



**CITY OF HAMILTON**  
**PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT**  
**Planning Division**

<b>TO:</b>	Chair and Members Planning Committee
<b>COMMITTEE DATE:</b>	September 19, 2014
<b>SUBJECT/ REPORT NO:</b>	Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study (PED14164) (Wards 1 and 2)
<b>WARD(S) AFFECTED:</b>	Wards 1 and 2
<b>PREPARED BY:</b>	Julia van der Laan de Vries (905) 546-2424 Ext.1224
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Jason Thorne General Manager Planning and Economic Development Department
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

- (a) That the Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study, Design Concept and Guidelines, attached as Appendix “E” to Report PED14164, be adopted;
- (b) That staff be directed to prepare and schedule a public meeting of the Planning Committee to present the Official Plan and Zoning By-Law Amendments required to implement the findings as illustrated in Appendix “D” of Report PED14164 – Sites that require Official Plan and/or Zoning By-Law Amendments, and outlined in Appendix “E” - Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study, Design Concept and Guidelines; specifically:
  - (i) 180, 182 and 198 Barton Street West, north side (between Hess Street North and Caroline Street North): Reduce building height from four storeys to three storeys;
  - (ii) 239 Caroline Street North (west side) at intersection with proposed East-West road: Increase residential density from Medium Density to High Density; Increase building height from eight storeys to twelve stories;
  - (iii) 128 Barton Street West (lands fronting onto Caroline Street North) at intersection with proposed East-West road: Increase residential density from Medium Density to High Density, and, increase building height from eight storeys to sixteen storeys;

- (iv) Caroline Street North (between Barton Street West and Stuart Street): Increase front yard and building setbacks to a range between four to ten metres;
- (v) 168 Bay Street North (Central Park): delete the proposed residential designations for the lands near Harriet Street, Mill Street, Caroline Street North and Railway Street and maintain as Neighbourhood Park designation; Connect north and south portions of Caroline Street North through the existing park;
- (c) That Landscape Architectural Services staff be directed to undertake the Master Planning process required to re-design and re-construct Central Park located at 168 Bay Street North;
- (d) That staff be directed to develop a strategy for the Public Works building and yard located at 125 Barton Street West, by undertaking a property appraisal of the site, and to determine the relocation options for the Public Works facility, as illustrated in Appendix “C” to Report PED14164 – Design Concept Plan;
- (e) That Fire Department staff be directed to develop a strategy for the Fire Station #13, Mechanical Division located at 177 Bay Street North, including the undertaking of a needs analysis and the development of relocation options for the Fire Department Mechanical Division, as illustrated in Appendix “C” to Report PED14164 – Design Concept Plan;
- (f) That Public Works and Planning staff be directed to implement the Streetscape Design Guidelines and conceptual right-of-way sections as illustrated in Appendix “E” to Report PED14164 – Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study, Design Concept and Guidelines.

**NOTE: Due to the size of the Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study (Appendix “E”), the Technical Studies (Appendix “F”), and the Background Study (Appendix “G”), they have not been attached as part of this staff Report. A complete hard copy is available for public viewing at City Hall in the Office of the City Clerk, located at 71 Main Street West, Hamilton, 1st Floor, or via the City of Hamilton website at: [www.hamilton.ca/bartontiffanyUDS](http://www.hamilton.ca/bartontiffanyUDS).**

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### Overview:

The Barton-Tiffany lands are located within the West Harbour Secondary Planning Area known as ‘Setting Sail’. The Secondary Planning process was initiated over a decade ago, and was approved by the Ontario Municipal Board (OMB) on December 27, 2012. A policy direction in that Secondary Plan requires the preparation of an urban design study for the Barton-Tiffany lands. This study must be adopted by Council prior to development taking place.

The OMB decision revised the land uses within the Barton-Tiffany study area from medium density residential to a mixture of two land uses. Medium density residential lands are proposed along Barton Street West and Bay Street North. Commercial land uses are proposed within 150 m of the CN rail yard. There are also existing parcels of land located at the south-west corner of Stuart Street and Bay Street, which remain as low density residential.

The Secondary Plan provides the framework for the land uses and building heights within the study area. The Zoning By-Law provides performance standards with respect to permitted uses. These standards include: building heights, setbacks and building locations, amount and location of parking, landscape areas, etc.

The urban design study takes this framework and illustrates how such land uses and building heights should be arranged. It visually demonstrates the “look and feel” of this new neighbourhood. Also, the study serves as the form and functional benchmark to which future development in the study area will be evaluated.

In August, 2013, the City hired a consulting team to initiate the urban design study. The study area was expanded beyond the Barton-Tiffany lands to include: Central Park, the Public Works building/yard on Barton Street West, the Fire station on Bay Street North, plus the lands surrounding these City-owned facilities.

The Secondary Plan called for a re-configured Central Park including the addition of streets through the park, and residential infill along the south and west boundaries of the park. By incorporating Central Park into the study area, it allowed the project to develop a more comprehensive approach, which in turn, created synergies between the Barton-Tiffany lands and the re-configured Central Park.

In order to ensure that the recommendations of the urban design study could be implemented, a series of technical studies were included in the scope of work. This allowed the design concepts to be tested against current performance standards. These additional technical studies included: a Functional Servicing Study, a Transportation Impact Study and a Transportation Demand Management Study. It also included modifications to the original Acoustic and Vibration Impact Study, based upon the study area’s proximity to the CN Rail shunting yard to the north.

The Design Concept Plan (Appendix “C” attached to this Report) envisions a compact, urban neighbourhood that provides commercial, residential and recreational uses. The potential to live, work and play in this area is supported by a transportation system that was considered in a holistic way. An individual can take regional transit (i.e. GO transit), local transit, use a personal vehicle, cycle or walk. The proximity to both the waterfront and downtown also contribute to the study area’s positive attributes.

***Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 22.***

## **FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

### Financial:

The Recommendations in this Report may create financial implications including:

- Costs to re-design and construct Central Park (Recommendation (c)),
- Cost to undertake a feasibility and needs assessment study to re-locate the Public Works building and yard (Recommendation (d)), as well as costs associated with the potential relocation,
- Cost to undertake a feasibility and needs assessment study to re-locate Fire Station #13 Recommendation (e)), as well as costs associated with the potential relocation, and
- Costs for detailed design and construction or increased costs associated with reconstruction of existing roads (Recommendation (f)).

### Staffing:

Several of the Recommendations in this Report will require City staff to create new projects within their respective work programs. The Recommendations include:

- Undertaking of Official Plan and Zoning By-Law Amendments and scheduling of the statutory public meeting to implement the findings within study (Recommendation (b)). Specifically:
  - 180, 182 and 198 Barton Street West (north side), between Hess Street North and Caroline Street North: Reduce building height from four storeys (Secondary Plan designation) down to three storeys;
  - 239 Caroline Street North (west side) at intersection with proposed East-West road: Increase residential density from Medium Density to High Density; Increase building height from eight storeys to twelve stories;
  - 128 Barton Street West (lands fronting onto Caroline Street North) at intersection with proposed East-West road: Increase residential density from Medium Density to High Density; Increase building height from eight storeys to sixteen stories;

- Caroline Street North (between Barton Street West and Stuart Street): Increase front yard and building setbacks to a range between four to ten metres; and,
- 168 Bay Street North (Central Park), delete the proposed residential designations for the lands near Harriet Street, Mill Street, Caroline Street North and Railway Street and maintain as Neighbourhood Park designation; Connect north and south portions of Caroline Street North through the existing park.
- Undertaking the Master Planning process required to re-design and re-construct Central Park located at 168 Bay Street North (Recommendation (c));
- Developing a strategy for the Public Works building and yard located at 125 Barton Street West, by undertaking a property appraisal of the site, and to determine the relocation options for the Public Works facility (Recommendation (d));
- That Fire Department staff be directed to develop a strategy for the Mechanical Division located at 177 Bay Street North, including the undertaking of a needs analysis and the development of relocation options for the Fire Department Mechanical Division (Recommendation (e)); and,
- Undertaking the Street Master Plan process and the functional design to implement the proposed Streetscape Guidelines and right-of-way sections (Recommendation (f)).

Legal:

Some of the Recommendations in this Report may create legal implications, including:

- Potential Ontario Municipal Board appeals with respect to the re-designating and re-zoning of lands (Recommendation (b)); and,
- Legal processes pertaining to the purchasing, selling and renovating of City assets (Recommendations (d) and (e)).

## **HISTORICAL BACKGROUND**

Over the past 200 years, Hamilton's West Harbour has evolved from a place for industry, to a place for people to live and enjoy the recreational amenities of the waterfront. For example, the creation of Bayfront Park, Pier 4 Park, and the Waterfront Trail has opened vast stretches of the waterfront for public enjoyment.

As the industries departed the area, large parcels of vacant, underused and contaminated land remained. To this end, the City purchased parcels of land within Barton-Tiffany in

order to develop the PanAm Stadium. However, it was decided that the stadium would be re-constructed in its original location on the former grounds of Ivor Wynne Stadium.

The current challenge is to re-develop these vacant lands into a mixed-use community in accordance with the vision outlined in the Setting Sail Secondary Plan. The study area has many opportunities based upon its geographical location: it is within walking distance to the waterfront and downtown, and it is a short drive along York Boulevard to Highway 403. Most recently, the study area is now included within the Mobility Hub Study for the new GO Station under construction at James Street North. Many areas within the study area are a five- to ten-minute walk to the train platform.

## **POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS**

### **Setting Sail Secondary Plan Policies**

The Barton-Tiffany lands are located within the West Harbour Secondary Planning Area, referred to as “Setting Sail”. The Secondary Plan has several policies that relate to the requirement to undertake an Urban Design Study:

#### Policy A.6.3.5.2.4

“Prior to development occurring, the City shall complete a comprehensive urban design study and provide guidelines for Barton-Tiffany including the following:

- i) Appropriate building heights, setbacks and landscaping;
- ii) Other built form controls intended to protect viewsheds, as shown on Schedule “M-5”, and prevent buildings from creating a barrier or wall effect;
- iii) The provision of an east-west continuous open space recreational trail on the south side of Stuart Street, Queen Street North and the north Side of Barton Street West to Locke Street North with a minimum width of 5 metres to be accommodated within the required 25 metre right-of-way width. The alignment of the recreational trail is shown conceptually on Schedule M-5 and will be determined at the time of development;
- iv) The provision of open space; and,
- v) Noise attenuation, including such techniques as innovative building design, open space buffers and vegetative planting.”

There are also Urban Design Principles within the Secondary Plan that are relevant to the Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study:

Policy A.6.3.3.4.1

“New development, redevelopment and alterations to existing buildings in West Harbour shall respect, complement and enhance the best attributes of West Harbour and shall adhere to the following urban design principles:

- i) Create a comfortable and interesting pedestrian environment;
- ii) Respect the design, scale, massing, setbacks, height and use of neighbouring buildings, existing and anticipated by this plan;
- iii) Generally locate surface parking at the rear or side of buildings;
- iv) Provide main entrances and windows on the street-facing walls of buildings, with entrances at grade level; and,
- v) Ensure barrier-free access from grade level in commercial mixed-use developments.”

There are additional policies which describe quality of design. For example, the need to achieve high design standards, improve streetscapes and the pedestrian realm, the inclusion of public art, and the preservation of views to the waterfront:

Policy A.6.3.3.4.3

“The City shall demonstrate leadership by designing new public buildings and spaces and maintaining and upgrading existing public facilities, streets and spaces to a consistent and high standard.”

Policy A.6.3.2.5

Enhance physical and visual connections.

“..Significant physical barriers, however, restrict easy access to the area generally and the waterfront in particular, especially for pedestrians and cyclists. These barriers include the Stuart Street Rail Yard, the main CN line and the bluffs south of the rail yard and east of Macassa Bay. They also include busy streets like York Boulevard, Cannon Street and Barton Street that can be difficult to cross. Physical and operational improvements in West Harbour, particularly to the public realm of streets, parks and open spaces, should strive to achieve the following:

- i) Mitigate or eliminate physical barriers to the waterfront;

- ii) Promote a connected open space system along the waterfront, through the neighbourhoods and between Downtown and the waterfront;
- iv) Preserve and augment important public vistas and view corridors to and from the waterfront;
- v) Improve pedestrian, cycling and transit connections to the waterfront from Downtown and the Escarpment; and,
- vii) Enhance the streetscapes of key north-south and east-west streets.

#### Policy A.6.3.3.4.4

“The integration of public art into the design of buildings and open spaces is strongly encouraged.”

### **Land Uses and Building Heights**

The land uses within the study area as determined through the Secondary Plan consist of a variety of residential, commercial and open space uses. Refer to Appendix “B”, attached to this Report, for an illustration of the Secondary Plan’s Land Use designations.

#### Residential Low Density

- |                       |  |
|-----------------------|--|
| Locations:            | - North-east corner of Bay Street North and Stuart Street (existing dwellings) |
|                       | - West side of Bay Street North, north of Sheaffe Street (existing dwellings)  |
|                       | - South and west boundaries of Central Park (proposed infill)                  |
| Building typology:    | - Single, semi-detached, and street townhouse dwellings                        |
| Building height:      | - Three storeys maximum  |
| Density:              | - 25 to 60 units per hectare   |
| Other permitted uses: | - Parks and Open Space, Live-Work Units  |

#### Residential Medium Density 1

- |                    |  |
|--------------------|--|
| Locations:         | - North side of Barton Street West, north of Magill and Ray Street (proposed infill) |
|                    | - South side of Barton Street West, south of Tiffany Street (proposed infill)        |
| Building typology: | - Multiple-residential, low rise buildings   |
| Building height:   | - Three to five storeys maximum  |
| Density:           | - 60 to 150 units per hectare  |



Other permitted uses: - Retail and service commercial uses at grade

Residential Medium Density (Schedule M2a)

- Locations: - North side of Barton Street West from east side of Queen Street North to west side of Bay Street North (proposed infill along west side and existing dwellings near Bay Street North)
- Building typology: - Multiple-residential, low and mid-rise buildings
- Building height: - Four storeys maximum; up to eight storeys with Urban Design Study
- Density: - 60 to 150 units per hectare
- Other permitted uses: - Retail and service commercial at grade, Parks and Open Space

Residential Medium Density - Special Policy Area

- Locations: - West side of Bay Street North, between Stuart Street
- Barton Street West (known as the “White Star lands”)
- Building typology: - Multiple-residential, mid-rise building
- Building height: - Eight storeys maximum
- Density: - 60 to 300 units per hectare
- Other permitted uses: - Retail and service commercial uses at grade

**Commercial**

These lands are intended to provide retail and service commercial uses to the immediate neighbourhood and will serve as the focus for the adjacent neighbourhood by creating a sense of place.

- Locations: - Lands bounded by Bay Street North to the east, Queen Street North to the West, Stuart Street to the North, and 150 m from the CN Rail shunting yard
- Building typology: - Multi or single tenant, low-rise buildings
- Building height: - Four storeys maximum
- Floor Areas: - 15,000 sq m maximum for total retail uses and 6,000 sq m maximum for individual retail uses; and
- 10,000 sq m maximum for total office uses and 3,000 sq m maximum for office uses on same lot
- Permitted uses: - Commercial Entertainment, Commercial Parking Facility, Commercial Recreation, Commercial School, Conference or Convention Centre,

Craftsperson Shop, Financial Establishment, Medical Clinic, Office, Personal Services, Recreation, Repair Service, Restaurant, Retail, Studio, Tradesperson's Shop, Veterinary Service

Other permitted uses: - Live-Work units, Parks and Open Space

### **Open Space**

Publicly-accessible open spaces, including parks, squares, trails, and public art, are permitted. Additionally, indoor and outdoor public recreational facilities are permitted, plus recreational equipment rental and maintenance facilities.

### Central Park

Central Park is located within Central Neighbourhood at 168 Bay Street North. The park area that exists today is configured differently than what was envisioned by the Setting Sail Secondary Plan. For example, the existing park is comprised of lands which are designated as “Open Space” and “Low Density Residential”. The “Open Space” designation permits publicly-accessible open spaces including: parks, squares, trails, indoor and outdoor recreation facilities and recreational equipment rental and maintenance facilities. The “Low Density Residential” designation permits single-detached, semi-detached and street townhouses at a density of 25 to 60 units per hectare.

The Secondary Plan envisioned that the north and south sections of Caroline Street North would be connected by extending Caroline Street through Central Park. Mulberry Street was also proposed to be extended. It would originate on the west side of Bay Street North and connect to Caroline Street North extension. These road connections would result in the creation of small land parcels to the west of Caroline Street North and to the south of Mulberry Street. These lands were designated in the Secondary Plan for low density residential lands.

To date, the reconfiguration of the park and the extension of Caroline Street North have not been implemented. Former uses in this area related to industrial and waste management operations, both of which have resulted in contamination that would require a significant amount of remediation. This could pose constraints if the lands were to be developed as residential.

### **RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

City staff, a Focus Group, Neighbourhood Associations, the Public and the Design Review Panel were consulted at various stages of the project.

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)

City Staff, by means of the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC), commented on all aspects of the study including the: Background Report, Technical Reports, and Urban Design Concepts and Guidelines. The Committee provided technical analysis with respect to the staff members' area of responsibility. The following is a list of divisions represented at TAC:

- Community and Emergency Services
  - Hamilton Fire Department
  - Housing Services
  - Neighbourhood and Community Initiatives
  - Recreation
  
- Planning and Economic Development
  - Building
  - Culture
  - Downtown and Community Renewal
  - Economic Development
  - Growth Management
  - Hamilton Municipal Parking System
  - Planning
  - Tourism and Culture
  
- Public Health Services
  - Healthy Living Division
  
- Public Works
  - Corporate Assets and Strategic Planning
  - Engineering Services
  - Environmental and Sustainable Infrastructure
  - Environmental Services
  - Transit
  - Transportation, Energy and Facilities
  - Water and Wastewater

Mayor's Breakfast

The Hamilton Chamber of Commerce held their annual "State of the City Address" on January 7, 2014. Staff attended the event where presentation materials pertaining to existing conditions and images of the future vision of the study area were provided in a display booth. Staff were also available to answer questions of the participants.

Downtown and West Harbour Co-ordinating Committee (DWHCC)

Staff attended this monthly meeting of internal stakeholders on several occasions to provide updates regarding the progress of the study. Staff also made two formal presentations to this Committee on October 3, 2013 and August 7, 2014. The Committee was provided with an overview of the Design Concept Plan, and the iterative process that took place based upon public and staff input.

Design Review Panel

The draft urban design guidelines and draft concept plan were circulated to the City's Design Review Panel. At the June 19, 2014 meeting of the Panel, an overview of the study was presented. The Panel provided peer advice with respect to the design and implementation of the concept plan.

The Panel was supportive of the concept plan and the proposal to make it a compact, urban neighbourhood with a variety of transportation options. The Panel's recommendation was to ensure that both the Official Plan and Zoning By-laws were revised, in order to ensure that the vision is realized. The recommendations are noted as Recommendations (b) #1-5 (inclusive) of this Report.

Focus Group

Stakeholders were consulted via a Focus Group that was created for the urban design study. The Focus Group met three times during the span of the project, where they provided feedback on the alternative concept plans and urban design guidelines. There were 15 Focus Group members in total. These individuals were a combination of local residents, professional individuals (i.e. architect, planner, real estate board member, chamber of commerce member). There was also representation from the three local Neighbourhood Associations: Central Neighbourhood Association, North End Neighbours and Strathcona Community Council.

Focus Group Meeting #1

The meeting was held on December 12, 2013 at the Workers Arts and Heritage Centre. The format consisted of a presentation, followed by break-out groups to discuss the vision for the various land uses within the study area.

Focus Group Meeting #2

The meeting was held on March 5, 2014 at Liuna Station. The format consisted of an updated presentation, followed by break-out groups to discuss the progress on creating a vision for the various land uses within the study area. Feedback from the first Focus Group meeting was incorporated into the updated materials.

### Focus Group Meeting #3

The meeting was held on June 16, 2014 at the Workers Arts and Heritage Centre. The format consisted of an updated presentation, followed by a group discussion to comment on the preferred Concept Plan. The latest materials were based upon the comments received from the second Focus Group meeting, and also feedback received from the first two Public Consultation events.

### Neighbourhood Associations

In addition to participating at the Focus Group meetings, the local neighbourhood associations were invited to attend the three Public Consultation meetings that were held for the urban design study. Staff also met with the Central Neighbourhood Association at their request for two additional consultations.

### Board of Director's Meeting, Central Neighbourhood Association

A presentation was given to the Central Neighbourhood's Board of Director's on November 21, 2013. The format included a hand-out with a brief description of the study area and the purpose of the study.

### Central Park Event

Staff attended this outdoor weekend event which was held by the Central Neighbourhood Association on Saturday, May 31, 2014. The format consisted of presentation boards and hand-outs to describe the study and draft concept plans. Staff were available to answer questions from the attendees which consisted of the Public. Approximately 25 members of the public visited the display table. This included children that attend the nearby Hess Street Elementary School. These students use Central Park for their physical recreation classes.

### Public Consultation Sessions

The Public were consulted by several methods during the course of the project. All consultations were advertised on the City's web page, the study's web page, via Twitter, and through advertisements in both The Spectator and the North End Breezes newspaper.

Three Public Engagement sessions were held in total. The Public were invited to learn about the background of the project, the proposed concept plans, and the urban design guidelines. Comment sheets were provided at each consultation. The feedback was compiled into a document and posted on the urban design study's web page. It was also used to inform and direct several aspects of the preferred concept plan.

Public Consultation #1

The meeting was held on December 4, 2013 at Liuna Station. Approximately 150 members of the public attended. In order to capture synergies between projects, this first meeting was combined with two other City initiatives. The other projects presented were: James Street North GO Station / Mobility Hub Study and Barton-Kenilworth Commercial Corridor Study.

The format of the meeting consisted of a presentation of each of the three projects followed by break-out sessions. Each of the three projects had focus areas where the public could learn about specific aspects of each study. The sessions were timed in order that the public could attend each of the three projects that were presented.

In addition to advertising with the media and on the web, this meeting was also advertised via a flyer that was hand-delivered to residents within the study area.

The content of the presentation focused on the different land uses within the area and the proposed visions and design principles for each land use.

Public Consultation #2

The meeting was held on April 28, 2014 at Liuna Station. Approximately 90 members of the public attended. The format consisted of an updated presentation, followed by break-out groups to discuss the progress on the various components of the study area.

In addition to advertising with the media and on the web, this meeting was also advertised via a flyer that was hand-delivered to residents within the study area.

The content of the presentation included refined design principles plus two demonstration concepts.

Public Consultation #3

The meeting was held on June 23, 2014 at Liuna Station. Approximately 80 members of the public attended. The meeting was combined with the consultation for the James Street North GO Station / Mobility Hub Study.

The format consisted of an updated presentation of each project, followed by stations with presentation materials where the public could learn and comment on the preferred concept plan.

For those members of the Public that could not attend the consultation events in person, a web page was created for the Urban Design Study. On this page, all the information that was presented during consultations was posted, along with dates

and descriptions of upcoming consultations. Staff contact information was provided for those that preferred to communicate via phone, email or in person.

The content of the presentation consisted of the preferred concept plan plus three-dimensional renderings of this plan.

### Summary of Public Comments

There was a large amount of feedback received by the Public over the course of the study. There were many themes that were identified. These include:

- Sensitivity towards existing stable residential neighbourhoods. For example:
  - Sensitive residential infill, with respect to height, density and built form typology;
  - Preference for low density residential lands where they abut existing low density residential;
  - Use of compatible building materials as those found in existing neighbourhoods, with a reference to the industrial past of Barton-Tiffany; and,
  - Gradual increase in residential density and building heights along the north side of Barton Street West from west to east, with the lowest densities and building heights being located closer to Crooks and Magill Streets.
- Improvements to transportation network;
  - Provision of bus service to the area;
  - Creation of an active transportation network, in the form of sidewalks, bike lanes and a comprehensive trail system; and,
  - Providing connectivity from other neighbourhoods to Barton-Tiffany and the waterfront.
- Parking for new areas to be at the rear of the site, and preferably within parking structures or underground;
- On-street parking to be preserved and increased;
- Improvements and expansions to Central Park and the Parks and Open Space system;
  - Adaptive Re-Use of Public Works building for recreational uses;

- Preservation and enhancement of existing views to the waterfront; and,
- Utilizing the area’s industrial and rail history in the design of public art and public spaces.

## **ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION**

### Description of Concept Plan

The Concept Plan (Appendix “B”, attached to this Report) envisions a compact, urban neighbourhood that provides commercial, residential and recreational uses. The potential to live and work and play in this area is supported by a transportation system that was considered in a holistic way. An individual can take regional transit, local transit, use a personal vehicle, cycle or walk. One can move through the study area and to many points beyond in this manner.

There are several components of the Urban Design Study which had a crucial role in the development of the concept plan and urban design guidelines. These include: Mobility Hub/ GO Station, Building Heights, Active Transportation, Parks and Open Space and Public Consultation.

### Mobility Hub/ James Street North GO Station

The Secondary Plan did not contemplate that a mobility hub would be constructed within the study area. The introduction of a regional transportation network adjacent to the Barton-Tiffany lands provides several new opportunities. It is a favourable location to increase residential height and density. This was identified in both the Mobility Hub Guidelines prepared by Metrolinx, and the James Street North Mobility Hub Strategy prepared by the City.

Mobility hubs not only bring new opportunities to residents, they also provide the commercial lands with additional opportunities for both clients and workers to access their businesses. It also introduces a greater population into the area, to visit various tourist activities within Hamilton (i.e. the waterfront, downtown, sporting and concert events, etc.).

### Building Heights

Through an analysis of existing building heights in the area, and the proposed GO station, there are several sites within the study area where proposed building heights differ from that which was approved in the Secondary Plan. Generally, the residential building heights are at their lowest along the westerly end of the study area, where they are adjacent to existing low density residential uses (within Strathcona Neighbourhood). The building heights gradually increase as one moves eastward along Barton Street West, towards the proposed GO station, with the greatest height proposed along the north side of Barton Street West at the intersection with Caroline Street North (within Central neighbourhood).



Please refer to Appendices “D” and “E” of this Report for an illustration of the following revisions to building heights and permissions.

290 Barton Street West north of Magill Street

These residential lands are located opposite and adjacent to existing two-storey single family dwellings. Accordingly, it is recommended that the building heights be reduced from five storeys to three storeys. This height will create a better transition to the existing neighbourhood. This input was received by the Strathcona Community Council through various consultations with the Public and Focus Group.

Under the Setting Sail Secondary Plan, the policies allows for a maximum building height of five stories. The subject lands have a dual zoning due to previous Zoning approvals by the landowner. The west portion of the subject land is zoned “RT-20/S-1478” (Townhouse-Maisonette) District, Modified, which permits townhouse dwellings and maisonette dwellings of up to 11 m, or approximately three storeys.

The east portion of the subject land is zoned “L-MR-1” (Planned Development) District, which permits primarily existing uses. Under the district zone provisions, the lands will be required to be rezoned to permit future residential development, and would be limited to townhouses, maisonettes, and multiple dwellings under the following districts: “DE”, “DE-2”, “DE-3”, “E-2”, “RT-10”, “RT-20”, and the “RT-30”. The maximum permitted height within the Zoning Districts range from three storeys to eight storeys.

180-182 and 198 Barton Street West (between Hess Street North and Caroline Street North

These residential lands are located opposite existing two-storey residential dwellings. Accordingly, it is recommended that the building heights be reduced from four storeys to three storeys. This height will create a better transition to the existing neighbourhood. This input was received by the Public and Focus Group members through various consultations with the Public and Focus Group.

The Secondary Plan allows for a maximum building height of four storeys. The current zoning designation is D6, 443, H45. This zone permits multiple dwellings and commercial uses as part of a mixed-use building such as a commercial school, commercial entertainment, office, financial establishment retail, and restaurant. Furthermore, height restrictions include a minimum of 7.5 m, or two storeys, and a maximum of 15 m, which would effectively permit up to four storeys.

239 Caroline Street North (west side) at intersection with proposed East-West road and 128 Barton Street West (lands fronting onto Caroline Street North) at intersection with proposed East-West road:

These residential lands are located on Caroline Street North which is the community spine of the new neighbourhood. This road originates at the proposed GO station, passes through the retail and commercial uses along Caroline, and then continues along the re-configured Central Park, ending at Cannon Street West.

By providing additional height at this intersection, it serves as a landmark into the Barton-Tiffany lands. Based upon the topography of this area, the perception of additional height would be lessened as it is at the lowest elevation. Also, placing additional residential density near the GO Station takes advantage of the site's close proximity to this regional transportation facility.

The proposed increases are from residential medium density to high density. The proposed increase in building height ranges from 12 storeys on the west side of Caroline and 16 storeys on the east side. These revisions would require an Official Plan Amendment and a Zoning By-Law Amendment.

### Unit Yield

The unit yields of the concept plan compared to those of the Secondary Plan are similar, with the concept plan being slightly lower with respect to residential units. The concept plan proposes 1,161 residential units or 2,025 people. The Secondary plan proposes 1,574 residential units or 2,739 people. Although the Secondary Plan achieves a slightly higher count for units and people, the siting of the residential units is more appropriate in the concept plan, since it proposes to place the majority of new residential units north of Barton-Street West, rather than relying upon infill within existing residential neighbourhoods, as per the Secondary Plan.

With respect to the commercial yields, the concept plan and the Secondary plan propose the same amounts: 58,367 sq m of floor space and 1,630 employees.

### Active Transportation Network

The streetscapes were designed to accommodate all modes of transportation, which supports a more "Complete Street" type of design. For example, many of the streets provide a combination of sidewalks, multi-use trails and/or bike lanes. This approach ties into the Mobility Hub Guidelines, which encourages a multi-modal split for transportation which is less car-dependent.

Caroline Street North is designed as a "green corridor" from Cannon Street (downtown) to Stuart Street (GO Station). In addition, the Secondary Plan identifies a proposed connection to the waterfront at the north end of Caroline Street North, in the form of a

pedestrian bridge. Caroline Street North is the central feature of the design, since it ties many of the land uses and design elements together. It opens up Central Park to more users with the proposed vehicular and active transportation route. It transitions from linear park along Central Park South of Barton Street West, to a green corridor north of Barton Street West.

For the residential lands located north of Barton Street West, two residential high rises are proposed to anchor this space. As you move further north along Caroline Street North, the street has wide boulevards with double rows of trees, which are the foreground for the retail spaces that will face this green corridor. Caroline Street North ends at Stuart Street, with an urban plaza on the east side of the street, which serves as a destination at the end of this green corridor.

Stuart Street proposes a multi-use trail along the north side from Bay Street North to Barton Street West. It will also connect to a future multi-use trail along the north side of the study area, which will eventually connect to Locke Street North.

Barton Street West proposes a combination of sidewalks, dedicated bike lanes, shared bike lanes and a multi-use trail.

### **Parks and Open Space**

The provision of parks and open space takes on many forms within the study area. The expansion and re-design of Central Park is a significant consideration within the study area. However, there are other forms of parks and open spaces within the study area that contribute to the vitality of this new neighbourhood while providing connections beyond the study area. These include: a Green Corridor along Caroline Street North and an urban plaza on Caroline Street North at Stuart Street.

#### Urban Plaza

The study proposes an urban plaza at the north end of Caroline Street, where it intersects with Stuart Street. This plaza will provide a focus for the adjacent retail and commercial uses while providing a place for people who are living, shopping, commuting or visiting the area. The vision is to provide a passive open space that can be used by people visiting the commercial lands, for residents and visitors to the area and for users of the GO station facility.

#### Central Park

2011 Census information indicates that the population for Central Neighbourhood is 3,720 people. It is estimated that the population will increase by approximately 2,000 people as a result of the proposed residential units for the Barton-Tiffany study area. Based upon the parkland requirements contained in the Urban Hamilton Official Plan, the area would

require a total of 4 ha of parkland for this Planning unit. Additionally, there is currently an overall deficiency of parkland within the Secondary Plan area.

Due to the overall deficiency in Neighbourhood Parkland, combined with the potential limitations for proposed residential infill due to soil contamination and costs associated with remediation, Planning staff support the expansion of the Neighbourhood Park to include the lands currently utilized for parkland to the west and south of the Neighbourhood area identified in the Secondary Plan. In addition, staff support the relocation of both the Public Works building and yard located at 125 Barton Street West and Fire Station #13 (Mechanical Division) located at 177 Bay Street North. The relocation of these two facilities will allow for the expansion of Central Park to the north as envisioned in the Secondary Plan.

In order to achieve this, the Secondary Plan and the Zoning By-law should be amended to reflect the reconfiguration of Central Park. This would require an Official Plan Amendment to the Secondary Plan to change the lands designated as “Low Density Residential” to “Open Space” and to re-zone these lands from “D” (Urban Protected Residential, being One and Two Family Dwellings) to “P1” (Neighbourhood Park). In addition, the lands north of Sheaffe Street are also zoned “D” (Urban Protected Residential, being One and Two Family Dwellings) and should be rezoned to “P1” (Neighbourhood Park).

The proposed expansion of Central Park involves two parcels of lands that currently function as a Public Works building and yard, and a Fire Station respectively. Below is a brief description of these facilities and their function.

#### Public Works Yard

The Public Works yard is located at 125 Barton Street West. The Secondary Plan and urban design study propose to convert this land, and potentially the building, into parkland with recreational uses.

The current functions of this site are for Facilities Management Operations and Maintenance sections with administration offices, a fully operational welding and carpenter shop and a centralized storage depot for supplies that support well over 500 city-owned facilities. The Parks Division, Play Lot Equipment Safety Section is also located at this yard, with a fully operational shop and storage space. In addition, secured lock-up units were built to accommodate City Department’s storage requirements and needs throughout the City. Other uses include a secured parking site for the Mobile Library Bus unit. At its peak during the summer, this yard houses well over 50 city employees.

The proposal to relocate the Public Works facility would require a Feasibility and Needs Assessment Study. The investment required to build a new yard makes the potential relocation a long-term planning exercise.

### Fire Station #13

The Hamilton Fire Department Mechanical Division is located at 177 Bay Street North. Similar to the proposal for the Public Works site, it is the intention of the Secondary Plan and urban design study to convert the site to parkland. This would allow the park to have additional frontage, pedestrian access and visibility along Bay Street North.

Fire Station #13 houses both the Mechanical Division Administrative offices and the Fleet and Equipment Repair facility. This facility provides a full service maintenance and repair garage for the Fire Department and Paramedic Service, large and small rolling stock fleet, maintenance and repair services for operational equipment (i.e. hose, ladders, small engines, power tools), maintenance and repair of the Fire Department's self-contained breathing apparatus and gas detection equipment and annual required testing of Fire Department pumping apparatus, ladders and aerial devices. This facility also houses the Firefighters' Occupational Health and Screening program that was approved by Council, post Plastimet.

The proposal to relocate Fire Station #13 (Mechanical Division) was communicated to Fire Department several years ago. At that time, the Fire Department identified the need for additional space and capacity for the Mechanical and Stores Division, due to growth. As part of the Development Charges Review Study, 2014 to 2019, which is currently moving through the approval process, the Fire Department identified the need to expand and relocate the Mechanical/ Stores Division. The expansion and relocation was identified in the study as a 2016 – 2018 project, which makes this a medium-term planning exercise.

### Relocation of existing City facilities for conversion to parkland

The proposal to relocate the above noted City facilities must be considered in conjunction with the approval of this Report. This will ensure that the re-design and re-construction of Central Park will occur in a timely fashion; it will also ensure that there is minimal loss to parkland during this process.

### Road Pattern

The Secondary Plan proposed to connect all roads through Central Park, in conjunction with the proposed residential infill. These road connections include: Caroline Street North, Harriet Street, Mill Street and Mulberry Street. However, since it is the recommendation of this Report that the parkland remains, the extension of these four streets is no longer necessary. The recommendation of this report is to only extend Caroline Street North, since it is the organizing feature around which the concept plan was created. Refer to Recommendation (b) #5.

## **ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION**

The Planning Committee may choose to approve the Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study with revised Recommendations. The financial implications would relate to the provision of additional fees for consulting work. The potential policy implications would pertain to the undertaking of Secondary Plan and Zoning By-Law amendments, depending upon the type of revised Recommendations.

The Planning Committee may choose not to approve the Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study. Lands within the study area cannot be developed without an approved Urban Design Study. Should an individual land owner seek to develop their lands, then they would be responsible for undertaking an Urban Design Study.

## **ALIGNMENT TO THE 2012 – 2015 STRATEGIC PLAN**

### **Strategic Priority #1:**

A Prosperous and Healthy Community.

*WE enhance our image, economy and well-being by demonstrating that Hamilton is a great place to live, work, play and learn.*

### **Strategic Objectives**

- 1.1 Continue to grow the non-residential tax base.
- 1.2 Continue to prioritize capital infrastructure projects to support managed growth and optimize community benefit.
- 1.3 Promote economic opportunities with a focus on Hamilton's downtown core, all downtown areas and waterfronts.
- 1.4 Improve the City's transportation system to support multi-modal mobility and encourage inter-regional connections.
- 1.5 Support the development and implementation of neighbourhood and City wide strategies that will improve the health and well-being of residents.
- 1.6 Enhance Overall Sustainability (financial, economic, social and environmental).

### **Strategic Priority #2:**

Valued and Sustainable Services.

*WE deliver high quality services that meet citizen needs and expectations, in a cost effective and responsible manner.*

### **Strategic Objective:**

- 2.2 Improve the City's approach to engaging and informing citizens and stakeholders.

**APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED**

- Appendix “A”: Barton-Tiffany Study area - Location Map
- Appendix “B”: West Harbour, Setting Sail Secondary Plan - Land Use Designations
- Appendix “C”: Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study - Design Concept Plan
- Appendix “D”: Sites that require Official Plan and/ or Zoning By-Law Amendments
- Appendix “E”: Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study - Design Concept and Guidelines
- Appendix “F”: Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study - Technical Studies (Traffic Impact Study and TDM Guidelines, Functional Servicing Report, Noise and Vibration Feasibility Study)
- Appendix “G”: Barton-Tiffany Urban Design Study - Background Report

JV/tp