

CITY OF HAMILTON PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT Planning Division

то:	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	September 17, 2020
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (Former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED20159) (Ward 2)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 2
PREPARED BY:	David Addington (905) 546-2424 Ext. 1214
SUBMITTED BY: SIGNATURE:	Steve Robichaud Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That the designation of 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel), shown in Appendix "A" to Report PED20159, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, be approved;
- (b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20159, be approved; and,
- (c) That the City Clerk be directed to take appropriate action to designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED20159.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

110-122 King Street East, Hamilton is the site of the former Royal Connaught Hotel which has been repurposed to its current use as a residential condominium building with lower floor commercial uses.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED20159) (Ward 2) - Page 2 of 11

On April 9, 2008, City Council endorsed a motion from the Economic Development and Planning Committee recommending that the former Royal Connaught Hotel be considered a high priority for future designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The property was added to the staff work plan for designation at that time. The subject property was also added to the City's *Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest* on October 29, 2008 as recommended in Report PED08211.

In 2013, the former Royal Connaught Hotel was subject to a Site Plan Control application (DA-13-012) to repurpose the building to a residential condominium with lower floor commercial uses including the addition of a 14 storey addition on the John Street North frontage of the site. At the request of the property owner, the designation of the subject property was put on hold until construction on the project was completed. Given that the construction related to the repurposing and addition to the former Royal Connaught Hotel is complete and the property has been registered as a condominium, staff are now continuing the process of designation for the subject property.

Staff retained Peter Stewart of George Robb Architect, and Paul Dilse, Heritage Planning Consultant to complete a Cultural Heritage Assessment of the subject property (final report dated March 2013). It has been determined that the former Royal Connaught Hotel property at 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton meets the criteria for designation, therefore, staff recommend the subject property for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

The detailed documentation is attached to Report PED20159 as follows: the recommended *Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes* as Appendix "B"; the draft *Notice of Intention to Designate* as Appendix "C"; and the full *Cultural Heritage Assessment Report on the Royal Connaught Hotel* (March 2013) as Appendix "D".

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 11

FINANCIAL - STAFFING - LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: Not applicable

Staffing: Not applicable

Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario*

Heritage Act, and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the Ontario Heritage Act, and heard before the Conservation Review Board,

prior to further consideration by Council of the designation By-law.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED20159) (Ward 2) - Page 3 of 11

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the Act.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Subsection 33(1)). Designation does not restrict the use of a property, prohibit alterations or additions, or restrict the sale of a property. The City of Hamilton also provides heritage grants and loan programs to assist in the continuing conservation of properties, once they are designated.

PROJECT BACKGROUND

The designation process for 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton was initiated on April 9, 2008, when City Council endorsed a motion from the Economic Development and Planning Committee recommending that the former Royal Connaught Hotel be "considered as a priority for future designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*". Prior to being presented at the Economic Development and Planning Committee, the contents of the motion had been formally supported by the Hamilton LACAC (Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee) at its meeting of January 24, 2008. On October 29, 2008, City Council added the property to the City's *Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest* as recommended in Report PED08211.

The designation of the subject property was subsequently put on hold on the request of the property owner in 2013 to facilitate the building's repurposing into a mixed use condominium. This involved the construction of a new 14 storey addition on the southwest area of the property fronting onto John Street South and the rehabilitation of the existing former hotel building to accommodate new lower floor commercial uses and residential units above. A Site Plan Control application (DA-13-012) to facilitate this development was given final Site Plan approval on December 5, 2014. Subsequently, three separate Draft Plan of Condominium applications have received approval: one condominium for the six lower floor commercial units and two separate condominiums corresponding to two different phases of the residential portion of the building. Construction on the new 14 storey addition and repurposing is now complete.

The historical research, evaluation of the significance of the property, and detailed description of the heritage attributes were prepared in a Cultural Heritage Assessment

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED20159) (Ward 2) - Page 4 of 11

completed by Peter Stewart of George Robb Architect, and Paul Dilse, Heritage Planning Consultant (final report dated March 2013). The Cultural Heritage Assessment evaluated the subject property using both the Council adopted heritage evaluation criteria and the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, as defined in Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This comprehensive research and assessment work inform staff's recommendation and provides Planning Committee and City Council with adequate information upon which to base a decision regarding designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Through the consultants' evaluation, it has been determined that the subject property has design and physical value, historical and associative value, and contextual value exemplified in its built heritage attributes. Although there have been some modifications to the exterior the building and a recent 14 storey addition, the buildings remain substantially as they were originally designed and built in 1914-16 and 1931. As a result, it has been determined that the former Royal Connaught Hotel property at 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton, meets the criteria for designation, therefore, staff recommend the subject property for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (see *Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes*, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20159, and the draft *Notice of Intention to Designate*, attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED20159).

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The Royal Connaught Hotel was first constructed in 1914-16 on the east section of the property, with a substantial addition constructed on the west side of the original building in 1931 (see Appendix "E" to Report PED20159 for a photograph showing each building section). The hotel was constructed to be a first class hotel for Hamilton and was for many decades the location of high profile events and activities. The hotel's decline began in the 1970s, and it was eventually closed in 2004. The buildings remained vacant until the recent repurposing of the building into a residential condominium with lower floor commercial units.

The 1914-16 portion of the building is twelve storeys high and designed in the Edwardian Classicism style by Buffalo architects Esenwein & Johnson, featuring brown rug brick, limestone cladding on the lower levels, and terra cotta cornice and embellishments on the upper levels. The 1931 addition that was built on the west side of the original building approximately doubled the hotel's footprint. It was designed in the Art Deco style by Hamilton architects Hutton & Souter. The addition also employed the use of high-quality materials and detailing that was customary on the original building.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

Provincial Policy Statement:

Section 2.6 of the Provincial Policy Statement pertains to Cultural Heritage and Archaeology and provides that:

"2.6.1 Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved."

The recommendations to designate the subject lands under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* of Report PED20159 are consistent with this policy.

Urban Hamilton Official Plan:

Volume 1, Section B.3.4 - Cultural Heritage Resources Policies of the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) include the following:

- "B.3.4.2.1(a) The City of Hamilton shall, in partnership with others where appropriate, protect and conserve the tangible cultural heritage resources of the City, including archaeological resources, built heritage resources, and cultural heritage landscapes for present and future generations.
- B.3.4.2.1(b) The City of Hamilton shall, in partnership with others where appropriate, identify cultural heritage resources through a continuing process of inventory, survey, and evaluation, as a basis for the wise management of these resources.
- B.3.4.2.3 The City may by By-law designate individual and groups of properties of cultural heritage value under Parts IV and V respectively of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, including buildings, properties, cultural heritage landscapes, heritage conservation districts, and heritage roads or road allowances."

Downtown Hamilton Secondary Plan:

Volume 2, Section 6.1.11 – Cultural Heritage Resource Policies of the Downtown Hamilton Secondary Plan include the following:

"B.6.1.11(d) Conservation of existing cultural heritage resources shall be a priority in all development. New development shall be compatible with on-site and

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED20159) (Ward 2) - Page 6 of 11

adjacent cultural heritage resources. Adaptive re-use will be given priority for all built heritage resources."

The recommendations to designate the subject lands under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* of Report PED20159 comply with these policies.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Pursuant to Sub-section 29 (2) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, Council is required to consult with its Municipal Heritage Committee respecting designation of property under Sub-section (1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

The Hamilton LACAC (Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee) indicated support for the designation of the former Royal Connaught Hotel at its meeting of January 24, 2008, as well as the later addition of the property to the City's *Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest* through the approval of the City's designation process contained in Report PED08211.

Given the significant timeframe that has passed between LACAC's 2008 initial recommendation and the current staff recommendation to designate the subject property, the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee (HMHC) is to be consulted again at its meeting on September 17, 2020 on the recommendation to designate the subject property.

Staff also informed the Ward Councillor of the request to designate and the recommendations of Report PED20159. The Ward Councillor noted the importance of providing notice of the proposed designation to each condominium owner.

Furthermore, the developer of the subject property notified staff that a clause informing purchasers of the condominium units of the property's anticipated designation was included in the purchase and sale agreement for the units in the building. Additionally, staff have mailed out notices to each condominium owner advising them of the anticipated designation of the subject property to provide each owner with a general background on heritage designation and an opportunity to contact Cultural Heritage Planning staff with questions on the process prior to the anticipated issuance of the Notice of Intent to Designate (NOID).

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of cultural resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality is enabled to manage change and alterations to

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED20159) (Ward 2) - Page 7 of 11

the property through the Heritage Permit process and to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained through the provision of financial assistance programs and the enforcement of Property Standards By-laws.

Repurposing to a Mixed Use Condominium Building:

The repurposing of the former Royal Connaught Hotel to its current mixed condominium use involved some physical modifications to the exterior of the building that resulted in the removal of a number of features that had initially been included in the list of heritage attributes set out in the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest proposed in the March 2013 Cultural Heritage Assessment Report.

The alterations on the ground floor consisted of the removal of the former bronze storefronts to facilitate the installation of modern storefront surrounds with new glazing. In terms of alterations on the upper floors, the bronze spandrel panels in between the upper storey windows on each elevation have been removed as well as the terra cotta sills on the north and east façades of the 1914-16 building. These items appear to have been removed in order to create HVAC venting to the outside of the building. Additionally, two wrought iron balconies on the north façade of the 1931 building have been removed. These items have been removed from the Description of Heritage Attributes in the proposed the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20159 in order to accurately represent the existing heritage attributes of the subject property. The majority of interior and exterior heritage attributes identified in the 2013 Cultural Heritage Assessment Report remain intact and have been restored during the building's repurposing. As a result, the property's overall heritage value has been preserved.

As mentioned, the subject property is now a registered condominium with three different condominiums being associated with the subject property (one for the commercial component and two representing different phases of the residential component). The list of heritage attributes recommended to be included in the Statement of Heritage Value or Interest attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20159 pertain only to common element features of the building and not to the units of individual condominium owners. These heritage attributes include the lobby and mezzanine common area space on the building's interior and features on the exterior facades of the 1914-16 and 1931 buildings.

Cultural Heritage Evaluation:

Designation is guided by the process of cultural heritage evaluation and assessment. The evaluation process, as documented in the Cultural Heritage Assessment completed by Peter Stewart of George Robb Architect, and Paul Dilse, Heritage Planning

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED20159) (Ward 2) - Page 8 of 11

Consultant (final report dated March 2013), attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED20159, attempts to clearly identify those heritage values associated with a property.

Council-Adopted Evaluation Criteria:

A set of criteria were endorsed by the City of Hamilton's Municipal Heritage Committee on June 19, 2003 and were adopted by Council as The City of Hamilton: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Criteria on October 29, 2008 (Appendix "B" to Report PED08211). The criteria are used to identify the cultural heritage value of a property, and to assess their significance. This evaluation assists in determining a property's merit for designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as well as deriving a Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes.

As identified in the Cultural Heritage Assessment attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED20159, the property was determined to have met all twelve of the City's twelve criteria pertaining to built heritage value.

Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest:

Section 29 (1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets the criteria prescribed by provincial regulation. In 2006, the Province issued Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. According to Sub-section 1 (2) of Ontario Regulation 9/06, a property may be designated under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* where it meets one or more of the identified criteria. Ontario Regulation 9/06 identifies criteria in three broad categories: Design/Physical Value, Historical/Associative Value and Contextual Value.

As outlined in the attached Cultural Heritage Assessment (see Appendix "D" to Report PED20159), the subject property satisfies all of the nine criteria contained in Ontario Regulation 9/06 in all three categories.

1. <u>Design / Physical Value:</u>

i. The Royal Connaught Hotel of 1914-16 is an early and surviving example of a second generation skyscraper. Designed in the Edwardian Classical style, it stands as an important building from the Edwardian era. It is also an early example of steel frame construction in Hamilton. The 1931 addition has been seamlessly integrated into the Edwardian building and is a unique example of the Art Deco style in that the design of its front façade is tempered to complement the tripartite Classical composition of the earlier Edwardian building.

- ii. The Royal Connaught Hotel of 1914-16 displays a high degree of artistic merit in the masterful use of white glazed terra cotta, a material particularly associated with the Edwardian period. The carved stonework in the 1931 Art Deco addition is also well executed.
- iii. In terms of the local hotel industry, the Royal Connaught Hotel of 1914-16, represents a significant advance in fireproof hotel construction. The seamless integration of the Art Deco addition into the Edwardian building by cutting through the Edwardian building's west curtain wall and extending its floor plan westward also shows a high degree of technical achievement for the early twentieth century in Hamilton.

2. <u>Historical / Associative Value:</u>

- i. The Royal Connaught Hotel is directly associated with important social events. A hotel in the tradition of grand hotels, it was the centre of social life in Hamilton during much of the twentieth century. It was the scene of royal visits, political functions, football rallies, convention banquets, ballroom dances, nightclub entertainment, community club meetings, family celebrations and fine dining. In addition, the first Kiwanis Club in Canada was formed at the hotel on November 1, 1916.
- ii. The construction of the Royal Connaught Hotel at the end of the Edwardian period in the form of a skyscraper symbolizes the ambition of the citizens of Hamilton for the city to reflect a metropolitan appearance and to offer first class hotel accommodation and exceptional service on par with other large cities.
- iii. The Royal Connaught Hotel of 1914-16, is a Canadian example of the work of Buffalo architects, Esenwein & Johnson. In addition to being the second most active architectural practice in Buffalo at the turn of the twentieth century, they were architects for the United Hotels Company of America, the largest hotel chain in the United States in the early twentieth century. The 1931 addition by Hutton & Souter, a prominent architectural firm in Hamilton in the early twentieth century, is among the firm's best known buildings.

3. Contextual Value:

 The Royal Connaught Hotel supports the character of King Street East, a boulevard of historic and infill buildings built to the lot line and next to one SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED20159) (Ward 2) - Page 10 of 11

another. Because of its height and long frontage, the hotel dominates the King Street East block between Catharine Street South and John Street South. It draws the eye eastward along the boulevard, and creates a physical character that reflects the metropolitan appearance sought by large North American cities in the early twentieth century.

- ii. The 1931 hotel addition is linked historically and visually to the Dominion Public Building on the west side of John Street South. Designed by the same architects, they were completed within five years of one another.
- iii. The Royal Connaught Hotel is a landmark in downtown Hamilton and has a commanding presence on King Street East. The view of the hotel from James Street North across Gore Park is important in the streetscape. The view of the rooftop pavilion is an especially memorable image

Conclusion:

The consultants have determined that the former Royal Connaught Hotel at 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton is of cultural heritage value or interest, sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff concur with the findings of the Cultural Heritage Assessment (attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED20159) that the subject property has significant cultural heritage significance given that it meets all criteria assessing its design, associative and contextual contribution to the City of Hamilton. Therefore, staff recommend designation of 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and the Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED20159 and the draft Notice of Intention to Designate attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED20159.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may consider two alternatives: agree to designate property or decline to designate property.

Decline to Designate:

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant heritage resource (designation provides protection against

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 110-122 King Street East, Hamilton (former Royal Connaught Hotel) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED20159) (Ward 2) - Page 11 of 11

inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's heritage grant and loan programs. Designation does not restrict the use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or affect its resale value.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 - 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Clean and Green

Hamilton is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

Culture and Diversity

Hamilton is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A": Location Map

• Appendix "B": Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of

Heritage Attributes

Appendix "C": Notice of Intention to Designate

• Appendix "D": Cultural Heritage Assessment Report on the Royal Connaught Hotel

112 King Street East, Hamilton, Ontario, By Paul Dilse, Heritage Planning Consultant, and Peter Stewart, Principal, George Robb

Architect (March 2013).

Appendix "E": Photograph of Building Sections

• Appendix "F": Council Adopted Heritage Designation Process