



# INFORMATION REPORT

<b>TO:</b>	Chair and Members Audit, Finance and Administration Committee
<b>COMMITTEE DATE:</b>	March 26, 2018
<b>SUBJECT/REPORT NO:</b>	Response to Mr. Shekar Chandrashekar, Respecting a Freedom of Information Request to Access to Police Services Accounting Records (FCS18030) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item)
<b>WARD(S) AFFECTED:</b>	City Wide
<b>PREPARED BY:</b>	Rick Male (905)546-2424 Ext. 4157
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Mike Zegarac General Manager Finance and Corporate Services Department
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	

## Council Direction:

Council approved the following recommendation:

**“That staff be directed to report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee addressing Mr. Chandrashekar’s concerns and outline next steps that may be required in addressing them.”**

## Information:

**Mr. Chandrashekar’s concerns can be broken down into two components. The first is concerns related to Hamilton Police Services (HPS) and the second part is concerns related to the City of Hamilton (City). The following are staff responses to the concerns raised. The HPS issues were shared with HPS staff and where a response is provided it was provided by HPS staff.**

---

*OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.*

*OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.*

*OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.*

**Hamilton Police Services**

1. The Municipal contribution on the HPS Schedule of Operations is wrong:

The City's Internal Auditor reviewed this claim and determined that the Municipal contribution on the Schedule of Operations was correct and in accordance with reporting requirements of the Public Sector Accounting Board (see Appendix "A" to Report FCS18030)

2. Pan Am Games Claim:

The City's Internal Auditor reviewed this assertion and determined that the correct amount was claimed and reimbursed. The claim was audited by PricewaterhouseCoopers, who were engaged by the Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services to audit the claims. (see Appendix "A" to Report FCS18030)

3. HPS budgeted salary contingency exceeded the settlement by \$3 million:

The City's external auditor, KPMG, audited the Schedule of Operations and reviewed the budget for salary contingency and the contract settlement retro payments and provided an unqualified opinion of no errors or misstatement.

4. HPS pre-planned excess budgeting for the salary settlement and Pan Am reimbursement to provide financing for the forensic building:

This is Mr. Chandrashekar's personal opinion and no question was posed.

5. Employment and retirement benefits for Police Services staff are excessive:

This is Mr. Chandrasekhar's personal opinion; benefits provided are part of a collective agreement or employment contract.

6. A HPS employee retired and purchased their HPS provided vehicle and amount and details not disclosed:

This is a statement by Mr. Chandrasekhar and no question was posed.

**SUBJECT: Respond to Mr. Shekar Chandrashekar, Respecting a Freedom of Information Request to Access to Police Services Accounting Records (FCS18030) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) - Page 3 of 5**

---

7. Former Chief allowed to keep cell phone and computer with confidential data on them:

This is a statement by Mr. Chandrasekhar and no question was posed.

8. There are vast differences in employment contracts for HPS Chief and Deputies and those of Fire Chief and Deputies:

This is Mr. Chandrashekar's personal opinion and no question was posed.

9. HPS Chief and Deputies get vehicle and car allowance and they are the only ones who do:

This pertains to former Chief and Deputies and these contracts have ended.

10. HPS staff receive two additional weeks of vacation at retirement and no other Police Services or Municipality provides this benefit:

This entitlement is contained in the collective agreements.

11. HPS does not provide the Board a detailed line item budget with prior years actuals:

This is a statement by Mr. Chandrasekhar and no question was posed.

12. Mr. Chandrashekar said he can reduce Police budget by \$2million:

This is Mr. Chandrashekar's personal opinion and no details were provided on how this would be obtained.

13. Two past funerals cost HPS \$375,000 – how were they financed without adjusting budget and reducing service:

No details were provided as to which funerals this was in reference to. Mr. Chandrashekar should make a formal request for information (FOI) to HPS for information he is specifically seeking.

14. Composition of HPS Board needs to be reviewed:

This is Mr. Chandrashekar's personal opinion, no staff response

**SUBJECT: Respond to Mr. Shekar Chandrashekar, Respecting a Freedom of Information Request to Access to Police Services Accounting Records (FCS18030) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) - Page 4 of 5**

---

15. Employment Contracts for HPS Chief and Deputies should be the responsibility of the City of Hamilton Human Resources not Legal Counsel who reports to the Chief:

This is Mr. Chandrashekar's personal opinion, no staff response

**City of Hamilton**

1. FOI request for Police accounting transactions should come from the City not Police:

The Information Privacy Commissioner has ruled that this information is the property of HPS and should come from HPS, not the City of Hamilton.

2. There were errors on the City's remuneration and Expenses Report:

Mr. Chandrashekar submitted a FOI request to HPS seeking details of Board member expenses. HPS asked the Manager of Accounts Payable, Account Receivable and Business Application Support, for information regarding conference expenses which was then provided to Mr. Chandrashekar. The amounts provided did not include airfares for Mrs. Madeleine Levy and Ms. Nancy Di Gregorio, as these were paid via credit card and not reimbursed through the submission of the travel expense form and receipts. Instead the airfares were submitted as part of monthly expenses and reimbursed through payroll. These amounts were captured and correctly reported on the Remuneration and Expenses report (all expenses including conferences and mileage are combined and shown as expenses on this report).

3. Finance staff didn't submit claim for \$90,000 of funeral expenses:

Mr. Chandrashekar did not provide details as to which funeral this was in reference to. Staff were not able to find information pertaining to this assertion. The staff member Mr. Chandrashekar said made the statement no longer works at the City.

4. Chief and Deputies provided car and car allowance, Mr, Chandrashekar claims the City absorbed these costs:

These costs are taxable benefits and were charged through Payroll to HPS salary/benefit accounts. The City does not absorb these costs.

**SUBJECT: Respond to Mr. Shekar Chandrashekar, Respecting a Freedom of Information Request to Access to Police Services Accounting Records (FCS18030) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) - Page 5 of 5**

---

5. The City no longer publishes detailed line budget, why not?

City Council approved revisions to the budget process, moving to service level performance measures and multi-year budgeting.

6. Why does the City need 19 communication officers?

Staff from the City Manager's office has had numerous discussions with Mr. Chandrashekar in person, via phone and e-mail, explaining the duties of the communication officers and the communication officer staffing level at the City and other Municipalities.

7. Why did the City hire external for Manager of Accounting Services when there were qualified internal candidates and it was appropriate to go internal?

This is Mr. Chandrashekar's personal opinion, no response provided

8. Human Resources should be working closely with senior management on hiring:

All hiring for the City of Hamilton is done through and must be approved by Human Resources.

No further action is required to address the concerns raised by Mr. Chandrashekar.

### **Appendices and Schedules Attached**

Appendix "A" to Report FCS18030– Issues Identified by Shekar Chandrashekar – City Manager's Office - Audit Services, City of Hamilton

RM/dw