

**HERITAGE PERMIT DELEGATED AUTHORITY REPORT – HP2021-056**  
**ADDRESS:** 118 St. Clair Avenue, Hamilton

**Owner:** George Nakamura

**Applicant / Agent:** Duy Nguyen (N-Squared Designs)

**Description of proposed alterations:**

- Rebuild second level enclosed porch, including:
  - To remove the metal ladder style support posts and replace with triple columns;
  - To remove the exterior second floor walls and rebuild and reframe with the same size, shape and openings;
  - Windows will be wood replacements;
  - Existing trim to be replicated and painted poplar; and,
- Exterior cladding materials (second level enclosed porch and front dormer) to be Celect Cellular Composite Siding by Royal.

**Reasons for proposed alterations:**

- Deterioration of exterior walls due to aging materials.

**Documentation submitted with application:**

- Window specifications;
- Celect Cellular Composite Siding brochure;
- Photographs of exterior deterioration;
- Photographic example of cladding of neighbouring property; and,
- Building elevations and floor plans.

**Staff assessment:**

Key factors in the evaluation of alterations affecting a heritage building or its setting are the consideration of:

- **“displacement effects”** (those adverse actions that result in the damage, loss or removal of valued heritage features); and,
- **“disruption effects”** (those actions that result in detrimental changes to the setting or character of a heritage feature).

In the consideration of any Heritage Permit application, staff must assess the impact of the displacement and disruption effects on the heritage resource, particularly in relation to the Reasons for Designation mentioned in the Designation By-law, in this case the St. Clair Avenue Heritage Conservation District Plan (By-Law No. 86-125).

The applicant proposes to rebuild the second level enclosed porch due to deterioration from aging materials. This includes removing the metal ladder support posts and replacing with triple wood columns, removing the exterior second floor walls and rebuilding and reframing with the same size, shape and openings and replicating the existing trim (to be painted poplar). The exterior cladding materials for the second level enclosed porch and front dormer are proposed as Celect Cellular Composite Siding by Royal 7" shake.

Moderate "disruption effects" are expected to the heritage context of the property as a result of this work. The use of a composite cladding will result in the loss of the wooden fish scale pattern of shingles in the front dormer. The best conservation practice would be to replace with in-kind materials, however, if composite cladding is to be installed, the final selection of cladding materials must be determined in consultation with Cultural Heritage Planning staff, and a cladding material resembling wood in texture and colours is required. This has been included as Condition No. 3 of the application.

There will be minimal "displacement effects" to the subject property as a result of this work. Due to the current condition of the second storey porch, trim, and cladding, the proposed repairs will ensure that the property does not experience further deterioration. Aspects of the proposed repairs will increase the visual appeal of the property from public view. For example, the existing metal ladder support posts will be replaced with wood columns and the windows will be wooden replacements, in keeping with the character of the Heritage Conservation District.

Staff are supportive of the application as it will repair and replace the heritage features of the property in like-for-like materials, with the exception of the proposed Celect Cellular Composite Siding, generally maintaining the character of the property and St. Clair Avenue Heritage Conservation District.

<b>Key dates:</b>
-------------------

Sub-committee meeting date: December 14, 2021  
 Notice of Complete Application: December 10, 2021

<b>Sub-committee comments and advice:</b>
---

The Sub-committee considered the application and passed the following motion:

(Priamo / Carroll)

That the Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee advises that Heritage Permit Application HP2021-056 be approved as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- a) Any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;

- b) Implementation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than December 31, 2023. If the alterations are not completed by December 31, 2023 then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton; and,
- c) That the applicant will work with city staff on a selection of cladding that matches the existing wood shakes in texture and colour.

CARRIED

<b>Final Recommendation:</b>
------------------------------

That the applicant be advised that Heritage Permit Application HP2021-056 is approved in accordance with the submitted application, subject to the following conditions:

- a) That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- b) Implementation of the alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than December 31, 2023. If the alterations are not completed by December 31, 2023, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton; and,
- c) That the selection of cladding shall match the existing wood shakes in texture and colour, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations.

<b>Approval:</b>
------------------

Staff Approval:

*Chloe Richer*

\_\_\_\_\_CT\_\_\_\_\_

Chloe Richer  
Cultural Heritage Planner

SPM/MGR Initials

Authorized:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Steve Robichaud, MCIP RPP  
Director of Planning and Chief Planner

Excerpt from St. Clair Avenue HCD Planning Study and Plan

### 10.3.4 Building

Restoration of the original features of the building will be encouraged.

Authentic materials such as brick, stone and wood, to reflect the texture of the area, will be encouraged. Original or similar materials and colours will be used.

Proportions and designs of windows and doors of the original structures will be maintained for additions alterations and replacements.

#### HIPPED-ROOF BOX

118 St. Clair Avenue (Built 1914)

An immediately apparent feature of this building is the shingled, second storey enclosed porch. It was originally supported by two clusters of three columns. The shingling is continued in the dormers with a row of fish scale shingles adding a further pattern. The stone foundations extending to the lower sill ledges of the bay corner is echoed in the stone support piers of the porch.

