INFORMATION REPORT

TO:	Mayor and Members General Issues Committee
DATE:	March 22, 2023
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Attracting Diversity During the Recruitment Process (HUR18017(a)/FCS23046) (City Wide)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Jodi Koch 905-546-2424 Ex. 3003 Andrea Holland 905-546-2424 Ext. 5409
SUBMITTED BY:	Lora Fontana Executive Director Human Resources *signature* Andrea Holland City Clerk Corporate Services *signature*

COUNCIL DIRECTION

At the September 19, 2018 General Issues (GIC) Committee meeting, a report on Attracting Diversity During the Recruitment Process (HUR18017) resulted in Council directing staff on the following:

(a)   As part of the Equity, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) framework, staff include recommendations for integrating an EDI framework to the City of Hamilton Policy respecting the Appointment of Citizens to the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees, including:

   (i) Training and orientation of Selection Committee members and supporting staff to implement the revised recruitment, application, selection and interview processes; and,

(b)   That the final Equity, Diversity and Inclusion policy and procedures for Selection Committee be implemented starting with the 2022-2026 term of Council

INFORMATION

To fulfil the direction of Council, the Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (EDI) Framework (Appendix "A" to Report HUR18017(a)/FCS23046) was applied to the existing Policy Respecting the Appointment of Citizens to the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees. The resulting recommendations have been provided to the City Clerk's Office for their consideration and implementation to enhance candidate diversity for the 2022-2026 term of Council recruitment process.

The EDI Framework is an ongoing and iterative process that is designed to embed EDI into all that we do. The following summarizes the EDI Framework as it pertains to the recruitment and selection of Agency, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees.

Business Case

City of Hamilton leadership and City Council understand the importance of embedding EDI into all that we do, including the critical role it plays in the Recruitment and Selection Process for Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Advisory (Volunteer) Committees. Enhancing EDI in this process will not only improve diversity and increase the varied perspectives of those on Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees (ABCs), but it will result in increased effectiveness of the ABCs and provide more meaningful recommendations to Council.

Communications Plan

A clear communication strategy and messaging is required to ensure consistent understanding of the intent to increase the diversity of the Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees. Specific strategies to increase outreach to diverse communities have been provided to the City Clerk's Office, including a listing of suggested community organizations to assist in community outreach.

Data Collection

The importance of continuing voluntary demographic data collection to assist with measuring the effectiveness of recruitment efforts and analysing the data trends is embedded for the 2022-2026 recruitment process. This data will also allow for identification of potential systemic barriers throughout the process.

Information collected will be used to evaluate if the advertising strategies utilized are attracting applicants that are reflective of the community we serve. The voluntary data collection will occur at the application stage. This data would be used to measure the inclusiveness of the process only and will only be shared in an aggregate form, ensuring compliance with Human Resources best practices and Federal Employment Equity Legislation.

Demonstrated Ownership

Demonstrated ownership is a key EDI Framework principle to drive leadership accountability and to exemplify the leadership required for the organization to become more inclusive and foster an overall sense of belonging. Visible comment from the Mayor and Council Members will emphasize the importance of the role Agencies, Boards, and Committees play in local government.

Applied Action Plans

Organizations also require accountability. The proposed recommendations allow for clear actions to increase diversity in the applicant pool and allow for the measurement to progress this for future Council terms.

Metrics and Measurement

The recommendation to measure actual representation on Committees and Boards will allow for the evaluation of the tactics adopted. These measurements will either confirm we are achieving the intended effect or identify opportunities so that we may adjust to the recommendations to achieve the desired state.

The 2014 - 2018 Advisory (Volunteer) Committee members expressed concern that the applicant pool for that term was not representative of the diverse communities of the City of Hamilton. Based on data collection and implemented recommendations from HUR18017 for the 2018-2022 term, there was a significant improvement in the diversity of applications received. For the first time, voluntary demographic data was collected, establishing a baseline of measurement on which to proceed for future Council terms.

Notably, there was a significant increase in applications overall, with 598 applications received during the 2018-2022 term, compared to 161 applications received for the 2014-2018 term. This improvement suggests the implementation of the Communications Plan and recommendations outlined in the September 19, 2018 report were successful in achieving the intended outcomes.

Based on the data collected, the demographics of the applicants received for the 2018 - 2022 term were reviewed and summarized. As illustrated below, applications received were in alignment for Indigenous Peoples and those that identify as Visible Minorities as

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.
OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy,
safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.
OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service,
Engaged Empowered Employees.

compared against the Hamilton population. There was still room to improve the applicant pool of Women and Persons with Disabilities. It should be noted that the applications for the Indigenous Advisory Committee were addressed through a separate process and are not included in the information below.

Designated Group	Applicant Representation	Statistics Canada - Hamilton Population (2016)
Women	36.9%	51.1%
Visible Minorities	16.2%	19%
Persons with Disabilities	15.2%	29.1%
Indigenous/Aboriginal Peoples	2.0%	2.3%

In preparation for the 2022-2026 term, the following are the recommendations which have been adopted by the City Clerk's Office to increase the diversity of applicants during the recruitment process as well as the retention of those citizens selected:

Improve Data Collection

While establishing baseline applicant data is integral to measuring progress, the data collection around the placement of those on the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees was not measured for the 2018 – 2022 Council term (i.e./ actual demographics on Committees is not available). In alignment with the EDI Framework, it is recommended for the 2022-2026 recruitment term to implement a method of data collection for successful candidates to understand the actual demographics on the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees.

Recruitment Process Enhancements

The full cycle recruitment, selection and training process of the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees was reviewed utilizing the EDI Framework. Various enhancements are recommended to improve the attraction and retention of diverse candidates, with added focus on improving the applicant pool for Women and Persons with Disabilities:

Recruitment Tools: The interview and selection processes were reviewed from an EDI best practice perspective. To ensure consistency in the process and evaluation and to mitigate unconscious bias, a screening tool, interview guide, and evaluation template have been created and are recommended for implementation during the 2022-2026 selection process. Candidates will be encouraged to share, as they deem appropriate, their lived experiences in their respective cover letters and during the interview process.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.
OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.
OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Recruitment Materials: Inclusive language enhancements and accessibility considerations were made to the recruitment application and marketing materials to be used.

Training: Online EDI training components will be available to the Selection Committees. The online training will consist of two offerings. The first program is the Harvard ManageMentor Diversity, Inclusion and Belonging training. This is the same foundational training provided to all City of Hamilton supervisors and above in 2022. Course content includes five modules and fourteen videos along with accompanying discussion guides and articles which are downloadable for continued self-directed learning. The modules are:

1. What Diversity Is and Why It Matters
2. Understand and Counter Bias
3. Lead Inclusively
4. Become a Diversity Advocate
5. Advance your Organization's Diversity Efforts

The second online training is the Kojo Institute Foundations of Equity training. This training has a focus on how leaders can achieve equitable outcomes by utilizing related frameworks and consists of the following modules:

1. Frameworks
2. Data – The Three D's
3. Powerful Unexamined Ideas
4. The Legacies
5. The Role of Institutions
6. Self, Institution, Community

An additional training option for Council's consideration is the Association of Municipalities Ontario hosted session on Human Rights and Equity for Municipal Leaders. This training consists of a legal overview of relevant Human Rights legislation and a module on how to achieve equitable outcomes for constituents. This training is offered next on May 16, 2023.

Additionally, guidance on how to use on the recruitment interview guide and evaluation tools will be provided by the HR Talent and Diversity team to Selection Committee members.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.
OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.
OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Expansion of Self Identify Selection: In addition to the standard four designated groups identified in Federal Employment Equity legislation, a voluntary gender identity question will also be included.

Based on the data, it is recommended to focus on improving the applicant pool for Women and Persons with Disabilities by leveraging the community organizations outlined in Appendix "B" to Report HUR18017(a)/FCS23046 – Community Listings Contact Sheet and targeted recruitment advertising, which include:

- Women: Somali Women of Hamilton, Afro-Canadian Action Congress, Women for Women of India, Women Abuse Working Group, Native Women's Circle, and Muslim Association of Hamilton Women's Group.

- Persons with Disabilities: CNIB Foundation (Canadian National Institute for the Blind – Hamilton), Development Services Ontario - Hamilton-Niagara Region, Goodwill Amity Employment Services, Canadian Hearing Services, March of Dimes Canada (Hamilton), Goodwill Amity Employment Services, and Path Employment Services.

Encourage Participation

As defined in the EDI Framework, demonstrated ownership of EDI is key to driving the cultural change needed to progress EDI initiatives. The recommendation for the 2022-2026 recruitment process is to have a senior leader, such as the Mayor, create a video message articulating the importance of the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees, as well as to amplify messaging of diversity and inclusion to attract a diverse applicant pool. This will be shared on the City's social media channels and will be supplemented by accessibility options, which will include ASL interpretation and translations based on the language demographics of Hamilton.

Increase Online Presence

The City has leveraged Escribe's application to implement an online recruitment module for agencies, boards and committees. This module will be implemented once the online application is launched. Paired with the direct communication with the agencies contained in Appendix "B" to Report HUR181017(a)/FCS23046, a social media plan will be executed to correspond with other advertising. Building on last term's print campaigns and online marketing efforts, it is recommended to enhance our online presence during recruitment efforts, as well as to make improvements to the City of Hamilton's website to reach diverse candidate pools through the following:

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.
OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.
OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

1. Posting the recruitment for various positions while leveraging the City of Hamilton's social media channels, including the video message from senior leadership directing applicants on how to apply

2. Dedicated drop-down option/selection for these volunteer opportunities on the City of Hamilton homepage

3. Dedicated tile on the City of Hamilton website homepage, during the recruitment period for "Apply! Agency, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees Opportunities"

Increased Community Engagement

It is recommended to continue to directly target diversity within Hamilton by directly sending the job poster and recruitment promotional material to various community groups. Appendix "B" to Report HUR18017(a)/FCS23046 – Community Listings Contact Sheet, outlines diverse community organizations that can be leveraged to maximize recruitment efforts.

It is also suggested to continue with previous efforts by providing the public open house and to continue with the print advertisement strategy as identified in Appendix "C" to Report HUR18017(a)FCS23046 - Communication Plan Resource Guide 2023.

Exit Interviews

To further address retention of citizens on Volunteer Committees and Boards and to better understand the reasons behind resignation and attrition of committee members, it is recommended to conduct exit interviews upon receipt of resignation. This will provide qualitative information to address and rectify any challenges occurring within these committees throughout the Council term.

To further address retention of citizens on Volunteer Committees and Boards, and to meet the need identified by current members, the Procedural Handbook for Citizen Appointees to City of Hamilton Local Boards was recently circulated to Local Boards, including Advisory Committees for feedback and will be updated to meet the need to clarify the "Responsibilities and Expectations of New Members". This document provides potential applicants with the necessary details regarding the full scope of the individual commitment required to be an Advisory (Volunteer) Committee member. The expectation is to have well-informed applicants to the Advisory (Volunteer) Committees which will improve retention. This document will be finalized in advance of the 2022-2026 recruitment term.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.
OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.
OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Policy Review

The Policy for Appointment of Citizens to the City's Local Boards (Appendix "D" to Report HUR18017(a)/FCS23046) was reviewed by the Human Resources Policy and Planning Specialist, as well as by the EDI Senior Project Manager and Talent Services Supervisor. This policy review has resulted in the following suggested revisions which are highlighted in yellow in the attached document:

i)   Adding a Purpose statement to the introduction of the policy
ii)   Adding a Policy ID identifier to the document to enhance version control
iii)   Adding accommodation language to the recruitment section
iv)   Adding lived experience to the interview section

The Human Resources Talent and Diversity team remains available to assist the Clerk's Office with respect to any support they require with this implementation. These suggested enhancements to the Recruitment and Selection Process will support the intended outcome of improving diversity for the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees. These committees provide an essential voice for members of our community that may not otherwise have an opportunity to engage in local government in a meaningful and impactful manner. These diverse teams will bring significant value to 2022 – 2026 term of Council and will enhance decision making and outcomes for our citizens.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report HUR18017(a)/FCS23046 – EDI Framework

Appendix "B" to Report HUR18017(a)/FCS23046 - Community Listings Contact Sheet

Appendix "C" to Report HUR18017(a)/FCS23046 - Communication Plan Resource Guide

Appendix "D" to Report HUR18017(a)/FCS23046 – Appointment of Citizens to the City's Local Boards Draft Policy November 2022

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.
OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy,
safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.
OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service,
Engaged Empowered Employees.