



**CITY OF HAMILTON**  
**PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT**  
**Planning Division**

<b>TO:</b>	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
<b>COMMITTEE DATE:</b>	February 20, 2020
<b>SUBJECT/REPORT NO:</b>	Recommendation to Designate 24 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Centenary United Church) under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (PED20044) (Ward 2)
<b>WARD(S) AFFECTED:</b>	Ward 2
<b>PREPARED BY:</b>	David Addington (905) 546-2424 Ext. 1214
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>	Steve Robichaud Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	

**RECOMMENDATION**

- (a) That the designation of 24 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Centenary United Church), shown in Appendix "A" to Report PED20044, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, be approved;
- (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20044, be approved; and,
- (c) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 24 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Centenary United Church) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED20044.

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

24 Main Street West, Hamilton is the site of the former Centenary United Church which is now known as New Vision United Church. The subject property was added to the City of Hamilton's Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and the work plan for designation by Hamilton City Council in September 2014 as part of the comprehensive Downtown Built Heritage Inventory Project. This recommendation was supported by staff and the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee at their August 21, 2014 meeting.

New Vision United Church is currently planning to adapt its auditorium to a concert venue use to help remain viable in the wake of declining congregation numbers. Performance events have been held at the subject property in the past and New Vision United Church intends on undertaking renovations to facilitate this adaptive reuse while meeting building and fire code requirements. New Vision United Church retained consultants including McCallum Sather Architects (MSA) to develop a construction plan to guide the reuse while preserving the heritage attributes of the building. As an extension of this background work, New Vision United Church opted to retain MSA to prepare a Cultural Heritage Assessment to comprehensively assess the church's heritage merit including the preparation of a Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes. The final Cultural Heritage Assessment report, dated November 19, 2019, is attached as Appendix "D" and the recommended Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes is attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20044.

The subject property was evaluated using both the Council-adopted heritage evaluation criteria and the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, as defined in Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. It has been determined that the subject property meets the criteria for designation, therefore, staff recommend 24 Main Street West, Hamilton for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

## **Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 11**

## **FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

Financial: N/A

Staffing: N/A

Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the

**SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 24 Main Street West, Hamilton  
(Former Centenary United Church) under Part IV of the *Ontario  
Heritage Act* (PED20044) (Ward 2) - Page 3 of 12**

---

*Ontario Heritage Act*, and heard before the Conservation Review Board, prior to further consideration by Council of the designation By-law.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the Act.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)). Designation does not restrict the use of a property, prohibit alterations or additions, or restrict the sale of a property. The City of Hamilton also provides heritage grants and loan programs to assist in the continuing conservation of properties, once they are designated.

## **PROJECT BACKGROUND**

The subject property was added to the City of Hamilton's Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and the work plan for designation in September 2014 as part of the comprehensive Downtown Built Heritage Inventory Project (DBHI). Staff Report PED14191, which included the recommendation to add 24 Main Street West, Hamilton to the Register and to the work plan for designation among other downtown properties, was approved by Planning Committee on September 16, 2014 and ratified by Council on September 24, 2014. A preliminary evaluation of the cultural heritage value of the subject property was included in Report PED14191.

The subject property was initially recommended to be added to the work plan for a projected designation date of 2021. At the request of New Vision United Church at the June 6, 2017 Planning Committee meeting, the Cultural Heritage Assessment work for the purposes of considering designation was reassigned to staff's work program for 2017. Staff retained the consultant MHBC to complete a Cultural Heritage Assessment of the subject property in January 2018 (final report dated November 29, 2019 and attached as Appendix "E" to Report PED20044).

In June 2018, New Vision United Church had requested to put the designation work on hold to allow for consideration of options to bring the building into compliance with building and fire code requirements in anticipation of the concert venue use. New Vision United Church retained MSA in January 2019 to conduct a building master plan and construction plan to guide the adaptive reuse. Given MSA's familiarity with the church

and master plan to incorporate the concert venue use, New Vision United Church retained them to complete a Cultural Heritage Assessment for the subject property (final report dated November 19, 2019 and attached as Appendix “D” to Report PED20044).

The comprehensive research and cultural heritage assessment work that has submitted is intended to inform staff’s recommendation and to provide Committee and Council with adequate information upon which to base a decision regarding designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Upon the request of New Vision United Church, staff worked with MSA to develop the recommended Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes as contained in Appendix “B” to Report PED20044. The historical research and property evaluation in the cultural heritage assessment by MSA was used by staff as the basis for the recommendations in Report PED20044 as it included comprehensive research into the interior and exterior of the property and was informed by familiarity with the proposed adaptive reuse. The cultural heritage assessment by MHBC did not include an evaluation of the interior of the church as they were not granted interior access, therefore, the property evaluation was less comprehensive than the MSA assessment. Both the MSA and MHBC cultural heritage assessments identified the majority of the exterior building features as significant heritage attributes and indicated that the property has sufficient heritage value to merit designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

The property’s cultural heritage value was assessed using the Council adopted heritage evaluation criteria and the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, as defined in Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. As outlined in the MSA Cultural Heritage Assessment, it has been determined that the subject property meets twelve of the City’s twelve criteria and eight of nine criteria as defined in Ontario Regulation 9/06. Therefore, staff recommend the designation of the subject property under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

## **HISTORICAL BACKGROUND**

The former Centenary United Church at 24 Main Street West, Hamilton is a two storey, red brick church originally built in 1868 for the Methodist Congregation. Its construction was necessitated by a rapidly growing population in Hamilton, one-fifth of which were Methodists. When the church was built it was regarded as an elegant and commodious church that would accommodate the overflow of congregants that the original Methodist churches could not contain.

The church was expanded with the addition of a front vestibule, Sunday school and lecture hall in 1896 and again in 1992 with the single storey addition around the east and north elevations. The Sunday school and lecture hall were demolished in 1991. In 1925, the Methodist, Congregational and majority of the Presbyterian churches joined

together to form the United Church of Canada and it was at this time that the church became known as Centenary United Church. The church was renamed New Vision United Church in 2014. It is the oldest remaining United church in downtown Hamilton constructed for the Methodists and remaining in continuous use by congregations in the Canadian Methodist tradition.

The 1868 church was designed by prominent local architect Albert H. Hills primarily in the Romanesque Revival style, a style not commonly applied to church buildings. The choice of building a church in this architectural style is thought as visibly distinguishing the Methodists from those that accept the Pope's authority, where churches were commonly built emphasizing the Gothic Revival style. None of the other Methodist churches in Hamilton built at the time featured Romanesque Revival features to the extent of Centenary United Church. Additionally, the open design and ample size of the auditorium with the U-shaped balcony functions to amplify the voice of the preacher to all congregants. The emphasis on creating a preaching space as opposed to sanctuary is reflective of the Methodist's approach to worship.

The former Centenary United Church was the site of the 1881 formation of the Centenary Woman's Missionary Society which was the first Women's Missionary Society of the Canadian Methodist Church. Martha Cartmell, a member of the Centenary United Church and the Woman's Missionary Society, was the first Canadian female Methodist Missionary to travel abroad when she went to Japan in 1882. The subject property is also associated with Edward Jackson, a member and trustee of the Centenary United Church, who also funded the first Chair of theology at Victoria University in Toronto.

## **POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS**

### **Provincial Policy Statement:**

Section 2.6 of the Provincial Policy Statement pertains to Cultural Heritage and Archaeology and provides that:

"2.6.1 Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved."

The recommendations to designate the subject lands under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* of Report PED20044 are consistent with this policy.

**Urban Hamilton Official Plan:**

Volume 1, Section B.3.4 - Cultural Heritage Resources Policies of the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) include the following:

- “B.3.4.2.1(a) The City of Hamilton shall, in partnership with others where appropriate, protect and conserve the tangible cultural heritage resources of the City, including archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes for present and future generations.
- B.3.4.2.1(b) The City of Hamilton shall, in partnership with others where appropriate, identify cultural heritage resources through a continuing process of inventory, survey, and evaluation, as a basis for the wise management of these resources.
- B.3.4.2.3 The City may by By-law designate individual and groups of properties of cultural heritage value under Parts IV and V respectively of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, including buildings, properties, cultural heritage landscapes, heritage conservation districts, and heritage roads or road allowances.”

The recommendations to designate the subject lands under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* of Report PED20044 comply with these policies.

**RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

Pursuant to Sub-section 29 (2) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, Council is required to consult with its Municipal Heritage Committee respecting designation of property under Sub-section (1) of the Act. Typically, Cultural Heritage Assessments are reviewed by the Inventory and Research Working Group (IRWG) of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee in accordance with the Council approved process attached as Appendix “F” of Report PED20044.

A draft Cultural Heritage Assessment prepared by MSA (dated August 30, 2019) was reviewed by the IRWG at their meeting on September 23, 2019. The IRWG received the draft report and supported the Cultural Heritage Assessment’s recommendation for designation. The IRWG identified multiple areas for revision to provide a more complete rationale to support the report’s conclusions. The revisions noted by IRWG were consistent with the revisions identified by staff. MSA addressed the identified concerns in a revised draft of the report on November 1, 2019 and a final version on November 19, 2019.

The IRWG also received and reviewed a draft of the MHBC Cultural Heritage Assessment at their meeting on October 28, 2019. Members agreed that the MHBC report was thorough and agreed with the report's recommendation to designate the property.

Staff attended a site visit with the church Minister on December 11, 2019. Additionally, staff consulted with the Minister regarding the proposed adaptive reuse of the Church and in the drafting of the recommended Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes.

Staff also informed the Ward Councillor of the request to designate and the recommendations of Report PED20044. The Ward Councillor expressed support of the designation of 24 Main Street West, Hamilton.

## **ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION**

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of cultural resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality is enabled to manage change and alterations to the property through the Heritage Permit process and to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained through the provision of financial assistance programs and the enforcement of Property Standards By-laws.

### **Adaptive Re-use to a Concert Venue:**

It is expected that the adaption of the church to accommodate a concert venue use will have a positive overall impact on the preservation of the building's heritage features as it will ensure the continued use and stewardship of the building. The proposed repurposing of the space is anticipated to include the addition of air conditioning, upgrades to meet building and fire code requirements, installation of lighting and speaker arrays, installation of a new elevator and washroom and establishing a gathering area on the main floor area. The interior of the main floor area consists of modern treatment and does not contain any heritage attributes. The proposed renovations have not yet commenced. The building is intended to function both as concert venue while also accommodating church services.

The designation of the property will not prevent the future repurposing of the building. New Vision United Church has worked with MSA to develop a construction plan to minimize the impact to the building's heritage features including the auditorium, entrances, balcony and exterior features. Where impacts to heritage attributes are unavoidable, such as with the potential construction of ceiling supports for light and

speaker arrays, Heritage Permits will be required to ensure there is minimal impact to the attribute through the application of appropriate mitigation measures.

Non-designated features that are not anticipated to be impacted by the proposed adaptive reuse include the organ, choir gallery, chandeliers, pews in the balcony (there are no pews on the ground floor) and the 1992 addition. It is expected that the exterior casing of the elevator will be impacted by the installation of a new, larger elevator in the same area as the existing elevator block. The elevator car itself is not original and is a modern replacement. New Vision United Church intends to salvage the decorative material on the elevator casing for use within the building. Should non-designated heritage features be altered by the repurposing, it is recommended that a salvage plan be prepared to mitigate the impact to the feature, to be submitted at the time of Heritage Permit application for the property's reuse.

### **Cultural Heritage Evaluation:**

Designation is guided by the process of cultural heritage evaluation and assessment. The evaluation process, as documented in the MSA Cultural Heritage Assessment, attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED20044, attempts to clearly identify those heritage values associated with a property.

### **Council-Adopted Evaluation Criteria:**

A set of criteria were endorsed by the City of Hamilton's Municipal Heritage Committee on June 19, 2003 and were adopted by Council as The City of Hamilton: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Criteria on October 29, 2008 (Appendix "B" to Report PED08211). The criteria are used to identify the cultural heritage values of a property, and to assess their significance. This evaluation assists in determining a property's merit for designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as well as deriving a Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes.

As identified in the MSA Cultural Heritage Assessment attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED20044, the property was determined to have met twelve of the City's twelve criteria pertaining to built heritage value.

### **Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest:**

Section 29 (1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets the criteria prescribed by provincial regulation. In 2006, the Province issued Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. According to Sub-section 1 (2) of Ontario Regulation 9/06, a property may be designated under



**SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 24 Main Street West, Hamilton  
(Former Centenary United Church) under Part IV of the *Ontario  
Heritage Act* (PED20044) (Ward 2) - Page 9 of 12**

---

Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* where it meets one or more of the identified criteria. Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies criteria in three broad categories: Design/Physical Value, Historical/Associative Value and Contextual Value.

As outlined in the attached MSA Cultural Heritage Assessment (see Appendix “D” to Report PED20044), the subject property satisfies eight of the nine criteria contained in Ontario Regulation 9/06 in all three categories.

**1. Design / Physical Value:**

- i. The property is a rare example of a church building built for the Methodists in the City of Hamilton and is the only surviving example of a Methodist church in the downtown core. The church’s architectural style is a representative example of a Romanesque Revival red brick church in the City of Hamilton.
- ii. The property displays a high degree of artistic merit in the design, composition and execution of the carved limestone accents, granite column shafts, incorporation of slim octagonal buttresses, brick corbelling and castellations and stained glass window work. In the interior it is displayed through the metal columns supporting the balcony area, the carved stone memorials at either side of the choir and former pulpit area.
- iii. The property is not considered to have a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

**2. Historical / Associative Value:**

- i. The property has historical or associative value as it has direct associations with the theme of religious organizations in the City of Hamilton and their contributions to the City’s cultural and social life. Additionally, the Centenary Women’s Missionary Society was founded at the Centenary United Church in 1881. It is associated with Martha Cartmell, member of the congregation and first Canadian woman Methodist missionary abroad. It is also associated with Edward Jackson, member and trustee of the Centenary United Church, who funded the first Chair of theology at Victoria University in Toronto.
- ii. The property has the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture in the design of the interior U-shaped layout of the balcony in the auditorium, the only existing in Hamilton associated with the Methodist community.

- iii. The property reflects the work or ideas of an architect who is significant to the City of Hamilton. The church was designed by Albert H. Hills, early builder and architect in Hamilton. He is the architect of several notable buildings some no longer standing (Knox Presbyterian Church, Crystal Palace). The Centenary United Church represents a unique example of his work due to its larger scale than the other surviving ecclesiastical work and execution of the design in the Romanesque Revival style with the unique octagonal turrets.

**3. Contextual Value:**

- i. Through the visual prominence of the front and MacNab Street elevations, the building has been a defining architectural element of the streetscape since 1868. From a social functional perspective, the church's presence within the downtown urban fabric demonstrates a longstanding and evolving history of a community gathering space centered within the downtown core which has included over 150 years of religious devotion, a youth community centre and a live music venue.
- ii. Although the area and adjacent buildings have changed over time, the church has remained in situ, physically and visually linked to its surroundings.
- iii. The building's physically unique and distinct architectural features stand out from the surrounding buildings. Its grand scale and the unique octagonal turrets have held its visual prominence through history and the changing streetscape.

**Conclusion:**

The consultants have determined that the subject property, 24 Main Street West, Hamilton is of cultural heritage value or interest, sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff concur with the findings of both the MSA and MHBC Cultural Heritage Assessment reports (attached as Appendices "D" and "E" respectively to Report PED20044) that the subject property has cultural heritage value. Therefore, staff recommends designation of 24 Main Street West, Hamilton under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and the Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20044 and the draft Notice of Intention to Designate attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED20044.

With respect to the potential repurposing of the building, any proposal to convert the building to a new use that may affect the property's heritage attributes will be subject to the approval of a Heritage Permit. Staff recommend that any future Heritage Permit application for the building's conversion be accompanied by a salvage plan for any non-designated or designated heritage features that may be partially or fully removed in the repurposing.

## **ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION**

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may consider two alternatives: agree to designate property or decline to designate property.

### **Decline to Designate:**

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's heritage grant and loan programs. Designation does not restrict the use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or affect its resale value. Staff does not consider declining to designate the property to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

## **ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN**

### **Clean and Green**

*Hamilton* is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.

### **Built Environment and Infrastructure**

*Hamilton* is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

### **Culture and Diversity**

*Hamilton* is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

**APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED**

- Appendix “A” - Location Map
- Appendix “B” - Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes
- Appendix “C” - Notice of Intention to Designate
- Appendix “D” - McCallum Sather Architects (MSA) Cultural Heritage Assessment Report for 24 Main Street West, Hamilton, dated November 19, 2019
- Appendix “E” - MHBC Cultural Heritage Assessment Report for 24 Main Street West, Hamilton, dated November, 2019
- Appendix “F” - Council-Adopted Heritage Designation Process