



**CITY OF HAMILTON**  
**PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT**  
**Engineering Services Division**

<b>TO:</b>	Chair and Members Public Works Committee
<b>COMMITTEE DATE:</b>	June 3, 2019
<b>SUBJECT/REPORT NO:</b>	Southcote Road Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19041) (Ward 12)
<b>WARD(S) AFFECTED:</b>	Ward 12
<b>PREPARED BY:</b>	Erika Waite (905) 546-2424 Ext. 6397
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Gord McGuire Director, Engineering Services Public Works Department
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	

**RECOMMENDATION(S)**

- (a) That the General Manager, Public Works, be authorized and directed to file the Southcote Road (Garner Road to Golf Links Road) Schedule C Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Environmental Study Report (ESR) with the Municipal Clerk for a minimum thirty (30) day public review period; and
- (b) That upon completion of the minimum thirty (30) day public review period, the General Manager, Public Works, be authorized and directed to proceed with the implementation of the preferred alternative within the Schedule C Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Environmental Study Report (ESR).

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The City of Hamilton has undertaken an Environmental Assessment Study (EA) for Southcote Road between Garner Road East and Golf Links Road as outlined in report PW19041 as Appendix "A". Southcote Road is a two-lane minor arterial road with a rural cross-section, consisting of unpaved shoulders in most areas. The Ancaster Transportation Master Plan recommended the Southcote corridor be expanded from two lanes to three lanes, including a centre two-way left turn lane, and identified the requirement for a Schedule C EA to be completed.

**SUBJECT: Southcote Road Municipal Class Environmental Assessment  
(PW19041) (Ward 12) - Page 2 of 10**

---

The City of Hamilton has completed a study following the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (MCEA) process for Schedule C projects, to address improvements needed for Southcote Road from Garner Road East to Golf Links Road. The purpose of this study is to recommend a preferred design that will address transportation issues along Southcote Road. The Environmental Study Report is complete and ready to be filed on the public record for the minimum thirty (30) day public review period. Upon Council approval of this Class EA and subject to comments received during the review, staff will proceed with the detailed design and implementation of the preferred alternative. Although the EA study area is from Garner Road East to Golf Links Road, the implementation of the preferred alternative has only been scheduled for the area between Garner Road East and Calder Street. The remaining area covered by the EA, Calder Street to Golf Links Road, will be assessed for implementation at a later point.

**Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 9**

**FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

Financial: Project funding in the amount of \$6,055,000 was approved in the 2017 and 2019 Capital Budget (Project ID 4031711015) and includes a budget of \$135,000 for environmental assessments. Any project budget adjustments required to accommodate the recommendations outside of the preferred alternative will be captured through the 2020 Capital Budget Process.

Staffing: N/A

Legal: Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Process

This study has been conducted in accordance with the Municipal Class EA process with the intent to determine the preferred design option to accommodate for changes in regional transportation demands. As a result, the study has fulfilled the Class EA requirements for Phases 3 and 4 to determine the preferred planning solution and design concepts and to document the results in the final report. This study will therefore fulfil all legal requirements of the planning process pertaining to Schedule C.

The City will be providing the Environmental Study Report to the public for a minimum thirty (30) day review in order for the public to provide any final comments that they may have with respect to this planning process. This will also be the opportunity for a Part II Order (appeal) for the public and agencies.

## **HISTORICAL BACKGROUND**

The City of Hamilton has undertaken an Environmental Assessment Study (EA) for Southcote Road between Garner Road and Golf Links Road. Under the City of Hamilton Official Plan, Southcote Road is designated as a Minor Arterial on Schedule C, Functional Road Classification. Currently, Southcote Road is two-lanes with a rural cross-section, consisting of unpaved shoulders in most areas. As per the Official Plan, minor arterial roads should include accommodations for cyclists and sidewalks should be provided on both sides of the street for pedestrians.

Approved by Council in 2010 and approved with revisions by the Ontario Municipal Board in 2015, the Airport Employment Growth District (AEGD) Secondary Plan presents a transportation strategy to guide the transportation infrastructure and strategic policies of the Hamilton International Airport area up to the 2031 planning horizon year. The Secondary Plan boundaries extend between Garner Road and Twenty Road in the north, Upper James Street in the east, and Highway 6 at the southern and western boundaries of some areas. In light of increasing development and employment opportunities south of the Southcote Road corridor, the AEGD has implications for transportation infrastructure within the study area, including vehicular traffic, transit, and active transportation requirements.

Furthermore, undertaken in 2011, the Ancaster Transportation Master Plan (ATMP) outlines Ancaster's current and future transportation needs and demands, particularly addressing issues of traffic volumes in the urban areas, congestion and traffic infiltration. The Master Plan was undertaken to prepare a transportation strategy to address these transportation needs. The Master Plan recommends the Southcote Road corridor be expanded from two to three lanes, including a centre two-way left turn lane. Anticipated timing of this project was provided as between 2017 and 2021 with a projected cost of \$3.4 million. Various recommendations came from this study including:

- Cycling infrastructure: The Southcote Road corridor is identified as a "Cautionary Un-signed Bike Route"
- Transit infrastructure: There are currently no transit routes along Southcote Road
- Traffic: Collisions were not found to be sufficiently high as to require mitigation. However, as part of the solution to improve transportation safety, the addition of a two-way left turn lane is recommended. It is recommended the corridor be monitored for potential traffic operations issues as development occurs. Reduction of the speed limit to 50 km/h was recommended as part of the 2006 Base EMME/2 Network Modifications to better represent the existing network condition and has been implemented. Roundabouts were determined to be

operationally viable and recommended as an alternative to signalized intersections at Golf Links Road and Southcote Road.

- Pedestrian safety: As a result of resident feedback, the Master Plan recommends that opportunities be sought to implement crosswalks, Intersection Pedestrian Signals (where warranted), and other roadway treatments to increase safety for pedestrians in the study area. Sidewalks are recommended along both sides of Southcote Road (Calder Street to Garner Street).

The recently completed City in Motion Transportation Master Plan (December 2018) includes the recommendations from the Ancaster Transportation Master Plan.

The Municipal Engineers Association Class Environmental Assessment (EA) document (October 2000, as amended 2007, 2011 and 2015) applies to reconstruction where the reconstructed road will not be for the same purpose, use, capacity or at the same location as the facility being reconstructed. As per the recommendations of the Ancaster Transportation Master Plan, the addition of a two-way left turn lane requires the project to follow the Schedule C project process.

The City of Hamilton has completed a study using the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (EA) process to address Schedule C projects, to concentrate on improvements needed for Southcote Road. The purpose of this study is to recommend preferred alternatives to improve the road infrastructure to accommodate for the transportation demands. The Environmental Study Report (ESR) is complete and ready to be filed on the public record for the minimum thirty (30) day review period. Upon Council approval of this Class EA and subject to comments received during the review, staff will proceed with the detailed design and implementation of the preferred alternative.

## **POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS**

These recommendations are consistent with the Urban Hamilton Official Plan, Hamilton Transportation Master Plan and all other corporate policies. This recommendation will not bind the Corporation or alter or contravene any established City Policy.

## **RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

### ➤ Members of Council

The study area is located within Ward 12. Project details have been discussed with Ward Councillor Ferguson through various communications and participation at the Public Information Centres.

### ➤ Public

**SUBJECT: Southcote Road Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19041) (Ward 12) - Page 5 of 10**

---

The Municipal Class EA process requires public consultation, according to the requirements of a Schedule C project. Consultation plans were developed and followed. Public Consultation was carried out in the form of a Notice of Study Commencement and a Public Information Centre, which was issued on May 10, 2018 and May 17, 2018 in the Ancaster News for the first Public Consultation Centre (PIC). A mail out was completed to pertinent agencies, City staff and 149 landowners within the study area. The first PIC was held on Thursday, May 24, 2018, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. at the Old Town Hall, 310 Wilson St E, Ancaster. The PIC followed a drop-in format which allowed attendees to review the display information, present their comments and discuss them directly with City of Hamilton and their consultants. A total of twenty-eight (28) individuals signed in at the PIC over the course of the evening.

Notification for PIC #2 was issued November 29, 2018 and December 6, 2018 in the Ancaster News. The second PIC was held on Monday, December 10, 2018, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. at the Old Town Hall, 310 Wilson St E, Ancaster. The PIC followed a drop-in format which allowed attendees to review the display information, present their comments and discuss them directly with City of Hamilton and their consultants. A total of thirty-two (32) individuals signed in at the PIC over the course of the evening.

The pertinent project information was made available throughout the study on the project website:

- <https://www.hamilton.ca/city-planning/master-plans-class-eas/southcote-road-garner-road-golf-links-road>

Throughout the public consultation process, feedback from the public has been generally supportive of the recommendations.

It was identified that there is public interest in having the hydro lines along Southcote Road buried. The City has contacted Hydro One to receive a cost estimate which will assist in determining the feasibility of burying the lines. Hydro One is still in the process of preparing a cost estimate which is expected to be finalized in the upcoming weeks. As this estimate will be received following the EA process, it will be addressed during detailed design. The preferred design option from the EA accommodates both above ground and below ground utility infrastructure.

➤ Agency/ Stakeholder Consultation

Responses and comments were received from individuals and agencies. All comments have been addressed and contained in the Environmental Study Report, including the City's initiated contact with Hamilton Conservation Authority, Ontario Ministry of Transportation, and Hydro One. Comments from concerned land owners have been addressed and are contained within the Environmental Study Report.

## **ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION(S)**

### ➤ Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Process

The Class Environmental Assessment (EA) study follows the planning and design process of the Municipal Engineers Association (MEA) Municipal Class Environmental Assessment, October 2000, as amended in 2007, 2011, and 2015. The City is completing this study in accordance with the planning process applicable to Schedule C projects under the Municipal Class EA. These projects are approved under the Environmental Assessment Act (EA Act), as long as they are planned, designed and constructed according to the requirements of the Class EA document.

The specific requirements for the above Class EA process depend on the type of project, its complexity and the significance of environmental impacts. Four categories of projects are identified in the Municipal Class EA document, including Schedule A, A+, B and C projects. The road improvements identified in previous studies classified this work as Schedule C projects.

The Ancaster Transportation Master Plan identified the need to widen Southcote Road to three (3) lanes, including a two-way left turn lane, between Garner Road East and Calder Street. The Airport Employment Growth District Secondary Plan also identified regional transportation changes which, in turn, impact areas such as Southcote Road.

The Southcote Road (Garner Road to Golf Links Road) Municipal Class Environmental Assessment is following the Municipal Class EA process as noted:

- An approved process under the Ontario Environmental Assessment Act
- It provides the preliminary planning and engineering direction to enable urban development of the neighbourhood into the existing urban structure
- As Schedule C projects
- Includes consultation with stakeholders and the public during the process
- The Environmental Study Report (ESR) would be available for a minimum thirty (30) day review period and the Part II Order request (appeal) process would be available

Schedule C Projects generally involve the construction of new facilities and the major expansion of existing facilities and have the potential for significant environmental effects. The proposed works confirm that Schedule C is the appropriate EA Schedule.

### ➤ Screening of Alternative Solutions

The Southcote Road (Garner Road East to Golf Links Road) Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Study has followed the Municipal Engineers Association

**SUBJECT: Southcote Road Municipal Class Environmental Assessment  
(PW19041) (Ward 12) - Page 7 of 10**

---

Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (EA) process for Schedule C projects. The Class EA process recognizes that there are many ways of solving a particular problem and requires various alternative solutions to be considered.

➤ Rationale for Selection of Alternative Solutions

The Ancaster Transportation Master Plan established a need to widen Southcote Road to three lanes, including a two-way left turn lane, and to provide improved active transportation facilities. Alternative solutions were developed to address the problem, identified through the ATMP, with a focus on improving the transportation issues along Southcote Road.

The “Do Nothing” alternative would not adequately address the factors considered in the evaluation of alternatives, and there is no reason to reconsider the “do nothing” alternative in this study for the same reasons.

➤ Identification and Description of Alternative Solutions

Five alternatives (Option 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5) were identified and evaluated as part of this study and further details for the options as outlined in report PW19041 as Appendix “B” and Section 6.2 in the Environmental Study Report. All options include two (2) three-point three metre (3.3 m) though lanes, one (1) three-point five metre (3.5 m) two-way left turn lane and the addition of curb and gutter. The main differences can be found in the active transportation facilities and the proposed layout of right of way components.

Alternative 1

- Two (2) – one point five metre (1.5 m) sidewalks, one on each side
- Two (2) – one point five metre (1.5 m) on-road bike lanes
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the west is located between the property line and the sidewalk
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the east is located between the curb and the sidewalk

Alternative 2

- Two (2) – one point five metre (1.5 m) sidewalks
- Two (2) – one point five metre (1.5 m) separated bike lanes (curb between driving lanes and bike lanes)
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the west is located between the property line and the sidewalk
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the east is located between the separated bike lane and the sidewalk

Alternative 3

- One (1) – one point five metre (1.5 m) sidewalk on the west side

- One (1) – three-point five metre (3.5 m) multi-use pathway on the east side
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the west is located between the property line and the sidewalk
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the east is located between the multi-use pathway and the property line

Alternative 4

- Two (2) – three-point five metre (3.5 m) multi-use pathways, one on each side
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the west is located between the property line and the multi-use pathway
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the east is located between the multi-use pathway and the property line

Alternative 5

- One (1) – one point five metre (1.5 m) sidewalk on the west side
- Two (2) – one point five metre (1.5 m) bike lanes
- One (1) – three-point five metre (3.5 m) multi-use pathway on the east side
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the west is located between the property line and the sidewalk
- The boulevard, including tree area, on the east is located between the curb and the multi-use pathway

➤ Preferred Option

The alternatives were assessed against the evaluation criteria as appropriate. The following evaluation criteria were considered:

- traffic operations and safety;
- engineering/ technical;
- land use;
- recreational user experience;
- natural environment;
- supportive of public input;
- cultural heritage;
- and economic/ financial

The selection of the recommended alternative involved identifying and making trade-offs among the advantages and disadvantages of the alternatives. The alternative that had the best overall balance of advantages and disadvantages was recommended as the preferred alternative.

➤ Recommended Design Option

Option 3 - sidewalk on one side of the road and multi-use pathway (accommodating two directions of travel) on the other side of the road - has been identified as the technically



preferred design concept. This option provides the best balance of improving active transportation facilities along Southcote Road and minimizing impacts to mature trees.

### **ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION**

The recommended design option was identified using an evaluation and screening process that fulfils the requirements for the Municipal Engineers Association (MEA) Municipal Class EA document for Schedule C projects. These projects are approved under the Environmental Assessment Act (EA Act) once the required four (4) phase process is complete and subject to a public review period.

The MEA Municipal Class EA document was approved under the Environmental Assessment Act. If the City does not follow the process outlined in the Municipal Class EA document, the City would be in violation of the document and as a result would have contravened the EA Act. The Minister of the Environment could revisit the approval of a project or take away the City's right to use the Municipal Class EA document.

It is recommended design option 3 be carried forward as the preferred option. There are two alternatives for Council to consider with respect to the recommendations of this report:

- a) To file the Southcote Road Municipal Class EA, Schedule C project with the City Clerk for a minimum thirty (30) day public review period in order to complete the phases 3 and 4 of the process. This will offer the public and agencies the opportunity for placement of a Part II Order (appeal) with the Minister of Environment and fulfil the City's legal obligations under the EA Act.
- b) To Not file the Southcote Road Municipal Class EA, Schedule C project with the City Clerk for a minimum of thirty (30) day public review period and, as a consequence, to not proceed with implementation.

Should Council not wish to approve the filing of the Southcote Road Municipal Class EA, Schedule C project, the Municipal Class EA process would be considered by the provincial government as incomplete and the City will not have the approval under provincial environmental legislation to implement the recommended alternative, required to address the transportation needs. The outcome would be equivalent to the do nothing alternative, which would result in the inability to effectively address both the short-term and the long-term infrastructure needs for the study area. Eventually the City would have to repeat the Class EA process, which would likely result in the same recommendations.

## **ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN**

### **Community Engagement and Participation**

Hamilton has an open, transparent and accessible approach to City government that engages with and empowers all citizens to be involved in their community.

### **Healthy and Safe Communities**

Hamilton is a safe and supportive City where people are active, healthy, and have a high quality of life.

### **Clean and Green**

Hamilton is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.

### **Built Environment and Infrastructure**

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

### **Our People and Performance**

Hamiltonians have a high level of trust and confidence in their City government.

## **APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED**

Appendix A: Study Area Map

Appendix B: Evaluation of Alternative Solutions