



BOARD OF HEALTH MINUTES 23-003

9:30 a.m.

Monday, March 20, 2023

Council Chambers, City Hall, 2nd Floor
71 Main Street West, Hamilton, Ontario

Present: Mayor A. Horwath (Chair)
Councillor M. Wilson (Vice-Chair)
Councillors J. Beattie, C. Cassar, B. Clark, J.P. Danko, M. Francis,
T. Hwang, T. Jackson, C. Kroetsch, N. Nann, T. McMeekin, E.
Pauls, M. Spadafora, M. Tadeson, A. Wilson

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. (a) **Clean Air Hamilton Annual Progress Report 2021 (BOH230010) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)**

(Pauls/Cassar)

That Report BOH23010, respecting Clean Air Hamilton Annual Progress Report 2021, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Absent	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

(b) (Nann/Danko)

WHEREAS, ArcelorMittal Dofasco has site-specific air standards granted by the Province of Ontario that allows for the toxic and carcinogenic pollution above provincial air quality standards of benzene, benzo(a)pyrene, suspended particulate matter, manganese & manganese compounds that expires June 30, 2023.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (i) That staff be directed to review the status of the site-specific air standards granted to ArcelorMittal Dofasco and other industry sectors, and report back to the Board of Health; and,

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Absent	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Absent	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Absent	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Absent	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

- (ii) That the Mayor contact the Minister of Environment, Conservation and Parks to articulate that the City of Hamilton is opposed to any extension or continued special permissions for contaminants above provincially regulated general air standards.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 3, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
No	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Absent	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
No	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
No	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis

Yes	-	Ward 4	Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6	Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2	Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Absent	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3	Councillor Nrinder Nann
Absent	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Absent	-	Ward 1	Councillor Maureen Wilson

2. Modelling Morbidity and Mortality using the Hamilton Airshed Modelling System (BOH18016(a)) (City Wide) (Item 9.2)

(Nann/Kroetsch)

That staff be directed to report back to the Board of Health on the feasibility of integrating the Health Check Revision adverse health outcomes attributed to air pollution including but not limited to neurological and psychiatric disorders, like dementia, cognitive decline or impairment, anxiety, depression and suicide.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Absent	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Absent	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

3. Opioid Emergency Response (BOH23008) (City Wide) (Item 9.1)

(McMeekin/Hwang)

That Report BOH23008, respecting Opioid Emergency Response, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Absent	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Absent	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Absent	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Absent	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

4. 2023 PHS Annual Service Plan & Budget Submission (BOH23011) (City Wide) (Item 10.1)

(Nann/Hwang)

- (a) That the Medical Officer of Health be directed to submit the 2023 Annual Service Plan and Budget to the Ministry of Health, in keeping with what is outlined in Board of Health Report (BOH23011);
- (b) That the Board of Health reiterate their call to the Ministry of Health to fully fund the provincial portion, at least 70%, of the total costs of the mandatory public health programs and services provided under the Ontario Public Health Standards;
- (c) That the Board of Health reiterate their call to the Ministry of Health to continue the current mitigation funding until such time as the cost-shared arrangement is restored to 75%/25% for all cost-shared programs and that the Province once again assumes 100% funding for those programs identified as such in the public health budget for 2018-2019: and,
- (d) That the Board of Health call on the Ministry of Health to include expectations for on-going COVID-19 response in the Ontario Public Health Standards and provide permanent funding to sustain these requirements.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie

Absent	-	Ward 12	Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9	Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8	Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5	Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4	Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6	Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2	Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Absent	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3	Councillor Nrinder Nann
Absent	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Absent	-	Ward 1	Councillor Maureen Wilson

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 2)

The Committee Clerk advised the Board of the following changes to the agenda:

6. DELEGATION REQUESTS

- 6.2 Daniel Freiheit, respecting Item 5.8, Correspondence from Loretta Ryan, Executive Director, Association of Local Public Health Agencies (aLPHa), respecting the 2022 Chief Medical Officer of Health Annual Report (for today's meeting)
- 6.3 Jean Fair, respecting Consumption and Treatment Services Site Caveats (for today's meeting)

CHANGE IN THE ORDER OF ITEMS

That Item 9.2 respecting Modelling Morbidity and Mortality using the Hamilton Airshed Modelling System (BOH18016(a)) (City Wide) be moved up on the agenda to be considered prior to Item 9.1 respecting Opioid Response (BOH23008) (City Wide).

(Pauls/Hwang)

That the agenda for the March 20, 2023 Board of Health be approved, as amended.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Absent	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) February 13, 2023 (Item 4.1)

(Hwang/Cassar)

That the Minutes of the February 13, 2023 meeting of the Board of Health be approved, as presented.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Absent	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann

Yes	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1	Councillor Maureen Wilson

(d) COMMUNICATIONS (Item 5)

(i) (A. Wilson/Hwang)

That the following Communication items be approved, as presented:

- (a) Correspondence from Carmen McGregor, Chair, Boards of Health Section, and Trudy Sachowski, President, Association of Local Public Health Agencies (ALPHA), respecting Boards of Health Order in Council Appointments (Item 5.1)

Recommendation: Be received

- (b) Correspondence from Dr. Penny Sutcliffe, Medical Officer of Health and Chief Executive Officer, Public Health Sudbury & Districts, respecting Provincial Funding for Consumption and Treatment Services (Item 5.2)

Recommendation: Be Received.

- (c) Correspondence from Dr. Penny Sutcliffe, Medical Officer of Health and Chief Executive Officer, Public Health Sudbury & Districts, respecting Community Engagement to Address Food Insecurity (Item 5.3)

Recommendation: Be Received.

- (d) Correspondence from Douglas Lawrance, Chair, Board of Health, Northwestern Health Unit, respecting Alcohol Health Warning Labels (Item 5.4)

Recommendation: Be Received.

- (e) Correspondence from Kathryn Wilson, Chair, Board of Health, Peterborough Public Health, respecting Improvements to Funding Streams to Support Small Businesses and Other Organizations to Improve Air Quality (Item 5.5)

Recommendation: Be Received.

- (f) Correspondence from Rick Champagne, Chairperson, Board of Health, North Bay Parry Sound District Health Unit, respecting Food Insecurity in Ontario (Item 5.6)

Recommendation: Be Received.

- (g) Correspondence from Loretta Ryan, Executive Director, Association of Local Public Health Agencies (alPHA), respecting June 2023 AGM Notice and Package (Item 5.7)

Recommendation: Be Received.

- (h) Correspondence from Loretta Ryan, Executive Director, Association of Local Public Health Agencies (alPHA), respecting the 2022 Chief Medical Officer of Health Annual Report (Item 5.8)

Recommendation: Be Received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Absent	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

(e) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 6)

(i) (Nann/Cassar)

That the following Delegation Requests for the March 20, 2023 Board of Health meeting, be approved:

- (a) Kayla Hagerty, respecting Safe Use Spaces and declaring a State of Emergency for Overdose Deaths (Item 6.1)
- (b) Daniel Freiheit, respecting Item 5.8, Correspondence from Loretta Ryan, Executive Director, Association of Local Public Health Agencies (alPHa), respecting the 2022 Chief Medical Officer of Health Annual Report (Added Item 6.2)
- (c) Jean Fair, respecting Consumption and Treatment Services Site Caveats (Added Item 6.3)

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Absent	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

(f) DELEGATIONS (Item 7)

- (i) The following Delegations addressed the Board:
 - (a) Kayla Hagerty, addressed the Board respecting Safe Use Spaces and declaring a State of Emergency for Overdose Deaths (Item 7.1)
 - (b) Daniel Freiheit, addressed the Board respecting Item 5.8, Correspondence from Loretta Ryan, Executive Director, Association of Local Public Health Agencies (alPHa), respecting the 2022 Chief Medical Officer of Health Annual Report (Added Item 7.2)
 - (c) Jean Fair, addressed the Board respecting Consumption and Treatment Services Site Caveats (Added Item 7.3)

(ii) **(Clark/Pauls)**

That the following delegations, be received:

- (a) Kayla Hagerty, respecting Safe Use Spaces and declaring a State of Emergency for Overdose Deaths (Item 7.1)
- (b) Daniel Freiheit, respecting Item 5.8, Correspondence from Loretta Ryan, Executive Director, Association of Local Public Health Agencies (alPHa), respecting the 2022 Chief Medical Officer of Health Annual Report (Added Item 7.2)
- (c) Jean Fair, respecting Consumption and Treatment Services Site Caveats (Added Item 7.3)

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Absent	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

(g) **STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 8)**

(i) **Clean Air Hamilton Annual Progress Report 2021 (BOH23010) (Item 8.1)**

Bruce Newbold, Ph.D., Chair, Clean Air Hamilton addressed the Board with a Presentation respecting the Clean Air Hamilton Annual Progress Report.

(Hwang/McMeekin)

That the presentation by Bruce Newbold, Ph.D., Chair, Clean Air Hamilton respecting the Clean Air Hamilton Annual Progress Report, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Absent	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Absent	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1(a).

(ii) (Nann/Danko)

WHEREAS, ArcelorMittal Dofasco has site-specific air standards granted by the Province of Ontario that allows for the toxic and carcinogenic pollution above provincial air quality standards of benzene, benzo(a)pyrene, suspended particulate matter, manganese & manganese compounds that expires June 30, 2023.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (i) That staff be directed to review the status of the site-specific air standards granted to ArcelorMittal Dofasco and other industry sectors, and report back to the Board of Health; and,
- (ii) That the Mayor contact the Minister of Environment, Conservation and Parks to articulate that the City of Hamilton is opposed to any extension or continued special permissions for contaminants above provincially regulated general air standards.

Upon the Board's request, sub-sections (i) and (ii) were voted on separately.

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1(b).

(iii) Respiratory Diseases Update (Item 8.2)

Jordan Walker, Director, Communicable Disease Control, addressed the Board with a presentation respecting a Respiratory Diseases Update.

(A. Wilson/Hwang)

That the presentation by Jordan Walker, Director, Communicable Disease Control, respecting a Respiratory Diseases Update, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Absent	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Absent	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

(h) ADJOURNMENT (Item 15)

(Hwang/Francis)

That, there being no further business, the Board of Health be adjourned at 12:48 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 11 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Absent	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor John-Paul Danko
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson

Yes	-	Ward 2	Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Absent	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin
Yes	-	Ward 3	Councillor Nrinder Nann
Absent	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Absent	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Absent	-	Ward 1	Councillor Maureen Wilson

Respectfully submitted,

Mayor Andrea Horwath,
Chair, Board of Health

Matt Gauthier
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk