#### 2016 Annual Follow Up of Outstanding Audit Recommendations Summary – Status Report (5 Years +)

#### CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE 2010

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2010-08 HR – Recruitment and Selection	3bii. That Employment Services set a target time to hire performance measure and implement processes to monitor and analyze performance against this measure with the goal of improving the overall recruitment and selection process.	In Progress	Due to the re-structuring of the Human Resources Division, it is unknown whether further performance improvements will be made to the time to hire target.	Undetermined
2010-08 HR – Recruitment and Selection (Continued)	4. That Employment Services determine what information is required in a call file to support the hiring decision. Staff should then be trained in this regard. The Table of Contents and Call File Checklist should be updated to reflect any revisions.	Initiated	Employment Services has formally determined the documentation required in a call file to support the hiring decision. A sample of selected files found that the required documents are being retained either electronically or in hard copy format.  Although an expectation exist as to what documents are contained in a call file, management will revisit what information is saved in a call file with the upcoming HR system upgrade which will have the capability to save documents electronically within the HR system.	July 2017

### CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE (Continued) 2010

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2010-08 HR – Recruitment and Selection (Continued)	8a. That Employment Services review the entire recruitment and selection process with the objective of eliminating instances where duplicate manual or electronic documents exist. Use of current technology for document storage and retention should be considered.	In Progress	A sample of selected files found some duplication of hard copy and electronic documents. Management expects that document duplication will be eliminated with the upcoming HR system upgrade.	July 2017
2010-08 HR – Recruitment and Selection (Continued)	8e. That once policies and procedures are brought up to date as outlined in #2, Employment Services provide training to hiring managers in regard to their responsibilities.	In Progress	Existing hiring managers are informed of policy and procedure changes via email/eNet communications or through interactions with their Staffing Specialist and Coordinators.  New and aspiring people leaders are expected to attend mandatory training covering all aspects of their recruitment and hiring process. The first offering of this course is expected to be completed in June 2017.	June 2017

# CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE (Continued) 2010

2010-08	11c. That departments be directed to	Initiated	Human Resources has created an	Undetermined
HR – Recruitment	retain documentation regarding co-op		informal Co-op Student Hiring process	
and Selection	student hires to support their selections.		which provides departments with	
(Continued)			direction on what documents are to be	
			retained as part of the co-op hiring	
			process. This process document has	
			not been finalized or formally	
			distributed to the organization.	
			Due to restructuring of the Human	
			resources division, it is not known what	
			further action will be taken.	

### COMMUNITY AND EMERGENCY SERVICES 2008

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2008-06 Fleet Management – Part 2 (HES)	A2. That a cost benefit analysis be performed to evaluate the necessity of maintaining all the City's fuel sites, garages and inventory stockrooms currently in operation.	In Progress	Some fuel site locations have been closed as a result of compliance issues. Further study and analysis are underway to identify other sites for possible closure and/or relocation.	December 2018
2008-06 Fleet Management – Part 2 (HES) (Continued)	12c. That a formal re-order point be set in the above-referenced system for frequently used parts in inventory.	In Progress	The re-order point has been set in FDM for 835 key parts. However, due to the space constraints, the mechanical sections continues to order parts based on its own judgement when space is available rather than the re-order point in FDM.  Management indicated that more space will become available in the future, at which time the re-order point will be used as the basis for re-ordering parts.	June 2018

2009-06	A2. That management and systems	In Progress	Management indicated that it has	December
Fire Prevention	support investigate the full potential	_	taken longer than expected to	2018
Division	functionality of FDM in regard to		implement the three remaining FDM	
	enhancing the efficiency of various		system automation initiatives.	
	processes through automation and		Management expects that these	
	database extractions.		initiatives will be completed by the end	
			of 2018.	

### CORPORATE SERVICES 2009

		Current		Anticipated
		Status by	Reason for	Completion
Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Audit Services	Outstanding Status	Date
2009-04	2b. That, once completed, the above	In Progress	There is inadequate evidence that all	June 2017
Telecommunication	procedures (including any still relevant		of the procedures relating to IPT, land	
Services	existing procedures) be reviewed on a		lines, cellular devices, Blackberries	
	regular basis to ensure that they remain		and pagers are reviewed on a regular	
	current and are appropriately and		basis.	
	consistently applied.			

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2010-07 IS Business Process Management	4d. That a Lead Time Policy be drafted, implemented and enforced across IS. This Policy should define standard lead times that are required for non-standard work based on priority levels. This	In Progress	Service Level agreements with lead time requirements have been created, reviewed, drafted and signed off between IT and various City Departments.	December 2017
	Policy should also contain documentation of CRM (Customer Relationship Manager) roles within IS including responsibility for the awareness of future departmental requests and needs on a more pro-active basis.		Management expects to have a formalized Lead Time Policy completed by the end of 2017.	

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2010-07 IS Business Process Management (Continued)	5. That IS management create, regularly update and ensure staff compliance with policies and procedures for all of the business processes within IS.	In Progress	Management has formalized approved written procedures. However not all subsequent procedural changes are reflected in the written document. In addition, annual review is not documented and monitoring compliance with policies and procedures is on hold until management's audit criteria are revised. Management indicated that procedures will be updated by the end of 2018	December 2018
2010-07 IS Business Process Management (Continued)	7. That IS draft and implement Service Level Agreements with other departments in the City.	In Progress	Service level agreements (SLAs) have been created and negotiated between IT and all of the City departments. Two agreements are still in draft form. Management expects these SLAs will be finalized by the end of 2018.	December 2018

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2010-07 IS Business Process Management (Continued)	15a. That the Change Management procedures be revised to address the deficiencies noted above. After these procedures have been augmented, they need to be communicated to staff in order to set expectations and ensure that they are followed by all staff.	In Progress	Change Management Procedures were revised in 2013. A Change Advisory Board has been created and meets regularly. The Change Management process occurs in a regularly defined schedule. However, not all subsequent procedural changes are reflected in the written document. Management indicated that procedures will be updated by the end of 2018.	December 2018
2010-07 IS Business Process Management (Continued)	21a. That IS investigate the various options for a Change Management database and reporting tool and implement the tools that best meet the City's needs.	In Progress	The "Change Management" module in the new tool "HEAT2015" was purchased in Q2 2015.  IT plans to implement this module by the end of 2018.	December 2018

### CORPORATE SERVICES (Continued) 2010

		Current Status by	Reason for	Anticipated Completion
Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Audit Services	Outstanding Status	Date
2010-10	1. That written procedures be developed	In Progress	Written procedures have been created	Mar. 2018
Development	for the collection of development charges	_	and are available in draft form only.	
Charges	in Building Services and the allocation of		These procedures are expected to be	
	fees to the reserve accounts in Financial		finalized and adopted after AMANDA	
	Planning and Policy.		7, the new version of Building services,	
	-		software, is implemented	

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management	2a. That the IS Division develop and implement a plan for the effective management of software assets that is reviewed and updated annually to reflect changes in the City's software asset management requirements. This should	In Progress	IT management has begun acquiring a tool for the management of software assets.  IT management expects to develop a plan for the management of software	Q2 2018
	be done in conjunction with the risk assessment recommended in #1 above.		assets once the above tool is implemented.  This is part of the ongoing IT Service Management (ITSM) project.	
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	2b. That the implementation of a comprehensive asset management tool (that has automatic detection capabilities) be considered by the IS Division as part of the plan.	In Progress	IT management has begun acquiring a tool for the management of software assets. This is part of the ongoing ITSM project.	Q2 2018

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	3. That business policies and procedures be written, implemented and distributed to staff in order to address and define key processes in the management of software assets.	In Progress	IT management has begun acquiring a tool for the management of software assets.  Business policies and procedures will be written, implemented and distributed to staff once the above tool is implemented.  This is part of the ongoing ITSM project.	Q2 2018
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	4a. That the responsibility and accountability for the management of all software assets be centralized in the IS Division.	Not Completed	The responsibility and accountability for the management of software assets is part of the ongoing IT Governance Review Project, which will now be overseen by the Business Improvement Team. The IT Governance Review Project is still in progress and it is unknown when the review will be completed.	Undetermined
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	4d. That IS staff currently working in other departments report directly to management in the IS Division.	Not Completed	IT staff reporting channels is part of the ongoing IT Governance Review Project, which will now be overseen by the Business Improvement Team. The IT Governance Review Project is still in progress and It is unknown when the Review will be completed.	Undetermined

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	6. That the IS Division verify and continue to monitor the compliance of software on City computers with the respective licence agreements. Any non-compliance should be rectified to ensure software complies with licence agreements and with PCI Standards.	Not Completed	The verification and monitoring of software compliance on City computers is part of the ongoing IT Governance Review Project, which will now be overseen by the Business Improvement Team. The IT Governance Review Project is still in progress and it is unknown when the Review will be completed.	Undetermined
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	7. That a process for reconciling software licence purchases against actual computer deployment be developed and implemented by the IS Division. Any issues with over or under purchasing that are identified in the reconciliation process should be resolved by the IS Division.	In Progress	IT management has begun acquiring a tool for the management of software assets.  A reconciliation process will be developed and implemented once the above tool is implemented.  This is part of the ongoing ITSM project.	Q2 2018

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	9. That the IS Division develop a complete and accurate inventory of all software on City computers and keep it up to date.	In Progress	IT has started developing an inventory of the software currently used and supported by IT. Management expects that an IT Standards Board will be created as part of the IT Governance Review Project to deal with both the hardware and software used by the City's business units.  The IT Governance Review Project is still in progress and it is unknown when the Review will be completed.	Undetermined
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	10. That, going forward, contract management staff in the IS Division manage all corporate contracts for the software installed on City computers. Annual maintenance fees should also be included in order to take advantage of possible cost efficiencies.	Not Completed	Contract management is part of the ongoing IT Governance Review Project, which will be overseen by the Business Improvement Team. The IT Governance Review Project is still in progress and it is unknown when the Review will be completed.	Undetermined
2011-09 IS Software Asset Management (Continued)	11. That key performance measures (metrics) for the management of software assets be defined. These performance measures should be reported to the Senior Management Team (SMT) and Council on a regular basis.	In Progress	This item is dependent on the completion of the IT Governance Review Project, the completion of which is unknown at this time.  Preliminary draft metrics have been defined but data collection has not yet started.	Undetermined

### HAMILTON PUBLIC LIBRARY 2007

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2007-10 Fines and Other Revenues (Continued)	10. That a comprehensive debt collection agreement be drawn up that will ensure that:  All services provided by the collection agency are incorporated into the agreement.  A rate adjustment formula that is responsive to currency fluctuations is negotiated or that the billing rate be set in US dollars.	Not Completed	There has been no change to the debt collection agreement. Hamilton Public Library's new Director of Finance and Facilities expects to have a new debt collection agreement in place by mid-2018.	June 2018
2007-10 Fines and Other Revenues (Continued)	<ul> <li>13. That management consider introducing the following performance measures:</li> <li>Fine waivers above certain established limits</li> <li>Fines waived by branch (number and dollar)</li> <li>Fine waivers by staff identification</li> <li>Delinquent accounts handed over by branch</li> <li>Fines waived as a percentage of billings</li> </ul>	In Progress	Management has collected data and can generate reports to measure fine waivers above \$20 fines waived by branch and fine waivers by staff members. Management plans to collect data and create reports to measure the two other recommended measures, and begin calculating, tracking and using measures to assess performance regularly by September 2017.	September 2017

### PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 2009

		Current	Reason for	Anticipated Completion
Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Status by Audit Services	Outstanding Status	Date
2009-11 Parking Revenue	4. That, on a quarterly basis, the Supervisor of Parking Revenues perform a reconciliation of the cash clearing account to provide a breakdown of the reconciling items.	In Progress	Management from various City divisions, including Hamilton Municipal Parking Services (HMPS), are working with Information Technology on an alternative reconciliation process. This new process will allow daily reconciliations without the need for a cash clearing account.	June 2017

## PUBLIC WORKS 2007

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2007-08 Encroachment Agreements	4a. That copies of the contracts with various newspaper providers pertaining to the vending box encroachment agreements be newly validated.	In Progress	The Publication Box Annual Permit Policy was approved by Public Works Committee in 2014. Although management has obtained agreements/permits from each newspaper/box vendor, staff will begin enforcement of the Policy in April 2017 to validate newspaper box locations and identify any non-compliant vendors	April 2017
2007-08 Encroachment Agreements (Continued)	4e. That proof of specified insurance coverage as set out by the contract be obtained and filed with corresponding contracts.	In Progress	Proof of specified insurance coverage has been obtained for benches and publication boxes. Proof of insurance bicycle racks was not up to date.  Management indicated they will follow up with the vendor to obtain a current certificate of insurance	April 2017

2007-09	A2. That a decision be made on whether	In Progress	The Operations Division and Legal	May 2017
Administration of	agreements for temporary		Services are drafting the Streets Use	
Outdoor Boulevard	encumbrances is currently under review		By-Law and Equipment Installation By-	
Cafes	but a decision will be deferred to the		law which will address the appropriate	
	development of the new Streets Use By-		treatment of temporary encumbrances.	
	Law.		Finalizing these By-laws was delayed	
			due to ongoing issues related to	
			Community Mailboxes which was	
			resolved in the Fall of 2016.	

## PUBLIC WORKS (Continued) 2007

		Current		Anticipated
		Status by	Reason for	Completion
Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Audit Services	Outstanding Status	Date
2007-09	3. That the policies and procedures	In Progress	The policies and procedures for	Undetermined
Administration of	governing the administration of		Encroachments, including Boulevard	
Outdoor Boulevard	agreements for Boulevard Cafes,		Café were last approved in 2011. The	
Cafes	Banners and Permanent Road Closures		policies and procedures for Permanent	
(Continued)	be formally documented.		Road Closures have been drafted but	
			not finalized. The section in Public	
			Works responsible for the development	
			of the policies and procedures for	
			Banners has not been determined at	
			this time.	

		Current Status by	Reason for	Anticipated Completion
Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Audit Services	Outstanding Status	Date
2009-08 Cemeteries - Administrative Office	2. That management complete the calculation for the resources required to convert the historically significant paper cemetery records into electronic format. Resources should then be temporarily assigned to complete the conversion within a reasonable time period.	In Progress	Data Entry staff continue to convert paper records into electronic format. This is a long- term project.	December 2020

# PUBLIC WORKS (Continued) 2010

		Current Status by	Reason for	Anticipated Completion
Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Audit Services	Outstanding Status	Date
2010-06 Tools	4hii. That these ledgers be updated periodically (monthly or quarterly) depending on the turnover of tools in inventory.	In Progress	Evidence was found that the ledger is updated monthly. However, not all tools costing more than \$50 are recorded and errors were noted in four of the six sampled tools purchases reviewed.	December 2017
2010-06 Tools (Continued)	4diii. That yearly inventory counts be taken to verify that the information in the ledgers is correct.	In Progress	Annual inventory counts cannot be verified in some locations because evidence of such counts is not being retained.	December 2017

		Current Status by	Reason for	Anticipated Completion
Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Audit Services	Outstanding Status	Date
2010-09 Facilities Maintenance & Administrative Controls	2ci. That management in Corporate Facilities and the Recreation Division work collaboratively to ensure that a corporate standard for the maintenance of the City's facilities is developed and adhered to.	In Progress	Service Level Standards for the maintenance of the City's facilities have been developed. Due to staffing changes, measurement of how well staff are adhering to these standards has been delayed to later in the year.	September 2017
2010-09 Facilities Maintenance & Administrative Controls (Continued)	3i. That a complete inventory of all equipment, furniture and fixtures be developed uploaded into ARCHIBUS and regularly updated to ensure that it remains current. (CF)	In Progress	Equipment inventories have been completed or partially entered into ARCHIBUS for 136 of 186 buildings.	December 2017

### PUBLIC WORKS (Continued) 2010

Report # & Subject	Recommendation	Current Status by Audit Services	Reason for Outstanding Status	Anticipated Completion Date
2010-09 Facilities Maintenance & Administrative Controls (Continued)	3ii. That a complete inventory of all equipment, furniture and fixtures be developed, uploaded into ARCHIBUS and regularly updated to ensure that it remains current. (Rec)	In Progress	Equipment inventories have been completed or partially entered into ARCHIBUS for 110 of 270 buildings.	December 2017
2010-09 Facilities Maintenance & Administrative Controls (Continued)	4i. That management of Corporate Facilities and the Recreation Division work with the Application & Systems Analyst to ensure that the City fully utilizes the ARCHIBUS modules covered by the existing license.	In Progress	Three of the ten modules remain to be implemented.	Undetermined
2010-09 Facilities Maintenance & Administrative Controls (Continued)	7. That the Manager corporate Buildings & Technical Services finalize service level agreements with client departments for implementation by January 2011. Service levels should be mutually agreed upon and each part's responsibilities and the basis of cost allocations should be clearly defined. (CF)	In Progress	Service level agreements (SLAs) have been negotiated with client groups. Negotiations for four SLAs are either in progress or have not started.	Undetermined
2010-09 Facilities Maintenance & Administrative Controls (Continued)	8d. That the ARCHIBUS internal work order system be linked to the PeopleSoft Payroll system to ensure that actual hours worked by internal trades people are billed to facilities.	Alternative Initiated	ARCHIBUS is not being linked to the PeopleSoft Payroll System.  Management is investigating an alternative to ensure that actual hours worked are billed to appropriate facilities.	December 2017