

# CITY OF HAMILTON PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT Tourism and Culture Division

and

**Planning Division** 

то:	Chair and Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	February 25, 2022
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 15
PREPARED BY:	Alissa Golden (905) 546-2424 Ext. 4654 Chloe Richer (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7163
SUBMITTED BY:	Carrie Brooks-Joiner Director Tourism and Culture Planning and Economic Development
SIGNATURE:	Carrie Brooks-Joiner
SUBMITTED BY:	Steve Robichaud Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	Per: CeteiNeuberd

### RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That City Council state its intention to designate the following properties under Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*:
  - (i) 289 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Smith-Carson House), in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, as outlined in Appendix "A" to Report PED21201(b);
  - (ii) 292 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Maple Lawn), in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, as outlined in Appendix "B" to Report PED21201(b);

#### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 2 of 14

- (iii) 298 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Former New Connexion Church), in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, as outlined in Appendix "C" to Report PED21201(b);
- (iv) 299 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Crooker House), in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, as outlined in Appendix "D" to Report PED21201(b);
- (v) 1 Main Street North, Flamborough (Royal Coachman/Former Kirk Hotel), in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, as outlined in Appendix "E" to Report PED21201(b);
- (vi) 134 Main Street South, Flamborough (Former Wesleyan Methodist Parsonage), in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, as outlined in Appendix "F" to Report PED21201(b);
- (vii) 8 Margaret Street, Flamborough (Reid House), in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, as outlined in Appendix "G" to Report PED21201(b);
- (b) That the City Clerk be directed to give Notices of Intention to designate the properties of cultural heritage value or interest in Recommendation (a) of Report PED21201(b), in accordance with the requirements of Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following:
  - (i) That issuance of the Notice of Intention to designate 299 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Crooker House) be delayed to give the owner time to complete the alterations approved as part of Site Plan Control Application MDA-17-039, with the understanding that the City Clerk shall issue the Notice of Intention to designate upon completion of such alterations or earlier if the approved work has not been completed within a reasonable amount of time or if there is a threat or perceived threat to the heritage attributes of the property outside the scope of the approved work, as determined by the Director of Planning and Chief Planner;
  - (ii) For each property that receives no objections to the Notice of Intention to designate in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to introduce the necessary by-law to designate the property to be of cultural heritage value or interest to City Council;

#### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 3 of 14

- (iii) For each property that receives any objection to the Notice of Intention to designate in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council directs staff to report back to Council to allow Council to consider the objection and decide whether or not to withdraw the Notice of Intention to designate the property.
- (c) That 9 Main Street North, Flamborough (Village Fish and Chips), be removed from staff's designation work plan.

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This report Recommends designation of seven significant built heritage resources in Flamborough under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* that were evaluated as part of the Waterdown Village Built Heritage Inventory (Waterdown Inventory). Council directed staff to review properties for designation as part of the Waterdown Inventory and as part of the Planning Division's designation work plan.

The properties being recommended for heritage designation as part of this report include 289 Dundas Street East (Smith-Carson House); 292 Dundas Street East (Maple Lawn); 298 Dundas Street East (Former New Connexion Church); 299 Dundas Street East (Crooker House); 1 Main Street North (Royal Coachman/Former Kirk Hotel); 134 Main Street South (Former Wesleyan Methodist Parsonage); and 8 Margaret Street (Reid House).

Four properties were also considered candidates for designation but are not being recommended for designation at this time, including 340 Dundas Street East, 341 Main Street North, 201 Main Street South and 265 Mill Street South.

### Alternatives for Consideration - See Page 12

### **FINANCIAL - STAFFING - LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

Financial: N/A

- Staffing: N/A
- Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the properties. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and considered by Council before either withdrawing the Notice of Intention to designate or passing a designation by-law. Once a designation by-law has

#### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 4 of 14

been passed, any further objection would be heard before the Ontario Land Tribunal.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the Act.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)). The City of Hamilton also provides financial incentive programs, including development charge exemption and heritage grants and loans, to assist in the adaptive re-use and continued conservation of designated properties.

## HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The City of Hamilton is proactively updating its Inventory of Heritage Buildings through its Built Heritage Inventory Strategy, outlined in Report PED20133. The Built Heritage Inventory (BHI) process involves the identification of properties of heritage interest worthy of listing on the Municipal Heritage Register (Register), and the identification of significant heritage buildings worthy of designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The Waterdown Inventory is the third phase in the City's BHI work and follows the Downtown Hamilton Inventory completed in 2014 and the Durand Inventory completed in 2017.

The Waterdown Inventory began in May 2018 and was completed in conjunction with the Waterdown Community Node Secondary Plan Study and the Waterdown Transportation Management Plan Study, which are ongoing. The study area of the Waterdown Inventory project included the Secondary Plan study area, as well as the remaining lands to the east that make up the historic village boundaries of Waterdown.

In 2019, Council approved motions to proactively list the subject properties on the Register prior to the completion of the Waterdown Inventory. These motions also directed Planning and Economic Development Department staff to review these properties for potential designation as part of the designation work plan and within the scope of the Waterdown Inventory project.

The Waterdown Inventory followed the Council-adopted BHI process and involved the preparation of comprehensive Cultural Heritage Assessment reports for properties identified as candidates for designation. Copies of the reports are available online at

### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 5 of 14

<u>www.hamilton.ca/heritageinventory</u> or upon request from the Planning and Economic Development Department.

Staff reported on the findings of the Waterdown Inventory project as part of Report PED21201. On November 10, 2021, Council approved the project recommendations and directed staff to add 209 properties of cultural heritage value or interest in Waterdown on the Register.

## **Designation Candidates Not Addressed in this Report**

341 Main Street North (Rymal/Buchan House) and 201 Main Street South (J.K. Griffin House) were identified as candidates for designation through the Waterdown Inventory project but were not comprehensively reviewed due to resource constraints and access issues, respectively. These properties may be candidates for designation in the future, subject to further review. In the meantime, both properties have been listed on the Register.

A Cultural Heritage Assessment was also prepared in support of designation of 340 Dundas Street East (Eager House). City staff are in conversation with the owner of this property about the adjacent Dundas Street Bridge replacement over the Grindstone Creek and its potential impact on the property. Staff will bring forward a recommendation to designate the property at a future date after the bridge-related matters have been resolved.

Staff deferred preparation of a Cultural Heritage Assessment for the property at 265 Mill Street South, known as Braebourne or the Cummer House, because it is under review as part of an active Zoning By-law Amendment Application (ZAC-21-017) under the *Planning Act.* A Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA) has been submitted by the proponent in support of their application to develop a Montessori school on the property, which incorporates the existing historic dwelling. The report, which includes an assessment of the cultural heritage value or interest of the property in accordance with *Ontario Regulation 9/06*, has been reviewed by staff and will be reviewed by the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's Inventory and Research Working Group for comment. The final CHIA report, which will incorporate staff and Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's comments, will be used to address the request to designate the property as part of the development application process.

Additionally, three City-owned properties were identified as significant Cultural Heritage Landscapes as part of the draft Waterdown Community Node Secondary Plan, 9 Margaret Street (Waterdown Union Cemetery); 115 Main Street South (Sealey Park); and 200 Hamilton Street North (Waterdown Memorial Park). On November 10, 2021, City Council directed staff to add Sealey Park and Waterdown Memorial Park to the

### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 6 of 14

Register (see Report PED21201). Planning staff are in ongoing conversation with staff from the Public Works Department to discuss designation of these significant heritage properties as part of a future staff report.

## **Owner Consultation**

In August 2020, the owners of properties identified for designation were notified by mailed letters of the draft recommendations and invited to participate in a virtual open house of the Waterdown Inventory findings. The virtual open house was accessible online via the City of Hamilton project page and Engage Hamilton from August 24, 2020 to September 21, 2020. Several subject property owners reached out to staff, including the owners of 289 Dundas Street East, 298 Dundas Street East, 340 Dundas Street East and 134 Main Street South, to discuss the draft CHIA reports, designation process, and available financial incentives. In September 2021, follow-up letters were sent to all the owners notifying them of the upcoming staff report and recommendations to designate.

# POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The Recommendations of this report are consistent with Provincial and Municipal legislation, policy and direction, including:

- Determining the cultural heritage value or interest of a property based on design/physical value, historical/associative value and contextual value criteria (*Ontario Heritage Act, Ontario Regulation 9/06*);
- Ensuring significant built heritage resources are conserved (Provincial Policy Statement, 2020, Sub-section 2.6.1);
- Identifying cultural heritage resources through a continuing process of inventory, survey and evaluation, as the basis for wise management of these resources (*Urban Hamilton Official Plan*, Section B.3.4.2.1(b)); and
- Designating properties of cultural heritage value under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (*Urban Hamilton Official Plan*, Section B.3.4.2.3).

# **RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

## External

• Property owners in Waterdown

### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 7 of 14

- Waterdown Community Node Secondary Plan Focus Group
- Waterdown-Mill Street Heritage Committee
- Inventory and Research Working Group of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

#### Internal

- Solicitor, Legal and Risk Management Services, Legal Services Division, Corporate Services Department
- Senior Project Manager, Rural Team, Development Planning Section, Planning Division, Planning and Economic Development Department
- Senior Planner, Community Planning and GIS Section, Planning Division, Planning and Economic Development Department
- Manager, Parks and Cemeteries Section, Environmental Services Division, Public Works Department
- Acting Senior Project Manager, Strategic Planning and Capital Compliance Section, Energy, Fleet and Facilities Management Division, Public Works Department
- Councillor, Ward 15

## ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The cultural heritage value or interest of the subject properties were assessed using the Council-adopted heritage evaluation criteria for designation, as well as the required provincial criteria. Section 29(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets one or more of the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest prescribed in *Ontario Regulation 9/06*. This regulation identifies criteria in three broad categories: Design/Physical Value, Historical/Associative Value and Contextual Value.

### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 8 of 14

As outlined in the Cultural Heritage Assessment Reports, it was determined that the following properties met the provincial criteria and are therefore being Recommended for individual designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*:

# 1. 289 Dundas Street East (Smith-Carson House)

The property located at 289 Dundas Street East is comprised of a two-storey brick dwelling believed to have been constructed circa 1885 by the Cummer family, who made significant contributions to the Village of Waterdown's industrial development. The property also has long-standing associations with the Carson family, and their prominent local business of Fred Carson and Sons, and Richard "Dick" Smith, former Reeve of Waterdown. The design of the building is influenced by the Queen Anne architectural style and demonstrates a high degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit in its detailing, including the decorative wooden bargeboard and treillage, the stone work in the voussoirs and keystones and the dichromatic brickwork. The building's distinctive tower and mature trees on the property help define it as a landmark on Dundas Street East that marks the transition into the historic downtown core of Waterdown. The property satisfies the criteria established in *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and warrants protection under the *Ontario Heritage Act* through designation in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (SCHVI) and Description of Heritage Attributes as outlined in Appendix "A" to Report PED21201(b).

## 2. 292 Dundas Street East (Maple Lawn)

The property located at 292 Dundas Street East is comprised of a two-storey brick dwelling believed to have been constructed in 1887, later converted into a commercial building. The property has direct associations with two prominent people significant to Waterdown's history, George Allison (1841-1926), a farmer and local magistrate; and George Harold Greene (1874-1960), the first publisher of the Waterdown Review. The former residence is a representative example of a late-nineteenth century farm house influenced by the Gothic Revival and Italianate architectural styles and displays a high degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit demonstrated through the decorative bargeboard and bracket detailing. This local landmark helps mark the transition into the historic core of Waterdown and define the Dundas streetscape. The property satisfies the criteria established in *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and warrants protection under the *Ontario Heritage Act* through designation in accordance with the SCHVI and Description of Heritage Attributes as outlined in Appendix "B" to Report PED21201(b).

# 3. 298 Dundas Street East (Former New Connexion Church)

The property located at 298 Dundas Street East, known as the Former New Connexion Methodist Church and the Maycock House, is comprised of a two-storey stone building

### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 9 of 14

originally constructed as a church circa 1859. The heritage value of the property lies in its long-standing association with the Methodist Church. The New Connexion Methodists purchased the property in 1859 and built the church, later using the building as their Sunday School (1874-1882) and then parsonage (1893-1921). The property also has direct associations with prominent Waterdown resident Paul Maycock (1931-2012), a plant ecology professor and former director of the Flamborough Historical Society who dedicated his spare time to researching and writing about the history of Waterdown. The property is also an early and unique example of an adaptively re-used mid-nineteenth century building displaying Classical Revival, Ontario Cottage and Gothic Revival influences. The prominent location of the building at the southwest corner of Dundas and Flamboro Streets in the core of Waterdown makes it a local landmark. The property satisfies the criteria established in *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and warrants protection under the *Ontario Heritage Act* through designation in accordance with the SCHVI and Description of Heritage Attributes as outlined in Appendix "C" to Report PED21201(b).

# 4. 299 Dundas Street East (Crooker House)

The property located at 299 Dundas Street East, known as the Crooker House, is comprised of a former residence and detached coach house originally constructed circa 1886. The heritage value of the property lies in its association with the Crooker family, who made significant contributions to the development of the Village of Waterdown, including Frederick William Crooker (1862-1927), who was a successful merchant who established the prominent Crooker Building (later demolished by fire), a teacher and superintendent of the Wesleyan Methodist Sunday School, postmaster, and later Reeve who oversaw the installation of a waterworks system in Waterdown. The property is also a representative example of a residence influenced by the Italianate and Second Empire styles of architecture, demonstrated by a high degree of craftsmanship in its bellcast mansard roof, decorative features and dichromatic brickwork. The Crooker House is a local landmark with a prominent vista looking north up Flamboro Street, located on Dundas Street in the core of Waterdown. The property satisfies the criteria established in Ontario Regulation 9/06 and warrants protection under the Ontario Heritage Act through designation or the negotiation of a heritage conservation easement agreement in accordance with the SCHVI and Description of Heritage Attributes as outlined in Appendix "D" to Report PED21201(b).

## **Previous Approvals**

On May 31, 2018 the owner of the subject property received Site Plan Control Approval of application MDA-17-039 for alterations to the property, including relocation of the detached coach house and the construction of a covered front porch and one-storey addition to the front and west side of the building. The owner was also granted

### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 10 of 14

permission from the Committee of Adjustment on November 17, 2017 for Minor Variance Application FL/A-17:382, required to implement the Site Plan Control application. Most of the Site Plan-approved work has been completed, apart from the covered front porch and addition. Issuance of a Notice of Intention to designate would void these previous approvals and require the owner to obtain new *Planning Act* approvals, as well as Heritage Permit approvals under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, for work that has already been reviewed and commented on by Heritage staff.

As such, staff Recommend that issuance of the Notice of Intention to designate the property be delayed to allow the owner time to complete the alterations approved as part of applications MDA-17-039 and FL/A-17:382. The Notice of Intention to designate will be issued when the work is completed, or may proceed with issuance of the Notice of Intention to designate the property if the Site Plan-approved works are not initiated within a reasonable amount of time or if there is a threat or perceived threat to the heritage attributes of the property outside of the scope of the approved work, as determined by the Director of Planning and Chief Planner. Staff note that the City may also consider entering into a heritage conservation easement agreement with the owner under the *Ontario Heritage Act* to provide long-term heritage protection for the property, while excluding the previously-approved works from any future Heritage Permit requirements. This alternative would require the owner's consent to enter into the heritage conservation easement agreement.

## 5. 1 Main Street North (Royal Coachman/Former Kirk House Hotel)

The property located at 1 Main Street North, formerly known as the Kirk Hotel or the Kirk House and currently known as The Royal Coachman, is comprised of a two-and-ahalf storey brick commercial building constructed circa 1889. The historical value of the property lies in its role as a significant gathering place in the Village of Waterdown for over 130 years, its association with the Great Fire of 1922 and its long-standing connection to the Kirk family. The property is also a representative example of a latenineteenth century commercial building influenced by the Queen Anne Revival and Italianate architectural styles, which displays a high degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit in its decorative wood detailing. Located on the prominent intersection of two historic roads, Main Street North and Dundas Street East, the former Kirk House was connected to early stagecoach routes and provided a place to eat and stay for travellers on their journey. Today, The Royal Coachman restaurant continues to serve as an important landmark and defines the historic character of the Village's commercial core. The property satisfies the criteria established in Ontario Regulation 9/06 and warrants protection under the Ontario Heritage Act through designation in accordance with the SCHVI and Description of Heritage Attributes as outlined in Appendix "E" to Report PED21201(b).

## 6. 134 Main Street South (Former Wesleyan Methodist Parsonage)

The property located at 134 Main Street South, known as the former Wesleyan Methodist Parsonage, is comprised of a one-and-a-half-storey stone building constructed circa 1857. The heritage value of the property lies in its association with the Wesleyan Methodist Church, who originally constructed the building as their parsonage, and with Ada Medlar (born 1868), a founding member of the Waterdown Women's Institute in 1897. The property is also a representative example of a vernacular Ontario Cottage influenced by the Gothic Revival architectural style and has a high degree of craftsmanship demonstrated by the ornate front porch and wooden detailing. The property defines the historic character of Main Street South, located on the prominent southwest corner of Flamboro and Main Streets, and is considered a local landmark. The property satisfies the criteria established in *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and warrants protection under the *Ontario Heritage Act* through designation in accordance with the SCHVI and Description of Heritage Attributes as outlined in Appendix "F" to Report PED21201(b).

## 7. 8 Margaret Street (Reid House)

The property located at 8 Margaret Street, known as the Reid House, is comprised of a two-and-a-half storey wood-frame dwelling constructed circa 1860 with a substantial circa 1910 addition. The historical value of the property lies in its association with the Reid family. John Reid (1854-1912) was a prominent Waterdown builder, who lived in and constructed the circa 1910 addition. His son, William (Will) Reid (1888-1956), was a photographer who created a visual record of life in Waterdown in the early-twentieth century. Without Will's photographs, little would be known about life in Waterdown during his lifetime. The property is a unique example of a dwelling believed to have been constructed in two distinct phases: a one-and-a-half storey cross-gabled vernacular farm house constructed circa 1860; and a substantial two-and-a-half storey, hipped roof, Queen Anne Revival influenced front addition constructed circa 1910. It demonstrates a high degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit demonstrated by the ornate wood detailing in the 1910 addition. The Reid House is a recognizable local landmark that defines the historic character of the area known as Vinegar Hill. The property satisfies the criteria established in Ontario Regulation 9/06 and warrants protection under the Ontario Heritage Act through designation in accordance with the SCHVI and Description of Heritage Attributes as outlined in Appendix "G" to Report PED21201(b).

## Removal from the Designation Work Plan

A CHIA was also prepared for the property located at 9 Main Street North, the former Waterdown Post Office and Village Fish and Chips, as directed by Council. Staff found

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully. OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner. OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 12 of 14

that the property satisfied the provincial criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest. However, the criteria satisfied relates primarily to the property's historical associations and how it supports the historic character of the village. The subject property is already recognized through listing on the Register.

Due to the limited design/physical value of the property, it is not recommended that the property be designated under the *Ontario Heritage Act* at this time. Instead, it is Recommended that the historical significance of the property be recognized through interpretive plaquing. Should the current owner, or subsequent owners, be interested in restoration of the building and missing historic features based on physical or visual documentation, the property may warrant designation to provide access to the City's heritage funding programs. Staff Recommend that the property be removed from the designation work plan.

## **Owner Opposition to Designation**

At the time of writing this report, staff have not received any formal correspondence from owners expressing their opposition to the staff recommendation to designate their property. However, the former owners of 292 Dundas Street East (Maple Lawn), expressed concern about their property being listed on the Register and added to staff's designation work plan in 2019. According to tax assessment records, the ownership of the property has changed. Staff did not receive a response to the written notice to the current owners advising them of the draft recommendation to designate their property.

Staff have determined that seven significant heritage properties in Waterdown are of cultural heritage value or interest sufficient to warrant individual designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act.* Staff are not recommending that any properties recommended for designation be withdrawn due to owner opposition. Staff Recommend that the properties be designated in accordance with the Statements of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Descriptions of Heritage Attributes for each property attached as Appendices "A" through "G" to Report PED21201(b).

## ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, may decide to designate property or decline to designate property.

## **Decline to Designate**

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to these significant cultural heritage resources (designation provides

### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 13 of 14

protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the properties would not be eligible for the City's financial incentives for heritage properties, including development charge exemption and grant and loan programs. Designation alone does not restrict the legal use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or been demonstrated to affect its resale value. However, designation does allow the municipality to manage change to the heritage attributes of a property through the Heritage Permit process. Staff does not consider declining to designate any of the properties to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

## **Designation Deferral**

Council may decide to defer the recommendation to designate one or more properties to a future study. Staff anticipate that one of the recommendations of the ongoing draft Waterdown Community Node Secondary Plan Study will be for staff to pursue a new Heritage Conservation District Study in Waterdown. Staff do not recommend deferring the designation of any properties to a future study. All the properties recommended for designation are worthy of Part IV individual designation, which provides greater protection and management under the *Ontario Heritage Act* than a Part V district designation. The *Ontario Heritage Act* does not prevent a property from being both Part IV and Part V designated. Further, Council has not yet directed staff to conduct a new Heritage Conservation District Study in Waterdown, and staff's ability to conduct one will depend on available funding and staff resources.

## ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 - 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

## **Community Engagement and Participation**

Hamilton has an open, transparent and accessible approach to City government that engages with and empowers all citizens to be involved in their community.

## **Culture and Diversity**

Hamilton is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

## **Our People and Performance**

Hamiltonians have a high level of trust and confidence in their City government.

# APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" - SCHVI for 289 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Carson-Smith House)

#### SUBJECT: Recommendations for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in Waterdown Village (PED21201(b)) (Ward 15) - Page 14 of 14

Appendix "B" - SCVHI for 292 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Maple Lawn)

Appendix "C" - SCVHI for 298 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Former New Connexion Church)

Appendix "D" - SCHVI for 299 Dundas Street East, Flamborough (Crooker House)

Appendix "E" - SCVHI for 1 Main Street North, Flamborough (Royal Coachman/Former Kirk Hotel)

Appendix "F" - SCVHI for 134 Main Street South, Flamborough (Former Wesleyan Methodist Parsonage)

Appendix "G" - SCVHI for 8 Margaret Street, Flamborough (Reid House)

AG/CR:ac