



**CITY OF HAMILTON**  
**PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT**  
*Environmental Services Division*

<b>TO:</b>	Chair and Members Public Works Committee
<b>COMMITTEE DATE:</b>	November 13, 2017
<b>SUBJECT/REPORT NO:</b>	Multi-Residential Waste Diversion Program (PW17086) (City Wide)
<b>WARD(S) AFFECTED:</b>	City Wide
<b>PREPARED BY:</b>	Raffaella Morello (905)546-2424 Extension 3926
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Craig Murdoch, B. Sc. Director, Environmental Services Division Public Works Department
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	

**RECOMMENDATION**

- (a) That one temporary full time Program Manager and two temporary full time field staff be hired for a three-year period to implement the activities outlined in the Multi-residential Waste Reduction Action Plan contained in Appendix A attached to Report PW17086, as well as, providing customer service support for the Multi-residential Waste Diversion Program.
- (b) That the funding for the three positions referenced in Recommendation (a) in the amount of \$250,000 be referred to the 2018 Operating Budget process;
- (c) That the Multi-residential Waste Reduction Action Plan contained in Appendix A attached to Report PW17086 be implemented upon approval of both Recommendations (a) and (b).

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

At the Public Works Committee meeting held on April 20, 2017 staff was requested to report on the status of the City of Hamilton’s (City) waste diversion programs for multi-residential properties. The purpose of this report is to provide information on participation and compliance with the existing Multi-residential Waste Diversion Program and recommended strategies to improve the program’s performance.

The City has invested significant time and resources to ensure that multi-residential buildings have access to waste diversion programs similar to the programs offered for

single-family properties. Historically, the waste diversion rate for multi-residential buildings has ranged from 13% to 19% which is substantially lower than the diversion rate from single-family properties which is approximately 47% to 49%. This report identifies potential opportunities to improve waste diversion in multi-residential buildings as part of a renewed strategy as outlined in the attached Appendix A of Report PW17086. These measures include the following:

- Education – Additional effort to ensure residents and building representatives understand how to participate properly in waste diversion programs;
- Program improvements – Ensuring that residents and buildings have the necessary tools to fully participate in the waste diversion programs;
- Planning initiatives – This requires developers to follow the City’s required development guidelines so that new multi-residential buildings have the ability to participate in waste diversion programs and they are designed to meet the City’s waste collection program requirements; and
- Solid Waste By-Law Enforcement - Enforcement of the City’s Solid Waste Management By-law 09-067 is necessary to ensure compliance with the City’s waste diversion programs and the garbage container limit.

***Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 10***

**FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

Financial: The cost to implement the waste diversion strategies identified in Appendix A to Report PW17086 is approximately \$250,000 annually for a three year period and is to be referred to the 2018 Operating Budget process. The Multi-residential Waste Diversion Program supports the City’s Solid Waste Management Master Plan, which previously has been funded through the City’s capital budget process. The \$250,000 includes a one-time cost to provide a waste guide to be provided to all multi-residential dwelling units, an improved instruction manual for building superintendents, and dedicated staff to coordinate the multi-residential program, including customer service support, and, where necessary, to ensure compliance with the City’s Solid Waste Management By-Law 09-067, including participation in the City’s waste diversion programs and complying with the garbage container limit.

New and replacement diversion containers for multi-residential buildings will be funded from the annual diversion container replacement capital account 5121890200, which has a draft budget of \$870,000 for 2018. Of this amount, approximately \$120,000 is forecasted for the multi-residential program which

includes supplying curbside recycling carts, curbside green carts, in-unit apartment recycling bags, and in-unit kitchen organics containers. In order to maintain the multi-residential waste diversion program in the future, ongoing costs of approximately \$95,000 per year will be required to supply new and replacement waste diversion containers for the multi-residential buildings, which will be funded from the annual capital account for waste diversion containers.

**Staffing:** It is recommended that a temporary full-time staff Program Manager position and two temporary field staff be assigned for a three-year period starting in 2018 to implement the activities outlined in the multi-residential waste diversion action plan. This temporary staffing request is being presented for Council's consideration, since the three-year term exceeds the 24-month term as outlined in the City's Complement Control Policy. Having dedicated positions for the three-year term to focus on the programs and policies directly impacting multi-residential buildings will help to improve customer support for these properties and ensure long-term success. From past practice, the customer service and promotional requirements for the City's multi-residential program has been provided by several staff through a piecemeal approach. This has resulted in limited support for this growing residential sector. Staffing needs for the continued monitoring of this program beyond the three-year period will be re-evaluated at that time and if necessary, brought before Council.

As a best practice, many large municipalities have dedicated staff to manage their multi-residential programs strategically rather than through an inconsistent manner by sharing the file among several non-dedicated staff. Several municipalities in Southern Ontario, including City of Toronto, Halton Region, and Region of Peel have staff specifically assigned for their Multi-residential Waste Management Program in order to effectively support this rapidly expanding sector in the Greater Toronto Area.

**Legal:** The recommendations outlined in this report do not have legal implications.

## **HISTORICAL BACKGROUND**

### Hamilton's Demographics

The City has a population of slightly over 545,000 residents and there are approximately 173,000 households. Approximately 29% of the City's residential dwellings are multi-residential units including small multi-unit complexes, condominiums, and apartments.

---

*OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.*

*OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.*

*OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.*

The Provincial Government's *Places to Grow - Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe* identifies how communities will develop over the long-term. Since introducing the Places to Grow Act, 2005, there has been a shift towards more compact communities, including increased growth of multi-residential buildings. As a result, the City needs to ensure that the multi-residential waste management services meet the needs of this expanding residential sector.

#### Waste Management Services for Multi-Residential Properties

The City provides comprehensive waste collection services for multi-residential properties which includes collection of organic waste, recyclables, yard waste, garbage, and bulk waste. Multi-residential properties typically include buildings with seven or more dwelling units. These include "vertical" buildings such as high-rise apartment/condominium buildings and others which are "horizontal" such as smaller sized two or three story buildings with multiple units. Apartments/condominium buildings count for approximately 47,000 multi-residential units of the total households in the City.

The type of collection service provided for multi-residential properties is based on the building configuration. For example, high-rise apartment buildings typically have front-end bins which range from two to eight cubic yards for garbage collection. Smaller "horizontal" multi-residential properties which do not have sufficient space for front-end bin collection receive curbside garbage collection. In a few cases, some multi-residential buildings have private waste collection service.

#### Waste Diversion Programs for Multi-Residential Properties

The City's comprehensive Solid Waste Management Master Plan (SWMMP) includes an aggressive waste diversion target which requires active participation from both the residential and multi-residential sectors. Since 2001, the City has been proactive with developing waste diversion programs for multi-residential buildings. Prior to 2001, only a few multi-residential buildings had recycling collection. In 2003 & 2004, the City completed a large-scale expansion of the blue cart recycling program among multi-residential buildings. Rollout of the organics program to multi-residential buildings was initiated in several locations in 2006 and further expanded to most locations from 2010 to 2012. Additional follow-up with multi-residential buildings was undertaken in 2013 and 2014. Several tactics have been used to encourage participation in the multi-residential waste diversion programs, which include:

- Surveying tenants, Superintendents and Property Managers to understand their waste management behaviours and potential barriers to waste diversion;

---

*OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.*

*OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.*

*OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.*

- Providing extensive communications packages, including tenant and Superintendent guides, signage, and improved labels for containers;
- Providing containers including carts for the buildings and in-unit containers for each dwelling unit; and
- Providing waste management presentations to tenants.

Improving waste diversion in multi-residential buildings has been of interest to Council in the past. In May 2012, through Council Meeting Report #12-010, City Council approved the following, “(b) That staff immediately utilizes all available resources to work with multi-residential, superintendents and building owners to increase the participation and diversion rates in medium and poor performing buildings”.

### Municipal Scan

Many larger sized municipalities in Ontario offer waste diversion programs for the multi-residential buildings in their community. In some cases, municipalities offer both garbage collection and diversion programs, for example, City of Hamilton, Region of Peel, City of Toronto, Durham Region, and Halton Region. Other municipalities provide recycling collection only (City of London and City of Brantford) and in these municipalities, the multi-residential building owners are responsible for obtaining a private company to handle their garbage collection requirements. There are only seven municipalities in Ontario, including the City of Hamilton, which provide organics collection for multi-residential buildings. In most cases, other municipalities experience challenges similarly to Hamilton’s program including low waste diversion, tenant issues, and resource requirements.

Hamilton’s multi-residential waste diversion rate has ranged from 13% to 19% historically, which is comparable to other municipalities including the Region of Peel (16%), City of Ottawa (18%), and City of Toronto (28%). The City of Toronto has been able to achieve a slightly higher waste diversion rate for their multi-residential buildings since they have a utility based system to charge for garbage collection for multi-residential buildings. Staff does not anticipate moving towards a utility based approach in the near future for the multi-residential program based on the current set up of the City’s taxation system.

## **POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS**

### Hamilton Policy Implications

Actions to address the Multi-residential Waste Diversion Program supports the City’s SWWMP’s guiding principles, including:

- The City of Hamilton must lead and encourage the changes necessary to adopt the principle of Waste Reduction; and,
- The Glanbrook Landfill is a valuable resource. The City of Hamilton must minimize residual waste and optimize the use of the City's diversion and disposal facilities.

Recommendation #3 of the SWMMP is specifically related to the multi-residential program, "Increase waste diversion through the implementation of the Council approved: (b) Improvements to the multi-residential recycling and green cart programs".

#### Provincial Policy Implications

Ontario Regulation 103/94 governs waste separation programs for multi-residential buildings, industrial, commercial, and institutional (ICI) properties. This regulation requires owners of multi-residential buildings to provide adequate facilities for waste collection, waste storage, and to make a reasonable effort to operate a recycling program.

As the result of Regulation 103/94, municipalities are not obligated through Provincial legislation to manage waste from multi-residential buildings. Several major Ontario municipalities offer waste diversion programs for their multi-residential sector in order to decrease the amount of waste sent for disposal, even though they are not mandated to do so by the Province. Even if waste collection services are not provided by the municipality, multi-residential buildings are still required to recycle as required by Regulation 103/94.

#### *Waste-Free Ontario Act, 2016*

In March 2017, the Ontario Government approved the "Strategy for a Waste-Free Ontario: Building the Circular Economy" to support the Waste-Free Ontario Act, 2016. This strategy's purpose is to encourage zero waste and zero greenhouse gas emissions from the waste sector through resource management. The strategy includes actions to help the Province achieve its waste reduction mandate including measures targeted towards the multi-residential sector, which include:

- "Action 5: Amend the 3Rs regulations to increase resource recovery across all sectors" - The 3Rs regulations require multi-residential dwellings of six or more units to source separate recyclable wastes. Improving resource recovery from high-rise and other multi-residential dwellings is important considering that there will be increased housing densification across the Province in the future.
- "Action 10: Implement an action plan to reduce the volume of food and organic waste going to landfill" - The Province has indicated that it will develop a plan to

---

*OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.*

*OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.*

*OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.*

reduce food waste and organic materials going to landfill. The action plan will consider how best to support Ontario's climate change efforts, including consideration of organic waste recovery in high-rise and multi-residential dwellings.

## **RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

Over the years, staff has used several consultation tactics as part of the development of the City's multi-residential waste diversion program including focus groups, surveys, and meetings with building superintendents. The strategies outlined in the proposed multi-residential waste diversion action plan are based on feedback received through interaction with multi-residential customers.

Consultation on the Multi-residential Waste Diversion Program has been undertaken with the Waste Management Advisory Committee (WMAC).

## **ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION**

The information and recommendations outlined in this report have City wide implications related to waste management services provided for multi-residential buildings across the City.

### **Current Multi-Residential Program Performance**

Hamilton's Solid Waste Management Master Plan (SWMMP 2012), recommendation #1 states that, "A waste diversion target of 65% will be maintained." One of the challenges with reaching the City's 65% diversion target is the fact that waste diversion from multi-residential properties falls behind single-family dwellings, despite the City's efforts to promote waste diversion. Multi-residential properties make up approximately 29% of the City's residential dwelling units; however, they contribute approximately 9% of the recyclables diverted by the City's recycling program. Information on organic waste diverted from multi-residential buildings cannot be quantified since green carts from multi-residential buildings are collected as part of the curbside residential routes; however, anecdotally, participation in the green cart program is much lower compared to the recycling program.

In 2016 and 2017, the City completed seasonal waste composition studies among 100 single family residential properties and five apartment buildings. The audit results indicated that the waste diversion rate for the buildings was approximately 13% compared to 49% for the residential properties. There is significant opportunity to divert waste which is currently being disposed by multi-residential buildings. Based on the 2016/2017 audit results, approximately 54% of the materials in the garbage stream from the multi-residential buildings were recyclables and organic waste which could have been diverted through the City's recycling program and green cart program.

---

*OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.*

*OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.*

*OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.*

## Multi-Residential Waste Diversion Program Challenges

Multi-residential waste diversion is a challenging program to support and maintain within the City of Hamilton as well as in other communities. The following are several issues which impact the program's success:

- Tenant residency - High turnover rates is common in a significant number of multi-residential apartment buildings which makes communication and participation in waste diversion program more difficult to achieve.
- Convenience - Some high-rise buildings offer increased access to garbage disposal such as garbage chutes on each floor, but offer less convenient access for the waste diversion programs. In these cases, residents have to travel farther to take their recyclable materials and organic waste to a centralized location.
- Lack of ownership - Waste management programs is communal in many multi-residential buildings, which means that individuals are not accountable for the amount or quality of the waste generated.
- Limited support from Building Management - Some building superintendents or property managers may not be interested in having waste diversion programs available in their building.

## Recommended Actions

The proposed Multi-residential Waste Diversion Program action plan represents a moderate but steady and positive approach to support the City's waste diversion goal. The recommended activities are outlined below and described in further detail in the Appendix A to Report PW17086:

- Advocacy - The City should urge the Provincial Government to adopt policies to support waste diversion programs for the multi-residential sector.
- Stakeholder Networking - Staff will continue to be involved with stakeholder engagement such as attending multi-residential building association meetings and workshops. In addition, the City is an active participant in inter-municipal multi-residential waste reduction working groups through the province's Continuous Improvement Fund.
- Education - Promotion and education are fundamental components to ensure success for the waste diversion program. Residents and building

---

*OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.*

*OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.*

*OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.*



owners/superintendents must be made aware of the programs, how to properly use them as well as receive ongoing reminders to encourage long-term participation.

- Planning controls – The City’s Waste Management Development Standards include guidelines to ensure waste diversion programs are incorporated in the design of new multi-residential properties. Staff will continue to ensure that new multi-residential developments follow these guidelines.
- Garbage limit - The City’s Solid Waste Management By-law 09-067 was amended in 2012 to change the weekly allowable garbage limits for multi-residential properties to permit one container per dwelling unit per week. Staff is planning to enforce this container limit for multi-residential buildings which are currently exceeding this limit.
- By-law enforcement – The City’s Solid Waste Management By-law 09-167 includes clauses that prohibit placing recyclable materials and organic waste in with regular garbage. Enforcement of the By-law could be considered as needed (in conjunction with education) to ensure buildings actively participate in the City’s waste diversion programs in order to receive municipal garbage collection services.

The recommended actions focus on the existing programs currently available within the community. The action plan will involve a focused approach which will include building owners, Property Managers, Superintendents, and multi-residential residents. For the most part, the options noted above do not involve any major changes or additions to the current waste management programs but are generally related to education and compliance with the City’s Solid Waste Management By-law 09-067.

### Ongoing Progress

Several issues need to be considered with the delivery of the City’s multi-residential waste diversion program:

- Resource requirements – Maintaining and providing continued support for the multi-residential program requires appropriate labour resources; and
- Building commitment – Residents, property owners & building Superintendents share the responsibility for participation in the City’s diversion programs.

Although the City has used its best efforts to provide information and tools necessary for the multi-residential program over the years, field data and waste audit results indicate that there are low diversion rates and low participation from multi-residential buildings. A targeted emphasis on recycling and composting in multi-residential buildings could help to overcome residents’ waste diversion challenges and increase diversion.

Staff will assess the outcome of the Multi-residential Waste Diversion Action Plan by monitoring customer service inquiries and reviewing contamination rates from multi-residential buildings. A waste audit is planned for 2018 to determine if there is any success with improving the waste diversion capture rate. Staff will continue to provide day-to-day customer service and operational support for the existing multi-residential program in addition to the action items noted above.

### **ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION**

Alternative One is to consider one or more items outlined in Appendix A to Report PW17086 rather than the complete list of recommended actions.

Alternative Two is to implement the process outlined in Appendix A to Report PW17086 but have two temporary staff for a one year period instead of three years. This would reduce the budget requirement from \$250,000 to \$100,000. Both alternatives above would be limited in addressing the low participation, low diversion, and high contamination rate from multi-residential buildings.

### **ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN**

#### **Community Engagement & Participation**

*Hamilton has an open, transparent and accessible approach to City government that engages with and empowers all citizens to be involved in their community.*

#### **Clean and Green**

*Hamilton is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.*

#### **Built Environment and Infrastructure**

*Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.*

### **APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED**

Appendix A - Multi-Residential Waste Diversion Program Action Plan