

Inventory & Research Working Group

Meeting Notes

Monday, July 20, 2020 (6:00 pm)

City of Hamilton Webex Virtual Meeting

Present: Janice Brown (Chair); Ann Gillespie (Secretary); Alissa Denham-Robinson; Graham Carroll; Lyn Lusted; Chuck Dimitry; Brian Kowalesicz; Rammy Saini

Regrets: Jim Charlton; Joachim Brouwer

Also present: Miranda Brunton (City of Hamilton Cultural Heritage Planner)

David Addington (City of Hamilton Cultural Heritage Planner)

Alissa Golden, Heritage Project Specialist

1. Chair's Remarks

Janice welcomed all able to join the first virtual meeting since the COVID-19 lockdown in mid March. Item 10 was moved up to allow Alissa Golden to make her presentation and then leave the meeting.

2. Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

3. Review and Approval of Meeting Notes, 24 February 2020

Approved with minor amendments.

4. Ancaster Village and Beasley Neighbourhood Volunteer Inventory Projects – Alissa Golden

Alissa reported that she has been working with Bob Maton, representing the Ancaster Village Heritage Community and Carol Priamo, representing the Beasley Neighbourhood Association, to oversee volunteer inventory projects. The goal is for volunteers in both groups is to obtain guidance from Cultural Heritage Planning staff in order to complete Built Heritage Inventory and Preliminary Evaluation forms, as used by the I & R Working Group. These will be reviewed by the I & R Working Group before the end of 2020. Alissa concluded that this is a positive pilot project in terms of City and community collaboration and that she will be making a presentation to each group to cover general procedures.

5. Grace Lutheran Church, 1107 Main Street West – presentation by David Addington

At the last Policy & Design (P & D) Working Group meeting, a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by Metropolitan Design Ltd. was presented for a proposal to replace the existing *inventoried* Grace Lutheran Church with a 15-story mixed-use (predominantly residential) building. The original relatively small church is a very late example of the Gothic Revival style with simplified detailing, designed by the noted architectural firm, William R. Souter and Associates and built in 1959. In 1970, the original limestone building was enlarged by a parish hall extension, possibly designed by the same firm. The building complex is situated on a spacious landscaped lot bounded to the west by Cline Avenue South, to the east by Dow Avenue and to the south by the large building complex of the Adas Israel Synagogue. The front façade of Grace Lutheran Church faces and sits parallel to Cline Avenue South; the north façade is angled to Main Street.

The developer's intent is to demolish the entire building complex except for the front façade, which will be dismantled and reassembled as a corner entrance to the new building, as shown on the architectural rendering provided by David. (see Appendix 'A') Members of the P & D Working Group were concerned about the treatment of the heritage building and the conclusions of the consultant's report, which endorsed the proposed development, despite identifying a number of heritage attributes (both exterior and interior), most of which would not be preserved. The initial proposal was sent back for revisions in response to the P & D Working Group's request that a more significant portion of the 1959 church be incorporated into the new development. In the meantime, the proposal was referred to the I & R Working Group for comments and consideration for listing the church property on the Heritage Register.

COMMENTS

- The consultant's report noted many heritage attributes but then supported keeping only the façade (see Appendix 'A').
- The 1959 church, with its tall slim steeple, is a visual landmark.
- In summary, the consultants' analysis does not align with their Recommendations and Conservation Strategy. The proposed new development, incorporating only the church façade, salvaged beams, stone base and "cut limestone accents" does not protect the design integrity of the historic church. (see Appendix 'A')

1. Update on Gothic Revival Houses on Hamilton Mountain

Chuck requested that the former Young family residence at 311 Rymal Road East also be included in the batch recommendation to add the Gothic Revival houses to the Heritage Register. For background, see item 8 of the I & R WG notes for November, 25th, 2019. Chuck will undertake the research for a recommendation to list this property on the Heritage Register. Summary paragraphs for all five Gothic Revival houses and 311 Rymal Road East must be completed to accompany the completed inventory forms, in order for a recommendation to be made to the HMHC. Whether any of these properties should also be added to the Designation Work Plan needs to be determined.

2. Updates on Places of Education Inventory Work

- Ward 3: Janice reported that Jim Charlton had photographed 13-14 of the Places of Education for her; research and inventory/ evaluation forms have been completed by McMaster student, Jade Laird on Memorial and Adelaide Hoodless elementary schools. Work 0in progress: the former Robert Land Elementary School (now the Eva Rothwell Centre), the former Cathedral Boys' School and the former Provincial Institute of Technology building (now Mission Services).
- The main obstacles to progress for other members were either other priorities (such as another I & R WG project) or the need for access to archives and libraries to complete the research, all of which have been shut down since mid-March.

1. Hoodless Carriage House, 24 Blake Street, Hamilton

This item was deferred to the next meeting, when Ann will have her Inventory Form and Heritage Evaluation completed.

2. Update on Places of Worship Inventory Work

Ann reported that during the COVID-19 lock-down, she had been working on completing the inventory work for the 8 non-designated, pre-1967 Places of Worship in Dundas. All of the information from the forms initially filled out by hand has been digitized, additional photos taken where needed, and further research completed from home-based and web resources, with assistance of the archivist at the Dundas Museum & Archives. Her goal is to complete a Preliminary Evaluation for each of the above 8 places of worship for the September meeting of the I & R Working Group.

3. Policy and Administration – Work Plan for HMHC Working Groups

The HMHC has been requested by Loren Kolar, Legislative Co-ordinator, to ask its working groups for work plans for the balance of 2020. Alissa D-R offered to send Janice a template for this report based on the one she is preparing for the P & D Working Group.

4. Other Business: Proposed Heritage Conservation District in Corktown

Graham brought to our attention an area with a significant number of 19th century residences in the vicinity of the Ferguson Pumping Station and an adjacent 5-unit Victorian rowhouse (both designated under the Ontario Heritage Act) located at the foot of Ferguson Avenue South and provided a virtual tour of these buildings as well as a number of residences on the adjacent Patrick and Foster streets. He then suggested that an area including these two streets and the two designated properties might be considered for designation as a *heritage conservation district* under Part V of the OHA.

COMMENTS

- Staff suggested that Graham start with some basic research and focus on a few properties with sufficient architectural/ heritage value to first list on the Heritage Register.
- Difficulties in finding the funds and staff resources to undertake a full heritage conservation district study were noted.
- The Corktown Neighbourhood Association could be engaged to undertake a “Volunteer Led Inventory”, similarly to what is being done for Ancaster Village and the Beasley Neighbourhood.

1. Adjournment and Next Meeting Date

The meeting was adjourned at 7:20.

Next virtual meeting: **Monday, August 24th, 6 p.m. -**