

HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE MINUTES 20-002

12:00 p.m. February 20, 2020 Room 264, 2nd Floor Hamilton City Hall 71 Main Street West

Present: Councillor M. Pearson

A. Denham-Robinson (Chair) J. Brown, K. Burke, G. Carroll, C. Dimitry (Vice-Chair), B. Janssen, L. Lunsted, T. Ritchie and W.

Rosart

Absent with

Regrets: D. Beland and R. McKee

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO THE PLANNING COMMITTEE FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. Effect of Heritage Designations on Property Values in Hamilton (PED20030) (Added Item 7.6)

(Rosart/Burke)

That Report PED20030 respecting the Effect of Heritage Designations on Property Values in Hamilton, be received for the information of Committee.

CARRIED

2. Recommendation to Designate 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED20050) (Ward 2) (Item 9.2)

(Burke/Carroll)

- (a) That the designation of 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building), shown in Appendix "A" to Report PED20050, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be approved;
- (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20050, be approved;
- (c) That the foyer of the 1929 building located at 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building), displays a high degree of artistic merit and is therefore considered to meet the Design and

Physical Value Evaluation Criteria under O. Reg 9/06 for craftmanship or artistic merit;

- (d) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20050, be amended and approved, to include the following:
 - (i) inclusion of the operation of windows; and,
- (e) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED20050.

CARRIED

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 2)

The Clerk advised the Committee of the following changes:

5. **COMMUNICATIONS**

5.1 Correspondence respecting 462 Wilson Street, Ancaster

Recommendation: Be received.

7. CONSENT ITEMS

- 7.5 Delegated Approval: Proposed Door Replacement for the Carriage House at 211 St. Clair Blvd., (Ward 3) (By-law No. 92-140)
- 7.6 Effect of Heritage Designations on Property Values in Hamilton (PED20030)

13. GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS

13.1 Representative from the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee on the Cross-Melville District Heritage Committee (Dundas)

(Lunsted/Carroll)

That the Agenda for the February 20, 2020 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) January 16, 2020 (Item 4.1)

(Janssen/Brown)

That the Minutes of the January 16, 2020 meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

(d) COMMUNICATIONS (Item 5)

(i) Correspondence respecting 462 Wilson Street, Ancaster (Added Item 5.1)

(Ritchie/Carroll)

That the Correspondence respecting 462 Wilson Street, Ancaster, be received.

CARRIED

(e) CONSENT ITEMS (Item 7)

(i) Delegated Approval: Heritage Permit Application HP2020-003: Proposed repointing and restoration at 1280 Main Street West, Building 8, Hamilton (Ward 1) (By-law No. 08-002) (Item 7.1)

(Brown/Ritchie)

That Delegated Approval respecting Heritage Permit Application HP2020-003: Proposed repointing and restoration at 1280 Main Street West, Building 8, Hamilton (Ward 1) (By-law No. 08-002), be received.

CARRIED

(ii) Hamilton Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee Minutes - November 19, 2019 (Item 7.2)

(Ritchie/Burke)

That the Hamilton Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee Minutes of November 19, 2019, be received.

CARRIED

(iii) Inventory & Research Working Group Meeting Notes - November 25, 2019 (Item 7.3)

(Lunsted/Ritchie)

That the Inventory & Research Working Group Meeting Notes of November 25, 2019, be received.

CARRIED

(iv) Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes - December 18, 2019 (Item 7.4)

(Brown/Carroll)

That the Policy and Design Working Group Meeting Notes of December 18, 2019, be received.

CARRIED

(v) Delegated Approval: Proposed Door Replacement for the Carriage House at 211 St. Clair Blvd., (Ward 3) (By-law No. 92-140) (Added Item 7.5)

(Ritchie/Janssen)

That the Delegated Approval respecting a Proposed Door Replacement for the Carriage House at 211 St. Clair Blvd., (Ward 3) (By-law No. 92-140), be received.

CARRIED

(f) STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 9)

(i) Recommendation to Designate 24 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Centenary United Church) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED20044) (Ward 2) (Item 9.1)

David Addington, Cultural Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee respecting the Recommendation to Designate 24 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Centenary United Church) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED20044) (Ward 2), with the aid of a PowerPoint presentation.

(Pearson/Carroll)

That the presentation respecting the Recommendation to Designate 24 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Centenary United Church) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED20044) (Ward 2), be received.

CARRIED

A copy of the presentation is available at www.hamilton.ca and through the Clerk's Office.

The following recommendation, as amended, was proposed for consideration at the May 13, 2020 Council meeting.

(a) That the designation of 24 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Centenary United Church), shown in Appendix "A" to Report

- PED20044, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be approved;
- (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20044, be approved; and,
- (c) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 24 Main Street West, Hamilton (Former Centenary United Church) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED20044.
- (ii) Recommendation to Designate 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED20050) (Ward 2) (Item 9.2)

David Addington, Cultural Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee respecting the Recommendation to Designate 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED20050) (Ward 2), with the aid of a PowerPoint presentation.

(Carroll/Burke)

That the presentation respecting the Recommendation to Designate 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED20050) (Ward 2), be received.

CARRIED

(Brown/Janssen)

That Report PED20050 respecting the the Recommendation to Designate 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, be amended to include new sub-sections (c) and (d), with the remaining sub-sections to be renumbered accordingly:

- (a) That the designation of 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building), shown in Appendix "A" to Report PED20050, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, be approved;
- (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20050, be approved;
- (c) That the foyer of the 1929 building located at 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building), displays a

- high degree of artistic merit and is therefore considered to meet the Design and Physical Value Evaluation Criteria under O. Reg 9/06 for craftmanship or artistic merit;
- (d) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20050, be amended and approved, to include the following:
 - (i) inclusion of the operation of windows; and,
- (e) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 127 Hughson Street North, Hamilton (Firth Brothers Building) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED20050.

Amendment CARRIED Main Motion as Amended, CARRIED

A copy of the presentation is available at www.hamilton.ca and through the Clerk's Office.

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 2.

- (g) GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS (Item 13)
 - A. Denham-Robinson relinquished the Chair to discuss the following items.
 - (i) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Attendance at the 2020 Ontario Heritage Conference (May 28-30, 2020 in Markham, Ontario) (Item 13.1)

(Burke/Lunsted)

That staff be directed to investigate costs for G. Carroll and J. Brown to attend the 2020 Ontario Heritage Conference, as representatives of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

CARRIED

- (ii) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Post Event Review "Preserving Hamilton's Built Heritage" (Workshop by Alan Stacey, February 19, 2020) (Item 13.2)
 - A. Denham-Robinson provided an overview of the event.

(Ritchie/Brown)

That the information respecting the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Post Event Review - "Preserving Hamilton's Built Heritage", be received.

CARRIED

(iii) Update on the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Heritage Recognition Awards 2019-20 (to be held on Thursday June 18, 2020) (Item 13.3)

A. Denham-Robinson advised that the deadline for submissions to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Heritage Recognition Awards 2019-20 is March 2, 2020.

(Carroll/Ritchie)

That the information respecting the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Heritage Recognition Awards 2019-20, be received.

CARRIED

(iv) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Participation in the City of Hamilton Heritage Day Event (Saturday February 22, 2020) (Item 13.4)

A. Denham-Robinson reminded those Committee members participating in the City of Hamilton Heritage Day Event, that set-up for the event begins at 9:00 a.m..

(Lunsted/Janssen)

That the information respecting the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Participation in the City of Hamilton Heritage Day Event, be received.

CARRIED

(v) Call for Volunteers for Doors Open Hamilton - Application Deadline April 1, 2020 (Item 13.5)

A. Denham-Robinson asked Committee members to consider volunteering for the upcoming Doors Open Hamilton event.

(Pearson/Ritchie)

That the information respecting a Call for Volunteers for Doors Open Hamilton - Application Deadline April 1, 2020, be received.

CARRIED

(vi) Buildings and Landscapes (Item 13.6)

(Ritchie/Carroll)

That the property know as Chedoke Estate (Balfour House), located at 1 Balfour Drive, Hamilton, be added to the Buildings and Landscapes of Interest (YELLOW).

CARRIED

(Carroll/Rosart)

That the following updates **as amended**, be received:

- (a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes (RED):
 (Red = Properties where there is a perceived immediate threat
 to heritage resources through: demolition; neglect; vacancy;
 alterations, and/or, redevelopment)
 - (i) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) T. Ritchie
 - (ii) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) C. Dimitry
 - (iii) Century Manor, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (D) G. Carroll
 - (iv) Beach Canal Lighthouse and Cottage (D) R. McKee
 - (v) 18-22 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) W. Rosart
 - (vi) 24-28 King Street East, Hamilton (R)(NOI) W. Rosart
 - (vii) 2 Hatt Street, Dundas (R) K. Burke
 - (viii) James Street Baptist Church, 98 James Street South, Hamilton (D) – J. Brown
 - (ix) 828 Sanatorium Road G. Carroll
 - (x) 120 Park Street, Hamilton R. McKee
 - (xi) 398 Wilson Street, Hamilton C. Dimitry

- (b) Buildings and Landscapes of Interest (YELLOW):

 (Yellow = Properties that are undergoing some type of change, such as a change in ownership or use, but are not perceived as being immediately threatened)
 - (i) Delta High School, 1284 Main Street East, Hamilton (D) D. Beland
 - (ii) 2251 Rymal Road East, Stoney Creek (R) B. Janssen
 - (iii) Former Valley City Manufacturing, 64 Hatt Street, Dundas K. Burke

New tarps have been installed on the roof of the property.

- (iv) St. Joseph's Motherhouse, 574 Northcliffe Avenue, Dundas (R) (ND) W. Rosart
- (v) Coppley Building, 104 King Street West; 56 York Blvd., and 63-76 MacNab Street North (NOI) G. Carroll
- (vi) 1021 Garner Road East, Ancaster (Lampman House) (NOI) –C. Dimitry
- (vii) Dunington-Grubb Gardens, 1000 Main Street East (within Gage Park) D. Beland
- (viii) 1 St. James Place, Hamilton (D) J. Brown
- (ix) St. Clair Blvd. Conservation District D. Beland
- (x) 51 Herkimer Street, Hamilton J. Brown
- (xi) 52 Charlton Avenue West, Hamilton J. Brown
- (xii) 292 Dundas Street, Waterdown L. Lunsted
- (xiii) Chedoke Estate (Balfour House), 1 Balfour Drive, Hamilton T. Ritchie

(c) Heritage Properties Update (GREEN): (Green = Properties whose status is stable)

- (i) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (R) T. Ritchie
- (ii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) R. McKee

- (iii) Treble Hall, 4-12 John Street North, Hamilton (R) T. Ritchie
- (iv) 104 King Street West, Dundas (Former Post Office) K. Burke
- (v) 45 Forest Avenue, Hamilton G. Carroll
- (vi) 125 King Street East, Hamilton T. Ritchie
- (d) Heritage Properties Update (black):

(Black = Properties that HMHC have no control over and may be demolished)

- (i) Auchmar Gate House, Claremont Lodge 71 Claremont Drive (R) R. McKee
- (ii) 80 and 92 Barton Street East (Hanrahan Hotel) T. Ritchie CARRIED
- (vii) Representative from the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee on the Cross-Melville District Heritage Committee (Dundas) (Added Item 13.7)

(Brown/Carroll)

That K. Burke be appointed to sit as a representative on the Cross-Melville District Heritage Committee (Dundas) for the duration of the 2018-2022 term.

CARRIED

(h) ADJOURNMENT (Item 15)

(Carroll/Ritchie)

That, there being no further business, the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, be adjourned at 1:35 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Alissa Denham-Robinson, Chair Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Loren Kolar Legislative Coordinator Office of the City Clerk