



CITY OF HAMILTON
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
Growth Management Division

TO:	Mayor and Members General Issues Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	September 23, 2020
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Gordon Dean Avenue Phases 3 & 4 Draft Environmental Study Report (Ward 10) (PED20149)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 10
PREPARED BY:	Margaret Fazio (905) 546-2424 Ext. 2218
SUBMITTED BY:	Tony Sergi Senior Director, Growth Management Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That the Gordon Dean Avenue Phases 3 and 4 Municipal Class Environmental Assessment’s Draft Environmental Study Report be endorsed and that the General Manager of Planning and Economic Development Department be authorized and directed to advise the project proponent (Fruitland-Winona Development Group) to file the Environmental Study Report on the public record for a minimum thirty-day public review, subject to satisfactorily addressing staff comments.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Council approved the Fruitland Road (Barton Street to Highway 8) Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (EA) Study - Phases 1 & 2 in 2010, which fulfilled requirements of the Municipal Engineers Association’s Municipal Class Environment Assessment Document. The recommendations from the study included replacing Fruitland Road between Barton Street and Highway 8 with a new minor arterial road (with a truck route designation) within Block 1 of the Stoney Creek Urban Boundary Expansion (SCUBE) lands to the east (refer to Appendix “A” to Report PED20149).

Two possible route options for the new road corridor, named Gordon Dean Avenue, one of which included a roundabout intersection with mid-block east-west Collector Road “B”

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

were subsequently incorporated into the Fruitland-Winona Secondary Plan approved in 2014 (refer to Appendix “B” to Report PED20149).

The Gordon Dean Avenue Class EA Phases 3 & 4, a requirement of the SCUBE Secondary Plan, was initiated by the Fruitland–Winona Development Group, a consortium of land owners in the Block 1 growth area, in late 2014. These land owners are also the project proponent of the ongoing Block 1 Servicing Strategy.

The Phase 3 & 4 study area included Gordon Dean Avenue and a portion of the planned east-west collector road (Collector Road ‘B’), connecting Gordon Dean to Fruitland Road at Sherwood Park Road (refer to Appendix “C” to Report PED20149).

Phase 3 of the study served to finalize the location of Gordon Dean Avenue by identifying Alternative Design Concepts (refer to Appendix “D” to Report PED20149), taking into consideration specific criteria, such as existing and future land use, the road network and traffic safety, the natural environment and cultural / built heritage, drainage and groundwater, as well as input from the public and stakeholders such the Hamilton Conservation Authority.

The Alternative Design Concepts, each starting from the same location on Barton Street connect to different locations along Highway 8 (refer to Appendix “D” to Report PED20149). The alternatives also included connections to Collector Road B within the Block 1 growth area and evolved through the study to include only a signalized intersection whereas originally a roundabout was contemplated for this intersection. From Barton Street southerly, each alternative is generally the same through the Block 1 toward the north end of 703 Highway 8 where the alignments diverge and flank either side of the property (westerly or easterly) with some of the proposed alternatives also going through the middle of the property. The property (9.9 acres) is significant in that it was purchased by the City in February 2020 to replace the Jones Road Public Works Yard and to serve as the future expansion site of the Mountview Gardens Cemetery, which abuts the north end of the property.

Results of the evaluation identified Alternative 4b as the Preferred Alternative (refer to Appendix “D” to Report PED20149). While the Preferred Alternative for the most part extends through the future development lands in Block 1; the southern portion of the alignment bisects the eastern portion of 703 Highway 8 (City property) and requires the purchase of two residential properties on Highway 8.

Implementation of the Preferred Alternative (refer to Appendix “D” to Report PED20149) may impact plans for the expansion of Mountview Gardens Cemetery for a columbarium; however, staff have identified other opportunities for cemetery expansion on abutting lands that will mitigate the impact.

When constructed, Gordon Dean Avenue will be classified as a minor arterial roadway, designated as a truck route (replaces Fruitland Road), and will serve as a future Rapid Transit route. It will also be designed to provide pedestrian and cycling opportunities.

Although the City of Hamilton is not the proponent of this Study, staff have provided technical oversight to support requirements of the Class EA process and have confirmed that the Preferred Alternative reflects the City of Hamilton's values, standards and objectives.

A Draft Environmental Study Report (ESR) was submitted by the proponent and staff comments have been provided (refer to Appendix "E" to Report PED20149) that include details that need to be addressed in the final ESR; however, the required changes to the ESR are immaterial to the choice of the Preferred Alternative. In addition, there will be an opportunity for further staff review during the formal public review period.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 7

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: Gordon Dean Avenue is a growth-related project identified in the 2019 Development Charges Background Study with a construction value of \$8.7M including land costs. The project is already partially funded (\$5.28M) in approved Capital Project 4031980988 Fruitland By-Pass – Barton to Hwy. 8. As a growth-related project, it is subject to the City's Local Service Policy. Benefitting developers of the Block 1 growth area are responsible to pay the local service component of the road with the remainder of the project to be funded by the City for the growth-related (over-sizing) and benefit to existing components of the road (levy).

Also, through the Local Service Policy, a significant amount of the land required for the road will be obtained by land dedication from developers. The balance of the road corridor will be acquired through the approved Capital Project 4031980988 Fruitland By-Pass – Barton to Hwy. 8. Any amount of additional required funds for the project including an appropriate source will be brought forward as part of the annual budget approval process.

Staffing: N / A

Legal: N / A

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Fruitland Road is a minor arterial roadway and a designated truck route that extends southerly from Lake Ontario to Highway 8 in Stoney Creek. The section between Barton Street and Highway 8 has a long history of truck traffic concerns amongst residents.

In 2010, the Fruitland Road EA (Phases 1 & 2) updated the results of the 1992 Fruitland Road Realignment (Barton Street to Highway 8) Class EA Study which identified a future Fruitland Road bypass, between Barton Street and a future escarpment crossing south of Highway 8 (refer to Appendix “A” to Report PED20149).

The 2010 study recommended construction of a new north-south truck route, east of the existing Fruitland Road between Barton Street and Highway 8. Two possible alignments were identified with the westerly option allowing for a roundabout intersection with mid-block east-west Collector Road “B” and with the final alignment to be determined through a subsequent Class EA process (Phases 3 & 4 EA), (refer to Appendix “A” to Report PED20149). These two alignments were also approved as part of the Stoney Creek Urban Boundary Expansion (SCUBE) Secondary Plan road network (refer to Appendix “B” to Report PED20149).

The Phase 1 & 2 study recommendations were carried forward to the Gordon Dean Avenue Phase 3 & 4 Class EA initiated in late 2014 (refer to Appendix “C” to Report PED20149) by the Fruitland-Winona Development Group, a consortium of land owners in the Block 1 growth area.

The Class EA study is now complete and a Draft Environmental Study Report (ESR) was submitted by the proponent in May 2020. Staff comments have been provided to the proponent and form the basis of the recommendation in this report (PED20149), (refer to Appendix “E” to Report PED20149).

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

Municipal undertakings such as road, water and wastewater and transit projects are subject to *Ontario’s Environmental Assessment Act (EA Act)*. The *EA Act* allows for the approval of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessments following the planning process set out in the Municipal Engineers Association Municipal Class Environmental Assessment document (October 2000, amended in 2015). The Schedule C project requirements for this Class EA have been fulfilled.

Under provisions of the *EA Act* there is an opportunity for the Minister to review the project. During the review period, members of the public, interest groups and review agencies may request the Minister to require a proponent to comply with Part II of the *EA Act* before proceeding with a proposed undertaking (commonly referred to as a

“bump up”). The Minister determines if this is necessary with the Minister’s decision being final.

The Fruitland-Winona Secondary Plan, section 7.4.14.1 states: “All development within the lands identified as the “Servicing Strategy Area” shall conform to the Block Servicing Strategy”. The Gordon Dean Avenue is a major component of the Block 1 Servicing Strategy and the finalization of the alignment through the approval of the Municipal Class EA is required before the rest of the Block 1 area servicing can be finalized in accordance with the Fruitland-Winona Secondary Plan.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Gordon Dean Avenue EA has fulfilled Phases 3 & 4 of the Municipal Class EA process in accordance with the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment document which requires a transparent decision-making process involving public consultation.

Public Information Centres (PICs) were held on April 4, 2017 and October 17, 2019. The first was combined with the City-led Block 2 Servicing Strategy PIC, and multiple meetings were held with staff, Hamilton Conservation Authority (HCA) and impacted land owners during the study process.

Growth Management staff facilitated the public engagement process for this study by providing the proponent the City’s standard agency list for agency mail outs, attending meetings with the public, various stakeholders, the proponent team, and HCA staff, and posted PIC materials on the City website at Hamilton.ca/blockservicingstrategies.

Staff in the following City departments / divisions were consulted throughout the study process and in preparation of this report (PED20149):

Corporate Services:

- Financial Planning Administration and Policy

Planning and Economic Development Department:

- Planning
- Transportation Planning
- Economic Development

Public Works Department:

- Energy, Fleet and Facilities Management
- Environmental Services
- Engineering Services
- Transportation Operations and Maintenance

There will be an opportunity for further public, agency and staff consultation during the minimum thirty-day review period.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

Alternative Design Concepts (route options) for Gordon Dean Avenue were generated based on the approved Fruitland Road Class EA (2010) (refer to Appendix “D” to Report PED20149). As part of Phase 3 work, variations of the two primary options identified in the Secondary Plan (refer to Appendix “B” to Report PED20149) were developed in order to investigate requirements related to the future intersection of Gordon Dean Avenue and Collector Road ‘B’ (the planned Block 1 east-west collector road connecting Fruitland Road to Jones Road).

The Secondary Plan recommended a roundabout at this intersection; however, through the technical review of alternatives being considered a roundabout was determined to be undesirable due to pedestrian traffic safety concerns related to the planned Community Centre situated on the east side of Gordon Dean Avenue. The deletion of the roundabout was an important consideration in the evolution of route options leading to four core route options being developed and analyzed, each providing for a signalized controlled intersection at Collector Road ‘B’.

Based on the results of the analysis and evaluation process which included inputs from members of the public, staff, agencies, and land owners, Option 4b (refer to Appendix “D” to Report PED20149) was chosen as the preferred alignment for the Gordon Dean Avenue corridor. Although there was some difference in the functionality of the main alternatives, Option 4b is preferred because it:

- Addresses the problem and opportunity statement identified in Fruitland Class EA (2010); i.e. it would replace Fruitland Road from Barton Street to Highway 8 as an arterial road with a truck route designation and could accommodate pedestrian, cycling, vehicular and transit needs;
- Conforms to the Fruitland-Winona Secondary Plan;
- Better limits predicted noise level impacts to future residential development compared to westerly options; and,
- Optimizes the developability of lands relative to the other options considered.

Overall, Option 4b is the Preferred Alternative and is supported by staff. It is recommended that the Gordon Dean Avenue Class EA be filed with the Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks for formal minimum thirty-day public review and approval and that it be incorporated into the Block 1 Servicing Strategy.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

There are two alternatives for Council to consider with respect to the Class EA recommendations:

1. To not endorse the ESR and, therefore, not proceed with next steps to implementation.

This is not recommended and would likely delay the advancement of the Block 1 Servicing Strategy and in turn delay planned development in this strategic growth area. Should Council not endorse the Gordon Dean Avenue Municipal Class Environmental Assessment, the proponent (Fruitland-Winona Development Group) may still proceed and file the ESR for public review with the intent to have it approved by the Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks.

2. To not endorse the ESR until an amended version is submitted that addresses staff comments before it being posted for public review.

This is not recommended and would require staff to submit another recommendation report to Council on this matter in the future. Staff have consulted with the land owner's group which has agreed to address comments to staff's satisfaction prior to filing the ESR for public review.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Community Engagement and Participation

Hamilton has an open, transparent and accessible approach to City government that engages with and empowers all citizens to be involved in their community.

Economic Prosperity and Growth

Hamilton has a prosperous and diverse local economy where people have opportunities to grow and develop.

Healthy and Safe Communities

Hamilton is a safe and supportive City where people are active, healthy, and have a high quality of life.

Clean and Green

Hamilton is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

Our People and Performance

Hamiltonians have a high level of trust and confidence in their City government.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

- Appendix “A”- Fruitland Road Phases 1 & 2 Class EA – Figure 19 – Report Recommendation Map
- Appendix “B”- Fruitland-Winona Secondary Plan – Map B.7.4-1 Land Use Plan
- Appendix “C” - Study Location Map
- Appendix “D” - Gordon Dean Avenue Class EA – Alternative Design Concepts
- Appendix “E”- Draft Environmental Staff Report – Preliminary Staff Comments

MF:as