



Hamilton

**HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE
REPORT 18-004
12:00 p.m.
April 19, 2018
Room 264, 2nd Floor
Hamilton City Hall
71 Main Street West**

Present: Councillor M. Pearson
A. Denham-Robinson (Chair), W. Arndt, D. Beland, G. Carroll,
K. Garay, M. McGaw, T. Ritchie, R. Sinclair and K. Stacey

**Absent with
Regrets:** Councillors A. Johnson and J. Partridge – Personal, C. Dmitry and
T. Wallis

**THE HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE PRESENTS REPORT 18-004
AND RESPECTFULLY RECOMMENDS:**

- 1. Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12) (PED18083) (Item 8.1)**
 - (a) That the property located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster, shown on Appendix "A" to Report PED18083, currently included in the City of Hamilton's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest NOT be designated as a property of cultural value or interest under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act;
 - (b) That the subject property be removed from staff's designation work plan entitled "Requests to Designate Properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act: Priorities (as amended by Council on February 28, 2018)", attached as Appendix "E" to Report PED18083;
 - (c) That the subject property be removed from the City's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest as a non-designated property;
 - (d) That the Documentation and Salvage Report, to be submitted by the applicant, be circulated to Council, to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, and to the Hamilton Public Library's Local History & Archives Department for archival purposes; and

- (e) That Planning staff be directed to explore the potential of having an historical interpretive plaque erected on site detailing the history of the Book family.

2. Recommendation to Designate 111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 4) (PED18088) (Item 8.2)

- (a) That the designation of 111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton (Barton and Kenilworth Reservoirs), shown in Appendix “A” to Report PED18088, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, be approved;
- (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix “A” to Report 18-004, be approved;
- (c) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton (Barton and Kenilworth Reservoirs) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix “C” to Report PED18088;
- (d) That the Public Works Department be directed to report back to Council on the preparation of a combined heritage conservation plan and management plan in consultation with Development Planning, Heritage and Design, Heritage Resource Management, and Municipal Law Enforcement staff, to guide the short to long term protection and preferred conservation treatment of the east portion of the property and to explore options for the future use of the property; and
- (e) That Council direct the Tourism and Culture Division of the Planning and Economic Department to include the Barton Reservoir, the Pipeline Trail and the Hamilton Waterworks National Historic Site of Canada in the Cultural Heritage Landscape Assessment Study.

3. Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 3) (PED18089) (Item 8.3)

That Report PED18089 respecting a Recommendation to Designate 378 Main Street East, Hamilton under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 3), be DEFERRED to the May 10, 2018 meeting, to allow for the representative of the property to attend the discussion of the report.

4. **Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12) (PED18094) (Item 8.4)**
- (a) That the designation of 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster, shown in Appendix “A” to Report PED18094, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be approved;
 - (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix “B” to Report 18-004, be approved;
 - (c) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix “C” to Report PED18094.

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk advised the Committee of the following changes to the agenda:

1. ADDED DELEGATION REQUESTS

- 4.1 Scott and Laurel Gallea, respecting Item 8.4, Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (for today’s meeting)
- 4.2 Jane Mulkewich, respecting Item 8.1, a Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff’s Work Plan for Designation (for today’s meeting)

Item 7.1, St. Clair Boulevard Heritage Conservation District Review – Meeting No.1 with the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, Item 8.1, Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff’s Work Plan for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12) (PED18083), and Item 8.4, Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster(Lampman House) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12)(PED18094), were moved up the agenda after Delegation Requests, to accommodate the delegates and presenters.

The Agenda for the April 19, 2018 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee was approved, as amended.

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

None.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)

(i) March 15, 2018 (Item 3.1)

The Minutes of the March 15, 2018 meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee were approved, as presented.

(d) DELEGATION REQUEST (Item 4)

(i) Scott and Laurel Gallea, respecting Item 8.4, Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (for today's meeting) (Added Item 4.1)

The delegation request from Scott and Laurel Gallea, respecting Item 8.4, Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster, was approved, for today's meeting.

(ii) Jane Mulkewich, respecting Item 8.1, a Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation (for today's meeting) (Added Item 4.2)

The delegation request from Jane Mulkewich, respecting Item 8.1, a Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation, was approved, for today's meeting.

(e) CONSENT ITEM (Item 5)

(i) Information Report Regarding Discovery of Time Capsule at J.L. Grightmire Arena, Dundas (Ward 13) (PED18059) (Item 5.1)

Jeremy Parsons, Cultural Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee with an overview of Report PED18059, respecting an Information Report Regarding Discovery of Time Capsule at J.L. Grightmire Arena, Dundas, with the aid of several photographic images. The images have been included in the official record and are available at www.hamilton.ca.

Report PED18059, respecting the Discovery of Time Capsule at J.L. Grightmire Arena, Dundas, was received.

(f) DELEGATIONS (Item 6)

(i) Scott and Laurel Gallea, respecting Item 8.4, Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Added Item 6.1)

Scott Gallea addressed the Committee respecting Item 8.4, Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster. He addressed the Committee with his plans for lifting and rebuilding the basement of the house located at 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster.

The delegation from Scott Gallea respecting Item 8.4, Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster, was received.

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Items 4 and (h)(ii)

(ii) Jane Mulkewich, respecting Item 8.1, a Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation (Added Item 6.2)

Jane Mulkewich addressed the Committee with a brief history of the property located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster.

The delegation from Jane Mulkewich, respecting Item 8.1, a Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation, was received.

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Items 1 and (h)(i)

(g) STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 7)

(i) St. Clair Boulevard Heritage Conservation District Review – Meeting No.1 with the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Chelsey Tyers, Cultural Heritage Planner, distributed copies of a presentation respecting a St. Clair Boulevard Heritage Conservation District Review, and introduced Lashia Jones, Cultural Heritage Specialist, Stantec Consulting Ltd.

Lashia Jones, Cultural Heritage Specialist, Stantec Consulting Ltd., addressed committee with an overview of the St. Clair Boulevard Heritage Conservation District Review, with the aid of a PowerPoint presentation. A copy of the presentation has been included in the official record, and is available at www.hamilton.ca.

The presentation respecting the St. Clair Boulevard Heritage Conservation District Review – Meeting No.1 with the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, was received.

(h) DISCUSSION ITEM (Item 8)

(i) Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12) (PED18083) (Item 8.1)

Jeremy Parsons, Cultural Heritage Planner, distributed copies of a presentation and addressed the Committee respecting Report PED18083, a Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12). The presentation has been included in the official record and are available at www.hamilton.ca.

The presentation respecting Report PED18083, a Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12), was received.

M. McGaw, D. Beland, G. Carroll, and K. Garay requested to be recorded as OPPOSED to the recommendations in Report PED18083, a Recommendation to Remove the Property Located at 167 Book Road East, Ancaster from the Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Staff's Work Plan for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

For disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1.

(ii) Recommendation to Designate 111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 4) (PED18088) (Item 8.2)

Chelsey Tyers, Cultural Heritage Planner, distributed copies of a presentation on Report PED18088 respecting a Recommendation to Designate 111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 4). The presentation has been included in the official record, and available at www.hamilton.ca.

The presentation on Report PED18088 respecting a Recommendation to Designate 111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 4), was received.

For disposition of this matter, refer to Item 2.

(iii) Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12) (PED18094) (Item 8.4)

Jeremy Parsons, Cultural Heritage Planner, distributed copies of a presentation and addressed the Committee with an overview of Report PED18094, respecting a Recommendation to Designate 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 12). A copy of the presentation has been included in the official record, and is available at www.hamilton.ca.

For disposition of this matter, refer to Item 4.

(i) GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 11)

(i) Correspondence from the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport respecting the 2018 Ontario Heritage Conference, in Sault Ste. Marie, June 7 – 9, 2018 (Item 11.1)

The Correspondence from the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport respecting the 2018 Ontario Heritage Conference, in Sault Ste. Marie, June 7 – 9, 2018, was received.

The following members of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee were approved to attend the 2018 Ontario Heritage Conference, in Sault Ste. Marie, June 7 – 9, 2018:

- G. Carroll
- K. Stacey

(ii) Buildings and Landscapes (Item 11.2)

- (a) The property at 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House), was added to the list of Buildings and Landscapes of Interest (YELLOW), and
- (b) M. McGaw will report on 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) when appropriate.

The following updates were received:

**(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes (RED):
(Red = Properties where there is a perceived immediate threat to heritage resources through: demolition; neglect; vacancy; alterations, and/or, redevelopment)**

- (i) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – A. Johnson

No report.

- (ii) Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (R) – M. McGaw

This property will be removed from the list upon Council ratification of the report.

For further disposition, refer to Item 1.

- (iii) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – M. McGaw

No report.

- (iv) Century Manor, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (D) – K. Garay

No report.

- (v) Beach Canal Lighthouse (D) – J. Partridge

No report.

- (vi) 18-22 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) – K. Stacey

No report.

- (vii) 24-28 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) – K. Stacey

No report.

- (viii) 1 St. James Place, Hamilton (D) – K. Stacey

No report.

- (ix) 2 Hatt Street, Dundas – K. Stacey

No report.

- (x) James Street Baptist Church, 98 James Street South, Hamilton (D) – A. Denham-Robinson

No report.

(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Interest (YELLOW):
(Yellow = Properties that are undergoing some type of change, such as a change in ownership or use, but are not perceived as being immediately threatened)

- (i) Delta High School, 1284 Main Street East, Hamilton (D) – D. Beland

No report.

- (ii) St. Giles United Church, 85 Holton Avenue South (L) – D. Beland

No report.

- (iii) 2251 Rymal Road East, Stoney Creek (R) – C. Dimitry

No report.

- (iv) Former Valley City Manufacturing, 64 Hatt Street, Dundas – K. Stacey

No report.

- (v) St. Joseph's Motherhouse, 574 Northcliffe Avenue, Dundas - K. Stacey

No report.

- (vi) Copley Building, 104 King Street West; 56 York Blvd., and 63-76 MacNab Street North – G. Carroll

No report.

- (vii) 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) – M. McGaw

For further disposition, refer to Item 4.

(c) Heritage Properties Update (GREEN):
(Green = Properties whose status is stable)

- (i) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

No report.

- (ii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – K. Garay
Planning Committee – May 1, 2018

K. Garay reported that discussions continue between City staff and the Royal Hamilton Light Infantry (RHLI).

- (iii) Jimmy Thompson Pool, 1099 King Street E., Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

No report.

- (iv) Treble Hall, 4-12 John Street North, Hamilton (R) – T. Ritchie

No report.

- (v) 104 King Street West, Dundas (Former Post Office) – K. Stacey

No report.

**(d) Heritage Properties Update (black):
(Black = Properties that HMHC have no control over and may be demolished)**

- (i) Auchmar Gate House, Claremont Lodge 71 Claremont Drive (R) – K. Garay

Jeremy Parsons reported that staff have been in touch with the property owner regarding a site visit. The Councillor of the ward has been apprised of the current situation. A report on the property is partially completed but other details are currently being explored.

A. Denham-Robinson relinquished the Chair to discuss the next item.

(iii) Information respecting a Workshop on Regenerating Places of Faith coordinated by a partnership between the National Trust for Canada, and Faith and the Common Good (Item 11.3)

A. Denham-Robinson addressed the Committee respecting a Workshop on Regenerating Places of Faith coordinated by a partnership between the National Trust for Canada, and Faith and the Common Good. She is currently working with Jeremy Parsons, Cultural Heritage Planner, regarding the set up on a workshop in the Hamilton area. The workshop would be a partnership with the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee and the National Trust for Canada, and other heritage organizations.

The information respecting a Workshop on Regenerating Places of Faith coordinated by a partnership between the National Trust for Canada, and Faith and the Common Good, was received.

A. Denham-Robinson assumed the Chair.

(j) ADJOURNMENT (Item 12)

There being no further business, the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, be adjourned at 2:18 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alissa Denham-Robinson, Chair
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Loren Kolar
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk

111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton
Barton and Kenilworth Reservoirs

STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST AND DESCRIPTION OF HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The Barton and Kenilworth Reservoirs, at 111 Kenilworth Access in the east end of the City of Hamilton, are situated on a long and narrow 8-hectare terrace below the crest of the Niagara Escarpment, between the former Hamilton and Lake Erie Railway (now the Escarpment Trail) and the Toronto, Hamilton and Buffalo Railway. The property includes mid-to-late 19th century elements associated with the Barton Reservoir, a component of Hamilton's first municipal waterworks, which were superseded in the mid-20th century by the Kenilworth Reservoir and associated structures.

The property that includes the Barton and Kenilworth Reservoirs is of cultural heritage value for its architectural, associative, and contextual elements, and collectively as a cultural heritage landscape. Constructed as a key element of the Hamilton Waterworks between 1856 and 1857, the Barton Reservoir is an 11-million gallon (3,785,412 litre) capacity, stadium-shaped basin lined with coursed limestone rubble and ashlar clay blocks, and supported on three sides by substantial earthworks. Associated with the basin are three (3) cast-iron pipes that empty into the basin, stone and concrete access stairs, cast-iron manhole covers for the valve shafts, and a two-stage standpipe built in ashlar limestone. East of the reservoir was the former Superintendent's Residence and public gardens, which were removed after 1970. To the west is the large and subterranean Kenilworth Reservoir, constructed in 1958, and its associated brick and poured concrete facilities. While the Kenilworth Reservoir is still in use, the Barton Reservoir is no longer operational and is covered in thick vegetation growth.

Barton Reservoir is of cultural heritage value as a component of the Hamilton Waterworks National Historic Site of Canada, the earliest surviving municipal waterworks system in Canada and one designed by Thomas Coltrin Keefer, an influential and highly respected hydraulic engineer recognized as a National Historic Person of Canada. Keefer selected the site for the reservoir and specified its construction in a combination of clay and stone. Under the leadership of Chairman of the Board of Water Commissioners, Adam Brown, the reservoir was completed as part of the larger waterworks infrastructure for an official opening by the Prince of Wales in 1860. Shortly afterward Barton Reservoir was upgraded with a stone standpipe and turbine, and a two-storey Italianate Superintendent's Residence surrounded by public gardens built nearby. Of these later features only the standpipe remains but it is of historical and physical value as a rare and well-preserved example of its type. Construction of the Kenilworth Reservoir in 1958 made the Barton Reservoir obsolete. As a result of the waterworks system's success and by providing water for fire

suppression and disease-free consumption, Hamilton could expand exponentially into its rural countryside. The Kenilworth Reservoir is of associative value for its connection to Hamilton's large and complex urban water supply system, and the continuous use of the property for municipal waterworks for 160 years.

Although now overgrown with vegetation, the Barton Reservoir has a high level of heritage integrity for its physical remains and the visual and historical connections it maintains with other elements of Hamilton Waterworks system, specifically the Pipeline Trail and the Hamilton Waterworks near the Lake Ontario shore. As an element of Hamilton's first municipal waterworks, the Barton Reservoir played a critical role in the City's 19th century expansion and development into one of Ontario's major population and industrial centres. The efficiency of the waterworks system became a source of civic pride for Hamiltonians, as represented by the numerous public fountains including the central Gore Park, and in the beautification of Barton Reservoir as a public park.

Description of Heritage Attributes

The key attributes that support the heritage value of Barton Reservoir include its:

- Large, stadium-shaped reservoir with:
 - Lining of puddled clay, stone chippings, and coursed rubble and clay blocks;
 - Large cast iron pipes, one supported on a brick pad;
 - Stone and concreted access stairway; and,
 - Large earthen embankment.
- Two-stage standpipe with:
 - Slanted walls constructed in large ashlar rusticated stone with cyclopean (rock or quarry faced) rustication and tooled and chamfered margins chiselled margins;
 - Intact riveted iron casing with guide wires; and,
 - Access ladder and railing made using iron pipe and elbows.
- Features associated with the reservoir including the cast iron valve manhole covers, hydrant, and wide drainage ditch.
- Archaeological remains of the Superintendent's Residence complex and Reservoir Park.
- Expansive and clear views of the City of Hamilton, the Pipeline Trail, the Hamilton Waterworks National Historic Site, and Lake Ontario.

The key attributes that support the heritage value of Kenilworth Reservoir include its:

- Brick pumphouse with metal strip art installation;
- Brick reservoir access structure with Roman relieving arches; and,
- Expansive and clear views of the City of Hamilton.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House)

Description of Historic Place

The Lampman House is a one and a half storey stone dwelling that was constructed ca. 1854-1858 in the Neo-Classical architectural style. The dwelling is located along Garner Road within the original settlement lands of the Lampman family (Lot 52, Concession 3, Ancaster Township). The property is addressed as 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster and is located on the north side of Garner Road East, between Raymond Road and Springbrook Avenue.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The property at 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster has cultural heritage value as a stone dwelling built between 1854-1858 by John Lampman and as representative example of Neo-Classical architecture. The Lampman House includes decorative quoins, voussoirs, sidelights, and a transom window. The modest, symmetrical plan was typical of Loyalist architecture in Ontario at the time.

The Lampman family were German-American Loyalists who settled in British Canada following the culmination of the American Revolutionary War. John Lampman and his family were formational members of the establishment of the New Connection Methodist sect in Canada, a Protestant denomination which seceded from the Wesleyan Methodist Church. Some sources indicate that the sect's first meeting in Canada was held in the Lampman House.

The property is significant in its historical associations with the Lampman Family, one of the region's earliest settler families and United Empire Loyalists. Contextually, the property was once part of a much larger parcel of land granted to Matthias Lampman in 1792-93. The property is located along Garner Road East, formerly known as "Methodist Row" and is nearby a number of historic churches forming part of this unique cultural landscape of religious settlement.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster that display its cultural heritage value include:

South (Front) Façade:

- Symmetrical three-bay façade profile;
- Limestone rubble walls;

- Sandstone cut quoin corner blocks;
- Roof profile and roofline;
- Westerly chimney;
- Symmetrical windows including sills and stone voussoirs; and,
- Entrance envelope including,
 - o Front door;
 - o Sidelights; and,
 - o Transom window.

West, East, and North (Rear) Elevations:

- Limestone rubble walls;
- Sandstone cut quoin corner blocks;
- Roof profile and roofline;
- All windows, doors, and connections to stone masonry; and,
- Unique sandstone voussoirs.