



CITY OF HAMILTON
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT
Hamilton Water Division

TO:	Chair and Members Public Works Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	June 3, 2019
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 11
PREPARED BY:	Sharon MacPherson-Németh (905) 546-2424 Ext. 2087
SUBMITTED BY:	Mark Bainbridge Director, Water and Wastewater Planning and Capital Public Works Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION(S)

- (a) That the General Manager, Public Works, be authorized and directed to file the Notice of Completion and issue the New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment for the mandatory 30-day review period;
- (b) That upon completion of the 30-day agency and public review period, the General Manager, Public Works, be authorized and directed to proceed with the implementation of the preferred alternative within the New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Hamilton Water Division invoked the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (EA) process to determine the preferred location for a new septage waste haulage receiving station. The study was carried out as a Schedule 'B' project to identify and evaluate a range of alternative solutions and recommend a preferred strategy.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11) - Page 2 of 12

The preferred site for the new septage waste haulage receiving station is located on Dartnall Road between Rymal Road East and Twenty Road East. This location meets the following required criteria:

- Primarily Industrial Land Use;
- Vacant Industrial Land within Area;
- Near Designated Truck Routes;
- Close Proximity to a Trunk Sewer; and
- Centrally located to Service Rural Areas.

Upon completion of the mandatory 30-day review period of the Class EA, a conceptual design of the preferred alternative will be initiated, land will be purchased, with construction commencing in 2021 at the earliest.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 11

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: Project funding in the amount of \$7,190,000 was approved in the 2016 and 2019 Capital Budget (Project ID 4031711015) and includes a budget of \$200,000 for environmental assessments. Any project budget adjustments required to accommodate the recommendations outside of the preferred alternative will be captured through the 2020 Capital Budget Process.

Staffing: The implementation of the preferred alternative will be carried out by existing staff and as such there are no staffing implications. Once the new station is operational, we predict that there will not be any additional operations staff required to operate the facility.

Legal: There are no know legal implications associated with this recommendation. However, Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks (MECP) approval of municipal undertakings such as road improvements and water and wastewater projects are subject to *Ontario's Environmental Assessment Act*. The Act allows for the approval of Class Environmental Assessments and the municipality has the option of following the planning process set out in the Municipal Engineers Association Class Environmental Assessment (amended 2007, 2011 & 2015) document. The Municipal Class EA Section A.1.2.2 allows for Schedule B projects to be carried out for projects which have the potential for some adverse environmental effects. The City is required to file the report on the public record for a minimum 30-day review period for the EA to have been satisfied.

SUBJECT: New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11) - Page 3 of 12

The City's *Sewer Use By-Law (No. 14-090)* regulates, monitors and enforces hauled septage waste by providing:

- Clearly Defined Common Pollutant Limits;
- A Prohibited Substance Listing;
- Discharge Limits for Permitted Carriers; and
- Monitoring Standards to Control Discharges and Reduce Impacts of Spills.

A new septage waste haulage receiving station was recommended in order to better enforce the hauled septage waste aspects of the City's *Sewer Use By-law (No. 14-090)*.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The City currently operates two septage waste haulage receiving stations, one at the Woodward Avenue Wastewater Treatment Plant and the second on Upper Ottawa Street at the Mountain Transfer Station.

A 2010 study confirmed the two current stations cannot be upgraded to meet the requirements of the City's Hauled Waste Management Program.

The Woodward Avenue Wastewater Treatment Plant currently experiences significant truck traffic linked to plant operations as well as septage waste haulage receiving station operations. The Plant is presently undergoing significant expansion and upgrades. In an effort to reduce truck traffic at the site as well as free-up building space, the City has identified the need to close this septage waste haulage site and construct a new facility to better meet the needs of the City. At present, a septage waste haulage receiving station is being constructed at the Eastport Sewage Pumping Station, located at the corner of Eastport Drive and Pier 25 Gateway South. Once this station is operational, the Woodward facility will be decommissioned.

The Upper Ottawa Street Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station currently operates to receive a discharge of hauled liquid waste directly into the sanitary sewer via an open manhole. Due to a number of operational challenges, site constraints, and ongoing odour issues, the City has identified the need to close this station and construct a new waste haulage receiving station. The new station would be designed to support operational needs, be constructed with odour control equipment, and it would service the southern portion of the City.

A Project Team, including Public Works staff and Consulting Engineers, was developed to undertake this Class EA study. Other key staff and sub-consultants including

SUBJECT: New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11) - Page 4 of 12

Environmental Scientists, Heritage Planners and Archaeologists were engaged, as required, to provide support for various components of the study.

The Class EA study was completed as a Schedule 'B' of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment process. The Class EA for this project included public and review agency consultation, evaluation of alternatives, assessment of the impacts of the proposed works, and identification of measures to mitigate any adverse impacts. Upon completion of the study, a Project File Report documenting the planning and decision-making process and preferred site alternative was prepared and is ready for public review. Pending approval of this recommendation, a separate advertisement will be issued to advise the public and stakeholders of the Notice of Completion of the Class EA.

Early in the project, a long list of target areas had been identified and evaluated for potentially locating the new septage waste haulage receiving station. The evaluation criteria considered included the following:

- Non-residential location (industrial area preferred);
- Near or along designated truck routes;
- Not located within the City's combined sewer system, or immediate areas with a history of sewer surcharging/basement flooding;
- Close proximity to existing sanitary trunk sewers (600mm DIA or above) or major sanitary pumping stations;
- In combination with the Eastport Pumping Station Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station, provide central locations for majority of waste haulers;
- Not be located on prime agricultural lands;
- Suitable land uses available within target area, such as vacant industrial land or transportation/utility.

The long list of target areas included the following:

- Clappison's Corners
- Ancaster (Ancaster Industrial Park)
- Airport
- Upper James Street /Twenty Road West
- Rymal Road East/Hannon North
- Hannon South
- Heritage Green (Upper Centennial Parkway/Mud Street)
- Rymal Road East/Regional Road 56

SUBJECT: New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11) - Page 5 of 12

Based on a comparison of key features for each target area, the following areas were selected to proceed to the short list phase. Please refer to Appendix "A" to Report PW19047 for a map of the short listed alternative sites:

- Airport (Option 1 and Option 2)
- Upper James/Twenty Road
- Hannon South (Option 1 and Option 2)

Each of the short-listed sites were further evaluated considering technical, natural, cultural, social and economic factors. Hannon South was the only site that met all of the required criteria including the following:

- Vacant Industrial Land in Target Area
- Nearby Truck Routes: Lincoln Alexander Parkway / Dartnall Road / Rymal Road East
- In Close Proximity to Red Hill Sanitary Trunk Sewer
- Centrally Located to Flamborough, Dundas, Ancaster, Glanbrook and Stoney Creek

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

These recommendations are consistent with the Urban Official Plan. Other policies affecting or impacting this Report include:

- *Ontario Environmental Assessment Act*
- *Ontario Environmental Protection Act*

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Public and Review Agency consultation is an integral and legislated component of any Municipal Class Environmental Assessment study. Stakeholders are initially notified of the study with a formal Notice of Commencement advertised in the local newspaper. Review Agencies are notified directly by mail or e-mail.

Project Stakeholder and Review Agency lists are developed at the onset of the study and maintained throughout, thus ensuring all interested parties are kept informed. All Stakeholders are invited and encouraged to comment on the project at any time during the study.

Categorically, the Agency and Stakeholder Contact Lists include the following groups:

- Provincial Ministries and Agencies
- Federal Agencies
- Aboriginal Groups
- Property owners/businesses within the study area
- Others (e.g. Municipal, Utilities, School Boards, etc.)

Two Public Information Centres were held at the Canadian Warplane Heritage Museum and the Turner Park Library on November 9, 2017 and September 19, 2018 respectively. Feedback from attendees focused on potential impacts with having the new facility in close proximity to residences and businesses. These concerns were focused on potential odours, increased truck traffic, and road erosion.

Based on feedback received from the Ward 6 and Ward 11 Councillors, additional stakeholder engagement was undertaken for three area businesses located in close proximity to the preferred site for the new septage waste haulage station. Feedback from two of these stakeholders indicated 'no concern' for the construction of this new facility. The third stakeholder expressed concerns related to potential odours, increased traffic and noise, as well as impacts to bus routes and existing sanitary infrastructure.

The recommendations of this staff report are in itself the final stage of consultation which is an inherent part of the Class EA process. The project team will receive and attempt to mitigate any Stakeholder concerns or Requests for a Part II Order that is initiated within the mandatory 30-day review period.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION(S)

By applying the Municipal Class EA process, the project followed the legislated multi-phased analysis rationale. In brief, the phases may be summarized as follows (as a minimum Schedule 'B' projects address Phases 1 and 2):

- Phase 1 - Identify the problem (deficiency) or opportunity;
- Phase 2 - Identify alternative solutions to address the problem or opportunity by taking into consideration the existing environment, and establish the preferred solution taking into account public and review agency input. At this point, determine the appropriate Schedule for the undertaking and document decisions in a Project File for Schedule B projects, or proceed through the following Phases for Schedule C projects;
- Phase 3 - Examine alternative methods of implementing the preferred solution, based upon the existing environment, public and review agency input, anticipated environmental effects and methods of minimizing negative effects and maximizing positive effects;

SUBJECT: New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11) - Page 7 of 12

- Phase 4 - Document, in an Environmental Study Report a summary of the rationale, and the planning, design, and consultation process of the project as established through the above Phases, and make such documentation available for scrutiny by review agencies and the public;
- Phase 5 - Complete contract drawings and documents and proceed to construction and operation; monitor construction for adherence to environmental provisions and commitments. Where special conditions dictate, also monitor the operation of the completed facilities.

The main elements of the Class EA planning process are incorporated in the following five phases:

	Phase 1		Phase 2		Phase 3		Phase 4		Phase 5
	Problem or Opportunity	→	Alternative Solutions	→	Alternative Design Concepts for Preferred Solution	→	Environmental Study Report	→	Implementation
Consultation Requirements	Optional		Mandatory		Mandatory		Mandatory		Optional

The planning and design process was undertaken in such a way as to allow a reviewer to trace each step of the process. In particular, the documentation explained the reasons for the criteria used to identify and assess the alternatives, the proponent’s weighing of these criteria, and the decision-making process followed.

To ensure that the planning and design process is easily traceable, the study ensured that:

- the analysis is understandable to the reasonable lay observer;
- all conclusions drawn from the analysis follow logically from the information gathered and presented; and
- a reasonable lay observer is able to replicate the conclusions based on the information presented.

Specifically, the narrative of this study is summarized as follows with detailed documentation in the Project File Report under separate cover.

SUBJECT: New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11) - Page 8 of 12

The Class EA Problem/Opportunity Statement was established at the onset of the study as follows:

- The city currently operates two septage waste haulage receiving stations - one at the Woodward Avenue Wastewater Treatment Plant and one on Upper Ottawa Street at the Mountain Transfer Station;
- The Woodward Avenue Wastewater Treatment Plant Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station is scheduled to be replaced with a new Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station at the Eastport Drive Sewage Pumping Station;
- Due to a number of operational challenges and site constraints at the Upper Ottawa Street Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station, the City is in need of a new Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station to service the southern portion of the City;
- The new station should support the objectives of the City's Septage Waste Haulage Program and the Sewer Use By-Law, while minimizing impacts to the social, cultural and natural environments.

All reasonable alternatives that meet the requirements of the Problem/Opportunity Statement were identified. The following is a list of the six alternatives considered in the study:

Alternatives	Description
1. Do Nothing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Status Quo
2. Airport Option 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lands Located in the Airport Employment Growth District Secondary Plan • Designated as Airport Prestige Business Land Use • Southwest Area of Upper James Street and Dickenson Road West
3. Airport Option 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lands Located in the Airport Employment Growth District Secondary Plan • Designated as Airport Prestige Business Land Use • Southeast Area of Upper James Street and Dickenson Road East
4. Upper James/Twenty Road Option	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Northwest Area of Upper Street and Twenty Road West
5. Hannon Option 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lands Located in Prestige Business Park Land Use • Between Rymal Road East and Twenty Road East
6. Hannon Option 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lands Located in Prestige Business Park Land Use • Southwest Corner of Glover Road and Twenty Road East

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11) - Page 9 of 12

Evaluation Criteria reflect the Triple Bottom Line evaluation methodology. The evaluation criteria established by the Project Team are summarized below. A detailed breakdown of each category is included in the Project File Report:

- Socio-Economic and Cultural Environment
- Natural Environment
- Engineering and Technical Considerations
- Economic

For the alternatives where the evaluation criterion is the best, the highest rank will be assigned. If the alternative has a disadvantage for that evaluation criterion, then it will be assigned a lower rank. The intent of this method of evaluation is to identify, for each evaluation criterion, which alternative or alternatives have an advantage or are preferred. Once this evaluation process is completed for all criteria, it can then be determined which alternative has the overall highest rank and preference.

Environmental Component	Airport 1	Airport 2	Upper James/ Twenty Road	Hannon 1	Hannon 2
Socio-Economic/ Cultural	Land acquisition required Limited truck routes Potential odour impact	Similar to Airport 1 Located within future commercial area	Potential odour and noise impact Proximity to residential area	Preferred due to proximity to truck routes Within industrial area Limited impact to surroundings	Located within prominent area of existing industrial business park
Category Score	16.9/25	13.1/25	16.9/25	23.8/25	20/25
Natural	Minimal environmental impact	Minimal environmental impact	Stream regulated by the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority Provincially Significant Wetland	Stream regulated by the Hamilton Conservation Authority Located on the site Mitigation measures can be identified	Stream regulated by the Hamilton Conservation Authority Located on the site Mitigation measures can be identified

SUBJECT: New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW19047) (Ward 11) - Page 10 of 12

Category Score	20.7/25	20.7/25	17.9/25	16.4/25	17.9
Technical	Limited downstream sewer capacity Pumping required	Limited downstream sewer capacity Pumping required	Limited downstream sewer capacity Pumping required	Gravity fed to WWTP Sufficient downstream sewer capacity	Gravity fed to WWTP Sufficient downstream sewer capacity
Category Score	17.9/25	16.4/25	17.9/25	20.7/25	19.3/25
Economic	\$4.5-5M capital cost	\$4.5-5M capital cost	\$5.5-6M capital cost	\$4.5-5M capital cost	\$4.5-5M capital cost
Category Score	15/25	15/25	10/25	15/25	15/25
Overall Score	70.5/100	65.2/100	62.7/100	75.9/100	72.2/100
Overall Ranking	3 rd	4 th	5 th	1 st	2 nd

Each alternative was screened against the evaluation criteria. The highest rank alternative was deemed to be the preferred alternative. The preferred site for the new septage waste haulage receiving station is the Hannon Option 1 site, located on Dartnall Road between Rymal Road East and Twenty Road East.

Mitigation measures of any negative environmental impact (such as odour control, noise control and dust control, as examples) of the preferred alternative have been identified and become conditions of the Implementation Phase of the Class EA. Detailed mitigation measures are included in the Project File Report under separate cover.

Public and Stakeholder consultation is an integral part of the Class EA process. See the Relevant Consultation section of this Report and the Project File for more details. The final step in the analysis rationale before proceeding to implementation of the preferred alternative is to undertake the mandatory 30-day review. A Notice of Completion of the Class EA as recommended herein will be issued in the second quarter of 2019. Notices will be issued via newspaper advertising and direct mail out to all members of the Stakeholder and Agency Contact lists. The Project File will be placed on public record along with contact information to receive concerns. All attempts will be made to mitigate all expressed concerns. Should resolution of a concern be unattainable the conflict may be escalated by the opponent to the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks for a decision.

The above analysis rationale is a prescribed process under that Municipal Class Environmental Assessment. The project was completed under full compliance.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

The recommended alternative solution has been identified using an evaluation and screening process that fulfils the requirements under the Municipal Engineers Association (MEA) Municipal Class EA document for Schedule 'B' projects.

The preferred site for the new septage waste haulage receiving station is Hannon Option 1 site, located on Dartnall Road between Rymal Road East and Twenty Road East. There are two alternatives for Council to consider with respect to the recommendations of this report:

1. To file the New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment with the City Clerk for a minimum 30-day period for public and review agency review in order to complete the first two phases of the Municipal Class EA process. This will offer the public and agencies the opportunity for placement of a Part II Order (appeal) with the Minister of Environment, Conservation and Parks and fulfil the City's legal obligations under the EA Act.
2. To not file the New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment with the City Clerk for a minimum 30-day public and agency review period and, as a consequence, to not proceed with implementation.

Should Council not wish to approve the filing of the New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Project File Report, the Municipal Class EA process would be considered incomplete by the provincial government and the City will not have approval under provincial environmental legislation to implement the preferred alternative. The outcome would be equivalent to the "Do Nothing" alternative, which would result in the inability to effectively address the requirements of City's Hauled Waste Management Program.

The alternative to not approve the filing of the New Septage Waste Haulage Receiving Station Schedule 'B' Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Project File Report is not recommended.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Community Engagement and Participation

Hamilton has an open, transparent and accessible approach to City government that engages with and empowers all citizens to be involved in their community.

Economic Prosperity and Growth

Hamilton has a prosperous and diverse local economy where people have opportunities to grow and develop.

Healthy and Safe Communities

Hamilton is a safe and supportive City where people are active, healthy, and have a high quality of life.

Clean and Green

Hamilton is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

Our People and Performance

Hamiltonians have a high level of trust and confidence in their City government.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" - Map of Short Listed Alternative Sites