



CITY OF HAMILTON
CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE
Digital, Innovation & Strategic Partnerships

TO:	Chair and Members General Issues Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	February 17, 2021
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Hate Prevention and Mitigation Initiative Update (CM19006(d)) (City Wide)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	John Ariyo (905) 546-2424 Ext. 1564 Pauline Kajiura (905) 546-2424 Ext. 2567
SUBMITTED BY:	Cyrus Tehrani Chief Digital Officer Digital, Innovation & Strategic Partnerships City Manager's Office
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATIONS

That staff be directed to retain a telephone polling company, to partner with the Project Lead Consultant, to conduct city-wide telephone polling with a target of 600 respondents, respecting the Hate Prevention and Mitigation Initiative to be completed by April 2021, at an estimated cost of \$25,000 to be funded through the Tax Stabilization Reserve.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On September 23, 2020, the General Issues Committee of Council received a Consultant/Staff Recommendations Report. The report detailed key community engagement efforts already completed for the project. These included:

- **Equity-based Community and Public Conversations:** Between June 29 and August 19, 2020, six (6) individual virtual project engagement sessions were conducted and attended by **192** participants. The participants at each of the six separate sessions included - Black (40); Indigenous (15); Racialized (28); 2SLGBTQIA+ (33); Faith-based (15) and the General Public (61).
- **Community Survey:** Between June 16 and July 15, 2020, a detailed online community survey was also launched. The survey was completed by **91** participants across the city.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

- **Telephone and Email Exchanges:** Ten (**10**) specific telephone conversations and email exchanges took place involving the lead consultant and residents who preferred these methods.
- **Engagement with Council Members:** Between December 2019 and January 2020, six (**6**) Council members had a one-on-one conversation with the lead consultant and project Staff to share their thoughts on hate-motivated incidents in Hamilton, and what they had been hearing from constituents.
- **Mayor's Roundtable on Diversity and Inclusion:** Project consultant held two conversation sessions with the members of the Mayor's Roundtable on Diversity and Inclusion. The **13-member** table has diverse representation of community leaders and people with lived-experiences.
- **Best Practices Research:** The project consultant conducted a comprehensive review of at least **20** municipalities in Canada, United States, Australia and the United Kingdom to further complement findings from public engagement and inform key directions.

Council Directions, Research Findings, Status Updates and Recommendations

On September 23, 2020, Council provided key directions to Staff, including:

- Conduct further engagement with key community stakeholders and equity seeking groups to develop actions, recommendations and resource needs.
 - **Status update:** Staff are currently implementing this recommendation. The project consultant has also conducted further public engagement and received additional input on preliminary project recommendations.
- Conduct research and develop a report involving Legal Services, on what actions could be taken by Council to address public displays of flags and symbols considered by many as racist, hateful or offensive.
 - **Status update:** Staff are currently implementing this recommendation. A Staff report will be brought forward to Council when completed.
- Write a letter to the federal Minister of Justice requesting that the threshold of hate crime in the Criminal Code be consistently applied across law enforcement agencies in Canada
 - **Status update:** direction completed.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

- Engage with the Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO) to partner and address community equity issues common across Ontario municipalities.
 - **Status update:** two virtual anti-racism/equity conferences involving AMO and about 10 Greater Toronto and Hamilton Area (GTHA) municipalities were held in October and December 2020. Staff will continue to monitor the collaboration and bring forward further advocacy opportunities to Council.
- Lastly and specific to the 91 survey respondents, Council directed Staff to “review options as to how to obtain feedback from a larger sample of the broader community, with focus given to those with lived experiences, if possible, as it relates to the Hate Prevention and Mitigation Initiative, and report back to the General Issues Committee”.
 - **Status update:** this Council direction is the basis of this staff report – (CM19006(d)) (City Wide)).

Staff engaged with the Project Lead Consultant, reviewed survey best practices and obtained larger telephone polling quotes. Staff concluded that although pursuing a larger survey sample size effort might not significantly change some of the feedback already received from project participants to date, nevertheless a larger sample size will allow for broader community voices to be heard on the project.

For this reason, Staff are recommending to Council that Staff hire a polling company and conduct a citywide telephone polling. The polling will have 600 completed phone interviews at a cost estimate of \$25,000. The polling can be initiated and completed within two months. The sample quote details are attached as Appendix “A” to Report (CM19006(d)) (City Wide).

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: Recommendation cost estimate is \$25,000. The cost covers hiring a polling company and the Project Lead Consultant (Sage Solutions) working with the polling company to incorporate polling findings into final project reports. Staff recommend that the cost estimate be funded through the Tax Stabilization Reserve.

Staffing: There are no staffing implications related to the recommendations of Report (CM19006(d)) (City Wide).

Legal: There are no legal implications related to the recommendations of Report (CM19006(d)) (City Wide).

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

On December 11, 2013, Council passed a motion reinforcing the use of the City Hall Forecourt as a space for public demonstrations and protests, and that there should be no cost to do so. Council also directed that the Special Events Advisory Team (SEAT) coordinate with protest organizers, where advanced notice of a protest is given.

On March 28, 2018, Council passed a motion directing Staff to investigate and report on ways to mitigate the use of City park and public spaces by "hate groups" in consultation with various groups.

On July 12, 2019, Council approved Staff recommendations on the draft Hate Incident Prevention Policy and Procedures, draft Procedure for Notification of Assembly or Demonstration and Corporate Security Office report (LS19031/PW19068). Council also directed Staff to retain an external consultant and conduct public engagement on these policies, procedures and other related issues.

On August 12, 2019, Staff provided an information update on the Staff composition and a process to retain a public engagement consultant (CM19006).

On October 16, 2019, Council received various project updates relating to the consultant procurement process and Corporate Security. Notably, Council approved a Trespass bylaw as submitted by Legal Services (LS19031/PW19068(a)/CM19006(a)).

In December 2020, Staff issued two notices under the new Trespass by-law.

On February 20, 2020, Council received an information update on the retention of a public engagement consultant (Sage Solutions) and their proposed public engagement plan (LS19031/PW19068(b)/CM19006(b)) (City Wide).

On September 23, 2020, Council approved Staff recommendations to the General Issues Committee, along with the two reports submitted by project consultant on research and public engagement (LS19031/PW19068(c)/CM19006(c)) (City Wide). Status updates of the subsequent Council directions are detailed on page 2 of this report.

Similarly on September 23, 2020 report, Council directed Staff to review options as to how to obtain feedback from a larger sample of the broader community, with focus given to those with lived experiences, if possible, as it relates to the Hate Prevention and Mitigation Initiative, and report back to the General Issues Committee (LS19031/PW19068(c)/CM19006(c)) (City Wide). This Council direction is the basis for this Staff report.

Additional Community Engagement Activities (October 2020 – January 2021)

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

While Staff continued to implement previous recommendations from September 23, 2020, the consultant also continued to do parallel work by engaging various community partners and stakeholders for additional feedback and input.

Between October 2020 and January 2021, the project consultant conducted additional community engagement to obtain input on preliminary draft recommendations. About **100** community stakeholders and general public participated.

These project engagement activities included:

- LGBTQ Advisory Committee – engagement, review and input received on the consultant’s draft recommendations report (October 20, 2020).
- Mayor’s Roundtable on Diversity and Inclusion – engagement, review and input received on the consultant’s draft recommendations report (October 30, 2020).
- Community stakeholders’ Meeting – engagement, review and input received on the consultant’s draft recommendations report (November 13, 2020).
- Committee Against Racism – engagement, review and input received on the consultant’s draft recommendations report (November 24, 2020).
- LGBTQ Advisory Committee – final engagement, review and input received on the consultant’s draft recommendations report (December 15, 2020).
- Consultant’s draft recommendations report was posted on the new Engage Hamilton platform for general public feedback (survey ran from November 16, 2020 to January 8, 2021).

The collective findings from these engagement activities will be captured and used by the consultant to inform the final project recommendations report.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

Policy implications and legislation relating to this initiative from the beginning include Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedom, Criminal Code of Canada and the Ontario Human Rights Code. Other related policies include privacy, policing and public safety requirements. Staff will regularly review and advise Council on continued alignments with applicable policies and legislation.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Internal Consultations

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

- **Audit Division**

Staff consulted to obtain names of major polling companies that participated in the procurement process for Our City Survey, which helped with getting a better sense of polling companies in the market place and cost estimates.

- **Related Survey Results**

Staff reviewed methodology, approach and results from related City-led equity-based projects, such as the Urban Indigenous Strategy and the Hamilton Anti-Racism Resource Centre (HARRC).

External Consultations

- **Project Consultant and Polling Companies**

Staff consulted with the project consultant to obtain advice on engagement methodology and polling sizes. The consultant also supported Staff in obtaining sample quote estimates from potential polling companies based on project needs and requirements. The quote options and estimates are attached as Appendix “A” to Report (CM19006(d)) (City Wide).

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

For this report, Staff reviewed advice from the consultant, average quote estimates from polling companies, various public engagement feedback and the City-led survey results from previous equity-based community projects. Staff key findings include the following:

- The issue of hate incidents is not unique to Hamilton as it is a common problem across Canada and around the world. As initially directed by Council, the Hate Prevention & Mitigation initiative is aimed at conducting community engagement to better understand the experiences of people impacted by hate, what is driving hate incidents and helping the City come up with more effective policies, strategies and other solutions to addressing them.
- In addition to various research and public engagement conducted for this project, Police-report hate crimes in Hamilton also provide another set of useful data and evidence for consultant’s review and consideration.
- Findings show that multiple engagement approaches are the best ways of obtaining input from people with lived-experiences, equity-seeking groups and the general public on a sensitive and often traumatizing topic like hate. However, COVID-19 and its effect on in-person public engagement impacted the project ability to obtain larger community engagement input typical for this kind of equity-based initiative.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

- Very useful input has been received from residents, equity-seeking groups and various community stakeholders on the project to date, even amid the pandemic. This feedback is key and remains very relevant in shaping project final recommendations.
- Lastly, Staff concluded that any additional effort by the City of Hamilton to obtain a broader community input could further be beneficial. The feedback could assist with further informing project recommendations and other policy considerations.

In view of the foregoing, Staff recommended that Council could direct Staff to conduct additional polling to increase sample size by hiring a polling company. The polling company and the lead consultant will work together to design, conduct and proceed with a citywide polling sample at a cost estimate of \$25,000.

The polling will target 600 telephone interviews, +/-5% margin of error, 19 times out of 20, with 95% confidence interval. The turnaround is typically within a couple of months, which can be launched in February 2021 and completed by mid-April 2021. The polling results will then be incorporated by the Project Lead Consultant into the project final recommendations report and submit to Council for approval by June 2021.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

As alternatives, City Council could consider two options:

- A. Direct Staff to hire a polling company and conduct a ward-by-ward polling sample at a cost estimate of \$114,000. The polling will target 5,700 completed telephone interviews (380 completed interviews per ward). Margin of error is +/-5%, 19 times out of 20, with 95% confidence interval. The timeframe for this option is three months.
- B. Direct Staff to hire a consultant and organize a Virtual Town Hall. The one-hour event has features like a live moderator, polling questions, guest speakers, question screeners, live audio/video webcasts, reporting and other functionality. Invitation outreach to potential participants could be conducted through Hamilton telephone landlines, with option for a pre-registration website. The event could accommodate up to 15 questions from potential participants. Total event cost estimate is \$9,000. The timeframe for this option is four weeks, which includes preparation and event promotion to ensure better community awareness. However, with a maximum of 15 questions this option allows, Staff believe the option would not adequately yield a larger sample size that meets Council direction.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Community Engagement and Participation

Hamilton has an open, transparent and accessible approach to City government that engages with and empowers all citizens to be involved in their community.

Healthy and Safe Communities

Hamilton is a safe and supportive City where people are active, healthy, and have a high quality of life.

Culture and Diversity

Hamilton is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix “A” to Report (CM19006(d)) (City Wide): Telephone Polling Quotes

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.