



CITY OF HAMILTON
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT
Environmental Services Division

TO:	Chair and Members Public Works Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	July 12, 2018
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial (PW18052) (City Wide)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Jonathan Epp (905) 546-2424 extension 4621
SUBMITTED BY:	Craig Murdoch, B.Sc. Director – Environmental Services Public Works Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That the site selection for the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial be confirmed at Gage Park (1000 Main Street East, Ward 3, Hamilton) as shown in Appendix “B” attached to Report PW18052, and staff continue with the detailed design of the memorial project;
- (b) That the capital and operating costs associated with the construction and maintenance of the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial be referred to the 2019 Capital Budget process for consideration;

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On January 18, 2017, Item 19 of General Issues Committee Minutes 17-001 was approved, as shown in Appendix “A” attached to Report PW18052.

The purpose of this report is to satisfy Items a, c, and d of the direction as shown in Appendix “A” attached to Report PW18052, and to seek authorization to proceed with further consultation and design toward the installation of the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial at the preferred location at Gage Park.

Through preliminary consultation with the Hamilton Professional Fire Fighters Association (HPFFA) and a subsequent site-selection study, staff determined the most appropriate location for the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial to be the northeast corner of Gage Park, as shown in Appendix “B” attached to Report PW18052. Consultation with

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

the HPFFA confirmed that the memorial will incorporate a public art component such as a commemorative statue, the details of which are to be determined through the City of Hamilton's Public Art Call for Artists process. Representation from the HPFFA, as well as the Friends of the Gage, will be sought for input during this Public Art selection procedure, in addition to the city-wide consultation that is part of the Call for Artists process.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 5

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: The recommendation of Report PW18052 directs staff to include the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial project in the 2019 Capital Budget process for consideration. Therefore, there are no financial implications of Report PW18052. The estimated capital costs for construction of the concept shown in Appendix "B" attached to Report PW18052 is \$900,000; the operating impact from the construction of the memorial will be shown on the detail sheet in the 2019 Capital Budget.

Staffing: There are no staffing impacts from the recommendations of Report PW18052.

Legal: There are no legal implications from the recommendations of Report PW18052.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

On January 18, 2017, Item 19 of the General Issues Committee Minutes 17-001 was approved, which provided the authorization for City staff to proceed with preliminary design and investigative work for the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial. A budget of \$125,000 was approved for this investigative process.

In 2017, Landscape Architectural Services (LAS) retained Forrec Limited to complete a site selection study to determine the best location for the memorial. Seven prospective sites were ranked according to 18 criteria that ranged from typical site attributes to special site features. Typical site attributes included site visibility, site servicing and existing site amenities (e.g. washrooms); special site features included items such as pre-existing accessibility routes or site-specific factors that could increase construction costs.

The following table summarizes the study sites and their scores:

Study Site	Score	Ranking
Bayfront Park	52	Tie – 3, 4
Eastwood Park	46	7
Fire station Number 23 at Memorial Square	50	Tie – 5, 6
Gage Park	61	1
Sam Lawrence Park	52	Tie – 3, 4
T.B. McQuesten Park	54	2
Valley Park	50	Tie – 5, 6

The study concluded that the northeast section of Gage Park, as shown in Appendix “B” attached to Report PW18052, is the ideal site for the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial.

In 2018, Forrec Ltd. was further retained to prepare conceptual designs for the Memorial. The preferred concept, as shown in Appendix “C” attached to Report PW18052, was chosen because of its more-formal nature, which responds to the current geometry of Gage Park’s formal gardens, the 2010 Gage Park Master Plan, and the original Gage Park vision first laid out by the Canadian Landscape Architects, Lorrie and Howard Dunnington-Grubb.

In May 2018, staff met with representatives from Friends of the Gage to review the proposed concept as shown in Appendix “C” attached to Report PW18052. While the Friends of the Gage are not opposed to and even support the idea of a memorial for Fire Fighters, they are not supportive of the proposed location within Gage Park. Their concerns relate to the Robbie Burns Memorial that already exists near the proposed Fallen Firefighters Memorial location, as well as the current and historical use of the garden area that is the site for redevelopment into the memorial space. The Friends of the Gage suggested a location near the parking lot closer to Lawrence Road, as shown in Appendix “D” attached to Report PW18052.

Staff compared this new location against the same site-selection criteria as the other sites in the above table. This new location scored higher with regard to parking proximity, but scored lower with regard to site visibility, accessibility, and the increased costs that would result from the entirely-new construction required in that location.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

The site proposed by the Friends of the Gage, as shown in Appendix “D” attached to Report PW18052, scored 55 points overall. Other concerns with this alternate location include:

- Interference with the new Tropical House entrance and the space around it;
- Limited access for fire trucks during ceremonial events;
- Interference with typical set up for festivals that use that area for food, portapotties, and access to the large grass area by the amphitheatre.

Staff therefore recommends that this alternate location is not selected for the final Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial, and that, if necessary, other locations for the Robbie Burns Memorial are considered as part of this process.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The recommendations are in keeping with the Public Art Master Plan 2016 and the Call for Artists Policy.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

The following internal stakeholders were consulted and have no concerns with the location and concept design of the proposed Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial:

Ward 3 Councillor
Ward 4 Councillor and Ward 5 Councillor

Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial Sub-Committee Members

Public Works
Parks Operations
Forestry and Horticulture

Planning and Economic Development - Public Art and Projects

The following groups external to the City of Hamilton were also consulted:

Hamilton Professional Fire Fighters Association, who are supportive of the concept and look forward to the implementation of the memorial.

Friends of the Gage, whose concerns are outlined above.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The northeast portion of Gage Park, as shown in Appendix “A” attached to Report PW18052, is recommended for the site of the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial because of its:

- Highest overall score when compared to the other potential sites;
- Accessibility via bus transit and proximity to future LRT;
- Ease of access for fire trucks along a main route during special ceremonies;
- Potential to integrate the memorial with existing park design;
- High pedestrian traffic and visibility from major road;
- Formal character (formal gardens, fountain);
- Highly programmed state (Greenhouses, playground, sports facilities, etc.);
- Existing facilities and servicing (washrooms, etc.).

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

One alternative to the recommendation in Report PW18052 is to recommence the site-selection process in light of the feedback received from the Friends of the Gage. This alternative is not recommended, however, as the recommended site as shown in Appendix “B” attached to Report PW18052 retains the highest score even when all sites are compared against the same criteria.

Another alternative to the recommendation in Report PW18052 is to direct staff to not move forward with the detailed design of the memorial project, and to not include a capital budget sheet for the Fallen Fire Fighters Memorial in the 2019 Capital Budget. This would not fulfil the mandate of the Subcommittee of Council established for this project, and therefore, this alternative is not recommended.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Community Engagement & Participation

Hamilton has an open, transparent and accessible approach to City government that engages with and empowers all citizens to be involved in their community.

Healthy and Safe Communities

Hamilton is a safe and supportive city where people are active, healthy, and have a high quality of life.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Culture and Diversity

Hamilton is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" – General Issues Committee Minutes Report No. 17-001 Item 19 dated
January 18, 2017

Appendix "B" – Recommended Site Location at Gage Park

Appendix "C" – Concept Plan of Proposed Fire Fighters Memorial

Appendix "D" – Gage Park Site #2

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.