



SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MINUTES 21-022

7:44 p.m.

November 19, 2021

Due to COVID-19 and the Closure of City Hall, this meeting was held virtually.

Present: Mayor F. Eisenberger
Councillors M. Wilson, J. Farr, N. Nann, S. Merulla, R. Powers,
E. Pauls, J. P Danko, B. Clark, M. Pearson, B. Johnson, T. Jackson, L.
Ferguson,
A. VanderBeek, T. Whitehead, J. Partridge

Mayor Eisenberger called the meeting to order and recognized that Council is meeting on the traditional territories of the Erie, Neutral, HuronWendat, Haudenosaunee and Mississaugas. This land is covered by the Dish with One Spoon Wampum Belt Covenant, which was an agreement between the Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabek to share and care for the resources around the Great Lakes. It was further acknowledged that this land is covered by the Between the Lakes Purchase, 1792, between the Crown and the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation. The City of Hamilton is home to many Indigenous people from across Turtle Island (North America) and it was recognized that we must do more to learn about the rich history of this land so that we can better understand our roles as residents, neighbours, partners and caretakers.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

The Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

3. COMMUNICATIONS

3.1 Correspondence respecting GRIDS 2, the Municipal Comprehensive Review and Land Needs Assessment:

- (a) Craig Burley
- (b) Don McLean
- (c) James Crowe
- (d) Jonathan Haggerty
- (e) Kaylynn Nicholls
- (f) Mitchell Richmond
- (g) Sarah Robinson
- (h) Simone Blain
- (i) Tracy Trofimencoff
- (j) Michael Piersanti
- (k) Alexander Kehn

- (l) Carolyn Heijm
- (m) David Zalepa
- (n) Debra Hartman
- (o) Derek Wilson
- (p) Emily Stanek
- (q) Joanne Turnell
- (r) Katie Docherty
- (s) Ken MacDonald
- (t) Kerry Arnett
- (u) Kevin Postma
- (v) Lenoir Jennifer
- (w) Lisa Wong
- (x) Nancy Hurst
- (y) Paula Grove
- (z) Rachel Weverink
- (aa) Rocco Baviera
- (ab) Sandra Shurly
- (ac) Robert P. Stovel, Stovel and Associates Inc.
- (ad) Wendy Leigh-Bell
- (ae) William Farkas
- (af) Wendy Passmore
- (ag) Adrian Duyzer
- (ah) Nancy Hurst

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of General Issues Committee Report 21-023.

(Pearson/Johnson)

That the agenda for the November 19, 2021 meeting of Council be approved, **as amended.**

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

- (i) Councillor B. Clark declared an interest to Item 4 of the General Issues Committee Report 21-023, respecting Report LS16029(f)/PED16248(f) - Update respecting Ontario Land Tribunal Appeals of Rural and Urban Hamilton Official Plans Regarding Urban Boundary Expansion in the Context of GRIDS 1 and 2006 Growth Plan, as the Principals of one of the parties has a retail business interest with his son.
- (ii) Councillor B. Johnson declared an interest to Item 4 of the General Issues Committee Report 21-023, respecting Report LS16029(f)/PED16248(f) - Update respecting Ontario Land Tribunal Appeals of Rural and Urban Hamilton Official Plans Regarding Urban Boundary Expansion in the Context of GRIDS 1 and 2006 Growth Plan, as her Administrative Assistant is related to one of the parties.

COMMUNICATIONS

(Pearson/Johnson)

That Council Communication 3.1 be approved, as presented, as follows:

- 3.1 Correspondence respecting GRIDS 2, the Municipal Comprehensive Review and Land Needs Assessment:
- (a) Craig Burley
 - (b) Don McLean
 - (c) James Crowe
 - (d) Jonathan Haggerty
 - (e) Kaylynn Nicholls
 - (f) Mitchell Richmond
 - (g) Sarah Robinson
 - (h) Simone Blain
 - (i) Tracy Trofimencoff
 - (j) Michael Piersanti
 - (k) Alexander Kehn
 - (l) Carolyn Heijm
 - (m) David Zalepa
 - (n) Debra Hartman
 - (o) Derek Wilson
 - (p) Emily Stanek
 - (q) Joanne Turnell
 - (r) Katie Docherty
 - (s) Ken MacDonald
 - (t) Kerry Arnett
 - (u) Kevin Postma
 - (v) Lenoir Jennifer
 - (w) Lisa Wong
 - (x) Nancy Hurst
 - (y) Paula Grove
 - (z) Rachel Weverink
 - (aa) Rocco Baviera

- (ab) Sandra Shurly
- (ac) Robert P. Stovel, Stovel and Associates Inc.
- (ad) Wendy Leigh-Bell
- (ae) William Farkas
- (af) Wendy Passmore
- (ag) Adrian Duyzer
- (ah) Nancy Hurst

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the consideration of General Issues Committee Report 21-023.

Result: Motion on the Communication Items, as presented, CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

- YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
- YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
- YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
- YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
- YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
- YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
- YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
- YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
- YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
- YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
- YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
- YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
- YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
- YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
- YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

(Pearson/Clark)

That Council move into Committee of the Whole to consider the Committee Reports.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

- YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
- YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
- YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
- YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
- YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
- YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
- YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
- YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
- YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
- YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
- YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
- YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson

YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

(Pearson/Ferguson)

That Section 5.8(2) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021, which provides that a minimum of 2 days shall pass before the Report of a Standing Committee, the Selection Committee, or other Committee that reports directly to Council is presented to Council to provide adequate opportunity for review, be waived in order to consider the General Issues Committee Report 21-023.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a 2/3 majority vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE REPORT 21-023

1. GRIDS 2 and Municipal Comprehensive Review – Urban Growth City-Wide Consultation Summary Report (PED17010(m)) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

(Pearson/Jackson)

That Report PED17011(m), respecting GRIDS 2 and Municipal Comprehensive Review – Urban Growth City-Wide Consultation Summary Report, be received

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls

YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

2. GRIDS 2 and Municipal Comprehensive Review – Final Land Needs Assessment and Addendum and Peer Review Results (PED17010(n)) (City Wide) (Item 8.2)

(Clark/Farr)

- (a) That the City of Hamilton Land Needs Assessment to 2051 – Technical Working Paper, prepared by Lorus & Associates, dated March 2021, attached as Appendix “A” to Report PED17010(n), and Addendum, prepared by Lorus & Associates, dated October 2021, attached as Appendix “A1” to Report PED17010(n), for the GRIDS 2 / MCR integrated growth management planning process, be received;
- (b) That the Land Needs Assessment Peer Review, prepared by Watson & Associates, dated October 2021, attached as Appendix “B” to Report PED17010(n), be received;
- (c) That the following reports be received:
 - (i) Residential Intensification Market Demand Study, prepared by Lorus and Associates, dated March 2021, attached as Appendix “C” to Report PED17010(n);
 - (ii) Residential Intensification Supply Update, dated March 2021, attached as Appendix “D” to Report PED17010(n);
 - (iii) Existing Designated Greenfield Area Density Analysis, dated March 2021, attached as Appendix “E” to Report PED17010(n).

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 1, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge

YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
 YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
 NO - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
 YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
 YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
 YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

3. GRIDS 2 and Municipal Comprehensive Review – “How Should Hamilton Grow? Evaluation” (PED17010(o)) (City Wide) (Item 8.3)

(Whitehead/Merulla)

That Report PED17070(o), respecting the GRIDS 2 and Municipal Comprehensive Review – “How Should Hamilton Grow? Evaluation”, **be amended**, by adding a new sub-section (h) to read as follows:

(h) *That staff be directed to report back to the General Issues Committee annually on the impacts of the no growth option; specifically, on Social housing unit cost, land cost, square footage development costs, and mixed housing contrasting with benchmarking on current values.*

Result: Amendment CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 5, as follows:

NO - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
 YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
 NO - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
 YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
 YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
 YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
 YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
 NO - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
 YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
 NO - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
 YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
 YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
 YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
 NO - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
 YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
 YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

(Pearson/Farr)

(a) That staff be directed to report to the Planning Committee annually on residential development activity including, but not limited to, the City’s residential intensification rate; construction activity in terms of housing mix; the City’s supply of vacant land to accommodate forecasted growth; and, a comparison of actual versus forecasted growth, as per the land needs assessment, to allow for adjustment, as needed, due to any negative or positive impacts of the adopted City of Hamilton urban boundary and growth strategy.

- (b) That staff be authorized and directed to evaluate requests for expansion from Waterdown up to a maximum size of 5 ha of which 50% may be for residential use, as per the Screening Criteria and Evaluation Tool (Waterdown), and report back to Council with the results of the evaluation analysis;
- (c) That the Growth Related Integrated Development Strategy (GRIDS 2) / Municipal Comprehensive Review (MCR) "How Should Hamilton Grow?" Evaluation, including associated technical supporting reports, attached as Appendix "A", as amended, to Report PED17010(o), be received;
- (d) That staff be directed to report back to the General Issues Committee no later than January 2022 with a draft Official Plan Amendment (OPA), as part of the Municipal Comprehensive Review, that implements the following growth directions, and to seek approval to present the draft OPA to the Province for review, and to the public for consultation, as part of the City's Growth Plan conformity exercise:
 - (i) A projected household growth of 110,300 households;
 - (ii) An average intensification target of not less than 60% and not more than 80% between 2021 and 2051;
 - (iii) A planned minimum density of 60 persons and jobs per hectare (pjh) in existing Designated Greenfield Areas;
 - (v) An Employment Area land need of 0 ha to 2051, to be confirmed subject to the finalization of the Employment Land Review, including deferred requests;
- (e) That the draft Official Plan Amendment include no expansion to the urban boundary;
- (f) That the draft Official Plan Amendment identify a Community Area Land need of 0 ha beyond 2031, to be reviewed at least every 10 years, as part of future Municipal Comprehensive Reviews, as required under the provincial *Planning Act and Places To Grow Act*;
- (g) That any determination on the Community Area Land need between 2021 and 2031, be deferred until the outcome of the GRIDS1 appeals of the Rural Hamilton Official Plan and Urban Hamilton Official Plan; and,
- (h) ***That staff be directed to report back to the General Issues Committee annually on the impacts of the no growth option; specifically, on Social housing unit cost, land cost, square footage development costs, and mixed housing contrasting with benchmarking on current values.***

Result: Main Motion, As Amended, CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 3, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
NO – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
NO - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
NO - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

4. Update Respecting Ontario Land Tribunal Appeals of Rural and Urban Hamilton Official Plans Regarding Urban Boundary Expansion in the Context of GRIDS 1 and 2006 Growth Plan (LS16029(f)/PED16248(f)) (City Wide)

(Pearson/Farr)

- (a) That the presentation provided to Committee in Closed Session, respecting Report LS16029(f)/PED16248(f) - Update Respecting Ontario Land Tribunal Appeals of Rural and Urban Hamilton Official Plans Regarding Urban Boundary Expansion in the Context of GRIDS 1 and 2006 Growth Plan, be received;
- (b) That the direction provided to staff in Closed Session, respecting Report LS16029(f)/PED16248(f) - Update Respecting Ontario Land Tribunal Appeals of Rural and Urban Hamilton Official Plans Regarding Urban Boundary Expansion in the Context of GRIDS 1 and 2006 Growth Plan, be approved; and,
- (c) That Report LS16029(f)/PED16248(f) - Update Respecting Ontario Land Tribunal Appeals of Rural and Urban Hamilton Official Plans Regarding Urban Boundary Expansion in the Context of GRIDS 1 and 2006 Growth Plan, remain confidential.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 3, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES– Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson

YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
NO - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
NO - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
NO - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

(Pearson/Ferguson)

That General Issues Committee Report 21-023, being the meeting held on Tuesday, November 9, 2021 and Friday, November 19, 2021, be received and the recommendations contained therein be approved, ***as amended***.

Result: Main Motion, As Amended, on General Issues Committee Report 21-023, CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

(Pearson/Powers)

That the Committee of the Whole Rise and Report.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

BY-LAWS AND CONFIRMING BY-LAW

(Pearson/Jackson)

That Bill No. 21-213, be passed and that the Corporate Seal be affixed thereto, and that the By-law, be numbered and be signed by the Mayor and the City Clerk, to read as follows:

213 To Confirm the Proceedings of City Council

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 1, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
NO - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

(Johnson/Clark)

That, there being no further business, City Council be adjourned at 8:20 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – Ward 2 Councillor Jason Farr
YES - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Sam Merulla
YES - Ward 5 Councillor Russ Powers
YES - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
YES - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
YES - Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko

YES - Mayor Fred Eisenberger
YES - Ward 15 Councillor Judi Partridge
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Terry Whitehead
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Arlene VanderBeek
YES - Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson
YES - Deputy Mayor - Ward 10 Councillor Maria Pearson
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

Respectfully submitted,

Mayor F. Eisenberger

Andrea Holland
City Clerk