



CITY OF HAMILTON
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
Planning Division

TO:	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	June 21, 2018
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, Hamilton (Former St. Giles United Church) under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (PED18153) (Ward 3)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 3
PREPARED BY:	Chelsey Tyers (905) 546-2424 Ext.1202
SUBMITTED BY:	Steve Robichaud Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That the designation of 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, Hamilton (former St. Giles United Church), shown in Appendix “A” to Report PED18153, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, be approved;
- (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix “B” to Report PED18153, be approved; and,
- (c) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, Hamilton (former St. Giles United Church) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix “C” to Report PED18153.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The subject property, 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, also known as the former St. Giles United Church is included on the City’s Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and/or Historical Interest. A demolition permit was submitted to the City on April 17, 2018. A Formal Consultation Application was submitted in 2015 which proposed to remove a portion of the church and redevelop the balance of the church

SUBJECT: Designation of 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, Hamilton (Former St. Giles United Church) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED18153) (Ward 3) - Page 2 of 10

with an attached 3-5 storey building consisting of 79 residential units. As of the time of preparation of this Report, no planning approvals (e.g. site plan) have been sought by the owner, nor have any approvals been granted.

In response to the demolition permit application, staff have completed a cultural heritage evaluation of the subject property. It has been determined that the subject property has design/physical value, historical/associative value and contextual value, and meets eight of nine criteria as defined in Ontario Regulation 9/06. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the property under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Staff also note the property's current status on the Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and / or Historical Interest, provides the property with no protection against demolition. As such, the property could be demolished as soon as the demolition permit is issued. If Council approves the Notice of Intention to Designate (see Appendix "C" to Report PED18153) before the building is demolished, the Notice will void the demolition permit.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 9

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: N/A

Staffing: N/A

Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and heard before the Conservation Review Board prior to further consideration by Council of the designation By-law.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the Act.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)). Designation does not restrict the use of a property, prohibit alterations or additions, or restrict the sale of a property. The City of

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Designation of 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, Hamilton (Former St. Giles United Church) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED18153) (Ward 3) - Page 3 of 10

Hamilton also provides heritage grant and loan programs to assist in the continuing conservation of properties, once they are designated.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property, municipally known as 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South (see Appendix “A” to Report PED18153) is known locally as the former St. Giles United Church.

In March, 1907, discussion began about the erection of a Presbyterian Sunday School which would also serve as a church. In the wake of a petition with 116 signatures in May 1907, the Presbytery of Hamilton granted permission to establish a new congregation known as St. Giles Presbyterian Church.

The early congregation met in a tent on the subject property, the first meeting being in June of 1908 conducted by Reverend R.B. Cochrane (see Appendix “D” to Report PED18153). It was also in June, 1908 that the contracts for the erection of the Sunday School were signed.

In November, 1908, the congregation moved into the newly erected Sunday School building and also welcomed Reverend J.B. Paulin who served the church community until 1916 when Reverend W. A. McIlroy took over.

The main portion of the church was constructed in 1912-1913 including the bell tower that was added above the arched entrance on Holton Avenue South and is the majority what exists today (see Appendix “D” to Report PED18153). It was designed by Hamilton architectural firm Stewart & Witton, who are responsible for a number of other significant buildings in Hamilton such as King George School, Central Fire Station (John Street North) and the Herkimer Apartments (at Bay Street South).

The bells in the bell tower are believed to have been donated by the Holton family, for whom Holton Avenue is named, although, based on a review of records, there is some suggestion that it may have been the organ that the Holton family donated rather than the bells. The bells are from the McShame Bell Foundry of Baltimore, Maryland which still exists and has provided bells all across the world since 1856.

In 1925, the Church voted to become part of the newly formed United Church of Canada. While 557 members voted for and 368 members voted against becoming part of the United Church, a rocky period of transition was recorded in the local newspaper. The Hamilton Spectator reported on a number of tense meetings revolving around the transition of the Presbyterian term for elders (for life) and the United Church’s terms for elders (three years). It was during this transition period that the church called for the resignation of Reverend W. A. McIlroy.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Designation of 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, Hamilton (Former St. Giles United Church) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED18153) (Ward 3) - Page 4 of 10

Around 1945, the Church had an addition on the east side of the building constructed as a war memorial to those church members who died in WW2.

In 1958, most of the original Sunday School building with the exception of the arched entrance on Holton was demolished to make way for a new Christian Education Centre (see Appendix “D” to Report PED18153). The 1958 addition was designed by Hamilton architectural firm Bruce Brown & Brisley.

In the 1960s, the St. Giles congregation started making a concerted effort to get involved in the betterment of the local community. These efforts included games nights for all ages, United Church Christian Expo, Festival of Christianity and the Arts, a nursery school for intellectually disabled children, Alcoholics Anonymous, Happy Gang (for physically disabled adults), a drop in centre for sex workers, etc. Of particular note and described below, are the nursery school for intellectually disabled children and the drop in centre for sex workers.

The nursery school started in September 1963 and in November 1965, it received the first licence under the Day Nurseries Branch for a nursery serving children with intellectual disabilities. Operated by the ‘Hamilton and District Association for the Mentally Retarded’ the organization also offered training from St. Giles to McMaster students and parents to help understand their children’s disabilities.

In 2003, in opposition to some neighbours, St. Giles opened its doors to women in the sex trade as part of the Sex Trade Alternative Resources Services (STARS) program. Operated by staff from the Elizabeth Fry Society, the program offered a safe place for women to take a shower, change clothes, make a telephone call, and talk openly with a public health nurse, a legal-aid advisor and a housing support worker.

In 2013, St. Giles United Church congregation amalgamated with Centenary United to form New Vision United Church whose congregation is located in the former Centenary United Church at 23 Main Street East, Hamilton and the building ceased to be used thereafter.

It is estimated that the former St. Giles United Church has been boarded up for at least a year.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

Provincial Policy Statement:

Section 2.6 of the Provincial Policy Statement pertains to Cultural Heritage and Archaeology. Sub-section 2.6.1 states that “significant built heritage resources and

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved”. The recommendations of this Report are consistent with this policy.

Urban Hamilton Official Plan:

Volume 1, Section B.3.4 - Cultural Heritage Resources Policies of the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) states that the City shall “protect and conserve the tangible cultural heritage resources of the City, including archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes” (B.3.4.2.1(a)), and “identify cultural heritage resources through a continuing process of inventory, survey, and evaluation, as a basis for the wise management of these resources” (B.3.4.2.1(b)). The policies also provide that the “City may, by By-law, designate individual and groups of properties of cultural heritage value under Parts IV and V, respectively, of the *Ontario Heritage Act*” (B.3.4.2.3).

The recommendations of this Report comply with these policies.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Pursuant to Sub-section 29 (2) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, Council is required to consult with its Municipal Heritage Committee respecting designation of property under Sub-section (1) of the Act. Given the emergency nature of this recommendation, the recommendations in this Report were not presented to the Inventory and Research Working Group. However, this Report to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee will constitute appropriate consultation with the Municipal Heritage Committee under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Staff advised the Ward Councillor of the recommendation to designate the subject property. As of the writing of this Report, the Councillor has not expressed any concerns.

Staff also advised a representative of the New Vision Church, the current owners, of the recommendation to designate. Furthermore, staff met with a few members of the Church on May 31, 2018 to tour the inside of the building and discuss what led the church to apply for a demolition permit. The members expressed that they have explored a number of options for adaptive reuse of the existing building, but given the condition of the building have been unable to find a developer for such a project. Currently the church is working with a developer who is proposing to demolish the church and build rental apartments.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of cultural resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality is enabled to manage alterations to the property through the Heritage Permit process and to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained through the provision of financial assistance programs and the enforcement of Property Standards By-laws. The evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the subject property has been completed by staff based on a site visit of the exterior conducted on May 18, 2018, another site visit including the interior on May 31, 2018, and available secondary and primary resources, and is outlined below.

Staff do note that there are areas in disrepair including plaster failure and mould due to water penetration (see Appendix “D” to Report PED18153). Staff cannot speak to the extent of repair required to fix these issues, and note that discussion of repairs are appropriate through the Heritage Permit process. It is further noted that if the building were to be designated, there are municipal financial incentives to assist with the costs to repair the building.

Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest:

Section 29 (1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets the criteria prescribed by provincial regulation. In 2006, the Province issued Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. According to Sub-section 1(2) of Ontario Regulation 9/06, a property may be designated under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* where it meets one or more of the identified criteria. Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies criteria in three broad categories: Design/Physical Value, Historical/Associative Value and Contextual Value.

As outlined below, based on staff’s cultural heritage evaluation, the subject property is identified as satisfying eight of the nine criteria contained in Ontario Regulation 9/06 in all three categories. Staff note that this evaluation was based on a review of the exterior of the property and interior of the property on May 31, 2018 as well as historical research and photographs.

1. Design/Physical Value:

- i. The property is a representative example of a Neo-Gothic place of worship. The Neo-Gothic style of architecture is often noted as the architectural expression of Christianity. The gothic pointed windows and the dominating verticality of the structures, were designed to point heavenwards. The former St. Giles United

Church is representative of the Neo-Gothic Style as evidenced by the combination of red-brick and decorative concrete details mimicking stone, large gothic arched windows, the smaller rectangular windows with gothic arches in the frames, the combination of gable rooflines with parapets and battlement parapets, tower feature, and leaded and stained glass in the windows. In the interior of the building, the carved wooden details with trefoil arches, and wooden trusses with intricately carved corbels are reflective of the Neo-Gothic style of architecture.

- ii. The property does display a high degree of craftsmanship, which is apparent in the stained glass windows and woodwork in the interior including the carved corbels, carved features on the pews and balconies.
- iii. The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

2. Historical/Associative Value

- i. The property has direct association with an institution that is significant to a community. The former St. Giles congregation over the years in this location had a significant impact on the local community. The early church congregation was active in the local Presbyterian circle. However, in the 1960s and onwards the church congregation made concerted efforts to get involved in the local community through efforts such as games nights, United Church Christian Expo, Festival of Christianity and the Arts, a nursery school for intellectually disabled children, Alcoholics Anonymous, Happy Gang (for physically disabled adults), a drop in centre for sex workers, etc. The church's level of involvement with each event or organization varied, but most of these organizations were provided space free of charge which suggests the St. Giles congregation was committed to being involved in the local community.
- ii. The subject property does have the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of the local community or culture. The former St. Giles Church congregation was the first in Hamilton to transition to the United Church of Canada and as such, the property has the potential to yield information about the Presbyterian church community and early United Church community. Furthermore, as the building was used extensively by the local community, there may be further information to be yielded about the local community and the organizations that made use of the church facility. As noted previously, staff did not conduct an interior evaluation of the building and, as such, are unable to determine which original interior features of significance remain.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Designation of 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, Hamilton (Former St. Giles United Church) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED18153) (Ward 3) - Page 8 of 10

Also, the WW1 cairn located outside the west side entrance on Holton Avenue South, stands as a tribute to the nine members of the congregation who lost their life in WW1. The addition built c.1945 on the east elevation was constructed as a memorial to those congregation members who lost their life in WW2. As such, there may also be information to be yielded about the local community's contribution to WW1 and WW2.

- iii. The property is known to reflect the works and ideas of architects who are significant to the Hamilton community. The 1912-1913 portion place of worship was designed by Stewart & Witton. Walter Wilson Stewart came to Hamilton in 1885 where he apprenticed with his father's architectural firm. William P. Witton returned to Hamilton in 1895 after training in Chicago. Stewart and Witton formed a partnership in 1904. Together they were responsible for a number of significant buildings in Hamilton such as King George School, Central Fire Station, and Herkimer Apartments.

While the 1958 addition was designed by Bruce Brown & Brisley who have designed over a hundred places of worship, the addition is not considered representative of their work which has remained faithful to the late Gothic style (see Appendix "D" to Report PED18153). As such the 1958 addition is not considered to have sufficient cultural heritage value for inclusion in the designation by-law.

The bells in the bell tower are reflective of the work of the McShame Bell Foundry, a company that has provided bells across the world to places of worship since 1856.

The stained glass window on the front façade is the work of Robert McCausland, completed in 1959. Robert McCausland Limited, based out of Toronto, is a longstanding stained glass company, founded in 1856 and responsible for the designing, producing, restoration and repair of stained glass windows around the world.

3. Contextual Value:

- i. The property is considered important in defining, maintaining and supporting the character of the area. When St. Giles was built there were very few dwellings in the area at the time; dwellings were constructed in the late 1910s through 1930s. Given its imposing stature along Main Street East and Holton Avenue South, the place of worship defines the local community, maintains and supports the character of the area. Furthermore the open space and mature tree on the corner of a Main Street East and Holton Avenue South contribute to the historic character of the area.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Designation of 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South, Hamilton (Former St. Giles United Church) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED18153) (Ward 3) - Page 9 of 10

- ii. The property is historically linked to its surroundings. Located in the heart of the community, the former St. Giles congregation has served the area for a hundred years.
- iii. The property is considered a local landmark.

Given the property's prominent location on the corner of Main Street East and Holton Avenue South, the place of worship stands out as a local landmark due to its architectural aesthetic and its imposing vertically oriented massing.

Conclusion:

Based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation, the subject property meets eight of nine criteria set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06. As such, staff are of the opinion that the former St. Giles United Church located at 679 Main Street East and 85 Holton Avenue South is of cultural heritage value, sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Accordingly, staff recommends designating the subject property according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and the Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED18153 and the draft Notice of Intention to Designate attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED18153.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may consider two alternatives: agree to designate or decline to designate the property.

Decline to Designate:

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to ensure long-term, legal protection to this significant heritage resource. Designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations, new construction and demolition. A demolition permit was received on April 17, 2018 and while the permit has not been issued as of the writing of this Report, declining to designate the property would likely result in demolition of the building.

Furthermore, without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's heritage grant and loan programs. Designation does not restrict the use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or affect its resale value.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Clean and Green

Hamilton is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

Culture and Diversity

Hamilton is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

- Appendix “A”: Location Map
- Appendix “B”: Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Designation of Heritage Attributes
- Appendix “C”: Notice of Intention to Designate
- Appendix “D”: Photographs

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.