



CITY OF HAMILTON
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
 Planning Division

TO:	Chair and Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	April 19, 2018
SUBJECT / REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (Ward 12) (PED18094)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 12
PREPARED BY:	Jeremy Parsons (905) 546-2424 Ext. 1214
SUBMITTED BY:	Steve Robichaud Director of Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That the designation of 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster, shown in Appendix “A” to Report PED18094, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, be approved;
- (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix “B” to PED18094, be approved;
- (c) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix “C” to Report PED18094.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The subject property is located at 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster within part of Lot 52, Concession 3 within the former Township of Ancaster. The property is a 0.67 acres parcel of land that contains a one and a half storey single detached stone dwelling built ca. 1854-1858 (known as the Lampman House) and a one and a half storey detached garage. The subject property is located on the north side of Garner Road East, between Raymond Road and Springbrook Avenue (see Appendix “A” to Report PED18094).

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Ward 12) (PED18094) - Page 2 of 11

The property is listed on the City's Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and / or Historical Interest and identified as Site Specific Policy – Area A in the Meadowlands Neighbourhood IV Secondary Plan, which requires retention of the Lampman House.

An application for a Demolition Permit was submitted to the City on March 9, 2018 for the Lampman House and associated detached garage and at the time of preparation of the staff report, the application for a Demolition Permit was still under review. The property's current status as an inventoried property does not provide any protection from demolition of the heritage resource.

Based on the preliminary assessment conducted by staff and the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) submitted by Detritus Consulting Limited in 2014, staff are of the opinion that the subject property contains sufficient cultural heritage value to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff are recommending that the subject property be designated to provide long term protection to the heritage resource.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 10

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: Not applicable.

Staffing: Not applicable.

Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and heard before the Conservation Review Board, prior to further consideration by Council of the designation By-law.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the Act.

Section 30 of the Act affirms that if a notice of intention to designate (NOID) a property is issued by Council, under Section 29, then the Demolition Permit in review would be voided as of the day the NOID is given.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Section 30 of the Act also affirms that the Heritage Permit process (as outlined in Sections 33 and 34) becomes in force and effect as of the day the NOID is given, requiring Council (or delegate) approval for any modifications that is deemed to be likely to alter the heritage attributes.

Designation does not restrict the use of a property, prohibit alterations or additions, or restrict the sale of a property. The City of Hamilton also provides heritage grants and loan programs to assist in the continuing conservation of properties, once they are designated.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Historical records indicate that the German-born Lampman family arrived in New York State in 1750, having left Stockheim, Germany. Frederick Lampman (1722-1789) is noted as serving as a sergeant in the Halenbeck Company of the New York Militia during the French and Indian War (1754-1763). Loyal to the British Crown during the American Revolutionary War (1775-1783), the Lampmans feared persecution from American Patriots and subsequently immigrated to British Canada in 1784. Frederick, his wife Katrina (1727-1799) and their adult children initially settled in Stamford Township, Welland County.

Their son Matthias (1761-1830) squatted on 200 acres at Lot 52, Concession 3, Township of Ancaster, before being allotted a Crown Land Grant for the land around 1792-1793. Matthias married Eve Bowman in 1777 and together had seven children. A research report conducted by Doreen Book and Dan Carty of Ancaster's Local Architectural Conservation Advisory Committee (LACAC) in 1982 notes that after settling the land, Matthias built a substantial log house which may have sat in front of the present stone house at 1021 Garner Road East (see Appendices "D" and "G" to Report PED18094). According to a journal entry held at the Wentworth County Land Registry, Matthias and Eve may have been murdered by aggravated members of a First Nations community in 1830 (see Appendices "G" and "H" to Report PED18094 for more information). The burial places of Matthias and Eve do not appear to be noted in any historical sources.

The fifth of their seven children, John Lampman (1801-1864), is credited with building the stone dwelling sometime between 1854 and 1858. John is noted in the Detritus report as possibly having been a veteran of the War of 1812, although he would have been only 13 at the end of the conflict (see Appendix "H" to Report PED18094). John and his wife had twelve children and died in 1864.

The Lampmans were active members of the New Connection / Connexion Methodist sect, a Protestant nonconformist tradition which seceded from the Wesleyan Methodist Church. One historical source claims that the New Connexion sect held its first meeting

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Ward 12) (PED18094) - Page 4 of 11

in Canada in the Lampman House (Ancaster Township Historical Society, *Ancaster: A Pictorial History*, 2001). The New Connection sect was amalgamated into the Methodist Church of Canada in 1874 and later the United Church of Canada in 1925.

When John Lampman built the house in the 1850s, it is noted that he made a series of design accommodations to allow for the hosting of gatherings and funerals within the building. The front hall, doorway, and upper room were made wide to allow for the passage of coffins and pallbearers. The stairs, which may have been altered since original construction, are noted as having been built straight for the same purpose. A large room on the upper floor was reputedly used for church services (see Appendix “G” to Report PED18094).

Garner Road (previously known as Highway No. 53) was once a unique cultural heritage landscape of localized religious settlement. The 7 km stretch of road between Shaver Road and Glancaster Road was previously known as “Methodist Row” as a result of the location of numerous Methodist churches and settlers with active religious affiliations. There were a series of home churches as well as established churches on the road, including: Bowman United Church, Bethesda United Church, the White Brick Church (non-active), and Garner’s Corners Church (demolished) (Jim Green, “Bowman United Church Cemetery,” in *A Grave Matter: Cemeteries of Ancaster*, 2006).

The land title search by Book and Carty notes that Matthias Lampman divided the 200 acres in half and sold the southerly 100 acre parcel to his son John in 1830. After John’s death in 1864, the estate was split in half again and split between his eldest son Peter and the surviving children. In 1947, it appears that a 4.5 acre parcel on which the stone house sat was severed from the 50 acre lot. The remainder of the 45.5 acre parcel was sold to the Director of the *Veterans Land Act* for a total of \$6,000, presumably retained for potential post-war veteran housing. The Lampman House currently sits on a 0.67 acre lot.

The property is listed on the City’s Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and / or Historical Interest, having been originally surveyed by Ancaster’s Local Architectural Conservation Advisory Committee (LACAC) in 1982 (see Appendix “G” to Report PED18094).

The subject property was later identified in advance of the development of surrounding lands within the Background Report: Meadowlands Neighbourhoods III, IV, and V, Class Environmental Assessment Master Plan (2000).

In 2004, the Secondary Plan for the Meadowlands Neighbourhood IV was completed by City staff and incorporated recommendations found within the Background Report. Enacting By-law No. 04-035 amended the former Town of Ancaster Official Plan (OPA 98) to add the Meadowlands Neighbourhood IV Secondary Plan, including “Special

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12) (PED18094) - Page 5 of 11

Policy Area A” which mandates the preservation of the existing dwelling at 1021 Garner Road East. In 2016, a City Wide Housekeeping Amendment (OPA 64) (By-law No. 16-256) modified this special policy within the Meadowlands Neighbourhood IV Secondary Plan, eliminating a repetitive sentence while maintaining the direction of the policy (see Appendices “E” and “F” to Report PED18094).

In June, 2014, the City of Hamilton received a Formal Consultation application for the development of the adjacent greenfield lands located at 1001, 1009, and 1035 Garner Road East (FC-14-033). Cultural Heritage staff required the submission of a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) in order to assess the impacts of the development of the adjacent lands on the subject property.

In November, 2014, the City received a completed CHIA which assessed the cultural heritage value of the subject property and provided recommendations to mitigate the impact of adjacent development, including providing adequate landscape buffering to screen proposed buildings and facilitate design that is compatible with the historic resource (see Appendix “H” to Report PED18094).

In February, 2015, the City received formal applications for an Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) Amendment, Zoning By-law Amendment, and Draft Plan of Subdivision for the lands located at 1001, 1009, and 1035 Garner Road East (UHOPA-15-001, ZAC-15-003, 25T-201501). As part of comments on this application, Cultural Heritage staff required revisions and re-submission of the CHIA report to further address impacts of the adjacent development on the subject property.

On April 8, 2015, the CHIA report was reviewed by the Policy and Design Working Group of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee. The Working Group offered the following recommendations to be considered by the applicant and the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee:

- “That the three storey dwellings at 1001, 1009, and 1035 Garner Road East be placed to the rear of the property;
- That the applicant consider revising the location of the proposed parking area at 1001, 1009, and 1035 Garner Road East, to another on site location; and,
- That 1021 Garner Road East be added to the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.”

On June 4, 2015, the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee recommended that the subject property be added to the City’s Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (Register), as per the recommendations made by the Policy and Design Working Group (Item 5, Report 15-005).

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Ward 12) (PED18094) - Page 6 of 11

On June 16, 2015, the Planning Committee deferred the recommendation to add the property to the Register to allow the Ward Councillor and staff more time to consult with the property owner (Report 15-010). This item was not immediately acted upon and was transferred to the Planning Committee's Outstanding Business List.

On September 16, 2016, the City of Hamilton received a Preliminary Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment for the Ancaster Elevated Water Reservoir Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (Archaeological Services Inc.). The Report identified the subject property, included in the City's Inventory, as a built heritage resource with historical, contextual, and design features (see Appendix "I" to Report PED18094).

On March 9, 2018, Building Division staff received a Demolition Permit Application for the stone dwelling and detached garage on the subject property. As of the time of preparation of the staff report, this application is currently in review by the Building Division.

On March 16, 2018, Planning staff met with the property owner to discuss the Demolition Permit and plans for the property. Staff were informed that the owner was intending to sell the lands for future development but was open to retaining the Lampman House and reintegrating it into redevelopment plans.

On March 21, 2018, Planning staff hosted a second meeting with the property owner and a prospective buyer to discuss support for reintegrating the Lampman House into future development plans.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

Provincial Policy Statement:

Section 2.6 of the Provincial Policy Statement pertains to Cultural Heritage and Archaeology. Sub-section 2.6.1 states that "significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved".

The recommendations of this Report are consistent with this policy.

Urban Hamilton Official Plan:

Volume 1, Section B.3.4 - Cultural Heritage Resources Policies of the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) states that the City shall "protect and conserve the tangible cultural heritage resources of the City, including archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes" (B.3.4.2.1(a)), and "identify cultural heritage resources through a continuing process of inventory, survey, and evaluation, as a basis for the wise management of these resources" (B.3.4.2.1(b)). The policies

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Ward 12) (PED18094) - Page 7 of 11

also provide that the “City may, by By-law, designate individual and groups of properties of cultural heritage value under Parts IV and V, respectively, of the *Ontario Heritage Act*” (B.3.4.2.3).

The recommendations of this Report comply with these policies.

Volume 2, Section B 2.6.8 – Ancaster Secondary Plans, Area and Site Specific Policies of the UHOP outlines the City’s direction to retain the dwelling (see Appendices “E” and “F” of Report PED18094 for more information):

“B.2.6.8.1 For the lands located at No. 1021 Garner Road East, and identified on Map B.2.-1 –Meadowlands Neighbourhood IV – Land Use Plan as Site Specific Policy – Area A, the following shall apply:

- a) To preserve and maintain the historic / architectural significance of this dwelling, any future development of these lands shall incorporate the existing single detached dwelling which is listed on the City’s Inventory as potentially being of historically / architectural significance. (OPA 64)”

The recommendations of this Report comply with this policy.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Staff have set up a meeting with the property owner on April 10, 2018, which is occurring after the writing of this Report. Staff have also notified the Ward Councillor of the recommendations of this Report. As of the writing of this Report, staff have not received any concerns from the Ward Councillor with respect to the staff recommendation.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of cultural resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality is enabled to manage alterations to the property through the Heritage Permit process, and to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained through the provision of financial assistance programs and the enforcement of Property Standards By-laws. The evaluation of the cultural heritage value of the subject property has been guided by the research and assessment carried out through the CHIA report completed in 2014, attached as Appendix “H” to Report PED18064.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Ontario Regulation 9 / 06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest:

Section 29 (1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets the criteria prescribed by provincial regulation. In 2006, the Province issued Ontario Regulation 9 / 06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. According to Sub-section 1(2) of Ontario Regulation 9 / 06, a property may be designated under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* where it meets one or more of the identified criteria. Ontario Regulation 9 / 06 identifies criteria in three broad categories: Design / Physical Value; Historical / Associative Value; and, Contextual Value.

As outlined below, based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation and the evaluation conducted by Detritus Consulting Ltd. in the CHIA attached as Appendix "H" to Report PED18094, the subject property is identified as satisfying four of the nine criteria contained in Ontario Regulation 9 / 06 in all three categories. Staff note that this evaluation was based on a review of the exterior of the property from the public right-of-way as well as historical research and photographs. It would be reasonable to assume that further cultural heritage evaluation of the interior of the heritage resource could reveal that the property meets more criteria and / or identifies more heritage attributes.

1. Design / Physical Value:

- i. The property is a representative example of an architectural style and a unique construction method.

The Lampman House is a representative example of the modest architecture that Loyalist settlers employed during the early to mid-19th century. The stone dwelling was built in the vernacular application of the Neo-Classical style that was fairly common throughout the region at the time. The form continues the symmetry, simplicity, and formality of the Georgian tradition. Stone dwellings of this type and quality are increasingly underrepresented in Hamilton. The unique design modifications made to the original construction of the building to accommodate religious life within the New Connexion Methodist sect are distinctive and unusual.

The Lampman House is built with rubble stone material and features cut stone quoins, stone voussoirs, and a decorative entrance with sidelights and a transom (original features have been altered). A number of other unsympathetic modifications include: the removal of easterly chimney, the attachment of the modern pedimented portico, and the installation of a large modern rear addition.

- ii. The Property does not appear to display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- iii. The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

2. Historical / Associative Value:

- i. The property does have direct associations with a group, organization or institution that are significant to the community.

The property has direct associations with the Lampman family, a group of early European settlers who contributed to the development of rural Ancaster and the formation of the New Connexion Order in Canada.

- ii. The subject property does have the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.

The property was settled and occupied by the Lampman family for over 100 years and may have contained other structures on site, including an early log home built by Matthias Lampman. Given that the Lampman House doubled as a gathering place for early adherents to the New Connexion sect, the building also has the potential to yield further information on this faith tradition. Staff did not conduct an interior evaluation of the house and, as such, are unable to determine which original features of significance remain.

- iii. The property is not known to reflect the work and ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.

The designer of the Lampman House is assumed to have been former property owner John Lampman (1801-1864), not a well-known architect or designer.

3. Contextual Value:

- i. The property is not important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area.

The character of Garner Road has changed extensively over recent years as a result of extensive low-density residential development. As such, the rural context in which the Lampman House originally sat has gradually been erased. Although Garner Road still contains a number of rural churches and maintains agricultural uses to the south, the house is currently surrounded on three sides by the Garner Town Estates development. The house is no longer associated with agricultural fields or agricultural outbuildings.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

- ii. The property is historically linked to its surroundings.

The property contains an historic stone dwelling that has been a part of the rural landscape along Garner Road for at least 160 years. The Lampman House was purposed towards use for church and funeral services for local adherents of a small Protestant religious sect unique in Canada. The building is located along a section of Garner Road formerly referred to as “Methodist Row” because of the number of house and purpose-built churches. Historically, the Lampman House was also once located adjacent to a frame house built by Peter Lampman in 1896. This Gothic Revival structure, located at 1061 Garner Road East, was demolished sometime after 1982.

- iii. The property is not considered a landmark.

Although the Lampman House is admired by locals and passersby, it is not considered to be a landmark that defines the area or the region.

Conclusion:

Based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation and the evaluation conducted by Detritus Consulting Ltd. in the CHIA attached as Appendix “H” to Report PED18094, staff determine that the subject property meets four of the nine criteria set out in Ontario Regulation 9 / 06. As such, staff are of the opinion that the Lampman House located at 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster is of cultural heritage value, sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Accordingly, staff recommends designating the subject property according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and the Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix “B” to Report PED18094 and the draft Notice of Intention to Designate attached as Appendix “C” to Report PED18094.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may consider two alternatives: agree to designate or decline to designate the property.

Decline to Designate:

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to ensure long-term, legal protection to this significant heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations, new construction and demolition), and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing provincial and municipal policies, including Site Specific Policy – Area A (see Appendices “E” and “F” to Report PED18094).

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's heritage grant and loan programs. Designation does not restrict the use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or affect its resale value.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Clean and Green

Hamilton is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

Culture and Diversity

Hamilton is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

- Appendix "A": Location Map
- Appendix "B": Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Designation of Heritage Attributes
- Appendix "C": Notice of Intention to Designate
- Appendix "D": Photographs and Figures
- Appendix "E": Excerpt from Site Specific Policy Area A (B.2.6.8.1) within Volume 2, Chapter B – Ancaster Secondary Plans, UHOP
- Appendix "F": Map B.2.6.1 – Meadowlands Neighbourhood IV Land Use Plan, UHOP
- Appendix "G": LACAC Research Report (1982)
- Appendix "H": Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (2014)
- Appendix "I": Excerpt from Preliminary Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment for the Ancaster Elevated Water Reservoir Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (2016)