

Inventory & Research Working Group (IRWG)

Recommendation Notes

January 24, 2022 (6:00pm – 8:00pm)
City of Hamilton WebEx Virtual Meeting

- Present:** Janice Brown (Chair); Rammy Saini (Secretary); Alissa Denham-Robinson; Ann Gillespie; Chuck Dimitry; Jim Charlton; Lyn Lunsted; Brian Kowalesicz; Graham Carroll; Dr. Sarah Sheehan
- Staff Present:** Amber Knowles (Cultural Heritage Planner); Alissa Golden (Heritage Project Specialist); James Croft (Intern, Cultural Heritage Planning); Natalie (Intern, Dundas Inventory Project)
- Regrets:** Stacey Kursikowski (Cultural Heritage Planner); Chole Richer (Cultural Heritage Planner); Julian Lee (Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner)

RECOMMENDATION

THE INVENTORY & RESEARCH WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDS THE FOLLOWING TO THE HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE:

1. The Inventory & Research Working Group recommends that **1107 Main Street West, Grace Lutheran Church**, be added to the Municipal Heritage Register and to the staff work plan for heritage designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act* (see attached Appendix "A", Built Heritage Inventory Form and summary of 9/06 attributes)

For further documentation, please consult the CHIAs for this property.

Recommendation Notes

1107 Main Street West, Grace Lutheran Church: Lyn L., Chuck D., and Amber K.

During the IRWG's January meeting, members reviewed the heritage evaluation from the November 2021 Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) on Grace Lutheran Church, 1107 Main Street West, and were provided with an update. There is an ongoing discussion with the developer who plans to construct a 15-storey building on the property. A CHIA from January 2020 was revised in 2021 with the latest CHIA coming after the original author retired. Despite feedback on how the development plans need to better incorporate the church to preserve its historical attributes, the recent CHIA recognizes that 1107 Main Street West meets 5 of the Ontario Regulation 9/06 criteria and that it is impossible to keep the church in place and do a redevelopment of the property. The previous CHIA had noted that the building met all 9/06 criteria.

After a long discussion, IRWG members also reviewed a Built Heritage Inventory Form and a summary document on how the property meets the criteria of regulation 9/06. IRWG members are now recommending that 1107 Main Street West be added to the City's Register and staff work plan for heritage designation. See Recommendation #1 above.



Hamilton

BUILT HERITAGE INVENTORY FORM

Address 1107 Main Street West Community Hamilton
 Also known as Grace Lutheran Church Legal Description _____
 P.I.N. 251801004505640 Roll No. _____ Ward _____ Neighbourhood Westdale

Heritage Status: Inventory Registered Designated (Part IV / Part V) Easement (City / OHT) NHS
 HCD (if applicable): _____ Cultural Heritage Landscape (if applicable): _____

Property Status (Observed): Occupied Building Vacant Building Vacant Lot Parking Lot

Integrity: Preserved / Intact Modified Compromised Demolished (date) _____

Construction Period: Pre 1867 1868-1900 1901-1939 1940-1955 1956-1970 Post 1970
 Year (if known) 1959 Architect / Builder / Craftsperson (if known) William R. Souter

Massing: Single-detached Semi-detached, related Semi-detached, unrelated Row, related Row, unrelated Other Church

Storeys: 1 1 ½ 2 2 ½ 3 3 ½ 4 or more Irregular Other Church

Foundation Construction Material: Stone Brick Concrete Wood Other _____ Finish: _____

Building Construction Material: Brick Frame (wood) Stone Log Other _____ Finish: _____

Building Cladding: Wood Stone Brick Stucco Synthetic Other _____ Finish: _____

Roof Type: Hip Flat Gambrel Mansard Gable Other _____ Type: _____

Roof Materials: Asphalt Shingle Wood Shingle Slate Tile/Terra Cotta Tar/Gravel Metal Other _____

Architectural Style / Influence:

- | | | | | |
|---|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Art Deco / Moderne
(1920s-1950s) | <input type="checkbox"/> Craftsman / Prairie
(1900s-1930s) | <input type="checkbox"/> International
(1930-1965) | <input type="checkbox"/> Ontario Cottage
(1840-1900) | <input type="checkbox"/> Romanesque Revival
(1850-1910) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Beaux-Arts Classicism
(1900-1945) | <input type="checkbox"/> Colonial Revival
(1900-Present) | <input type="checkbox"/> Italian Villa
(1830-1900) | <input type="checkbox"/> Period Revivals
(1900-Present) | <input type="checkbox"/> Second Empire
(1860-1900) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Bungalow
(1900-1945) | <input type="checkbox"/> Edwardian
(1900-1930) | <input type="checkbox"/> Italianate
(1850-1900) | <input type="checkbox"/> Post-Modern
(1970-Present) | <input type="checkbox"/> Vernacular |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Classical Revival
(1830-1860) | <input type="checkbox"/> Georgian / Loyalist
(1784-1860) | <input type="checkbox"/> Neo-Classical
(1800-1860) | <input type="checkbox"/> Queen Anne
(1880-1910) | <input type="checkbox"/> Victory Housing
(1940-1950) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Chateau
(1880-1940) | <input type="checkbox"/> Gothic Revival
(1830-1900) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Neo-Gothic
(1900-1945) | <input type="checkbox"/> Regency
(1830-1860) | <input type="checkbox"/> 1950s Contemporary
(1945-1965) |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Other <u>Late example of Neo Gothic</u> | | | | |

Notable Building Features:

- Porch: _____ Sill(s): _____ Tower/Spire Bargeboard Eaves: _____
- Verandah: _____ Lintel(s): _____ Dome Transom Verges: _____
- Balcony: _____ Shutters: _____ Finial Side light Dormer: _____
- Door(s) : _____ Quoins: _____ Pilaster Pediment Chimney: _____
- Stairs: _____ Voussoirs: _____ Capital Woodwork Parapet: _____
- Fire wall: _____ Cornice: _____ Panel Date stone Bay: _____
- Windows: Stained Glass Column Cresting Other Door Hardware

Notes: The interior contains vaulted ceilings and laminated beams

Context:

- Historic Context Statement: Yes No Name of HCS Area: _____
- Streetscape (Residential / Commercial) Terrace / Row Complex / Grouping Landmark
- Multi-address parcel (list addresses): _____ Other _____
- Related buildings: _____

Plan: Square Rectangular L U T H Cross Irregular Other _____

Wings: _____ **Setback:** Shallow Deep At ROW Other Irregular Corner Lot

Accessory Features and Structures:

- Features (e.g. stone wall, fountain): Community Garden
- Structures (e.g. shed, outbuilding): Community Hall

Additional Notes:

Related Files: _____

Fire Insurance Mapping:

Additional Documentation and Research Attached (if applicable):

Surveyed by: Graham Carroll	Date: January 24th 2022	Survey Area:
Staff Reviewer:	Date:	

PRELIMINARY EVALUATION

Physical / Design Value:	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The property's style, type or expression is: <input type="checkbox"/> rare <input type="checkbox"/> unique <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> representative <input type="checkbox"/> early
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The property displays a high degree of: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> craftsmanship <input type="checkbox"/> artistic merit
<input type="checkbox"/>	The property demonstrates a high degree of: <input type="checkbox"/> technical achievement <input type="checkbox"/> scientific achievement
Historical / Associative Value:	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The property has direct associations with a potentially significant: <input type="checkbox"/> theme <input type="checkbox"/> event <input type="checkbox"/> belief <input type="checkbox"/> person <input type="checkbox"/> activity <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> organization <input type="checkbox"/> institution
<input type="checkbox"/>	The property yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The property demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of a potentially significant: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> architect <input type="checkbox"/> artist <input type="checkbox"/> builder <input type="checkbox"/> designer <input type="checkbox"/> theorist
Contextual Value:	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The property is important in: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> defining <input type="checkbox"/> maintaining <input type="checkbox"/> supporting the character of the area
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The property is linked to its surroundings: <input type="checkbox"/> physically <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> functionally <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> visually <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> historically
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The property is a landmark

Classification:

- Significant Built Resource (SBR)
- Character-Defining Resource (CDR)
- Character-Supporting Resource (CSR)
- Inventory Property (IP)
- Remove from Inventory (RFI)
- None

Recommendation:

- Add to Designation Work Plan
- Include in Register (Non-designated)
- Remove from Register (Non-designated)
- Add to Inventory – Periodic Review
- Inventory – No Further Review (Non-extant)
- No Action Required

Evaluated by: Graham Carroll	Date: January 24th 2022
HMHC Advice:	Date
Planning Committee Advice:	Date:
Council Decision:	Date:
Database/GIS Update:	AMANDA Update:

The former Grace Lutheran Church is listed on Hamilton's Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and/or Historical Interest, and is included on the City's Places of Worship Inventory.

Comparing the former Grace Lutheran Church against the criteria of regulation 9/06 shows the structure to meet the criteria for potential designation under the categories of design or physical value, historic or associative value and contextual value. The structure is an example of transitional mid-20th century design combining contemporary design elements with traditional Gothic elements. The exterior of the structure displays fine examples of craftsmanship at a quality greater than typical of the era, utilizing cut limestone details and a rusticated limestone cladding. Attention to detail is evident in the use of door hardware that matches the cut limestone finishes, further reflecting the use of non-commercially available finishes on the exterior of the structure. The structure was designed by the firm of local Hamilton architect William R. Souter.

Grace Lutheran Church reflects the protestant development of the Westdale area and has served as a visual marker of that history for the past 60 years. The structure, with its steep gable roof and slim steeple, stand in contrast the single family residential and mixed use commercial massing of the surrounding area.

Character-Defining Elements

Exterior

- Rectangular and symmetrical massing with steep gable roof line
- Stained glass windows with emphasis on main façade
- Carved limestone detailing: window tracery, main door surround, continuous plinth course
- Rusticated limestone exterior
- Simplified Gothic style pointed arched punched windows
- One storey flat roofed wing, clad to match main church building
- Slim metal steeple
- Central placement on lot with east-west orientation

Interior:

- Structural glued laminated timber in main sanctuary
- Unadorned concrete block walls
- Plastered pointed arched ceiling above altar
- Shaped concrete block framing altar area
- Exposed plank ceiling

Elements of Liturgical Significance

- East-west orientation of structure
- Stained glass windows depicting Christian scenes
- Elevated altar alcove at east end of structure

Historic/Associative Value

The structure reflects historic and associative value being designed by the firm of well-known Hamilton architect William R. Souter. Souter and his firm also designed Hamilton's acclaimed

Cathedral Basilica of Christ the King 1931-33, for which Souter was awarded the Bemerenti Medal from Pope Pius XI in Rome in 1933. Souter is a significant architect in the community with many houses, institutions and the cenotaph in Gore Park being examples of his work. The structure reflects the influx in the Lutheran congregation of Hamilton following the Second World War, whereby the congregation grew from around 300 to 3,000. The influx necessitated the formation of four new Lutheran Church congregations, of which Grace Lutheran Church at 1170 Main Street West in Westdale was one.