



## Hamilton

### **HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE**

#### **REPORT 16-005**

9:30 a.m.

Thursday, May 19, 2016

Council Chambers, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor

Hamilton City Hall

71 Main Street West

**Present:** Councillor M. Pearson, A. Johnson and J. Partridge  
A. Denham-Robinson (Chair), W. Arndt, D. Beland, D. Dmitry, M. McGaw, T. Ritchie, R. Sinclair, K. Stacey, T. Wallis (Vice Chair)

**Absent with  
Regrets:** K. Garay

**Also Absent:** W. Furlan

#### **THE HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE PRESENTS REPORT 16-005 AND RESPECTFULLY RECOMMENDS:**

1. **Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes – April 18, 2016 (Item 8.1)**
  - (i) **Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment of the former St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage, 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton**
    - (a) That 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton be included in the Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest;
    - (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes for 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton, attached as Appendix "A" be approved;
    - (c) That the Notice of Intention to Designate 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton attached as Appendix "B", be approved; and
    - (d) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to serve Notice of Intention to Designate 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act on the owner of the property and on the Ontario Heritage Trust, and to publish the

Notice of Intention to Designate in a newspaper having general circulation in the municipality.

**FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE COMMITTEE:**

**(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Clerk advised the Committee of the following change to the agenda:

**1. ADDED DELEGATION REQUEST**

- 4.1 Delegation request from Luke Johns and Melanie McAulay, Sacajawea Non-Profit Housing Inc., respecting their opposition to the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment of the former St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage, 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton (for today's meeting).

The Agenda for the May 19, 2016 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee was approved, as amended.

**(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)**

There were no declarations of interest.

**(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)**

**(i) April 21, 2016 (Item 3.1)**

The Minutes of the April 21, 2016 meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as presented.

**(d) DELEGATION REQUEST (Item 4)**

- (i) Delegation request from Luke Johns and Melanie McAulay, Sacajawea Non-Profit Housing Inc., respecting their opposition to the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment of the former St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage, 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton (for today's meeting) (Added Item 4.1)**

The Delegation request from Luke Johns and Melanie McAulay, Sacajawea Non-Profit Housing Inc., respecting their opposition to the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment of the former St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage, 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton, for today's meeting, was approved.

**(e) CONSENT ITEMS (Item 5)**

**(i) Heritage Permit Applications – Delegated Approvals (Item 5.1)**

- (a) Heritage Permit Application HP2016-007, Lighting Schedule, 610 York Boulevard, Hamilton, Dundurn Castle National Historic Site, By-Law No. 77-239 (Ward 1)

Item 5.1(a), Delegated Approvals for Heritage Permit Applications, was received.

**(f) PUBLIC HEARING/DELEGATION (Item 6)**

- (i) Luke Johns and Melanie McAulay, Sacajawea Non-Profit Housing Inc., respecting their opposition to the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment of the former St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage, 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton (Added Item 6.1)

Mr. Johns addressed the Committee. His comments included, but were not limited to the following:

- Sacajawea Non-Profit Housing Inc.(Sacajawea), a longstanding social housing provider in Hamilton, has a conditional offer on a property owned by the Good Shepherd, 18 West Avenue South
- Tim Welch and his Associates (TWC) have been retained as Development Consultants for this project
- Sacajawea has completed the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment, an Archeological Assessment as well as an Environmental Assessment
- Sacajawea intends to demolish the parsonage to accommodate a development that would include a minimum of 16 affordable residential units for First Nations families

The delegation from Luke Johns and Melanie McAulay, Sacajawea Non-Profit Housing Inc., respecting their opposition to the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment of the former St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage, 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton, was received.

**(g) PRESENTATIONS (Item 7)**

**(i) Light Rail Transit Project (Item 7.1)**

Danielle Bury, Senior Project Manager for the Light Rail Transit Project, addressed the Committee with the aid of a PowerPoint presentation. A copy of the presentation has been included in the public record. Ms. Bury's comments included, but were not limited to the following:

- Long-Term Rapid Transit Strategy
- Light Rail Transit map
- Alignment Overview
- McMaster University to Highway 403
- Highway 403 to Downtown
- A-Line Spur – James Street North
- Wellington Street to Queenston Circle
- Ongoing work
- Factors that could affect alignment
- Next steps

The presentation respecting the Light Rail Transit Project, was received.

**(h) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)**

**(i) Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes – April 18, 2016 (Item 8.1)**

Kathy Stacey of the Policy and Design Working Group, provided an overview of the April 18, 2016 Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes to the Committee. Chelsey Tyers, Cultural Heritage Planner, provided the Committee with an overview of the background and process that brought forward the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment of the former St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage, 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton.

R. Sinclair requested that he be recorded as OPPOSED.

For disposition of this matter, please refer to Item 1.

**(i) GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 11)**

**(i) Correspondence to Councillor A. Johnson from Hal Hillgren, President of Towers Inc. respecting Proposed Designation of 4 Queen Street South, Hamilton (Scottish Rite) (Item 11.1)**

The copy of Correspondence to Councillor A. Johnson from Hal Hillgren, President of Towers Inc. respecting the Proposed Designation of 4 Queen Street South, Hamilton (Scottish Rite), was received.

**(ii) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year-End Report 2015 follow-up (Item 11.2)**

Alissa Denham-Robinson of the Education Sub-Committee advised the Committee that the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year-End Report 2015 is not yet complete.

The follow-up respecting the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year-End report, was received.

**(iii) 2015 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Heritage Recognition Awards (Item 11.3)**

Alissa Denham-Robinson of the Education Sub-Committee advised the Committee that the Nomination for the 2015 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Heritage Recognition Awards were approved by Council on May 11, 2016.

The information respecting the 2015 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Heritage Recognition Awards, was received.

**(iv) Attendance of members from the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee to the Ontario Heritage Conference 2016, Stratford, Ontario (Item 11.4)**

Kathy Stacey of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee addressed the Committee respecting her attendance at the Ontario Heritage Conference 2016 in Stratford Ontario. Her comments included, but were not limited to the following:

- The conference was sold out
- Former Councillor B. McHattie spoke at the conference
- Of particular interest was a session on Post-War Housing and Heritage Conservation

The information respecting Attendance of members from the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee to the Ontario Heritage Conference 2016, Stratford, Ontario, was received.

**(v) Buildings and Landscapes (Item 11.5)**

Item (b)(ix), Treble Hall, 4-12 John Street North, Hamilton, was moved from the Building and Landscapes of Interest (Yellow) to the Heritage Properties Update (Green) list.

The St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage located at 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton, was included on the Endangered Buildings and Landscapes (Red) List, for monitoring by the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

The updates for items listed on the agenda as 11.5, were received, as presented.

**(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes (Red):  
(Red = Properties where there is a perceived immediate threat to heritage resources through: demolition; neglect; vacancy; alterations, and/or, redevelopment)**

- (i) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – A. Johnson

No report.

- (ii) Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (R) – M. McGaw

No report.

- (iii) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – M. McGaw

No report.

- (iv) Century Manor, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (D) – K. Garay

A. Denham-Robinson reported that there has been some damage done at the property and that staff have contacted the property authorities to investigate. Photos of the damage were distributed to the Committee.

- (v) Beach Canal Lighthouse (D) – J. Partridge

No report.

- (vi) 18-22 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) – K. Stacey

No report.

- (vii) 24-28 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) – K. Stacey

No report.

(viii) 1 St. James Place, Hamilton (D) – K. Stacey

No report.

(ix) All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South (L) – D. Beland

No report.

(x) 43-51 King Street East, Hamilton (Kresge Property) (R) – K. Stacey

No report.

(xi) St. Thomas Anglican Church Parsonage, 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton.

No report.

**(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Interest (yellow):  
(Yellow = Properties that are undergoing some type of change,  
such as a change in ownership or use, but are not perceived  
as being immediately threatened)**

(i) Delta High School, 1284 Main Street East, Hamilton (D) – D. Beland

No report.

(ii) James Street Baptist Church, 96 James Street South, Hamilton (D) – A. Denham-Robinson

No report.

(iii) Centenary Church, 24 Main Street West (R) – D. Beland

No report.

(iv) Pearson Home, 493 Dundas Street East, Waterdown (D) – J. Partridge / W. Arndt

No report.

(v) Charlton Hall, 52-56 Charlton Avenue West (D) – M. Pearson

No report.

- (vi) St. Giles United Church, 85 Holton Avenue South (L) – D. Beland

No report.

- (vii) 33 Bowen Street, Hamilton (R) - T. Ritchie

No report.

- (viii) 2251 Rymal Road East, Stoney Creek (R) – C. Dmitry

No report.

**(c) Heritage Properties Update (green):  
(Green = Properties whose status is stable)**

- (i) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

No report.

- (ii) (Thomas Building) 46 - 52 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – R. Sinclair

No report.

- (iii) Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton (R) – K. Stacey

No report.

- (iv) St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – A. Denham-Robinson

No report.

- (v) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – K. Garay

No report.

- (vi) Westdale Theatre, 1014 King Street West, Hamilton (R) – A. Johnson / K. Stacey

A. Johnson reported that the property has been included in the staff's work program for 2018.

- (vii) Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – R. Sinclair

No report.



- (viii) Jimmy Thompson Pool, 1099 King Street E., Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

No report.

- (ix) Abrey-Zimmerman House, Courtcliffe Park, Flamborough (D) – J. Partridge

J. Partridge reported that upgrades continue on the property.

- (x) Treble Hall, 4-12 John Street North, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

T. Ritchie reported that a wine bar is opening on the main floor of the property.

**(d) Heritage Properties Update (black):  
(Black = Properties that HMHC have no control over and may be demolished)**

- (i) Auchmar Gate House, Claremont Lodge 71 Claremont Drive (R) – K. Garay

No report

**(j) ADJOURNMENT (Item 12)**

There being no further business, the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee adjourned at 1:12 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alissa Denham-Robinson, Chair  
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Loren Kolar  
Legislative Coordinator  
Office of the City Clerk

## **Appendix "A" - Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes**

### **Description of Historic Place**

The Parsonage, at 18 West Avenue South in the City of Hamilton, is adjacent to and associated with the former Anglican Church of St. Thomas at the southwest corner of Main Street East and West Avenue South. The tall, two-storey and three-bay brick residence, with a T-plan and projecting bay windows, is situated on a large and flat urban lot with paths, deciduous trees and hedges, and is set back a distance from its frontage on West Avenue South.

### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest**

Believed to have been constructed in 1870, the Parsonage is associated with Hamilton's third Anglican church, the Church of St. Thomas at 16 West Avenue South. Both the church and parsonage are attributed to significant Hamilton architect Albert Harvey Hills, who was also responsible for building Hamilton's Crystal Palace and many other religious, institutional, and residential structures in the City of Hamilton and surrounding former townships.

The parsonage is built in a sparse Gothic Revival style and even incorporates elements for religious residential architecture introduced by the main advocate for the Gothic Revival, Augustus Pugin (1812-1852). These elements include the gable-roofed, three-bay and two-storey T-plan oriented with a gable and façade facing the street, projecting bay with three aligned windows, and a round oculi in the gables with quatrefoil windows. Other ornament includes brick labels, square-arch vertical joint heads, and stone lug sills at the windows, and large Gothic abacus-profile roof brackets on a moulded frieze.

The main entrance from West Avenue South is now covered by a modern storm door but behind it is the original wood panel door with large four-pane transom and side lights. The level of craftsmanship seen on the exterior also survives on the interior with tall moulded baseboard, and moulded door and window surrounds adorning nearly all the rooms and corridors. A curving central stairway with curvilinear skirt brackets, turned wood balusters, and turned, carved, and cut newel post is prominent when first entering the building and provides access to the largely intact second floor level.

The 0.28-acre lot is relatively unchanged since the Parsonage was built, and has a central path and large front lawn interspersed with mature deciduous trees and hedges. The central path to the east entrance is accentuated by the building's set back from West Avenue South, and the still open surrounding area allows for strong visual connections between the Parsonage and the Church of St. Thomas. Overall, changes to the Parsonage building, property, and viewsapes have been minimal since the late 19th century.

## Description of Heritage Attributes

*Key attributes that express the heritage value of the property include the:*

- T-plan oriented with a gable and façade facing West Avenue South and set back from the road;
- Tall, two-storey massing;
- Brick construction combining a squared-stone foundation, five-course brick plinth, and stretcher bond pattern for the east façade and American/ common bond for all other sides;
- Tall window openings with single-course brick labels, flat arch vertical joint heads, and bush hammered with chiselled margin stone lug sills;
- Projecting, ground-level bays with combined windows surrounded with flat arch vertical joint heads and moulded stone lug sills;
- Round oculi on each gable with decorative brick surrounds and quatrefoil windows;
- A moulded frieze and soffit, and large Gothic abacus-profile brackets at the eaves and gables;
- An early, single-storey addition with bevelled concrete plinth and wood door with brick label and stone threshold;
- Large central entrance with vertical panel door, four-pane transom and side lights with panels;
- An central curved stairway with curvilinear skirt brackets, turned wood balusters, and a turned, carved, and cut newel post;
- Prominent interior mouldings around the entrances and windows, and tall moulded baseboards; and,
- A surviving coal fireplace with granite top.

## Appendix “B” – Notice of Intention to Designate

# Notice of Intention to Designate 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton

The City of Hamilton intends to designate 18 West Avenue South, Hamilton, under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as being a property of cultural heritage value.

### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest**

Believed to have been constructed in 1870, the Parsonage is associated with Hamilton’s third Anglican church, the Church of St. Thomas at 16 West Avenue South. Both the church and parsonage are attributed to significant Hamilton architect Albert Harvey Hills, who was also responsible for building Hamilton’s Crystal Palace and many other religious, institutional, and residential structures in the City of Hamilton and surrounding former townships. The Parsonage’s brick construction is representative of its type, as is its Gothic Revival massing, plan and details. Apparently unique compared to other Ontario parsonages is the scale and height of the structure. Additionally, the Parsonage has a relatively unique level of preservation. In combination with the Church of St. Thomas, the Parsonage - with its surrounding open space, set back from the road, and architectural features that match those on the church and elsewhere on the street - is important for defining the religious, institutional, and residential character of West Avenue South near Main Street East.

The Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, Description of Heritage Attributes and supporting Cultural Heritage Assessment may be found online via [www.hamilton.ca](http://www.hamilton.ca) or viewed at the Office of the City Clerk, 71 Main Street West, 1st Floor, Hamilton, Ontario, L8P 4Y5, during regular business hours.

### **Written Notice of Objection**

Any person may, within 30 days after the date of the publication of the Notice, serve written notice of their objections to the proposed designation, together with a statement for the objection and relevant facts.

Dated at Hamilton, this **xxth** day of **xxxx**, 2016.

R. Caterini  
City Clerk  
Hamilton, Ontario

**CONTACT:** Chelsey Tyers, Cultural Heritage Planner, Phone: (905) 546-2424 ext. 1202, E-mail: [Chelsey.Tyers@hamilton.ca](mailto:Chelsey.Tyers@hamilton.ca)

**Website:** [www.hamilton.ca/heritageplanning](http://www.hamilton.ca/heritageplanning)