



CITY OF HAMILTON
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT
Corporate Assets & Strategic Planning Division

TO:	Chair and Members Public Works Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	March 17, 2014
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Coordinated Street Furniture Program (PW09033b) - (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Lugene MacDonald , Business Initiatives Coordinator (905) 546 2424, Extension 2199
SUBMITTED BY:	Gerry Davis, CMA General Manager Public Works Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That up to \$55,000 be utilized for the retention of consulting services to develop Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines for the City's Street Furniture Program, funded from, Transportation Account 55916-530400 and Engineering Services Account 55916-4031311015.
- (b) That Staff be directed to renegotiate the Creative Outdoor Advertising (known as transit benches/waste receptacles) contract one year prior to its expiration in order to facilitate the installation of new street furniture elements prior to the 2015 Pan Am Games.
- (c) That the contracts of the remaining street furniture elements, including but not limited to; transit shelters, bicycle racks and publication boxes, will be awarded through competitive procurement processes and take effect January 1, 2016. Each street furniture element will align with the Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to identify the key factors involved in creating a Coordinated Street Furniture Program. Progress to date includes the plan to engage a consultant to work with staff in developing Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines for the placement of elements within the City streetscapes. The criteria and guidelines will include standard furniture types and placement of the furniture elements. As well, the guidelines will encourage solutions for conditions which are not considered to be typical or have unique characteristics such as Business Improvement Areas and Special Policy Areas. The focus of this initiative is to improve the image and identity of our

streetscapes while negotiating municipally specific contracts, incorporating enhanced maintenance, revenue-sharing, and greater accountability of suppliers.

In preparation for the 2015 Pan Am Games, Councillors have advised the acceleration of the renewal of the existing Creative Outdoor Advertising contract, one year prior to its expiration, with the goal of implementing new transit benches/waste receptacles prior to the Games. Should the recommendation to renegotiate be supported, staff will begin discussions with Creative Outdoor Advertising to address maintenance and operating concerns as well as enhanced revenue-sharing models. Successful renegotiation of the contract is contingent on the completion of and adherence to, the Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines. The goal of the early negotiations is to have the renegotiated agreement and implementation of new transit benches/waste receptacles, take effect prior to the 2015 Pan Am Games.

The remaining street furniture contracts, specifically the transit shelter and bicycle rack agreements do not allow the City to terminate earlier than the December 31, 2015 expiration, without cause. Therefore, staff are recommending a competitive procurement process for all other street furniture elements.

Staff will continue to work with Transportation Divisions of the Public Works Department and the Finance, Administration and Revenue Generation Division of the Corporate Services Department to ensure the Coordinated Street Furniture Program is consistent and complementary to the Transit Shelter Expansion Plan and City Wide Marketing strategy.

Alternatives for Consideration - See Page 7

FINANCIAL - STAFFING - LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: This report will support the expenditure of up to \$55,000 from existing accounts to engage a consultant, in assisting staff in the development of Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines.

Staffing: There are no staffing implications with the recommendations in this report.

Legal: There are no legal implications associated with the recommendations in this report. However, Legal Services staff will be involved in the renegotiation of the Creative Outdoor Advertising contract.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The first step leading to the realization of a Coordinated Street Furniture Program in the City of Hamilton was in 2009 as part of the Bus Bench Furniture Program Review and Street Furniture Request for Proposal (RFP).

At its meeting June 15, 2009, the Public Works Committee recommended, and on June 24, 2009 Council subsequently approved the following:

(a) That the existing contracts of:

(i) Hamilton Bench Advertising Limited (also known as Creative Outdoor Advertising) respecting bus bench furniture, expiring October 31, 2009; and

**SUBJECT: Coordinated Street Furniture Program
(PW09033b) - (City Wide) - Page 3 of 8**

- (ii) *Pattison Outdoor Advertising, a division of Jim Pattison Industries Ltd., respecting billboards, expiring August 31, 2011, both be extended to December 31, 2015 to coincide with the termination of CBS Outdoor Canada (transit shelters) contract;*
- (b) *That the extensions be updated to provide improved terms, including an enhanced maintenance program and an annual revenue inflation factor, and shall be to the satisfaction of the General Manager of Public Works (bus bench furniture) the General Manager of Planning and Economic Development (billboards) and the City Solicitor;*
- (c) *That Terms of Reference and development of site selection criteria for a coordinated street furniture program as outlined in staff report "Bus Bench Furniture Program Review and Street Furniture RFP (PW09033) – (City Wide)" be updated and submitted to Public Works Committee for consideration in Q4 2014 or earlier.*

Street furniture consists of a wide variety of elements and amenities installed in the public right of way for the use and convenience of the public. Examples include, but are not limited to:

- transit shelters
- litter/recycling receptacles
- benches
- multi-publication structures
- information/way-finding structures
- poster kiosks
- bicycle racks
- cigarette receptacles

Over time, numerous street furniture amenities have been introduced to Hamilton's streetscape and demand continues to grow. The resulting streetscape, in the absence of a standard design or placement guidelines, consists of disordered design elements.

Public Works took on this project in an effort to bring together a working group to establish guidelines and criteria that would assist in integrating street furniture into the public realm in a manner that would be cohesive, accessible, safe, efficient and aesthetically pleasing.

A project charter has been developed to guide the Coordinated Street Furniture Program, which includes fundamentals such as project sponsor, scope, work breakdown, schedule, business case, working group and steering committee. The steering committee consists of staff from Public Works; Corporate Assets and Strategic Planning, Operations, Transportation, Planning and Economic Development; Tourism and Culture, Community Planning and Design, and Corporate Services; Finance, Administration, and Revenue Generation.

In addition, the Mobility Programs and Special Projects section of the Public Works Transportation Division has completed a considerable amount of work to improve the image of transit, and establish a unique identity for rapid transit. This effort is recognized and will be incorporated into the process of establishing a street furniture program for Hamilton. Representatives from Transportation and Corporate Assets and Strategic Planning will continue to work together to ensure coordination and synergy of the two programs.

To successfully implement a Coordinated Street Furniture Program, staff recommend the retention of a consultant to assist with establishing street furniture Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines. These guidelines will include potential furniture types, standard parts and design elements that will provide general guidance for the placement of street furniture and encourage site specific solutions for conditions which are not considered typical. For example, the following are a sampling of what will be considered in the development process; Pedestrian Mobility Master Plan, Daylight Triangles, Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA), and limiting duplication of furniture elements. In addition, the guidelines will identify which street furniture elements are suitable for limited and controlled advertising to regulate a tasteful and tactful streetscape. These elements will form part of a revenue sharing program for each of the street furniture elements that the City determines as viable options. It is imperative that all advertising meet the standards set out by the City of Hamilton Policy for Commercial Advertising & Sponsorship (2008) and the Advertising Standards Council of Canada. All proposals, whether single or multi-element, will be evaluated based upon the ability to adhere to the Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines. Staff will utilize existing accounts for consulting services to a maximum of \$55,000.00.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

N/A

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

1. Internal Consultation

Multiple Departments and Divisions play various roles in the administration and management of street furniture amenities within the City of Hamilton. Furniture amenities appear on the streetscape through many different types, designs, conditions and quantities. Over the last year, the Street Furniture working group identified that the existing inventory of elements is a result of numerous requests from a variety of internal and external sources. In moving forward with Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines, the process needs to be consistent with other on-going projects and existing secondary and transportation strategies within the City.

The Rapid Transit section of the Public Works Transportation Division has developed the Hamilton Rapid Transit A and B lines. Staff continues to work closely and consult with the Mobility Programs & Special Projects and Transit Planning teams on a regular basis. Staff recognize the importance of incorporating the established unique identity of the new bus shelters into the process of establishing a street furniture program for Hamilton.

The Planning Department has developed Secondary Plans and Streetscape Master Plans. Public Works Landscape Architectural Services is involved in the functional detail and design of the streetscapes. Secondary Plans have been approved for a number of areas in the City, including Downtown, Ancaster and Stoney Creek. The streetscape design for the street furniture program will be consistent with these Secondary Plans and Streetscape Master Plans.

Staff has consulted with Community Planning and Design of the Planning and Economic Development Department to coordinate efforts with the Ottawa Street Business Improvement Area Master Plan for streetscapes.

The Street Furniture working group has been consulting with the Finance, Administration, and Revenue Generation Division to incorporate the revenue sharing component of the Coordinated Street Furniture Program into the City Wide Marketing Strategy.

In consultation with both the Procurement and Legal Departments, staff has been advised there is no issue from either department with the strategy as presented herein.

Staff has consulted with Ward Councillors in considering the strategy herein provided, and thus far Councillors have supported the direction.

2. Municipal Consultation

In order to benefit from best practices and lessons learned, staff has consulted with a number of municipalities to obtain the current status of their street furniture programs.

The City of Toronto entered into a twenty year agreement with Astral Media Outdoor L.P. in 2007 for the design, supply, manufacture, installation, and maintenance of over 26,000 street furniture elements. As part of the contract, Astral Media was granted exclusive rights to limited and controlled advertising on some of the street furniture elements allowing the full program to be funded through revenue sharing at no cost to the City of Toronto.

The City of Ottawa and Region of Durham have previously issued RFP's based on a single contract with revenue sharing and were unsuccessful in obtaining proposals.

In 2008 the Region of York was unsuccessful with a single contract RFP. Recently, they have issued a Request for Information to assist in the development of a revised RFP. Their new request was open to both single and split-bid submissions. The contract was recently awarded and the successful proponent is pursuing a program that includes revenue-sharing in conjunction with the supply and maintenance of street furniture throughout the Region.

3. Contractor Consultation

Staff has discussed the existing programs with current service providers and the following comments should be considered in the development of a sustainable street furniture program:

- Placement guidelines are critical to a sustainable program and eliminate guess work and costly errors.
- One standard design element is cost efficient and preferred by contracted companies.
- Recognize vandalism of street furniture elements is a costly maintenance issue. Currently, CBS Outdoor Advertising reports that 80% of their revenue from

advertising is spent maintaining bus shelters. As a result of the vandalism, there is limited local advertising support for the transit shelters.

- Current contractors have indicated a fully consolidated Street Furniture Program is not attractive due to the fact the revenue potential is too low in a city the size of Hamilton. If Hamilton was to open bids for a consolidated RFP, current suppliers have advised they would not bid.

Staff met with Creative Outdoor Advertising representatives in February 2014 to determine if this supplier was interested in continuing their relationship with the City of Hamilton. The representatives stated there is avid interest in continuing the partnership and would be open to renegotiation discussions should the recommendations contained within this report be supported.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

As seen in Toronto's unified streetscape program, the development of guidelines has garnered progressive results. The streetscapes of Toronto are unified and cohesive, making exceptions for unique areas within the City, while creating an overall coordinated image. The development of the Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines would benefit the City allowing for better coordination, cost efficiencies and greater control of elements. Moving forward, the criteria and guidelines will prove valuable for any delivery model whether single or multi contract.

To facilitate the 2015 Pan Am Games, Councillors have advised toward the acceleration of Creative Outdoor Advertising contract renegotiation to meet the firm timelines of the Games. Should the recommendations contained in this report be supported, staff will initiate renegotiations prior to the expiration of the current contract. Early negotiations of the transit bench/waste receptacle program will result in a more unified image in preparation for our international audience.

Due to the fact the other street furniture elements specifically, transit shelters and bicycle racks, are currently in binding contracts and the City does not have the authority to exercise early termination, staff are recommending a competitive procurement process for either a single or multi contracts at the expiration of the existing agreements, for all other street furniture elements. The evaluation of proposals will be based upon the proponent's ability to meet the requirements of the Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines.

NEXT STEPS

Staff plans to focus on the following priority areas to develop a comprehensive, coordinated and successful program:

- The development of Site Selection Criteria and Guidelines
- Early renegotiation of the Creative Outdoor Advertising contract for transit benches and waste receptacles
- Awarding a single or multi-contract proponent through a competitive procurement process for the remaining street furniture elements to take effect January 1, 2016

Should the recommendation to renegotiate the transit bench/waste receptacle contract with Creative Outdoor Advertising be supported, the new agreements will take effect one year earlier than the original expiration date. In consideration of the capital investment on the part of Creative Outdoor Advertising, the revised term of the contract is being considered as a ten (10) year term with possible renewal options. Implementation would take place over an approximate eight month process, in phases beginning with those areas that will be most utilized during the 2015 Pan Am Games with an additional focus on the “Gateways” to The City of Hamilton.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

To not approve the expenditure to develop site selection criteria, element designs and specifications, would limit the ability of the City of Hamilton to provide a Coordinated Street Furniture Program. Regardless of a single contract or multi contracts with revenue sharing, adherence to these guidelines will ensure a functional and aesthetically pleasing streetscape, while delivering a more favourable financial package for the City of Hamilton. Therefore, the alternative is not recommended.

Should the Creative Outdoor Advertising contract renegotiation recommendation not be supported, the transit bench element will be included in the competitive procurement process. The City would be required to fulfil the obligations of the existing contracts through until their December 31, 2015 expirations, missing the opportunity to enhance streetscapes prior to the Pan Am Games. Therefore, this alternative is not recommended.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2012 - 2015 STRATEGIC PLAN

Strategic Priority #1

A Prosperous & Healthy Community

WE enhance our image, economy and well-being by demonstrating that Hamilton is a great place to live, work, play and learn.

Strategic Objective

- 1.3 Promote economic opportunities with a focus on Hamilton's downtown core, all downtown areas and waterfronts.
- 1.6 Enhance Overall Sustainability (financial, economic, social and environmental).

Strategic Priority #2

Valued & Sustainable Services

WE deliver high quality services that meet citizen needs and expectations, in a cost effective and responsible manner.

Strategic Objective

- 2.1 Implement processes to improve services, leverage technology and validate cost effectiveness and efficiencies across the Corporation.

**SUBJECT: Coordinated Street Furniture Program
(PW09033b) - (City Wide) - Page 8 of 8**

2.2 Improve the City's approach to engaging and informing citizens and stakeholders.

2.3 Enhance customer service satisfaction.

Strategic Priority #3

Leadership & Governance

WE work together to ensure we are a government that is respectful to wards each other and that the community has confidence and trust in.

Strategic Objective

3.4 Enhance opportunities for administrative and operational efficiencies.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

None