MEETING NOTES POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP

Monday January 17, 2022 3:00 pm City of Hamilton Web Ex Virtual Meeting

Attendees: C. Dimitry, L. Lunsted, A. Denham-Robinson, W. Rosart, R. McKee,

C. Priamo

Regrets: K. Stacey,

Also Present: C. Richer, A. Knowles, J. Croft

THE POLICY AND DESIGN WORKING GROUP NOTES FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE WITH RESPECT TO:

1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None

3. REVIEW OF PAST MEETING NOTES Notes of December 13, 2021

Approved

4. C.H.I.A. – Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment for 1107 Main Street W, (Grace Lutheran Church), November 2021 by Parslow Heritage Consultancy Inc.

This is a new CHIA, based on previous versions, as the original consultant had retired. The proposal is to demolish Grace Lutheran Church and replace it with 15 storey mixed-use residential structure.

Individual comments:

 This property has come multiple times before the Policy & Design working group and each iteration seems to retain less of the heritage attributes than the last version

- The previous CHIA indicated that the church met all of the criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest. This current CHIA indicates that it meets five out of nine criteria.
- The recommendation to create a Community Garden on City-owned property is not a feasible alternative for destroying a community green space in situ.
- A zoning amendment would be required to build the proposed structure.
- The building retains enough heritage attributes to recommend heritage designation.

Recommendations regarding the CHIA for 1107 Main Street W.

The Policy & Design Working Group feels that the CHIA does not make enough effort to retain the church or at least significant portions of it, and its green space.

The group recommends that this property be addressed by the Inventory & Research Working Group for further research and potential designation.

The Working Group does not accept the CHIA.

5. C.H.I.A. – Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment for 1072 Main Street East, (Children's Museum) November 11, 2021 by Megan Hobson

The proposal is to construct a one-storey addition on the west side building and a small one-storey addition at the back of the building. In addition, the Museum would also like to improve accessibility to the site and is proposing to make the front and back entrances fully accessible and add an elevator on the east side. This property is listed on the Municipal Heritage Register and is located in Gage Park.

Individual Comments:

- The Policy & Design Working Group would like more information to evaluate the appropriateness of the proposed additions. This includes further elevation drawings and renderings, including details on the proposed cladding.
- We have concerns that the proposed west addition will look like gabled huts or greenhouses.
- Further consideration should be given to placing the addition on the east side of the building to limit impacts on the historic Beech hedges.
- o The Working Group would like to see directional information on the images.
- While not specifically connected to this CHIA, there may be impacts on the original landscape design of Gage Park by renowned landscape architects Howard & Lorrie Dunington-Grubb, as the Beech hedges are proposed to be cut back
- The suggestion was made that perhaps the Friends of Gage Park would appreciate seeing this CHIA.

Recommendations regarding the CHIA for 1072 Main Street East

The Working Group would like to see this CHIA again, once it has been revised to reflect the Policy & Design Working Group comments.

6. C.H.I.A. – Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment for 574 Northcliffe Ave, Dundas (Sisters of St. Joseph Motherhouse), July 2019 by ASI.

The proposal is to build an addition on to an addition that was built in 2004, as well as adding new parking spaces and sidewalks. The new addition will house a gymnasium with a capacity of 1370.

Individual Comments:

- The Policy & Design Working Group are comfortable with the proposal to have a second addition to the Motherhouse building as this means seeing the building retained.
- Page 57, regarding the Ontario Regulation 9/06 evaluation criteria, the members believe the following criteria should be met, as the architect has been identified:
 - o 1.ii "displays a high degree of craftmanship or artistic merit"; and,
 - o The Group also felt that the building is a landmark.
- Page 14, section 2.2.1 contains an error (change 'Township of Barton' to Township of West Flamborough).
- o Page 15, Section 2.3.1 contains an error (change '1877' atlas to '1875').
- Page 64, recommendation to provide a copy of the final CHIA to the Flamborough Archives.

Recommendations regarding the CHIA for 574 Northcliffe Ave., Dundas

The Policy & Design Working Group is supportive of the CHIA and does not need to review it again.

7. ADJOURNMENT

The Policy & Design Working Group Meeting adjourned at 4:30pm.

Next meeting date: February 14, 2022