



CITY OF HAMILTON
CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE

TO:	Mayor and Members General Issues Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	April 20, 2016
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Modernizing the City of Hamilton's Livestreaming Capabilities and Experience (CM16006) (City Wide)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Livestreaming and SIRE Replacement Working Group: Rose Caterini (905) 546-2424 Ext. 5409 Kwab Ako-Adjei (905) 546-2424 Ext. 2548 Dave Grzicic (905) 546-2424 ext. 4208 Glenn Binkosky (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7388 Kathy Miljanovic (905) 546-2424 Ext. 1539 Bonnie Large (905) 546-2424 Ext. 6608 Jen Recine (905) 546-2424 Ext. 4970 Chuck Alkerton (905) 546-2424 Ext.7015 Pat DiLeonardo (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7002 Lisa Barroso (905) 546-2424 Ext. 2743 Rose MacGowan (905) 546- 2424 Ext. 6172 Janet Pilon (905) 546-2424 Ext. 4304
SUBMITTED BY:	Kwab Ako-Adjei Acting Director, Corporate Communications City Manager's Office and Rose Caterini City Clerk City Manager's Office
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATIONS

- (a) That the capital costs to modernize the City's existing livestreaming capabilities for the Council Chambers and expand live streaming capabilities in designated meeting rooms in City Hall in the amount of \$572,000 be funded from the unallocated Capital Levy Reserve (108020);
- (b) That Council approve a single source procurement, pursuant to Procurement Policy #11 – Non-competitive Procurements, for the upgrading of the equipment

SUBJECT: Modernizing the City of Hamilton's Livestreaming Capabilities and Experience (CM16006) (City Wide) Page 2 of 7

in Council Chambers; installation of equipment in the designated meeting rooms, and an Agenda Meeting Management Software Program;

- (c) That the City Manager be authorized to negotiate, enter into and execute a Contract and any ancillary agreements required to give effect thereto with Hamilton Video and Sound in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor;
- (d) That the operating impact of the livestreaming capital project estimated at \$99,250 annually to provide on-going sustainment of livestreaming activities and support, be funded from unallocated Capital Levy Reserve in 2016 and be included in the 2017 operating budget;
- (e) That an FTE required to support livestreaming activities be reviewed during the 2017 budget process;
- (f) That in order to continuously maintain a high-quality and modern livestreaming experience, staff is requested to review the costs needed to upgrade equipment and software in five years and to consider establishing a capital reserve and report back during the 2017 budget process.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

As per Council's direction on December 9, 2015:

That staff (City Manager, Legal, IT, Facilities, Finance, and Clerks) review and report back to the General Issues Committee on the:

- (a) modernization of the City's existing livestreaming capabilities for Council Chambers;
- (b) expansion of livestreaming capabilities in all designated committee meeting rooms in City Hall;
- (c) future sustainability of the City's livestreaming capabilities for the Council Chamber and all designated committee meeting rooms in City Hall;
- (d) other audio / visual equipment improvements;
- (e) current Media Policy to determine if best practices are being utilized, including accreditation, and update if necessary; and,
- (f) the costs associated with each of the upgrades.

In response to Council's direction, a Working Group, the Livestreaming and SIRE Replacement Working Group was formed which included staff from the City Manager's Office, Facilities, Information Technology (IT), Enterprise Management and Revenue Generation, Records and Clerks.

The Working Group set out initially to determine which rooms should be upgraded or has equipment installed to allow for livestreamed meetings. After conducting a review of meeting schedules and quality and accessibility of the meetings rooms, it was determined that Council Chambers and Meeting Rooms 192, 193 and 264 be identified for livestreaming capabilities.

Along with equipment within Council Chambers that is nearly ten years old, it has also become quite apparent that the current software used to deliver our livestreaming service is of poor quality. An immediate upgrade or full replacement of the software is warranted.

Staff has also determined that in order to ensure we are able to maintain a high-quality livestreaming experience and service, funding must be set aside to fix, service and upgrade equipment and software as necessary.

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: Upfront capital cost of approximately \$572,000 and an annual operating budget of approximately \$99,250 to provide on-going maintenance and support.

Staffing: Support will be required from Information Technology; Communications; Facilities and Clerks. FTE to be considered during the 2017 budget process.

Legal: Legal Services to review Procurement Agreement in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor.

Procurement: Some of the existing equipment within City Hall were purchased from and installed by Hamilton Video and Sound. The City's Facilities Division currently has a contract with Hamilton Video and Sound related to equipment within Council Chambers.

Hamilton Video and Sound, on a regular basis, is at City Hall to fix or service equipment. They are familiar with the needs of the City and have provided a level of service which has been acceptable to the City.

It was the belief of the Working Group that the need to secure new equipment in order to improve our current livestreaming capabilities would constitute an upgrade and should be then considered as a sole sourced opportunity.

The Working Group also took into consideration, when making this determination, Council's desire to move expeditiously to resolve our current livestreaming situation. Our livestreaming service has received numerous complaints from the public.

The Working Group did undertake its due diligence when determining costs by conducting market research with a total of three companies including Hamilton Video and Sound. Hamilton Video and Sound's price was competitive and offered a quick turnaround time for delivery.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The City of Hamilton installed some of existing equipment in Council Chambers approximately ten years ago in order to livestream Standing Committee and Council

SUBJECT: Modernizing the City of Hamilton's Livestreaming Capabilities and Experience (CM16006) (City Wide) Page 4 of 7

meetings. The City was in discussion recently with Cable 14 about the current state of the cameras in Council Chambers and the need to upgrade them to better quality.

The livestreaming and broadcasting of Committee and Council meetings needs to be upgraded and modernized in order to offer a more stable viewing experience. This has been considerably noticed by members of Council and the public. In addition, the current version of the software is also not compatible with iOS and Android devices.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

Staff is seeking approval to waive the Procurement Policy in order to seek a single source contract with an existing vendor.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Livestreaming and SIRE Replacement Working Group

In order to improve the quality of livestreaming for the City of Hamilton, staff formed the Livestreaming and SIRE Replacement Working Group which met on a regular basis. The Working Group is made up of staff from Communications, Facilities, Information Technology, Enterprise Management and Revenue Generation, Records and Clerks. The Working Group reached out to other municipalities, including a site visit to the Region of Halton head office, in order to learn about their livestreaming capabilities.

Hamilton District Christian High

Staff met with high school students from Hamilton District Christian High who had reached out to the City to offer their livestreaming services. The students had experience livestreaming events including multiple post-secondary sporting events.

The students proposed having three cameras in operation at the meetings. They would have access to all the equipment they would need through their school; however, they would have to rent them. To recoup this cost the students would be looking to be compensated for their time.

Mohawk College

Staff met with representatives from Mohawk College and staff are advised that the students would require compensation in the range of \$15 per hour and that the City would be required to provide the equipment the students would need to livestream meetings through YouTube. Equipment needed would be:

- 3 laptops (\$2648 per laptop)
- 3 cameras (\$1750 to \$2499 per camera)
- Microphones, capture devices, tripods and software (total of approximately \$4000)
- Total cost to City approximately \$20,000

ANALYSIS AND RATIONAL FOR RECOMMENDATION

Meeting Overlap Review:

One of the first tasks of the Working Group was to determine which meeting rooms would be suitable for an equipment upgrade and installation. In order to make this determination, Clerks undertook a review as to whether the City would require the use of six meetings room at any one time.

Clerk's practice is to only schedule Sub-Committee meetings when Standing Committee meetings are not being held. The practice is in place to ensure there is quorum at the Standing Committee and Sub-Committee meetings.

Clerks randomly chose six Sub-Committees and attempted to have all six of these Sub-Committees meet at the same time in six different rooms at City Hall. The review illustrated as per Appendix "A", that in order to ensure quorum was in place, Clerks would only be able to schedule two of the six Sub-Committee meetings at the same time based on their membership.

Designated Meeting Rooms:

Based on the review performed by Clerks, the six meeting rooms (Council Chambers, Meeting Room 264, Meeting Room 192 and 193, Meeting Room 816 and 830) initially identified to be equipped for livestreaming could be reduced to four based on the City's needs.

Clerks staff have only used Meeting Rooms 816 and 830 if there are no other meeting rooms available because the acoustics aren't satisfactory and the difficulty to get to these rooms as there is only one elevator that goes up to the 8th floor.

Clerks have the ability to bump non-committee meetings from these meeting rooms; therefore, a room that is equipped for livestreaming will always be available for any of the Sub-Committee meetings.

Through discussions with the Legislative Section and the Working Group, the recommendation is that the following meeting rooms are to be equipped to enable livestreaming:

- Council Chambers
- Meeting Room 192
- Meeting Room 193
- Meeting Room 264

Note that signage to notify the public of livestreaming will be posted outside of all designated meeting rooms enabling livestreaming in consideration of individual's personal privacy.

Existing Equipment and Experience

The current practice is to livestream all Standing Committee and Council meetings that are convened in Council Chambers. The only Sub-Committee meeting which is livestreamed is the LRT Sub-Committee which is held in Council Chambers.

The cameras used to support livestreaming within Council Chambers are approximately ten years old. Other equipment used to support this broadcast; including the television lights are also outdated. The outdated equipment contributes to the poor quality and experience of the City's livestreaming service.

Upgraded equipment will provide the City with a higher quality livestreamed video product which will address the concerns Council has expressed with the existing audio / visual equipment in the Council Chamber and meeting rooms.

The timeframe required in order to have all of the meetings rooms listed outfitted with the necessary equipment would be approximately eight weeks.

Replacing SIRE (Agenda, Meeting Management Software)

The current version of the software used to manage Committee Agenda's and Livestream meetings does not meet our business requirements and service standards.

Staff in the Clerk's office had been working with the IT Department and the current owner of SIRE to determine whether the software should be upgraded to a new version or replaced by another vendor's product.

Hyland Software purchased SIRE Technologies approximately two years ago; Hyland Software has plans to release an updated livestreaming product to be incorporated into their new Agenda Management software in May 2016. Currently, staff has been provided very little information regarding the upgraded livestreaming software and its capabilities.

At this time, staff's recommendation would be to proceed in replacing SIRE with a new product. This recommendation is due to the instability of our current experience and the lack of information and knowledge regarding the upgraded software.

Included in the request for \$572,000 in capital is the cost of replacing SIRE with a new product; estimated costs for a new product up to \$150,000.

Capital Reserve for Upgrades to the Equipment

In order to ensure that a high-quality and stable livestreaming experience is maintained, a Reserve should be identified and funded on an annual basis to service and upgrade equipment and software as necessary.

Review and Updating of Media Policy

In coordination with the review of livestreaming capabilities and opportunities for the replacement of SIRE, Communications staff are currently reviewing the City's Media Relations Policy to ensure alignment with future livestreaming capabilities, the City's

SUBJECT: Modernizing the City of Hamilton's Livestreaming Capabilities and Experience (CM16006) (City Wide) Page 7 of 7

media relations efforts, other related City policies, and the changing landscape of media.

The review is being conducted and will include consultation with key stakeholders including staff, members of Council and media partners, as well as an environmental scan of other area municipalities' media policies to ensure the City's policy is current and reflects best practices and approaches with respect to media partnerships.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

None

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2012 – 2015 STRATEGIC PLAN

Strategic Priority #1

A Prosperous & Healthy Community

WE enhance our image, economy and well being by demonstrating that Hamilton is a great place to live, work, play and learn.

Strategic Objective

1.6 Enhance Overall Sustainability (financial, economic, social and environmental).

Strategic Priority #2

Valued & Sustainable Services

WE deliver high quality services that meet citizen needs and expectations, in a cost effective and responsible manner.

Strategic Objective

2.2 Improve the City's approach to engaging and informing citizens and stakeholders

Strategic Priority #3

Leadership & Governance

WE work together to ensure we are a government that is respectful towards each other and that the community has confidence and trust in.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" – to Report CM16006 Meeting Overlap Exercise