

City of Hamilton

Accessible Transportation Services Performance Review

2019-2021 and Q1 2022

Michelle Martin

Manager, Accessible Transportation Services

Transit Division

Public Works Department

7-12-2022

This information report provides a summary of key statistical data and performance indicators for the years 2019, 2020, 2021 and Q1 of 2022 (January to March). The City is obligated to provide statistical reports to the Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities (ACPD) to meet the terms of the City's 2004 settlement with the Ontario Human Rights Commission (OHRC) and complainants under the Code.

The report reflects the performance of specialized transportation services offered by HSR Accessible Transportation Services (ATS) through its contractor for services, Disabled and Aged Regional Transportation System (DARTS) and their subcontractors, and through the ATS Taxi Scrip program. The data was obtained from DARTS performance report records and ATS Taxi Scrip program data.

TRIPS REQUESTED AND PROVIDED

Table 1a: System Requested and Delivered Passenger Trips 2019

DEMAND	2019	2020	2021	Q1 2022
DARTS: Number of Total Trips Requested	1,092,651	439,530	354,264	112,155
DARTS: Number of Total Trips Delivered	844,007	327,102	281,326	82,356
TAXI SCRIP: Number of Total Trips Delivered	96,076	43,991	35,679	8,189
ATS: Number of Total Trips Requested, All Modes	1,188,727	483,521	389,943	120,344
ATS: Number of Total Trips Delivered, All Modes	940,083	371,093	317,005	90,545
ATS % Of Total Trips Delivered vs Requested, All Modes	79%	77%	81%	75%

Table 2: System Demand by Mode: DARTS vs. Taxi Scrip

DEMAND BY MODE	2019%	2020%	2021%	Q1 2022 %
DARTS	91.9%	90.9%	90.9%	93.2%
TAXI SCRIP	8.1%	9.1%	9.1%	6.8%
ATS: All Modes	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Demand for specialized trips on DARTS continues to be the main driver of trips requested and delivered. As of Q1 2022, Taxi Scrip accounts for approximately 7% of system trips requested, and over 90% of trips requested are for DARTS, from 2019 to the first quarter of 2022 (Table 2, above). The total number of requested trips includes client cancellations and no shows.

In 2019, ATS delivered a total of 940,083 trips through both DARTS and the Taxi Scrip program; 10% of these trips were delivered through Taxi Scrip. The numbers in Table 1 show that though overall trip counts have decreased due to the COVID-19 pandemic, trips delivered through Taxi Scrip have not risen above 12% of system trips delivered (2020).

In 2019, DARTS delivered 844,007 trips: 56,781 trips more than the budgeted 2019 total of 787,226 trips. The Office of the City Auditor's 2020 report on ATS eligibility processes (AUD20009) and the 2021 report from Dillon Consulting (PW21055) provided direction for ATS to begin exploring ways to mitigate budget pressures while ensuring equitable and inclusive access to service. The years 2020 and 2021 saw a sharp decline in specialized trips delivered on DARTS: over these two years, trips were delivered at an average of about 36% of the 2019 total, and an average of about 58% under budget numbers.

For Q1 of 2022, DARTS trips counts are at 42% of 2019 Q1 numbers (pre-COVID), and at 79% of Q1 budgeted service.

RATE OF DENIED SYSTEM TRIPS

Table 3: Rate of Denied Trips: ATS All Modes

Rate of Denied Trips: ATS All Modes	2019	2020	2021	Q1 2022
ATS Total Number of Trips Requested	1,188,727	483,521	389,943	120,344
ATS Total Number of Trips Denied	12,817	4,370	4,442	799
% of Trips Denied	1.1%	0.9%	1.1%	0.7%

System trip denial rates remain below the 5% goal established by the City's 2004 settlement with the OHRC, which states, in part, "For the purpose of calculating the trip denial rate, the City will include Taxi Scrip trips." The industry best practice is 0% (Canadian Urban Transit Association (CUTA) Specialized Transit Services Industry Practices Review, 2016). Table 3 (above) shows that the system denial rate is has not been above 1.1% since 2019, and in Q1 of 2022 it was 0.7%.

SPECIALIZED TRANSPORTATION TRIP DISPOSITION

Table 4: Contractor (DARTS) Trip Dispositions

Contractor Trip Dispositions	2019	2020	2021	Q1 2022
Total Trips Requested	1,092,651	439,530	354,264	112,155
Total Trips Provided	844,007	327,102	281,326	82,356
Total Trips Denied	12,817	4,370	4,442	799
% of Total Trips Denied	1.2%	1.0%	1.3%	0.7%

Contractor Denied Trip

A denied trip by the contractor occurs when the client's request, within the allowable booking windows, cannot be agreed to within one hour of the requested date and time of travel or acceptable alternative, according to the criteria listed in Appendix 1, below. Denial rates for service provided by our contractor, DARTS, has not risen above 2% since 2019, and currently sits at 0.7% for Q1 of 2022 (Table 4, above)

Table 5: Client Trip Disposition

Client Trip Disposition	2019	2020	2021	Q1 2022
Total Trips Cancelled On-Time	109,486	39,581	20,469	11,431
% of Total Trips Cancelled on Time	10.0%	9.0%	5.8%	10.2%
Total Trips Cancelled Late	88,752	53,011	35,112	13,217
% of Total Trips Cancelled Late	8.1%	12.1%	9.9%	11.8%
Total No Show/Cancelled at Door	37,420	15,105	12,505	4,250
% of Total No Show/Cancelled at Door	3.4%	3.4%	3.5%	3.8%
Total Trips Refused	169	361	410	102
% of Total Trips Refused	0.0%	0.1%	0.1%	0.1%

Client Trip Cancelled On Time

A trip cancelled on time trip has been cancelled by the client by 4:30 PM of the day prior to service. The industry best practice is a cancellation rate of between 5-10% (CUTA Specialized Transit Services Industry Practices Review, 2016). Trips that are cancelled on time provide the opportunity to accommodate any outstanding trip requests or wait list trips in a timely manner.

Table 5 (above) shows a downward trend in on-time cancellations from 2019 to 2021, with a jump back up to 10.2% in Q1 of 2022.

Client Trip Cancelled Late

A late cancellation is one that is made after 4:30 p.m. of the day prior to service, and prior to vehicle arrival within the pickup window and/or within thirty minutes after the negotiated pick up time. Late cancellations rarely provide opportunity to accommodate any outstanding trip requests or wait list trips in a timely manner. Table 5 shows the late cancellation rate has ranged between 8.1% and 11.8%, which is currently outside of the industry best practice range.

Client No-Show/ Cancelled at Door

A No Show trip occurs when a client books a trip, does not cancel ahead of time, and is not available at the time that the vehicle arrives within the pickup window and/or within thirty minutes after the negotiated pickup time. This includes any occurrence of trips cancelled at door, where the client refuses a trip at the door that is within the pickup window and/ or within thirty minutes after the negotiated pickup time. No shows leave no opportunity to accommodate any outstanding trip request or wait list trips. The no-show rate ranges from 3.4% to 3.5% from 2019-2021 and is at 3.8% in Q1 of 2022.

The industry best practice for no-shows is less than 1%, as no shows result in both lost revenue and lost service efficiency (CUTA Specialized Transit Services Industry Practices Review, 2016). Table 5 illustrates that the rate of client no shows/ cancels at the door exceeds the industry best practice of less than 1%, instead ranging between 3.4%-3.8%.

Client Refused Trip

A refused trip occurs when a client does not accept the travel times provided at the time of booking. The refused trip rate is extremely low, at only 0.1% Q1 2022.

DARTS ON-TIME PERFORMANCE

Table 6: Contractor (DARTS) On-Time Performance

Service Metrics	2019	2020	2021	Q1 2022
Total Trips Provided	844,007	327,102	281,326	82,356
Total Number of Late Trips	9,675	2,530	2,514	293
% of Trips Completed On Time	98.9%	99.3%	99.1%	99.7%

The City's 2004 settlement with the OHRC defines late trips as those where the contractor or subcontractor Operator does not arrive until 30 minutes or more after the scheduled arrival time and established an on-time performance goal of 95% or greater. The industry standard for on time performance is 95%-99% for large systems (agencies that serve a population higher than 150,000) (CUTA Specialized Transit Services Industry Practices Review, 2016).

On-time performance consistently performs better than the target established in the OHRC settlement agreement and within the industry benchmark. As shown in Table 6 (above), DARTS on-time performance averaged at approximately 99.1% from 2019 to 2021 and sits at 99.7% for Q1 of 2022.

COMPLAINTS

Table 7: Complaints per Thousand Trips

Year	Complaints per Thousand ATS Trips, All Modes	Complaints per Thousand DARTS Trips
2019	1.6	1.8
2020	1.8	2.0
2021	2.6	2.9
2022 Q1	2.8	3.0

Complaints are those customer contacts in which a customer submits an objection to the planning or provision of service. Complaints per thousand are shown in Table 7, above. The first column uses the total number of ATS trips provided (where complaints about Taxi Scrip have been included). The second column uses the total number of DARTS trips provided (not including complaints about Taxi Scrip: since 2019 up to Q1 of 2022, there have only been a total of 6 Taxi Scrip complaints).

The industry best practice is 1.0 complaints per 1,000 trips. The 2016 CUTA average for large system is 2.1 complaints per 1,000 trips. The complaint level has consistently been greater than the industry best practice (1:1,000) and has exceeded the CUTA average both in 2021 and Q1 2022 (2.1:1,000)

Table 8: Complaint Type

Complaint Type	2019	2020	2021	Q1 2022
Service Performance	931	369	490	182
Staff Performance	569	269	290	65
Service Sufficiency	20	31	35	6
TOTAL	1520	669	815	253

Table 8 breaks down the number of complaints based on three general categories:

- Service performance – categories of complaint where the service as performed did not meet expectations, including but not limited to complaints about pickup/ drop off outside of window; call return wait time; address, date or time errors; missed trip; or scheduled on board time. Most complaints are in this category.
- Staff performance – categories of complaint where staff conduct did not meet expectations, including but not limited to complaints about staff conduct or driving habits. This is the second most frequent category of complaint.
- Service sufficiency – categories of complaint where the service was insufficient to meet reported customer needs, including but not limited to complaints about subscription trips or waiting lists. This is the least frequent category of complaint.

COMMENDATIONS

Table 9: Commendations per Thousand Trips

Year	Commendations per Thousand ATS Trips, All Modes	Commendations per Thousand DARTS Trips
2019	0.3	0.4
2020	0.7	0.8
2021	0.9	1.0
Q1 2022	1.0	1.1

Table 9 (above) shows the number of commendations per thousand trips, for all ATS trips (contractors and subcontractors) and for DARTS commendations both per thousand system and per thousand DARTS trips. It should be noted ATS does not typically receive commendations about Taxi Scrip service, and none were received in either 2019-21 or Q1 2022.

The industry best practice is 1 commendation per 1,000 trips. The 2016 CUTA average for large system is 0.36 commendations per 1,000 trips. Commendations are on an upward trend, reaching close to the industry best practice of 1 commendation per thousand trips in 2021 and meeting or exceeding it in Q1 of 2022.

APPENDIX 1 - Definition of terms

Number of Total ATS Trips Requested, All Modes: the sum of DARTS Requested Trips [plus] Taxi Scrip Trips Delivered.

Taxi Scrip Trips Delivered: the total of all passengers reported by contracted brokers under the Taxi Scrip program.

Number of Total DARTS Trips Requested: the sum of Trips Delivered by DARTS, DARTS subcontractors, and meter taxi [plus] No Show Trips [plus] Cancelled Trips [plus] Trips Denied [plus] Trips Refused.

Trips Denied: a denied trip occurs when

- a casual trip request has been made as much as 7 days in advance up to 4:30 PM on the day prior to the required day of service, and a negotiated time cannot immediately be agreed to

within one hour of the requested time or at a time otherwise suitable to the passenger, or cannot subsequently be agreed to through the use of the waiting list

- when a passenger requests a subscription trip which cannot immediately be fulfilled, this form of request is not recorded as a denial of service, however, each instance of a like casual trip request that cannot be accommodated as noted above is recorded as a trip denial
- when the passenger agrees to assignment to the waiting list, a trip denial will still occur if no trip can be found, or if an offered trip is not deemed by the passenger as either suitable or required
- when a passenger requests a trip after 4:30 PM of the day prior to the required day of service, or on the required day of service, and the trip request cannot be accommodated, such request will not be recorded as a denial of service.

Cancelled Trips: a cancelled trip is one that is cancelled by the passenger, or on the passenger's behalf, once a subscription or casual booking has been made

- an advance cancellation is one that is made by 4:30 p.m. of the day prior to service
- a late cancellation is one that is made after 4:30 p.m. of the day prior to service, and prior to vehicle arrival within the pickup window and/or within thirty minutes after the negotiated pick up time
- a program closure cancellation is one that is made for all passengers to a program with advance notification, including program shutdown periods and temporary program venue changes
- a service suspension cancellation is one that is made as a result of a weather or other emergency within the control of ATS and/ or DARTS.

No Show Trips: a no show occurs when a passenger books a trip, does not cancel ahead of time, and is not available at the time that the vehicle arrives within the pickup window and/or within thirty minutes after the negotiated pickup time. This includes any occurrence of trips cancelled at door, where the passenger refuses a trip at the door that is within the pickup window and/or within thirty minutes after the negotiated pickup time.

Number of Total DARTS Trips Delivered: the sum of all trips taken by passengers and their escorts and/or companions delivered by DARTS on DARTS, DARTS subcontractors, or metered taxi.

Late Trips: the sum of all trips that are more than 30 minutes late from that time negotiated with the passenger for the trip, as reported by drivers and as recorded by DARTS from driver manifests.

Complaints: those customer contacts under which a customer submits an objection to the planning or provision of service

Commendations: those customer contacts under which a customer submits praise for the planning or provision of service.

Rate of Denied Trips: Denied Trips expressed as a percentage of Number of Total ATS Trips Requested, All Modes.

Rate of Cancelled Trips: Cancelled Trips (by type) expressed as a percentage of Number of Total DARTS Trips Requested.

Rate of No Show Trips: No Show Trips expressed as a percentage of Number of Total DARTS Trips Requested.

Rate of On-Time Performance: (DARTS Trips Delivered [minus] Late Trips) expressed as a percentage of (Number of Total DARTS Trips Delivered).

Refused Trips: A refused trip occurs when a client does not accept the travel times provided at the time of booking – see Trips Denied, above.

Complaints per 1,000 Trips: complaints per thousand trips (sum of Taxi Scrip Trips Delivered [plus] DARTS Trips Delivered).

Commendations per 1,000 Trips: commendations per thousand trips (sum of Taxi Scrip Trips Delivered [plus] DARTS Trips Delivered).