts from the informal trail system.
- To identify the park as part of the Niagara Escarpment Park and Open Space System by including the Niagara Escarpment Program logo on park signs and printed material.
- To undertake an archaeological site management plan to ensure that the management of all remaining areas of archaeological potential are actively integrated into all Park activities entailing future soil disruption.
- To increase barrier-free access throughout the property and investigate alternatives for innovative solutions where physical access is limited.
- To increase the site's security for visitors and staff through increased lighting and vehicular control measures and in consideration of CPTED principles (Crime Prevention through Environmental Design).
- To mitigate the impact of noise and visibility from Centennial Parkway South with a proposed berm and new planting on the western side of the park.

Alternatives for Consideration - See Page 8

FINANCIAL / STAFFING / LEGAL IMPLICATIONS
--

Financial: None at this time as a financing plan is not yet in place for the costs relating to the development of the Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan components on the west side of the park. Implementation

costs will be reviewed and provided to Council through the Capital Budget process.

Funding for the implementation of the Dunington Grubb Landscape Plan, as part of the commemoration of the 2013 Bicentennial of the Battle of Stoney Creek, had been approved by Council in the 2009 Capital Budget. This project is now under construction and it is anticipated to be completed by October 31, 2011. Partial funding has been received for the implementation of the commemorative Public Art focus at the northwest corner of the park. Additional funding of \$350,000 will be recommended through the 2012 Capital Budget process. If approved it is anticipated construction will take place in the spring of 2012.

Staffing: Existing staff resources will be utilized to undertake the recommendations in the report. There are no identified staffing implications arising out of this recommendation.

Legal: Not applicable

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Battlefield Park was the site of the Battle of Stoney Creek on June 5-6, 1813. It was an integral part of the defense of British North America and the battle was a significant event in the history of the War of 1812 and the history of this country. The importance of this event was recognized by the Federal Government with a National Heritage Site designation in 1960. In 2013, the 200th anniversary of this event will be celebrated at Battlefield Park.

In 1993, the *Battlefield Park Master Plan Study* by Taylor Hazell Architects Ltd. addressed both the site's built heritage and landscape features. The report included an assessment of the site's use, the museum collection, and programming. The study proposed the restoration of Battlefield House (Gage House) and surrounding landscape and a new site design for the west side of the Park. This report was a comprehensive look at the facilities, grounds, collections and programming of the park for the former City of Stoney Creek by Taylor Hazell Architects Ltd. As part of its recommendations, it concluded that a new interpretive centre was needed to provide the provincial Ministry criteria for space allocations for a new museum. This 1993 Master Plan was endorsed by the former City of Stoney Creek Council.

In August 1998, Philip Goldsmith and Company Ltd. Architects produced *The Jackson House Feasibility Study*. The purpose of this report was to assess the viability of relocating the Jackson House (now known as "Grandview") to Battlefield Park. Many of the recommendations of this report are currently in progress.

In addition to the Municipal heritage designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Ontario Heritage Trust (OHT) holds a heritage conservation easement on Battlefield Park property and all proposed works must be reviewed by the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee (HMHC) and the Ontario Heritage Trust (OHT). Any proposed works resulting in soil disturbance will be subject to the Battlefield Park

Archaeological Site Management Plan, and sign off of the provincial interest by the Ministry of Tourism and Culture.

Since the first Master Plan was completed nearly 20 years ago, there have been a significant number of enhancements and changes made to the site and the surrounding area. In many ways, however, individual works have been undertaken in isolation to solve specific needs. This 2011 Master Plan update takes into account the new information now available.

It is important to note the following changes that have occurred since the Master Plan was first developed in 1993:

- The site has been recognized as having significance to all Canadians. The Commemorative Integrity Statement for the site was completed in 2002. This is a Parks Canada documentation and evaluation process which assists in interpretation and conservation planning.
- The former City of Stoney Creek has been amalgamated into the new City of Hamilton. This has added Battlefield House Museum to the family of municipal museums operating in Hamilton and in turn allows for potential museum support activities to be coordinated with other sites, possibly reducing duplication of space requirements on site.
- Additional archaeological investigations are in progress or have been completed in various parts of the site, increasing our understanding of its history.
- The Nash Jackson House, “Grandview”, has been relocated to the site and the final renovation work completed. Its landscape setting has been established.
- The restoration of the Battlefield Monument has been completed.
- The parking lot has been relocated from where the pavilion now stands to its current location and the bandshell on the west side of the site has been removed.
- The barn, which Park Maintenance uses for operation purposes, has been assessed and it has been discovered that it may be a significant historic artifact from the Gage Farm era.
- A new washroom/concession and picnic shelter/pavilion has been constructed on the site for public use.
- The road entrance to the site from King Street West has been relocated to the west side of Battlefield Creek following the acquisition and demolition of a residential property on King Street West.
- The remaining three residences fronting King Street West, no. 79, 81, and 95, had been acquired by the City and along with the corner Battlefield Park Administration building at 99 King Street West have been demolished (as of May 2010) creating an open view into the park.

- The Ministry of Tourism and Culture's spatial requirements for the recommended size of the interpretive centre have increased over and above what was initially proposed for the interpretive centre in 1993.

Subsequently an updated Master Plan was necessitated by the City's Community Services Department - Culture Division, and Public Works Department - Environment and Sustainable Infrastructure Division to address these changes that have occurred on the site since 1993.

Therefore the updated Master Plan lays out an overall strategy showing the general locations for new facilities including an interpretative building, parking area and alterations to some of the existing park buildings, namely the picnic pavilion, the works maintenance building, as well as restoration of the commemorative landscape on the east side of the park. It should be noted these recommendations were contained in the 1993 Master Plan.

Should the interpretive building project be undertaken, associated costs for the interpretive building, demolition and reconstruction of the barn for programming purposes, and subsequent relocation of the maintenance yard will be addressed by Community Services - Culture Division in future budget submissions.

It is the intention of the updated Master Plan to lay out the scope of enhancement work to continue to undertake the park program requirements as funding is available. The complete January 2011 Master Plan document is available for public review on the City's website as follows:

[//www.hamilton.ca/CityDepartments/PublicWorks/EnvironmentSustainableInfrastructure/OpenSpace/Battlefield+Park.htm](http://www.hamilton.ca/CityDepartments/PublicWorks/EnvironmentSustainableInfrastructure/OpenSpace/Battlefield+Park.htm)

POLICY IMPLICATIONS

Components of the Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan support the Council adopted Official Plan and the Public Works Department's Business Plan, "Innovate Now" – to be a leader in "greening" and stewardship in the City through participation in policy land management development opportunities within the Province (NEPOSS - Niagara Escarpment Park and Open Space System).

Archaeology Policies - The City shall require the protection, conservation, or mitigation of sites of archaeological value and *areas of archaeological potential* as provided for under the Planning Act, the Environmental Assessment Act, the Ontario Heritage Act, the Municipal Act, the Cemeteries Act, or any other applicable legislation.

- The drafting of an archaeological site management plan for Battlefield Park will ensure care is taken to conserve this rare battlefield site, and archaeological data can be incorporated into interpretive features.

There are additional legislative and consultative implications with respect to the Battlefield Park Master Plan, as follows:

The subject property is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Any alterations, demolition or construction that impacts archaeological, built heritage and cultural heritage landscape features identified in the reasons for designation require a heritage permit. Heritage permits for alterations are subject to the consultation and advice of the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee as a staff-delegated approval. Heritage Permits for the demolition and erection of structures are the decision of Council, as advised through consultation with the Municipal Heritage Committee. Heritage permits are applicable law under the Ontario Building Code Act. Heritage Permits have been approved by delegation on advice of the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee for work to date on the restoration of Battlefield Park National Historic Site.

The Ontario Heritage Trust also holds a heritage easement on the subject property, and as such alterations to the cultural heritage values or interests identified in the easement are subject to a permitting process administered through the Ontario Heritage Trust (OHT). Permits have been approved for work to date on the restoration of Battlefield Park National Historic Site by the OHT.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Consultation with various governments, agencies, stakeholders, and general public has been undertaken to ensure that the objectives of the improvements at Battlefield Park are understood and that there is overall agreement on the Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan.

Externally, key participants included Parks Canada, Ontario Heritage Trust (OHT), the Ministry of Natural Resources (MNR), the Niagara Escarpment Commission (NEC), the Six Nations of the Grand River Territory First Nation, the Mississaugas of the New Credit First Nation, the Battlefield Park Master Plan Advisory Committee, the Battle of Stoney Creek Re-enactors and the general Public.

Through the public process, Public Works staff presented a series of focused meetings and updates on the Master Plan with agencies (OHT January 12, 2010, MNR and NEC May 5, 2010), stakeholder groups (Battle of Stoney Creek Re-enactors February 10, 2010, Battlefield Park Master Plan Advisory Committee June 1, 2010), the general public (Public Meeting May 5, 2009), and the Ward Councillor. The creation of a project web page on the City's website assisted to provide regular updates and obtain comments from the general public (February 2010 to May 2010). Media coverage was made through the Hamilton Spectator and Stoney Creek News. The purpose of these consultations was to:

- Inform the public, stakeholder groups and local residents of the process to redevelop the Park
- Obtain public and user group input
- Identify the studies required for the future redevelopment of the Park
- Identify potential issues

Internally, a City staff project steering committee was struck by Public Works, Landscape Architectural Services that included cross department representation from Public Works, Community Services, Planning and Economic Development with input from the following Divisions and Sections.

Public Works:

Environment & Sustainable Infrastructure, Landscape Architectural Services
Operations and Waste Management, Parks, Support Services

Community Services:

Culture

Planning and Economic Development:

Economic Development and Real Estate, Real Estate
Economic Development and Real Estate, Urban Renewal
Strategic Services/Special Projects
Planning, Community Planning and Design, Heritage Planning
Planning, Community Planning and Design, Natural Heritage

Public Works staff presented updates on the Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan to the Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee on November 4, 2009, and April 7, 2010. This resulted in receiving the necessary delegated approvals for heritage permits from the City and permission was likewise received from the Ontario Heritage Trust to undertake the restoration of the Dunington Grubb landscape on the east side of the park.

Ward 9 Councillor

The Councillor is a strong advocate in the community and is in support of the Master Plan and based on his recommendation, the Battlefield Park Master Plan Advisory Committee was established. Primarily made up of special interest groups, the Advisory Committee's mandate is to advise on the implementation of the Master Plan and will continue to play an advisory role in the future implementation of phased works.

Ward 5 Councillor and Ward 10 Councillor

Both Councillors attended the Public Meeting held on May 5, 2009 and have expressed support for the Master Plan.

ANALYSIS / RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION
--

As Battlefield Park is located within the Niagara Escarpment Parks and Open Space System (NEPOSS) of over 130 parks and open spaces, the Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan has to be approved by the Niagara Escarpment Commission (NEC) and the Ministry of Natural Resources (MNR).

The City has been able to move forward with construction projects (such as the implementation of the Dunington Grubb Landscape Plan) without Development Control

Permits and in advance of Niagara Escarpment Commission (NEC) approval of the Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan, since the site is outside the NEC's Development Control Area. However, the NEC has proposed an amendment to the current regulation that would, if approved, put this land inside the Development Control Area.

Notwithstanding the current non-requirement for a development permit, the Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan itself is of interest to the Niagara Escarpment Commission (NEC) based on the property's inclusion in the Niagara Escarpment Plan (NEP), and specifically because of its designation as an historical park within the Niagara Escarpment Parks and Open Space System (NEPOSS).

Part 3 of the NEP contains policies addressing NEPOSS lands. Specifically, 3.1.6 states that management agencies will prepare plans for each park or open space in the system. 3.1.7 states that the land use designations of the NEP and the Development Criteria in Part 2 will be used as a guide in the planning process through which zoning would be developed and take precedence over the NEP land use designations once the Plan is determined to be not in conflict with the NEP and is approved.

It is the mandate of the NEC and Ministry of Natural Resources (MNR) to ensure the updated Master Plan will establish effective policy guidelines for long term protection, development and management of the park related to the natural and cultural heritage features and functions of the natural space.

Approval of the recommendation by Committee and Council will allow this process to take place. Once the management plan as contained in the updated Master Plan has been reviewed and approved by the NEC and MNR then the Approval/Conformity Statement is signed off.

If the NEC and the Ministry of Natural Resources were able to review the Master Plan towards the goal of declaring that the Master Plan is not in conflict with the NEP, development permits to implement portions of the Master Plan would in that case not be required whether the site was in the development control area or not.

This would then allow Community Services - Culture Division to move forward with continued necessary studies and detailed planning for future implementation of other site works.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

The first alternative is for the City to not adopt the Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan as the official policy document for the management and development of this Park and to not submit the Master Plan to the NEC and MNR for approval but rather as a "for information purposes only" document.

This alternative is not recommended as the updated Battlefield Park National Historic Site Master Plan that was developed embodies the principles of protection, conservation, and interpretation in presenting options for future use of the park and in

particular the proposal for an interpretive centre on the west side of the park. It is important that this document be brought forward by City staff in any planning processes.

In addition to the above, the Ministry of Natural Resources (MNR) and the Niagara Escarpment Commission (NEC) have mandated that all municipalities within and abutting the Niagara Escarpment Park and Open Space System must provide a Park Management Plan in conformity with the general intent and purpose of the Niagara Escarpment Plan pursuant to S.13-(1) of the Niagara Escarpment Planning and Development Act (1995). Review of the Master Plan by these Agencies has indicated the document meets this criteria and receives their support. Approval of the Master Plan would thereby allow the MNR and the NEC to review and formally approve this document and to allow Community Services - Culture Division to move forward with continued necessary studies and detailed planning for future implementation of other site works. There would be no costs associated with this alternative, however, staff time would still be required to review future use of these lands.

CORPORATE STRATEGIC PLAN

Focus Areas: 1. Skilled, Innovative and Respectful Organization, 2. Financial Sustainability, 3. Intergovernmental Relationships, 4. Growing Our Economy, 5. Social Development, 6. Environmental Stewardship, 7. Healthy Community

Skilled, Innovative & Respectful Organization

- ♦ More innovation, greater teamwork, better client focus
- ♦ Cross department collaboration between Public Works and Community Services

Financial Sustainability

- ♦ Delivery of municipal services and management capital assets/liabilities in a sustainable, innovative and cost effective manner
- ♦ Increased opportunity to delivery expanded public outreach programs

Intergovernmental Relationships

- ♦ Promote public and private awareness, appreciation, and enjoyment of Hamilton's cultural heritage through public programmes or heritage interpretation activities, heritage tourism, and guidance on appropriate conservation practices.
- ♦ The Battlefield Park Master Plan will accommodate a co-ordinated approach to overall management and promotion of the park through public participation.
- ♦ Protect and conserve the tangible cultural heritage resources of the City, including archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes for present and future generations.
- ♦ Promote awareness and appreciation of the City's cultural heritage and encourage public and private stewardship of and custodial responsibility for the City's *cultural heritage resources*.

- ♦ Adoption of the Battlefield Park Master Plan will meet these policy objectives by putting in place a comprehensive management plan for the property and its component cultural heritage resources.
- ♦ Maintain effective relationships with other public agencies including Ontario Heritage Trust, and Ministry of Culture. The designation of Battlefield Park as a National Historic Site allows for identifying existing grant opportunities within the Provincial ministries and the fostering of positive working relationships
- ♦ Involvement of Niagara Escarpment Commission and Ministry of Natural Resources to expand connectivity with the escarpment natural area and the participation in policy development opportunities within the Province (NEPOSS - Niagara Escarpment Park and Open Space System)

Growing Our Economy

- ♦ A visitor and convention destination
- ♦ Comprehensive restoration of Battlefield Park in advance of the War of 1812 Bicentennial event will ensure this is a landmark event and location, and establish it as a key location in future commemorative tours and events.
- ♦ Expanded programs for the newly constructed Dunington Grubb formal gardens on the east side, the future interpretive building on the west side, Gage House, Monument Hill and Grandview will provide a tourist destination at a regional level.

Social Development

- ♦ Residents in need have access to adequate support services
- ♦ People participate in all aspects of community life without barriers or stigma

Environmental Stewardship

- ♦ Natural resources are protected and enhanced
- ♦ Reduced impact of City activities on the environment. The trail creation will focus on minimizing impacts and providing habitat improvements through the concentration of users on the City's and Niagara Escarpment's trails rather than the current scenario of informal footpaths with wider-spread impacts.
- ♦ Aspiring to the highest environmental standards
- ♦ Recommendations for LEED (Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design) technology

Healthy Community

- ♦ Plan and manage the built environment.
- ♦ An engaged Citizenry: Increase the percentage of Hamilton residents who are moderately active (22.4%) and physically active (26.6%) from 49% to 54% by 2011. Access to walking trails has been shown to increase the physical activity in a neighbourhood.

APPENDICES / SCHEDULES

Appendix "A" - Battlefield Park East Side Site Development Plan
Appendix "B" - Battlefield Park West Side Site Development Plan



Hamilton

Public Works

General Manager
Gerry Davis, CMA.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT
Environment and Sustainable Infrastructure Division

BATTLEFIELD PARK EAST SIDE SITE DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Appendix A

October 3, 2011

N.T.S.



General Manager
Gerry Davis, CMA.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT
Environment and Sustainable Infrastructure Division

BATTLEFIELD PARK WEST SIDE SITE DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Appendix B

October 3, 2011

N.T.S.