



CITY OF HAMILTON
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
Planning Division

TO:	Mayor and Members Planning Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	April 5, 2022
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Alana Fulford (905) 546-2424 Ext. 4771
SUBMITTED BY:	Steve Robichaud Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That approval be given to **City Initiative CI 22-D to amend City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200** to permit commercial entertainment and recreation on outdoor commercial patios on the following basis:
- (i) That the Draft By-law, attached as Appendix “A” to Report PED16155(c) which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor, be enacted by Council;
 - (ii) That the proposed changes in zoning are in conformity with the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP), Rural Hamilton Official Plan, Hamilton-Wentworth Official Plan and City of Hamilton Official Plan;

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 2 of 16

- (iii) That the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment is consistent Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), 2020 and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019, as amended.
- (b) That approval be given to **City Initiative CI 22-D to amend Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57** to permit commercial entertainment and recreation on outdoor commercial patios on the following basis:
 - (i) That the Draft By-law, attached as Appendix “B” to Report PED16155(c) which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor, be enacted by Council;
 - (ii) That the proposed changes in zoning are in conformity with the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) and Rural Hamilton Official Plan;
 - (iii) That the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment is consistent Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), 2020 and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019, as amended;
- (c) That approval be given to **City Initiative CI 22-D to amend Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86** to permit commercial entertainment and recreation on outdoor commercial patios on the following basis:
 - (i) That the Draft By-law, attached as Appendix “C” to Report PED16155(c) which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor, be enacted by Council;
 - (ii) That the proposed changes in zoning are in conformity with the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) and Rural Hamilton Official Plan;
 - (iii) That the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment is consistent Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), 2020 and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019, as amended;
- (d) That approval be given to **City Initiative CI 22-D to amend Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z** to permit commercial entertainment and recreation on outdoor commercial patios on the following basis:

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 3 of 16

- (i) That the Draft By-law, attached as Appendix “D” to Report PED16155(c) which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor, be enacted by Council;
 - (ii) That the proposed changes in zoning are in conformity with the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) and Rural Hamilton Official Plan;
 - (iii) That the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment is consistent Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), 2020 and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019;
- (e) That approval be given to **City Initiative CI 22-D to amend Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464** to permit commercial entertainment and recreation on outdoor commercial patios on the following basis:
- (i) That the Draft By-law, attached as Appendix “E” to Report PED16155(c) which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor, be enacted by Council;
 - (ii) That the proposed changes in zoning are in conformity with the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) and Rural Hamilton Official Plan;
 - (iii) That the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment is consistent Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), 2020 and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019;
- (f) That approval be given to **City Initiative CI 22-D to amend former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593** to permit commercial entertainment and recreation on outdoor commercial patios on the following basis:
- (i) That the Draft By-law, attached as Appendix “F” to Report PED16155(c) which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor, be enacted by Council;
 - (ii) That the proposed changes in zoning are in conformity with the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP), Rural Hamilton Official Plan, Hamilton-Wentworth Official Plan and City of Hamilton Official Plan;

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 4 of 16

- (iii) That the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment is consistent Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), 2020 and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019;
- (g) That approval be given to **City Initiative CI 22-D to amend City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92** to permit commercial entertainment and recreation on outdoor commercial patios on the following basis:
 - (i) That the Draft By-law, attached as Appendix “G” to Report PED16155(c) which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor, be enacted by Council;
 - (ii) That the proposed changes in zoning are in conformity with the Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP) and Rural Hamilton Official Plan;
 - (iii) That the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment is consistent Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), 2020 and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019;
- (h) Subject to the approval of City Initiative CI 22-D, that Licensing and Bylaw Services staff be directed to report back to Planning Committee to amend Licensing By-law No. 07-170 by adding a condition stating business licence holders may not permit noise from commercial entertainment or commercial recreation on Outdoor Commercial Patios

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In 2016, at the direction of Council, staff reported on how other major cities address outdoor entertainment on restaurant/bar patios, including live or recorded music and dance facilities, and on possible alternatives for permitting such outdoor entertainment. Subsequently, in 2017 through Report PED16155(a), staff recommended temporarily removing the restriction on outdoor entertainment for a series of pilot project areas located in different geographic urban areas and eighteen rural areas within the City for a twenty-four month period. Staff further recommended amending Noise Control By-law No.11-285 (Noise By-law) by introducing an exemption permit to regulate the noise emanating from live entertainment or recorded music on Outdoor Commercial Patios (OCPs) and establishing conditions for granting an exemption.

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 5 of 16

In April 2017, amendments were approved to the Noise By-law. In May of 2017, Council approved Temporary Use By-laws to allow commercial entertainment/recreation on OCPs for the following eight urban pilot project areas and specific locations in the rural area:

1. Downtown Hamilton;
2. Hess Village;
3. West Harbour area;
4. Downtown Dundas;
5. James Street North;
6. James Street South/Augusta Street;
7. Upper James Street (Stone Church to Rymal Road); and,
8. Some properties (predominantly golf courses) within the Rural Area.

These By-laws were appealed to the Ontario Land Tribunal by the Harbour West Neighbours (HWN). The appeals were withdrawn in June 2018 on the condition the West Harbour area be removed from the pilot project.

In May 2019, Council approved Temporary Use By-laws which extended the temporary use permissions for the now seven pilot project areas to May 1, 2022 (Temporary Uses 3, 4, and 5 of Zoning By-law No. 05-200).

Finally, in August 2020, Council approved a Temporary Use By-law to Zoning By-law No. 05-200 to permit commercial entertainment/recreation on OCPs within the following zones if located in the Downtown Secondary Plan area:

- Downtown Central Business District (D1) Zone;
- Downtown Prime Retail Streets (D2) Zone;
- Downtown Mixed Use (D3) Zone;
- Community Park (P2) Zone; and,
- City Wide (P3) Zone.

These temporary use permissions were subsequently extended twice before expiring on December 31, 2021 (Temporary Use 7 of Zoning By-law No. 05-200).

The pilot project, which through extensions has been in place for almost four years (from the date when the appeals were withdrawn), has provided staff the opportunity to

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 6 of 16

determine if nuisances caused by OCPs are better regulated and dealt with by Noise Control By-law No.11-285, or rather, through Zoning By-law regulations.

Staff were directed to report back to Council at the pilot project's conclusion, with a recommended action. The temporary use permissions for the original seven pilot project areas expires on May 1, 2022. Having evaluated the results of the pilot project, staff are recommending that the pilot project be implemented on a permanent basis in Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Zoning By-laws of the former Communities, this recommendation removes the prohibition of commercial entertainment and recreation on OCPs and employs the Noise By-law as the preferred method to regulate noise.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 16

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: N/A

Staffing: N/A

Legal: As required by the *Planning Act*, Council shall hold at least one Public Meeting to consider a Zoning By-law Amendment. Notice of these Amendments has been posted in the Hamilton Spectator, as required by the *Planning Act*.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The City's Zoning By-laws define an Outdoor Commercial Patio as:

“Shall mean any outdoor area used in conjunction with any establishment licensed under the *Liquor Licence Act*, where meals or refreshments are served to the public for consumption on the premises.”

The City's Zoning By-laws prohibit outdoor music on OCPs with the intent being to ensure entertainment is managed to protect neighbouring sensitive land uses from noise and other impacts.

1.0 PED16155 - July 2016

In 2015, Council directed staff to investigate and report to the Planning Committee on how other major cities address outdoor entertainment on restaurant / bar patios and on possible alternatives for permitting such outdoor entertainment.

As detailed in Report PED16155, staff surveyed and consulted with municipalities across Southern Ontario, as well as a number of municipalities farther afield. Consultation also extended to the public, stakeholders and other Divisions within the City. Comments were received via emails, surveys (including resident surveys), and public meetings. The City also consulted with an external acoustical engineer to provide technical expertise on noise limits and measures.

The key findings of the 2015 / early 2016 consultation was:

- The majority of the jurisdictions had zoning provision(s) to distance / separate commercial outdoor patios from residential zones (i.e. XX m from a residential area); and may have identified or indirectly regulated noise in its zoning provisions;
- Three of the fifteen municipalities surveyed had comparable zoning provisions that prohibited outdoor entertainment on commercial patios; and,
- The municipalities surveyed that allowed commercial entertainment on outdoor patios used the Noise By-law as the preferred method to enforce.

2.0 Zoning By-law Amendment Nos. 17-082 to 17-084 and Amendment to the Noise Control By-law (PED16155(a))

2.1 Zoning By-law Amendments

Based on the results of the consultation, in early 2017, through Report PED16155(a), staff recommended passing a Temporary Use By-law to permit entertainment on OCPs for certain areas of the City for a specific time period. The Noise By-law would be the mechanism to address noise complaints. Correspondingly, the Noise By-law was amended to introduce an OCP exemption permit (noise exemption permit – NEP) where live entertainment or recorded music could be permitted, subject to a series of conditions.

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 8 of 16

The temporary use permissions, combined with the amendments to the Noise By-law, would enable staff to test whether the Noise By-law was the appropriate tool to address potential noise impacts from entertainment on OCPs.

On May 10, 2017, City Council approved three Temporary Use By-laws to permit the temporary use permission for seven urban pilot project areas and specific locations in the rural area (predominately golf courses). The By-laws were established for a period of 24 months with an expiry date of May 10, 2019.

At the time these Temporary Use By-laws were approved, there were three Zoning By-laws which had to be amended:

- **By-law No. 17-082 (Zoning By-law No. 6593)** – Applied to James Street North, Augusta Street/James Street South, West Harbour and Upper James Street;
- **By-law No. 17-083 (Zoning By-law No. 05-200)** – Applied to parts of the downtown area, Hess Village and the rural area; and,
- **By-law 17-084 (Zoning By-law No. 3581-86)** – Applied to Downtown Dundas.

The amending By-laws were appealed to the Ontario Land Tribunal by the Harbour West Neighbours (HWN). On June 2, 2018, the HWN withdrew their appeals on the By-laws and the West Harbour area was removed from the pilot project.

2.2 Amendments to the Noise Control By-law

The Noise Control By-law was amended to implement the pilot project in conjunction with the introduction of the temporary use permissions. With the temporary permissions for commercial entertainment/recreation on OCPs, the Noise By-law is now relied upon to regulate noise from OCPs that is deemed unreasonable or likely to disturb. To facilitate a reasonable and balanced solution for patios in a mixed commercial/urban environment, amendments were made to the Noise By-law for a Noise Exemption Permit (NEP) in the event of a public concern or complaint.

OCPs outside the pilot project areas are not permitted to have outdoor entertainment/live music and are dealt with in accordance with current enforcement practices and liable to legal action for both the zoning and noise contravention.

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 9 of 16

City staffs' response to alleged noise violations in the designated pilot areas is complaint driven, to educate and gain voluntary compliance. Orders under the Noise By-law are available for immediate compliance to discontinue the use, and/or require the issuance of a NEP. Legal action is reserved in the event an offender is indifferent and fails to comply with City staff, disobeys an order, or knowingly re-offends.

For those business owners requiring a NEP to remedy an Order, the procedure and application requires a certified acoustic report (at the applicant's expense) with a floor plan to ensure the applicant falls within the allotted decibel readings. The Application requires public and Councillor notifications and must be posted at the site for 15 days.

The key aspects of the Outdoor Commercial Patio NEP impose the following conditions:

- The dates/times be limited from Thursday to Saturday, 11:00 a.m. – 11:00 p.m.;
- Any resulting noise be restricted to a maximum equivalent sound level (Leq) 60 dBA measured at the permit holder's property line (i.e. conversation in a restaurant, office, background music, air conditioning unit at 30 metres);
- The activity/use comply with all City By-laws and other applicable law;
- No sound equipment other than equipment approved under the permit shall be used; and,
- All sound equipment shall be placed and used in accordance with the approved Floor Plan and Certificate of Compliance from a qualified noise consultant.

The NEP Application process includes a public comment component. Guidelines are available to applicants requiring a NEP, and for the public to comment on any NEP application before the City.

When implemented, 43 identified stakeholders from the pilot project area were invited to a meeting with City staff for the business owners to gain an understanding of the:

- Business owner responsibilities and obligations under the Noise By-law;
- Purpose/application of the NEP; and,
- Role/procedure for City staff administering/enforcing this pilot project.

The results of the amendments to the Noise By-law and the introduction of the NEP process are detailed in the analysis and rationale for recommendation section of this Report.

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 10 of 16

3.0 Zoning By-law Amendment No. 17-255 (PED16100(c))

On November 22, 2017, City Council passed By-law No. 17-255 to include two pilot project areas (Upper James Street and Downtown Dundas) within City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200. These two areas were previously approved by Zoning By-law No. 17-082 (Schedule A-4) and Zoning By-law No. 17-084 (Dundas). This By-law had an expiry date of June 22, 2019.

4.0 Zoning By-law Amendment Nos. 19-103 - 19-106 (PED16155(b))

The purpose of these amendments was to:

- Extend the temporary use permissions for the pilot projects areas for a period of 36 months, to May 1, 2022 (Temporary Use 3 and 4); and,
- Establish new Temporary Use By-law No. 19-106 for the James Street North and James Street South / Augusta Street pilot project areas (Temporary Use 5). These lands were removed from Zoning By-law No. 6593 and included in Zoning By-law No. 05-200. At the time of the passage of the new Downtown and Commercial and Mixed Use Zones, the companion Temporary Use By-laws were not passed for these lands. The temporary use permissions were permitted until May 1, 2022.

There were no additional pilot project areas permitted as a result of these by-law extensions.

5.0 Zoning By-law Amendment No. 20-181 (amended by By-law Nos. 20-215 and 21-143) (PED20135)

In August 2020, through By-law No. 20-181, the same temporary use permissions - commercial entertainment/recreation on Outdoor Commercial Patios, was established for certain zones within the Downtown Secondary Plan area (Temporary Use 7). These temporary permissions expired on December 31, 2021.

6.0 Pilot Project Evaluation and Recommendations

Through Recommendation (b) of Report PED16155(a), Council approved the following:

- “(b) Subject to the approval of City Initiative 16-C, that the Noise Control By-law No.11-285 be amended to provide for the issuance, refusal and revocation of an outdoor commercial patio exemption permit where live entertainment or recorded music is provided, on the following basis;
- (iii) That Municipal Law Enforcement (MLE) staff be directed to undertake an enforcement pilot program for the duration of the Temporary-Use By-law approved in City Initiative 16-C, to administer and enforce the Outdoor Commercial Patio exemption permits under the Noise Control By-law and monitor related activity levels; and,
- (iv) That staff, at the conclusion of the pilot project, analyze the data and evaluate the results to determine if the actions and initiatives met the goals and objectives of the project for a final report to the Planning Committee.”

This Report responds to Council’s direction by reporting back to Planning Committee on the results of the pilot project and recommended action.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

1.0 Provincial Policy

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2020) and the Provincial Policy Statement 2020 is silent on outdoor commercial patios since this is a use that is accessory to permitted uses.

2.0 Urban Hamilton Official Plan (UHOP)

Outdoor Commercial Patios are not identified as a use in the UHOP. Under Volume 1 of the UHOP, the policy for development and redevelopment of local commercial uses (E.3.8.9 Design), in part, provides that local commercial uses be compatible with the surrounding area in terms of noise impact.

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 12 of 16

OCPs are permitted as an accessory use to a restaurant in the Neighbourhoods (Local Commercial Uses), Commercial and Mixed Use and some Rural and Settlement Commercial Designations. The Pilot Project areas were selected based on the compatibility with the surrounding area.

Staff's recommendation to remove the prohibition of commercial entertainment and recreation on OCPs in the City's Zoning By-laws does not conflict with the policies of the Urban Hamilton Official Plan.

3.0 Rural Hamilton Official Plan (RHOP)

Similarly, outdoor commercial patios are not identified uses in the RHOP. However, they are located in conjunction with existing restaurants. For those areas that have been identified as pilot project sites, restaurants are permitted uses (i.e. stand-alone in a rural settlement area, golf courses, or private clubs).

Staff's recommendation to remove the prohibition of commercial entertainment and recreation on OCPs in the City's Zoning By-laws does not conflict with the policies of the Rural Hamilton Official Plan.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

- Planning and Economic Development Department, Licensing and By-law Enforcement Division and Building Division.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

There are different municipal tools that can be used to control noise and regulate land uses. The City's Noise Control By-law regulates noise and authorizes exemptions from the By-law for certain types of noise under certain conditions and may require a permit to permit exemptions from the By-law. The City's Zoning By-laws regulate land use through permissions and prohibitions of land use and associated regulations.

Prior to this pilot project, to permit commercial entertainment on OCPs, a Zoning By-law Amendment or Minor Variance application was required. This requirement applied to patios associated with businesses. Patios associated with businesses without liquor licences (and thus not defined as an Outdoor Commercial Patio), do not have

restrictions on entertainment in the Zoning By-laws; any noise impact is dealt with through the Noise By-law.

Through staff's analysis of municipal approaches and extensive consultation, the pilot project was recommended and implemented. The City's Zoning By-laws were amended to establish temporary permissions for noise on OCPs, and the Noise By-law was amended to regulate this noise through an exemption permit process. With the temporary use permissions expiring on May 1, 2022, staff have assessed the results of the pilot project that has been in place since June 2018.

1.0 Pilot Project Analysis

The primary means of analysis has been through data collection of:

- Application for and issuance of Noise Control By-law exemption permits; and,
- Tracking municipal by-law complaints specific to noise on OCPs.

OCPs outside the pilot project areas are not permitted outdoor entertainment/live music and are dealt with in accordance with current enforcement practices. Numerous public complaints at five locations outside the pilot area were investigated and eventually remedied using the City regulatory By-laws following the progressive enforcement process.

Inside the pilot project areas, staff review of data shows no noise complaints/investigations from OCPs. Therefore, no NEPs were required. Several business owners inquired about the NEP process but elected to introduce soft background music/videos or acoustic entertainment to avoid any public complaint. Primarily, most OCPs in the pilot project areas declined to introduce any form of outdoor entertainment.

2.0 Recommendations

2.1 Noise Control By-law, Licencing By-law, and Administrative Penalty By-law

The overall impacts and the effectiveness of the regulatory regime in the pilot project areas has demonstrated a reasonable and balanced solution to live entertainment on OCPs. The amendment and introduction of the NEP to the Noise By-law provided an

immediate level of enforcement but the success can be attributed to the responsible and measured approach by the business industry.

The Alcohol and Gaming Commission of Ontario (AGCO), in granting / approving licenses, has placed controls to restrict or prohibit noise from OCPs where significant sounds are audible to the nearby community. Ontario Regulation 746/21 of the *Liquor Licence and Control Act, 2019* regulates noise where license holders may not permit noise from entertainment or from the sale and service of liquor to disturb nearby residents.

Municipal Law Enforcement staff are of the opinion that a similar condition under the City's Licensing By-law No. 07-170 can provide an additional layer of enforcement to ensure nearby residents are not to be disturbed by the activities from an OCP along with fines under the Administrative Penalty By-law (By-law No. 17-225) (APS).

The use of the APS has produced positive impacts to administer and enforce minor contraventions. Issuing APS tickets does not include the lengthy formal process for zoning contraventions found in the Provincial Offences Court. It has proven to be an important step in the Progressive Enforcement Policy enforcing the City's regulatory By-laws as a fair, effective and efficient enforcement tool to compel voluntary compliance.

In summary, it is recommended the Noise Control By-law and its Noise Exemption Permit process be the preferred method to regulate noise, alongside an amended Licensing By-law and in consort with fines under the Administrative Penalty By-law.

2.2 Proposed Amendments to the Zoning By-laws

With the recommendation to rely on the Noise By-law to regulate noise from OCPs, and further reliance on the Licensing By-law and fines under the Administrative Penalty By-law, the prohibition of commercial entertainment and recreation on OCPs can be repealed city-wide.

2.2.1 Rural Area

At the onset of the pilot project, certain properties within the rural area of Hamilton were included for evaluation through the pilot project. Outdoor Commercial Patios are permitted as an accessory use to a restaurant in the Settlement Commercial (S2) Zone. The Open Space (P4) Zone permits Golf Courses, which may include a restaurant as

an accessory use. In the Rural Area, the majority of licenced establishments are located within golf courses; other licenced establishments include private clubs and restaurants. The locations selected as pilot project sites all had restaurants as a permitted use (i.e. stand-alone in a rural settlement area, golf courses or private clubs).

The rural area presents a different context given that agriculture is the primary and predominant land use. There are fewer commercial establishments that may permit an OCP and fewer areas with residential uses. Having also evaluated the rural sites over the course of this pilot project, staff are of the opinion that rural areas can be addressed in the same manner as the remainder of the City.

2.2.2 West Harbour Area

The three Temporary Use By-laws established in May 2017 were initially appealed in full by the Harbour West Neighbours (HWN). The appeal was subsequently withdrawn when it was agreed that the West Harbour Area would be removed from the pilot project. As the pilot project analysis indicates, the overall impacts and the effectiveness of the regulatory regime in the pilot project areas has demonstrated a reasonable and balanced solution to live entertainment on OCPs that can be applied city-wide. On this basis, it is recommended that commercial entertainment on OCPs should be subject to the same regulatory framework city-wide, which shall include establishments within the West Harbour Area.

2.2.3 City-Wide Recommendation

The Zoning By-law regulation currently in place in all of the City's Zoning By-laws is proposed to be removed. The following regulation will be repealed from City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Zoning By-laws of the former Communities:

“Prohibition of Commercial Entertainment and Recreation:

That portion of a lot on which the outdoor patio is permitted shall not be used for commercial entertainment or commercial recreation including live or recorded music or dance facilities.”

SUBJECT: Entertainment on Outdoor Commercial Patios – Amendments to City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 and the Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57, Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86, Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z, Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464, former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593, and City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 (CI 22-D) (PED16155(c)) (City Wide) - Page 16 of 16

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

If the City's Zoning By-law are not amended, commercial entertainment and recreation on OCPs will continue to be prohibited across the City. The Noise Control By-law will have to be amended to remove the Noise Exemption Permit process.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Economic Prosperity and Growth

Hamilton has a prosperous and diverse local economy where people have opportunities to grow and develop.

Culture and Diversity

Hamilton is a thriving, vibrant place for arts, culture, and heritage where diversity and inclusivity are embraced and celebrated.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" - Draft City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 05-200 Amendment
Appendix "B" - Draft Town of Ancaster Zoning By-law No. 87-57 Amendment
Appendix "C" - Draft Town of Dundas Zoning By-law No. 3581-86 Amendment
Appendix "D" - Draft Town of Flamborough Zoning By-law No. 90-145-Z Amendment
Appendix "E" - Draft Town of Glanbrook Zoning By-law No. 464 Amendment
Appendix "F" - Draft former City of Hamilton Zoning By-law No. 6593 Amendment
Appendix "G" - Draft City of Stoney Creek Zoning By-law No. 3692-92 Amendment

AF:sd