




CITY OF HAMILTON
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT
Energy, Fleet and Facilities Management Division

TO:	Mayor and Members General Issues Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	March 23, 2022
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	The Security of the City's Property and Personnel (PW22016) (City Wide)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Delfina Duarte (905) 546-2424 Ext. 6627 Martin Dambeau (905) 546-2424 Ext. 2855 Gina McCormick (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7258
SUBMITTED BY:	Rom D'Angelo Director, Energy, Fleet and Facilities Management Public Works Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATIONS

- (a) That the Corporate Security Office be directed to provide Council Security Orientation Training to all elected Members of Council, their administration staff and other City staff members, as may be appropriate, at the start of a new Council term and at any other time as maybe requested throughout the term of Council;
- (b) That the one-time cost of the Training Program (software and materials) estimated at \$50,000 be funded from the previously approved Capital Account PID #3722241805 - Facilities Security Program 2022;
- (c) That the Corporate Security Office be authorized and responsible to procure and coordinate 3rd party services to provide personal environment Security Risk Assessments for Elected Members of Council (and Senior Staff on a case by case basis) if voluntarily requested to do so (once per term of Council);
- (d) That the ongoing costs of the Security Risk Assessments, as identified in Recommendation (c), estimated at \$5,000/ per assessment be funded from the Capital Account PID #3722241805 - Facilities Security Program 2022 and

**SUBJECT: The Security of the City's Property and Personnel
(PW22016) (City Wide) - Page 2 of 9**

further, that an estimated \$105,000 be referred to the 2023 Capital Budget process for consideration;

- (e) That subsequent to completion of the Security Risk Assessment, Elected Members of Council (and Senior Staff on a case by case basis) may voluntarily choose to implement some or all of the Security Risk Assessment recommendations and, upon completion of the work, will be entitled to reimbursement for the associated actual costs up to a maximum of \$8,000 (plus HST) once per Council term. Such expenses to be deemed as a taxable benefit;
- (f) That a one-time estimated \$168,000 be referred to the 2023 Capital Budget to cover costs of implementing recommendation (e), and that any new Council costs incurred in 2022 be funded from Capital Account PID #3722241805 - Facilities Security Program 2022;
- (g) That for any security implementation requiring 3rd party monthly monitoring, the City of Hamilton will reimburse the Elected Official (Senior Staff on a case by case basis) for the actual cost up to a maximum of \$100 monthly (plus HST) as a taxable benefit and that such costs be funded from the Elected Official's (Senior Staff's) applicable expense budgets. Reimbursements are applicable only during elected status (or employed status for Senior Staff); and
- (h) That the annual operating impacts of \$53,000 to fund an additional 0.5 FTE to coordinate and manage the ongoing requirements of these recommendations be included in the 2022 Public Works Department operating budget in the Corporate Security Office Dept ID #790017.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Any municipal organization within Canada has responsibilities through various governance and legislative edicts to ensure reasonable programs are in place to support employee health and safety in the workplace. These responsibilities are usually clear when it comes to its own staff, however ambiguity arises when considering the application for elected officials who are not defined as employees of the institution and who may be deemed to conduct official duties outside of the City of Hamilton (City) owned workplace. This challenge is being discussed by many different municipality leadership teams and associations. The City has a responsibility to ensure that appropriate measures are considered and applied to help mitigate foreseeable threats.

The purpose of this report is to provide General Issues Committee with:

- some background on increased Canadian threat trends to Elected Officials;

**SUBJECT: The Security of the City's Property and Personnel
(PW22016) (City Wide) - Page 3 of 9**

- the results of a research and Municipal benchmarking exercise conducted by staff with various Canadian Municipal partners and their response to increased Canadian threat trends to Elected Officials;
- recommendations for Security Safety Awareness Training, that would be provided to the Mayor and all Members of Council, their administration staff and other staff as may be appropriate at the beginning of each new Council term and as may be further required from time to time;
- recommendations and mitigating responses that can be utilized on a case by case basis by the Mayor, Members of Council and Senior Leadership Team (on a case by case basis).

Alternatives for Consideration – Not Applicable

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: The Training Program Software and materials will be funded from Capital Account PID #372224185 -Facilities Security Program 2022 at an estimated cost of \$50,000. Training software was previously approved as part of the 2022 Capital Budget Process.

That the annual operating impacts of \$53,000 to fund an additional 0.5 FTE to coordinate and manage the ongoing requirements of the recommendations be included in the 2022 Public Works Department base operating budget in the Corporate Security Office Dept ID #790017;

The Security Risk Assessments are estimated at \$5,000/ per individual. For 2022 (2 months) any funding requirements will be charged to Capital Account PID #3722241805 -Facilities Security Program 2022 and further, an estimated \$105,000 (\$5,000 x 16 for Elected Officials and \$5,000 x 5 for Senior Staff on a case by case basis) will referred to the 2023 Capital Budget process for 2023 requirements.

Security Systems (Recommendations c and d) installations are estimated at \$168,000 for 2023 (and will be referred to the 2023 Capital Budget process. Any 2022 expenses (2 months) will be funded from Capital Account PID #372224185. The estimate is calculated as (\$8,000 x 16 for Elected Officials and \$8,000 x 5 for Senior Staff on a case by case basis)

That the monitoring fees of \$100/month +HST be expensed from the Councillors/Senior Staff individual expense accounts and reimbursed through the normal expense procedures.

Taxable Benefit: The CRA definition of a taxable benefit is whether an employee or officer receives an economic advantage that can be measured

**SUBJECT: The Security of the City's Property and Personnel
(PW22016) (City Wide) - Page 4 of 9**

in money and whether the individual, rather than the employer is the primary beneficiary of the benefit. In this case the security is being provided to the Elected official for their "personal residence, vehicle and other personal environments" therefore this would meet the definition of a taxable benefit.

Staffing: The addition of 0.5 of an FTE (Security Coordinator) is recommended to develop, implement and administrate the program at an estimated \$53,000/year. This report recommends an in-year operating budget enhancement to develop the training content in advance of the new Council inauguration.

Legal: Section 25(1)(h) of Ontario's *Occupational Health and Safety Act* obliges and employer to "take every precaution reasonable in the circumstances for the protection of a worker".

This report was reviewed by Legal Services.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

This report addresses increased Canadian threat trends to Elected Officials and to public facing Senior Staff members.

Since 2015, the tolerance and, at times, the fostering of aggressive to violent public dissidence and disruption of democratic processes including the attempted influencing of Elected Officials has become a more frequent talking point both in the traditional media and on social media platforms.

In Canada since 2020, the urgent need by elected officials and Public Health officials to enact unprecedented public health measures has fueled the use of social media to spread misinformation including the notion of premeditated governmental takeover of social freedoms.

The 2019 federal election campaign brought to light many local Hamilton groups that openly vocalized support for intimidation-based ideologies and methods intended to influence political associations and decisions. Between 2019 and 2021, there was a noticeable increase in disruptive protesting and vandalism observed on City property and in some cases on the private property belonging to Elected Officials.

On December 14, 2021, Corporate Security presented a Briefing Note to Senior Leadership Team (SLT) regarding the significant emergence of increased threats to elected officials. Related discussions indicated that threats previously focused on Elected Officials have grown in their scope to now include senior level government staffing positions who, through their delegated authorities have become the public face of locally implemented public health safety measures. Within Hamilton's experience, this

**SUBJECT: The Security of the City's Property and Personnel
(PW22016) (City Wide) - Page 5 of 9**

includes appointed roles such as the Medical Officer of Health, the Director of the City's Emergency Operations Centre, and members of the Senior Leadership Team.

In preparation for this report, members of the City's Corporate Security team attended recent discussions and benchmarking sessions (February 3 & 11, 2021) with other members of Canadian municipal corporate security teams. Through these sessions, the primary topic was the impact of increased Canadian threat trends to elected and bureaucratic officials, as well as the overall institution. In the recent February 2022 sessions, representation from the corporate security teams of each the municipalities identified in Table 1 (below) were able to informally share their previous challenges, trends and current business strategies to respond to, and mitigate, these issues.

Table 1 - List of Municipalities Consulted			
Hamilton	Toronto	Kitchener	Brampton
Edmonton	Cambridge	Calgary	Mississauga
Montreal	Surrey	Sudbury	Halifax
Oshawa	Windsor	York Region	
Markham	Vaughn	Vancouver	

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

All policies and legislated requirements have been considered and adhered.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

The following have been consulted in the development of this report and its recommendations.

- Members of SLT;
- City Manager's Office;
- Corporate Services, Clerks Office, Finance and Administration;
- Corporate Services, Legal Services & Risk Management Services
- Senior Leadership Team (various presentations and meetings); and
- External Municipal Security Benchmarking (Edmonton, Montreal, Oshawa, Markham, Toronto, Cambridge, Surrey, Windsor, Vaughn, Kitchener, Calgary, Sudbury, York Region, Vancouver, Brampton, Mississauga and Halifax).

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The City's Corporate Security Office recognizes that the challenges faced by the City's Members of Council are similar to those experienced by partner municipal security teams who are tasked with providing mitigating measures and proactive responses. The

**SUBJECT: The Security of the City's Property and Personnel
(PW22016) (City Wide) - Page 6 of 9**

Corporate Security Office have engaged in comprehensive benchmarking and knowledge transfer with major Canadian municipalities to understand their programs, assigned resources, business structures, policies and procedures. While there are varying degrees from one municipality to another in how these challenges are addressed, there are some significant measures applied by some such as of dedicated protection resources through police and private security staff, as well as optional measures that can be applied on a case by case basis as requested by an Elected Official. The ways and means of applying these strategies also vary, however there appears to be a trend with recent changes implemented by larger municipalities to ensure that optional measures that can be considered are delivered through an enterprise security risk process. This process addresses the known risks, their likelihood of occurrence, their impact, and it provides mitigating measures and recommendations for consideration. A key element of this process is that the individual Elected Official maintain control of the process through their own discretion of implementing all or some of the recommendations presented.

Through the recent benchmarking, the Corporate Security Office has been able to understand that a great focus in the last few years by larger municipalities has been to ensure at the beginning of every new Council term, all Members of Council are provided with security orientation training. This training includes knowledge transfer related to the safety and security in Council Chambers, authorities and tools that meeting Chairs can exercise, situational awareness training for both in the workplace and on personal time, and the ability to assess event scenarios and apply basic risk assessment practices to preserve life, safety and democratic processes.

Corporate Security Office has also captured the trends related to the deployment of safety and security measures for Members of Council outside of the traditional workplace and at private residences. For example, in a recent January 2022 By-law amendment, the City of Calgary's Council approved to provide a reimbursement of up to \$8,000 to cover costs to professionally install home security systems and additionally to cover \$100 per month for monitoring fees as a taxable benefit.

While the environment around security and safety is very fluid, and the need to provide reasonable measures of protection in the workplace for Elected Officials can extend beyond the traditional walls of City Hall, the following measures are recommended based on internal and external consultation, network benchmarking and industry best practices.

Council Security Orientation Training:

The Corporate Security Office provides Council Security Orientation Training to all elected Members of Council at the start of a new council term and at any other frequencies required by Council throughout the term. This training will instill mindsets and cognitive tools for each Member that will be essential to ensuring their own safety

and the safety of those around them during challenging experiences. The goal of the training will be to provide a foundation for security situational awareness practices to enable each recipient of the training, with the ability to anticipate threats and act accordingly based on their environment.

Major focus areas of the Council Security Orientation Training would include:

- Security Situational Awareness;
- Procedures on Workplace Safety;
- Procedures on How to Report Incidents and/or Threats;
- Personal Safety Guidelines that would include in-person meetings and discussions on social media footprints;
- Council Chambers Emergency Evacuation Training that will include;
 - i. Procedures on Run / Hide / Fight
 - ii. Location of Rescue Points and Emergency Plan.

Annual refresher training for Emergency Evacuation procedures/drills will be implemented. Costs associated with the training would be captured through the previously approved Capital Account PID #3722241805 - Facilities Security Program 2022 and future budget processes.

Security Risk Assessment:

Upon request by the Elected Official or Senior Staff or as recommended by the Corporate Security Office (in response to known threats), a one-time personal environment Security Risk Assessment will be coordinated through the Corporate Security Office and conducted by a 3rd party firm. A standard scope for a Security Risk Assessment will be developed by the Corporate Security Office and will include personal residence security, vehicle and/or other personal environments that could be reasonably targeted during the execution of official duties. The scope may also include a review of social media footprint and other reasonable measures based in best industry practices required to assess the individual's threat risks. The Recommendations provided would be based on Corporate Security Technology Standards for lock changes, intrusion / panic alarms and CCTV and other applicable measures. It should be noted that technology risks, such as cyber-attacks are not included in the scope of these recommendations and should be referred to the City's Information Technology Division.

The purpose of the Risk Assessment is to produce any required recommendations to address potential threats.

**SUBJECT: The Security of the City's Property and Personnel
(PW22016) (City Wide) - Page 8 of 9**

Members of Council may initiate this optional service at any time including throughout their term of Election. Opt-in and Opt-out decisions would not be required by any individual.

Security Risk Assessment's would be provided on a one-time basis for each Elected Officials term of Council. Additionally, Senior Staff may be eligible for this same procedure on a case by case basis for extenuating circumstances.

Security Risk Assessments would not apply to the following:

- a) campaign office locations;
- b) situations where individuals are Councillor-elect or Mayor-elect, as a result of a recent election and not yet sworn into their term, and are not acting under an existing term that has not yet expired (incumbent);
- c) individuals who are citizen members of committees that are appointed by a Council body;
- d) volunteers of City, or employees of 3rd party entities (contractors) engaged in delivering municipal services to the community on behalf of the City, or employees of 3rd party entities (contractors) engaged in providing services to the City.

Security Recommendations and Mitigating Measures Implementation:

At the completion of a Security Risk Assessment coordinated through Corporate Security, the associated Elected Official/Senior Staff would be responsible, at their sole discretion to implement all, some or none of the recommendations provided in the Assessment.

Where any or all the recommendations are implemented at the discretion of the Elected Official, a one-time budget with an upset limit of \$8,000 (plus HST) within the Elected term would be available for reimbursement to the elected individual (or Senior Staff) by the City as a taxable benefit.

Reimbursement of costs through this program must be directly associated to specific recommendations and mitigating measures identified in the Security Risk Assessment coordinated by Corporate Security. Alternate assessments and measures that are not included in the Security Risk Assessment coordinated by Corporate Security, would not apply to this program.

Technology Monitoring Services:

**SUBJECT: The Security of the City's Property and Personnel
(PW22016) (City Wide) - Page 9 of 9**

Subsequent to the implementation any recommendations that require monthly monitoring by a 3rd party service, reimbursement of costs up to a maximum of \$100 monthly (plus HST) within the Elected Council term would be reimbursed to the Elected

Official as a taxable benefit. The reimbursement by the City of these costs would end at the completion of the Elected term or employment with the City.

Reimbursement of costs through this program must be directly associated to specific mitigating measures through technology identified in the Security Risk Assessment coordinated by Corporate Security.

Program Coordination and Administration:

The implementation, coordination and administration of the Council Security Orientation Training and Security Risk Assessment services require a dedicated coordinator (0.5 FTE) position. The responsibilities of the Security Coordinator will include course content development in time for the new term of Council (Q4-2022) as well as delivering the training, managing semi-annual emergency evacuation drills and other refresher courses for both Elected Officials and staff.

Workplace Security Enhancements (case by case basis):

Any future recommendations related to City owned workplace environments will continue to be implemented by the Corporate Security Office and funded by the applicable City Department.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Not Applicable

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Healthy and Safe Communities

Hamilton is a safe and supportive City where people are active, healthy, and have a high quality of life.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state of the art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Not applicable