



CITY OF HAMILTON
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
PLANNING DIVISION

| | |
|-----------------------------|--|
| TO: | Chair and Members Planning Committee |
| COMMITTEE DATE: | January 16, 2018 |
| SUBJECT / REPORT NO: | Preliminary Screening for the Request to Designate 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (Ward 8) (PED18001) |
| WARD(S) AFFECTED: | Ward 8 |
| PREPARED BY: | Jeremy Parsons 905-546-2424 Ext. 1214 |
| SUBMITTED BY: | Steve Robichaud Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department |
| SIGNATURE: | |

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That Council direct and authorize staff to undertake a Cultural Heritage Assessment of 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, shown on Appendix “A” to Report PED18001, to determine whether the property is of cultural heritage value worthy of designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;
- (b) That the Cultural Heritage Assessment work be assigned a high priority and be added to staff’s work plan for completion and presentation to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee (HMHC) no later than December 31, 2018, as per the attached Appendix “G” to Report PED18001;
- (c) That should the Cultural Heritage Assessment determine that 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, is of cultural heritage value or interest, a Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes be prepared by staff for Council’s consideration for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;
- (d) Pursuant to Section 27(1.2) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, that Council direct staff to add the respective buildings located at 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, shown in Appendix “A” of Report PED18001, to the Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (the “Register”), following consultation with the HMHC as per the Council-approved Designation Process (see Appendix “D” to Report PED18001);

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Preliminary Screening for the Request to Designate 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Ward 8) (PED18001) - Page 2 of 9

- (e) Pursuant to Section 27(5) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, that Council require that any notice of intention to demolish or remove any structure or building on 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, shown in Appendix “A” to Report PED18001, include a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment report, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner;
- (f) That a copy of Report PED18001 be forwarded to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee for information and consultation; and,
- (g) That a copy of Report PED18001 be forwarded to the property owner and the designation requestors for information.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The subject lands known municipally as 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, (see location map and photographs attached as Appendices “A” and “C” to Report PED18001) is a total of 6.51 acres and contains the following features:

- The Medical Superintendent’s Residence (also known as Residence 37 and the San House): Colonial Revival campus residence built in 1922;
- The Patterson Building: Collegiate Gothic institutional building built in 1932;
- Early-mid 20th century accessory garage building;
- Modern accessory building;
- Two large surface parking lots; and,
- A substantial lawn area with a number of large trees.

On August 22, 2017 staff received a letter requesting designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act* for the property located at 650 Sanatorium Road (the “San House”). On October 16, 2017, staff received a second formal designation request, from the same party to include the property located at 672 Sanatorium Road (the “Patterson Building”). Both buildings are located on the same parcel of land despite having separate municipal addresses.

The property is currently listed on the City’s Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and / or Historical Interest as a Cultural Heritage Landscape. The property is not designated under Part IV or V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, listed on the Register, or subject to a Heritage Conservation Easement Agreement.

SUBJECT: Preliminary Screening for the Request to Designate 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Ward 8) (PED18001) - Page 3 of 9

Through this Report, staff have determined that 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road meets all three categories of the criteria contained in Ontario Regulation 9 / 06 and is considered to have design / physical value, historical / associative value, and contextual value. Staff recommend that Council direct and authorize staff to carry out a Cultural Heritage Assessment of 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road to determine whether the property is of sufficient cultural heritage value to merit designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff recommend that the Cultural Heritage Assessment work be assigned a high priority within the staff work plan.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 8

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: None

Staffing: None

Legal: The City's Legal Counsel was consulted in the preparation of the original 2008 staff report regarding the formal Designation Process (Report PED08211), the recommendations of which are summarized below:

Owner consent is not required for designation of a property under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Accordingly, a Council may decide that it is in the public and / or community interest to conserve a property, despite objections by the owner.

As per the Council-approved Designation Process (see Appendix "C" to Report PED18001), this Report provides staff with direction to complete further research and evaluation of the properties for a later decision by Council. If staff are directed to proceed, Council will make a decision on designation at a subsequent stage in the designation process once a staff report has been prepared, and Cultural Heritage Assessment, a draft designation By-law, advice from the HMHC, and the positions of the property owners and any other interested parties are presented.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property, known municipally as 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, was previously included in the lands of the former Mountain Sanatorium (and later Chedoke Hospital) on the western brow of the Niagara Escarpment. The Sanatorium lands once contained approximately 30 buildings. The Mountain Sanatorium was officially opened in 1906 by the Governor General Earl Grey. The institution was Canada's fourth sanatorium but the largest of its kind in Canada. During the early 20th

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

century, tuberculosis was a severe disease that affected thousands of people. The original Mountain Sanatorium contained upwards of 15 buildings, many of them simple wood-frame structures. Following efforts to contain outbreaks during the First World War, the Federal government invested in more substantial structures, including the following structures still standing in the vicinity: the Long & Bisby Building (1920), the Bruce Memorial Building (1922), the Southam Pavilion (1928), the Evel Pavilion (1932), the Wilcox Pavilion (1938), and the Holbrook Pavilion (1951).

The San House was built in 1922 for Dr. John Howard Holbrook, the hospital's medical superintendent from 1908-1945 and served subsequent hospital uses in the latter half of the 20th century. The San House replaced the former farmhouse, purposed as the residence of Dr. John Howard Holbrook and family, that was destroyed by fire that same year. The property currently sits vacant but does not appear to have been added to the City's Vacant Building Registry. The Patterson Building was built in 1932 as a residence for 45 nurses. The building was renovated as early as 1975 for office use, and currently houses Columbia International College. Both properties are listed on the City's Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and / or Historical Interest as part of a Cultural Heritage Landscape.

On August 22, 2017 staff received a letter with seven (7) signatures from nearby residents of the subject lands requesting designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act* for the property located at 650 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton. Staff served the owners with Notice of this request on September 14, 2017. On October 16, 2017, staff received a second formal designation request from the same residents to include the property located at 672 Sanatorium Road. The residents had originally requested designation for 565 Sanatorium Road (which is located across the street). After staff followed up to confirm the request, the requestors clarified that the designation request was intended for the Patterson Building (672 Sanatorium Road). Staff served the owners with Notice of this request on October 17, 2017.

Under the Council approved process for requests to designate, preliminary screening reports are presented to Planning Committee and Council, after which a copy is provided to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee. After consultation with HMHC, the property may be placed on the Register.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

Provincial Policy Statement (2014):

Section 2.6 of the Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) pertains to Cultural Heritage and Archaeology and Subsection 2.6.1 states that "significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved". The recommendations of

SUBJECT: Preliminary Screening for the Request to Designate 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Ward 8) (PED18001) - Page 5 of 9

this Report will enable the City to better facilitate the conservation of the subject property and, therefore, are consistent with this policy.

Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP):

Volume 1, Section B.3.4 - Cultural Heritage Resources Policies of the UHOP states that the City shall “protect and conserve the tangible cultural heritage resources of the City, including archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes” (B.3.4.2.1(a)), and “identify cultural heritage resources through a continuing process of inventory, survey, and evaluation, as a basis for the wise management of these resources” (B.3.4.2.1(b)). These policies demonstrate Council’s commitment to the identification, protection, and conservation of cultural heritage resources; the recommendations of this Report comply with these policies.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Staff have been in contact with the requesting parties as well as the property owner. Following each of the letters requesting designation, staff have served notice of the request upon the property owner (see Appendix “H” to Report PED18001). Staff were first contacted by phone on June 23, 2017 by Ms. Deborah Clinton, a neighbouring property owner, inquiring about requesting designation for the San House. On June 26, 2017 staff were contacted by phone by Mr. Victor Lee of ATA Architects, inquiring about the status of the property and indicating that the current direction of the property owner is to eventually tear down the San House as part of future development of the lands. Staff have noted to Mr. Lee that discussions have begun on a heritage designation request for the subject property. Subsequently, staff have maintained communication with the requesting parties; with Mr. Lee; and with Ms. Nadine Nock, executive assistant at Columbia International College. Staff have also informed the Ward Councillor of the designation requests through the carbon copy of a letter sent to the property owners (see Appendix “H” to Report PED18001). A copy of this Report will be sent to the property owners as well to the requesting parties.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

Preliminary Evaluation – Ontario Regulation 9 / 06:

In 2006, the Province issued criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The regulation identifies three (3) broad categories of criteria: Design / Physical Value, Historical / Associative Value, and Contextual Value, under which three (3) subsets of criteria are further identified (see Appendix “E” to Report PED18001).

1) Design / Physical Value:

The property known municipally as 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road includes two prominent buildings estimated to be of significant cultural heritage value. The San House (or Residence 37) was built in 1922 as the residence of medical superintendent Dr. John H. Holbrook. The red brick building is an excellent example of Colonial Revival architecture with a high, symmetrical profile, a steeply-pitched side gable roof, and pedimented dormers along the front and rear roof. The building includes a decorative doorway with sidelights, transom, and an early or original door. The entrance is covered by a columned portico. The building's windows have all been replaced but are punctuated by stone sills and brick lintels with stone keystones. The building's slate roof material may also be original to the home (see Appendix "C" to Report PED18001 for photographs of the building). One historical account indicates that the San House was "finished in quarter-cut oak, a gift of Guy Long of the Long Lumber Company" (Ralph Wilson, *Chedoke: More Than a Sanatorium*, 2006).

The Patterson Building was built in 1932 and is a reserved example of Collegiate Gothic architecture (1890-1940). The brick building has long, rectangular, and balanced massing. The front façade has two large projecting pedimented sections capped with decorative stone niches at the apexes. The central entrance is projected and features attached flanking pilasters and an attractive stone hood moulding surrounding the doorway. The Patterson Building includes a modern glass addition on the south end and a less contemporary addition at the rear. The rear of the building features a simple brick face with stone sills, soldier course brick lintels, and stone stringcourses running the length of the wall. The building includes modern windows throughout (see Appendix "C" to Report PED18001 for photographs of the building).

2) Historical / Associative Value:

The property is included in the former Mountain Sanatorium Cultural Heritage Landscape. The property has a lengthy institutional history as hospital lands. The former sanatorium was a treatment centre for patients with tuberculosis during the 20th century. The San House is associated with Dr. John Howard Holbrook, medical superintendent from 1908-1945. As both a resident and superintendent, Dr. Holbrook was pivotal in the sanatorium's eminence as an expansive treatment centre for tuberculosis and, later, the institution's transition to an emergency hospital in the 1960s. The Patterson Building is named after Thomas Patterson, Hamilton Health Association board member from 1918 to 1928. The building's Collegiate Gothic architecture parallels other buildings that form a part of the heritage landscape, including the Southam Pavilion, Wilcox Pavilion, and Evel Pavilion each located on adjacent property. The Patterson Building housed resident nurses until 1975 when it was renovated for office space. Both buildings are directly connected to the history of the lands and form significant elements of the former Mountain Sanatorium Cultural Heritage Landscape.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

3) Contextual Value:

The property is a part of the former Mountain Sanatorium (and later Chedoke Hospital Sanatorium) lands. The Patterson Building and the San House each contribute to the context of this campus landscape and stand as tangible features of the landscape's historical narrative. The property is located adjacent to other former sanatorium properties located within the area. The property includes an expansive lawn with numerous mature trees, pointing to the site's former pastoral character.

Conclusion:

Staff concludes that the property known municipally as 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, is of sufficient cultural heritage value to warrant further research and assessment of the property for potential designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Work Plan Priority:

The Council approved Designation Process provides for the prioritization of detailed research and assessment work. Within the annual work plan, Planning staff can typically process three (3) to four (4) properties through the designation process. These priorities generally fall within the following time frames: high-priority (0-1 years), medium priority (2-3 years), and low priority (4+ years). The current work plan extends to the year 2034 and contains seventy-three (73) properties pending review for designation.

Work plan priorities are assigned based on a number of factors, including:

- Heritage value associated with the property;
- Risk to the property with respect to demolition or removal;
- Current level of property maintenance;
- Funding eligibility;
- City ownership of the property; and,
- Work plan / staff resources.

Staff are recommending that the subject property be assigned as a high priority designation for completion in 2018 (see Appendix "G" to Report PED18001), based on the lack of protections in place and the possible demolition of the San House. The further research and assessment work will provide Council with adequate information upon which to base a decision regarding designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The currently approved work plan priorities are contained in Appendix "F" to Report PED18001. At the time of preparing this Report, the City has not received any applications for the demolition of the subject property. However, the building has been vacant. Given the property's vulnerable state due to it being vacant, staff recommend

that Council require that, following its addition to the Register, any Notice of Intention to Demolish the building on the subject property include a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment to protect the City's interest in the building, in the interim period before a Cultural Heritage Assessment can be prepared (see recommendation (d) to Report PED18001).

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Direct Staff Not to Carry Out a Cultural Heritage Assessment

Council could direct staff not to carry out a Cultural Heritage Assessment. This alternative would be contrary to the Council-approved Designation Process (see Appendix "D" to Report PED18001) for considering requests for designation. The Designation Process anticipates that, when legitimate requests for designation are received, a Cultural Heritage Assessment will be completed so that Council can then consider designation with all of the pertinent information before it. As such, staff do not support this recommendation.

2. Assign Different Work Plan Priority

Council may assign a different work plan priority for the Cultural Heritage Assessment than recommended by staff. Given the consideration of all the factors noted in the Analysis and Rationale for Recommendation section of this Report, staff are of the opinion that the recommended work plan priority is warranted. As such, staff do not support this recommendation.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

Culture and Diversity

Hamilton is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

- Appendix "A": Location Map
- Appendix "B": Designation Requests for 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton
- Appendix "C": Historical and Contemporary Photographs
- Appendix "D": Council-Approved Designation Process

SUBJECT: Preliminary Screening for the Request to Designate 650 and 672 Sanatorium Road, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Ward 8) (PED18001) - Page 9 of 9

- Appendix “E”: Ontario Regulation 9 / 06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest
- Appendix “F”: Staff Work Plan for Designation of Property Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as Amended by A Council Motion on June 14, 2017)
- Appendix “G”: Staff Work Plan for Designation of Property Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (as Amended by Report PED18001)
- Appendix “H” Letters to Property Owner

JP/sd

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.