

GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE (OPERATING BUDGET) MINUTES 19-002(k)

1:25 p.m.
Friday, March 22, 2019
Council Chambers
Hamilton City Hall
71 Main Street West

Present: Mayor F. Eisenberger, Deputy Mayor T. Jackson (Chair)

Councillors M. Wilson, J. Farr, N. Nann, S. Merulla, C. Collins,

E. Pauls, J.P. Danko, B. Clark, M. Pearson, B. Johnson, L. Ferguson,

A. VanderBeek, T. Whitehead, J. Partridge

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. Recalculation of the 10 Year Local Transit Strategy (PW14015(b)) (City Wide) (Item 6.1)

(Eisenberger/Farr)

That Report PW14015(b), respecting the Recalculation of the 10 Year Local Transit Strategy, be received.

CARRIED

2. Councillor Ward Office Budgets and Policy and Guidelines for Eligible Expenses for Elected Officials (FCS18083(b)) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)

(Clark/Pearson)

That the Student Accommodation Benefit Factor be eliminated and the budget be allocated equally to the Councillor Ward Office Budgets.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 1, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

YES - Councillor Chad Collins

YES - Councillor Esther Pauls

NO - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

YES - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

3. Implementation of Living Wage (FCS19017) (City Wide) (Item 7.2)

(Johnson/Eisenberger)

- (a) That City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards, be paid a Living Wage effective April 1, 2019, to be included in the 2019 Operating Budget; and,
- (b) That the Living Wage rate for the City of Hamilton School Crossing Guards, be adjusted annually to reflect the cost of living.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

YES - Councillor Chad Collins

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

YES - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

YES - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

4. 2019 Tax Supported Operating Budget - Recommendations (FCS18096(a)) (City Wide) (Item 7.3)

(Eisenberger/Pearson)

- (a) Council Referred Items, Business Cases and 2020 2022 Multi-Year Outlook
 - (i) That Appendix "A" 2019 Council Referred Items, be received;

- (ii) That Appendix "B" 2019 Business Cases, be received;
- (iii) That Appendix "G" 2020 2022 Multi-Year Outlook, be received;

(b) Boards and Agencies

- (i) That the Boards and Agencies operating budget Appendix "C", \$214,201,384, inclusive of approved amendment as per Appendix "D", be approved;
- (c) Planning and Economic Development Department
 - (i) That the Planning and Economic Development operating budget (Book 2 –2019 2022 Business Plans), page 6, \$29,806,000, be approved;
- (d) Healthy and Safe Communities Department
 - (i) That the Healthy and Safe Communities operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 91, \$243,245,010, be approved;
 - (ii) That the General Manager of Healthy and Safe Communities Department or his delegate be authorized and directed to execute all Federal and Provincial Program Service Level Funding Agreements and any ancillary agreements required to give effect thereto and contracts, as provided for in Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans, until such time Council approves the subsequent budget. This also includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly / year end reporting;
 - (iii) Where required for Public Health Services, that the General Manager of Healthy and Safe Communities Department or his delegate or the Medical Officer of Health or her delegate be authorized and directed to execute all Federal and Provincial Program Service Level Funding Agreements and any ancillary agreements required to give effect thereto and contracts, as provided for in Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans, until such time Council approves the subsequent budget. This also includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly / year end reporting;

- (e) Public Works Department
 - (i) That the Public Works operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 206, \$241,780,180, be approved;
- (f) City Manager's Office
 - (i) That the City Manager's operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 286, \$11,531,610, be approved;
- (g) Corporate Services Department
 - (i) That the Corporate Services operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 328, \$29,177,520, be approved;
- (h) Legislative
 - (i) That the Legislative operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 393, \$5,018,500, be approved;
- (i) Hamilton Entertainment Facilities
 - (i) That the Hamilton Entertainment Facilities operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 401, \$3,912,390, be approved;
- (j) Corporate Financials Expenditures / Non Program Revenues
 - (i) That the Corporate Financials Expenditures operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 395, \$23,110,360 inclusive of approved amendments as per Appendix "D", be approved;
 - (ii) That the Non Program Revenues operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 411, (\$44,964,500), be approved;
- (k) Capital Financing
 - (i) That the Capital Financing operating budget (Book 2 2019 2022 Business Plans), page 403, \$128,975,900, be approved;

- (ii) That the Capital Financing portion of the Police Services budget (Book 1 2019 Preliminary Tax Operating Budget Report), page 18, \$805,750, inclusive of approved amendments as per Appendix "D", be approved;
- (iii) That the Capital Financing portion relating to the Hamilton Public Library budget (Book 1 2019 Preliminary Tax Operating Budget Report), page 19, \$187,290, be approved;
- (I) 2019 By-Law Authorization
 - (i) That the City Solicitor and Corporate Counsel be authorized and directed to prepare all necessary by-laws, for Council approval, for the purposes of establishing the tax levy;
- (m) Budgeted Complement Transfer Schedule
 - (i) That in accordance with the "Budgeted Complement Control Policy", the requested complement transfers from one department/division/cost category to another, as outlined in Appendix "E", be approved;
- (n) Budget Exclusions Related to Regulation 284/09
 - (i) That the budget exclusions related to Regulation 284/09 of the *Municipal Act* titled "Budget Matters Expenses", as per Appendix "F", be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

YES - Councillor Chad Collins

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

YES - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson YES - Councillor Brad Clark

5. Lincoln M. Alexander Parkway and Red Hill Valley Parkway Enhanced Enforcement Initiative (PW19014(a)) (City Wide) (Item 7.4)

(Merulla/Nann)

- (a) That the Lincoln M. Alexander Parkway and Red Hill Valley Parkway Enhanced Enforcement Initiative, as outlined in this report, be funded in the amount of \$150,000 from the Red Light Camera Reserve #112203, with zero net levy impact, be approved; and
- (b) That the Mayor submit a letter to the Attorney General and the Minister of Transportation Ontario, on behalf of City Council, seeking legislative and regulatory amendments to allow the City to implement Automated Speed Enforcement on the Lincoln M. Alexander Parkway and Red Hill Valley Parkways through an administrative monetary penalty system.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

YES - Councillor Chad Collins

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

YES - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

6. Project 7101954902 - Valley Park Life Cycle Renewal and Accessibility Funding (Item 8.1)

(Clark/Pearson)

WHEREAS, the Energy, Fleet & Facilities Management Section is preparing design and specification documents for a new/expanded 12,400 square foot library addition, attached to Valley Park Community Centre, which will also house 3,000 square feet of new community programming space;

WHEREAS, through Information Report PW18092 - Capital Lifecycle Renewal – Valley Park Community Centre, which was submitted at the December 7, 2018 General Issues Committee Budget meeting, staff suggested taking a holistic approach by taking advantage of the opportunity to complete capital works in the existing complex, in conjunction with the new library construction project;

WHEREAS, Project 7101954902 - Valley Park Life Cycle Renewal and Accessibility is currently not included in the 2019 Capital Budget, due to funding constraints, but is being accelerated in the plan for future life cycle program years;

WHEREAS, through Information Report PW18092 - Capital Lifecycle Renewal – Valley Park Community Centre, which was submitted at the December 7, 2018 General Issues Committee Budget meeting, staff revised the capital project costing to only include those projects that demonstrated the opportunity for cost avoidance by taking a holistic approach in conjunction with the new library construction project; and,

WHEREAS, capitalizing on the current tender process and in conjunction with the new library construction project for Project 7101954902 - Valley Park Life Cycle Renewal and Accessibility, an estimated cost avoidance of approximately \$420K, is anticipated due to contractor mobilization fee savings, synergies, soft costs, programming and public disruptions, as well as risk of emergency fixes due to end-of-life infrastructure;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That, in order to complete the capital works of the 3,000 square feet of new community programing space, at the same time as the expansion of the library, at the Valley Park location, Project 7101954902 - Valley Park Life Cycle Renewal and Accessibility, in an amount of up to \$2,400,000, to be funded as follows, be approved:

- (a) \$500,000 from the Terrapure Compensation Royalties Reserve Account #117036; and,
- (b) \$1,900,000 from the Unallocated Capital Reserve Account #108020.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

YES - Councillor Chad Collins

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

YES - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

7. Additional Administrative Support for Councillors' Offices (Item 8.3)

(Whitehead/Clark)

(a) That the following Motion, respecting Additional Administrative Support for Councillors' Offices, be referred to the Governance Review Sub-Committee for review:

WHEREAS, the current allotment for vacation and sick leave is insufficient for Councillor administrative staff whose accumulated vacation entitlement exceeds the amount of coverage currently provided in the ward office budgets (2 weeks);

WHEREAS, our social media and engagement policies and practices at the city have been successful in engaging more residents than ever before with their ward Councillors' offices subsequently requiring closer monitoring by staff and Councillor's to these outlets to efficiently respond to constituent concerns;

WHEREAS, a 0.5 FTE administrative support person would provide greater continuity in the office by facilitating coverage of the FTE person resulting in a more seamless exchange between the constituent and the ward office staff on a given issue or concern;

WHEREAS, a single staff person often deals with complex issues or projects to support their Councillor's initiatives requiring them to exercise greater responsibilities beyond basic constituency matters;

WHEREAS, the amount of work in each ward office is substantial and can be clearly demonstrated through activity levels there is a need to ensure we have the resources to protect the health and wellbeing of our admins who may incur negative impacts due to increased stress or burnout:

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That an additional 0.5 FTE for administrative support at gross cost of \$339,000 (or \$22,600 per ward) starting on July 1st, 2019 and an annualized gross cost of \$678,000 (or \$45,200 per ward), be approved; and,
- (b) That the administrative support previously allocated to old wards 7 & 8 of \$177,000 be equally allocated across all new wards (or \$11,800 per ward), be approved.
- (b) That staff be directed to attend the Governance Review Sub-Committee, when the matter respecting additional administrative support for Councillors' offices is to be discussed, to provide the background information/history respecting the staffing in the Councillors' offices as well as comparators to other municipalities.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

YES - Councillor Chad Collins

YES - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

YES - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

YES - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

1. COMMUNICATIONS (Item 4)

4.3 Correspondence from Evan Johnston, respecting Item 7.2 - Report FCS19017 – Implementation of Living Wage

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.2.

4.4 Correspondence from Anthony Marco, respecting Item 7.2 - Report FCS19017 – Implementation of Living Wage

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.2.

4.5 Correspondence from Brad Park, President & CEO, United Way Halton & Hamilton Item 7.2 - Report FCS19017 – Implementation of Living Wage

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.2.

4.6 Correspondence from Ritch Whyman, Item 7.2 - Report FCS19017 – Implementation of Living Wage

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.2.

2. STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 6)

6.1 Recalculation of the 10 Year Local Transit Strategy (PW14015(b)) (City Wide)

3. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 7)

7.3 2019 Tax Supported Operating Budget - Recommendations (FCS18096(a)) (City Wide)

Item 7.3 has had a presentation added for information.

7.4 Lincoln M. Alexander Parkway and Red Hill Valley Parkway Enhanced Enforcement Initiative (PW19014(a)) (City Wide)

(Pearson/Farr)

That the agenda for the March 22, 2019 Special meeting of the General Issues Committee (Operating Budget) be approved, as amended.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

YES - Councillor Chad Collins

YES - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

YES - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)

(i) February 28, 2019 (Operating Budget) (Item 3.1)

(Collins/Merulla)

That the Minutes of the February 28, 2019 General Issues Committee (Operating Budget) meeting be approved, as presented.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

YES - Councillor Chad Collins

YES - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

YES - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

(d) COMMUNICATIONS

(VanderBeek/Partridge)

That Communication Items 4.1 through 4.6, as shown below, be approved, as follows:

(i) Correspondence from Terri Bocz, BSc Bed, and Tibor Bocz, Peng, PMP, MSc, MBA, respecting the City of Hamilton Stormwater Budget – Sources of Funding, Prioritization of Capital Funding; and Sufficiency of Capital Reserves (Item 4.1)

Recommendation: Be received.

(ii) Correspondence from Terri Wallis, Disability Justice Network of Ontario Campaigns Committee Member, respecting Snow Removal (Item 4.2)

Recommendation: Be received.

(iii) Correspondence from Evan Johnston, respecting Report FCS19017 – Implementation of Living Wage (Item 4.3)

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.2.

(iv) Correspondence from Anthony Marco, respecting Item 7.2 - Report FCS19017 – Implementation of Living Wage (Item 4.4)

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.2.

(v) Correspondence from Brad Park, President & CEO, United Way Halton & Hamilton Item 7.2 - Report FCS19017 – Implementation of Living Wage (Item 4.5)

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.2.

(vi) Correspondence from Ritch Whyman, Item 7.2 - Report FCS19017 – Implementation of Living Wage (Item 4.6)

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of Item 7.2. **CARRIED**

(e) STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 6)

(i) Recalculation of the 10 Year Local Transit Strategy (PW14015(b)) (City Wide) (Item 6.1)

Debbie Dalle Vadove, Director of Transit, addressed Committee and provided a PowerPoint presentation respecting Report PW14015(b), the Recalculation of the 10 Year Local Transit Strategy.

(Eisenberger/Clark)

That the presentation respecting Report PW14015(b), the Recalculation of the 10 Year Local Transit Strategy, be received.

CARRIED

A copy of the presentation is available on the City's website at www.hamilton.ca or through the Office of the City Clerk.

(f) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 7)

(i) 2019 Tax Supported Operating Budget - Recommendations (FCS18096(a)) (City Wide) (Item 7.3)

Brian McMullan, Acting General Manager of Finance & Corporate Services, addressed Committee and provided an added presentation respecting Report FCS189096(a), the 2019 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Recommendations.

(Eisenberger/Pearson)

That the presentation respecting Report FCS189096(a), the 2019 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Recommendations, be received.

CARRIED

A copy of the presentation is available on the City's website at www.hamilton.ca or through the Office of the City Clerk.

Councillors Clark, Danko, Nann and Wilson wished to be recorded as OPPOSED to the Hamilton Police Services Board portion of the 2019 Operating Budget.

For disposition of this matter, please refer to Item 4.

(g) MOTIONS (Item 8)

(Nann/Merulla)

That the following Motion, respecting the City of Hamilton moving toward becoming a Living Wage Employer, be referred to Finance, Human Resources and Legal staff for review and a report back through the 2020 Operating budget, with a three-year strategy for the City becoming a full living wage employer:

Toward Making the City of Hamilton a Living Wage Employer (Item 8.2)

WHEREAS, municipal governments are anchor institutions in communities and have an opportunity to influence other employer organizations;

WHEREAS, the City of Hamilton is a large public sector employer in the city and some employees earn minimum wage;

WHEREAS, we know that the current minimum wage is inadequate in covering basic living expenses, limiting participation of workers in community life;

WHEREAS, minimum wage workers must often take on multiple jobs in order to survive;

WHEREAS, there is evidence to prove that those making minimum wage are often otherwise marginalized;

WHEREAS; the best place to raise a child and age successfully includes a commitment to reduce the number of precarious jobs in our city;

WHEREAS, we have a duty to lead by example to the best of our ability as both a city and an employer;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That the City of Hamilton pay 122.19 FTE Regular Staff and 67.92 FTE Library Staff, currently making minimum wage, a Living Wage of \$15.85 per hour within the 2019 Operating Budget; and,
- (b) That staff prepare a report for consideration in the 2020 Budget cycle to pay Summer Student workers a Living Wage rate of \$15.85 per hour.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 12 to 3, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

YES - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla

NO - Councillor Chad Collins

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

YES - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

NO - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

NO - Councillor Brenda Johnson

YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

(h) PRIVATE & CONFIDENTIAL (Item 10)

(i) Toward Making the City of Hamilton a Living Wage Employer (Item 8.2)

(Clark/VanderBeek)

That Committee move into Closed Session to discuss Item 8.2, pursuant to Section 8.1, Sub-sections (d) and (f) of the City's Procedural By-law 18-270, and Section 239(2), Sub-sections (d) and (f) of the Ontario Municipal

Act, 2001, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to labour relations or employee negotiations; and, the receiving of advice that is subject to solicitor-client privilege, including communications necessary for that purpose.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 12 to 0, as follows:

YES - Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Councillor Jason Farr

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Nrinder Nann

YES - Councillor Sam Merulla YES - Councillor Chad Collins

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Deputy-Mayor Tom Jackson

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger

YES - Councillor Judi Partridge

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Terry Whitehead

YES - Councillor Arlene VanderBeek

NOT PRESENT - Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Councillor Brenda Johnson YES - Councillor Maria Pearson

YES - Councillor Brad Clark

(i) ADJOURNMENT (Item 11)

(Johnson/Pearson)

That, there being no further business, the Special General Issues Committee (Operating Budget), be adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

T. Jackson, Deputy Mayor Chair, General Issues Committee

Stephanie Paparella Legislative Coordinator Office of the City Clerk