



AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MINUTES 23-005

9:30 a.m.
April 6, 2023
Council Chambers
Hamilton City Hall

Present: Councillors C. Kroetsch (Chair), T. Hwang (Vice-Chair), J. Beattie, B. Clark, M. Spadafora M. Tadeson, A. Wilson, and M. Wilson

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. **Accessible Transit Services: DARTS Fleet Management and Vehicle Safety Audit (Report 50695) Management Action Plans (AUD22007(a)) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)**

(Tadeson/Hwang)

- (a) That the Management Action Plans, as detailed in Appendix “A” of Report AUD22007(a) be approved; and,
- (b) That the General Manager of Public Works be directed to implement the Management Action Plans (attached as Appendix “A” to Report AUD22007(a) and report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee by October 2023 on the nature and status of actions taken in response to the audit report.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
 YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
 YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
 YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
 YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
 YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
 YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
 YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

2. **Consent Items (Item 9)**

(Hwang/Tadeson)

That the following Consent Items be received:

- (a) 2022 Fourth Quarter Emergency and Non-competitive Procurements Report (FCS22046(c)) (City Wide) (Item 9.1)
- (b) 2022 Fourth Quarter Non-compliance with the Procurement Policy Report (FCS22047(c)) (City Wide) (Item 9.2)
- (c) 2022 Fourth Quarter Request for Tenders and Proposals Report (FCS22048(c)) (City Wide) (Item 9.3)

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

3. Indigenous Advisory Committee - Citizen Committee Report, respecting Revised Terms of Reference for the Indigenous Advisory Committee (IAC23001) (Item 10.1)

(Hwang/Spadafora)

That the Indigenous Advisory Committee revised Terms of Reference attached as Appendix "A" to Report IAC23001, be approved.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

4. Private Water Service Line Leak Wastewater Bill Adjustment Policy (FCS23030) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) (Item 10.2)

(Hwang/M. Wilson)

That the Private Water Service Line Leak Wastewater Bill Adjustment Policy, effective May 1, 2023, attached as Appendix "A" to Report FCS23030, be approved;

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

5. HMRF-HWRF Pension Administration Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 30, 2023 (Added Item 10.3)

(A. Wilson/Beattie)

(a) Appointment of Chair and Co-Vice-Chairs (Item 1)

- (i) That Councillor Craig Cassar be appointed Chair of the HMRF-HWRF Pension Administration Sub-Committee for 2022-2026.
- (ii) That Don Skarratt (HMRF) be appointed Co-Vice-Chair of the HMRF-HWRF Pension Administration Sub-Committee.
- (iii) That Robert Slack (HWRF) be appointed Co-Vice-Chair of the HMRF-HWRF Pension Administration Sub-Committee.

(b) Hamilton Municipal Retirement Fund (HMRF) Valuation at December 31, 2021 (FCS23003) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

That Report FCS23003, respecting Hamilton Municipal Retirement Fund (HMRF) Valuation at December 31, 2021, be received.

(c) Hamilton Wentworth Retirement Fund (HWRF) Valuation at December 31, 2021 (FCS23005) (City Wide) (Item 8.2)

That Report FCS23004, respecting Hamilton Wentworth Retirement Fund (HWRF) Valuation at December 31, 2021, be received.

(d) Consent Items (Item 9)

That the following Consent Items, be received:

- (i) 2021 Hamilton Municipal Retirement Fund Financial Statements (FCS23002) (City Wide) (Item 9.1)
- (ii) 2021 Hamilton Wentworth Retirement Fund Financial Statements (FCS23004) (City Wide) (Item 9.2)

- (iii) Master Trust Pension Investment Performance Report as at December 31, 2021 (FCS21091(a)) (City Wide) (Item 9.3)
 - (iv) Master Trust Pension Investment Performance Report as at June 30, 2022 (FCS23044) (City Wide) (Item 9.4)
 - (v) Master Trust Pension Investment Performance Report as at December 31, 2022 (FCS23044(a)) (City Wide) (Added Item 9.5)
- (e) 2022 Master Trust Pension Statement of Investment Policies and Procedures (FCS23009) (City Wide) (Item 10.1)**
- (i) That Appendix “A” to HMRF-HWRF Pension Administration Sub-Committee Report 23-001, respecting the 2022 City of Hamilton Defined Benefit Pension Plans Master Trust Statement of Investment Policies and Procedures, be approved and replace the previous 2021 City of Hamilton Defined Benefit Pension Plans Master Trust Statement of Investment Policies and Procedures contained in Report FCS21095 and approved by Council on December 15, 2021;
 - (ii) That Appendix “A” to HMRF-HWRF Pension Administration Sub-Committee Report 23-001, respecting the 2022 City of Hamilton Defined Benefit Pension Plans Master Trust Statement of Investment Policies and Procedures, be forwarded to the Hamilton Street Railway Pension Advisory Committee for their information.
- (f) Hamilton Municipal Retirement Fund (HMRF), Hamilton Wentworth Retirement Fund (HWRF) Plan Wind-Up (FCS23006) (City Wide) (Item 10.2)**
- (i) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services Department, or their designate, be authorized to explore the option of winding up the Hamilton Municipal Retirement Fund (HMRF) and Hamilton Wentworth Retirement Fund (HWRF) pension plans, including performing a survivor audit and mortality study and any other studies necessary; and,
 - (ii) That staff report back to the HMRF/HWRF Pension Administration Committee on pricing estimates to purchase annuities from an insurance company that will provide HMRF and HWRF plan members with the same level of benefit that is currently being provided under their respective pension plans.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

- YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

6. Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 27, 2023 (Added Item 10.4)

(Hwang/A. Wilson)

- (a) That the Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001 be received and the recommendation as follows, be approved:

(i) Appointment of Chair and Vice-Chair

1. That Councillor Tammy Hwang be appointed Chair of the Governance Review Committee for 2022-2026.
2. That Councillor Cameron Kroetsch be appointed Vice-Chair of the Governance Review Committee for 2022-2026.

(ii) Feedback from the Advisory Committees on the Code of Conduct for Local Boards (FCS23032) (Item 9.1)

1. That Report FCS23032, respecting Feedback from the Advisory Committees on the Code of Code of Conduct for Local Boards, be received.
2. That the Integrity Commissioner for the City of Hamilton be invited to appear before the General Issues Committee, preferably before May 1, 2023, to address concerns raised by the Advisory Committees respecting the Code of Conduct for Local Boards and to discuss:

(aa) a process for receiving and integrating feedback from Advisory Committees to Code of Conduct for Local Boards; and

(ab) how training may be conducted in a more cost-effective manner; and

3. That staff be directed to obtain feedback and recommendations from the Advisory Committees who are noted as "received without comment" and "have not met to review" in Appendix B to Report FCS23032, and report back to Governance by the end of May 2023.

(iii) Procedural Handbook for Citizen Appointees to City of Hamilton Local Boards (FCS23034) (Item 10.1)

1. That consideration of the Procedural Handbook for Citizen Appointees to City of Hamilton Local Boards be deferred until such time as there has been a report back from City staff to the April 6, 2023 meeting of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee about how feedback has been incorporated;
2. That staff be directed to obtain feedback and recommendations from the Advisory Committees who are noted as "received without comment" and "have not met to review" in Appendix C to Report FCS23034, and report back to Governance by the end of May 2023.
3. That the Corporate Policy, Hamilton City Council – Appointment of Citizens to the City's Local Boards attached as Appendix 'A' to Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, be approved.

(iv) 2024 and 2025 Committee / Council Meeting Calendars (FCS23048) (Item 10.2)

1. That the 2024 Committee / Council Meeting Calendar, attached as Appendix 'B' to Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, be approved; and
2. That the 2025 Committee / Council Meeting Calendar, attached as Appendix 'C' to Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, be approved.

(v) Amendments to the Procedural By-law 21-021 respecting the Board of Health Standing Committee (FCS23031) (City Wide) (Item 10.3)

1. That By-law 21-021, A By-Law To Govern The Proceedings of Council and Committees of Council, as Amended, be **amended** to reflect the Board of Health Standing Committee's name change to the **Public Health Committee**, as follows:
 - (aa) the Board of Health Terms of Reference (Appendix 'B' to By-law 21-021, as amended), be **amended**, as follows:
 - (i) Title: Public Health Committee
 - (ii) Composition: The Public Health Committee shall be comprised of all 16 members of Council
 - (iii) *Specific duties shall include:*

- To consider recommendations of any Sub-Committees and/or Task Forces which report directly to the Public Health Committee
- To consider Citizen Committee Report recommendations of any Advisory Committee which reports directly to the Public Health Committee

(ab) Section 5.1 “Standing Committees” be **amended**, as follows:

5.1 Standing Committees

The Standing Committees that report directly to Council shall be as follows:

(b) Public Health Committee

(ac) Section 5.2 “Appointment of Committee Chairs and Vice Chairs” be **amended**, as follows:

5.2 Appointment of Committee Chairs and Vice Chairs

(2) Despite subsections 5.2(1)(a) and (b):

(a) the Mayor shall stand as Chair for the term of Council for the Public Health Committee; and

(3) The Public Health Committee shall recommend to Council the appointment of a Vice Chair in accordance with 5.2(1). Despite subsection 5.2(1)(a) and (b), the Vice Chair shall stand as Vice Chair for the term of Council for the Public Health Committee.

(ad) Section 5.3 “Standing Committee Membership” be **amended**, as follows:

5.3 Standing Committee Membership

(1) General Issues Committee and Public Health Committee shall be comprised of all Members of Council.

- (6) Each Member of Council shall sit on a minimum of 2 Standing Committees, in addition to the Public Health Committee and General Issues Committee.
- (ae) Section 5.6 “Standing Committee Meeting Times” be **amended**, as follows:

5.6 Standing Committee Meeting Times

- (1) Unless otherwise decided by Council, scheduled meetings of the Standing Committees will be as follows:
 - (a) (ii) Public Health Committee shall meet at least once per month commencing at 9:30 a.m.;
2. That By-law 21-021, A By-Law To Govern The Proceedings of Council and Committees of Council, as Amended, be **amended** to confirm applicability of the Procedure By-law when Council operates and functions as the Board of Health for the City of Hamilton, as follows:

- (aa) Section 3 “Council Meetings” be **amended** by adding the following new sub-section 3.15 “Board of Health Meetings” and renumbering the remaining sub-sections accordingly:

3.15 Board of Health Meetings

Where Council is exercising the jurisdiction of a Board of Health under the Health Protection and Promotion Act, 1990:

- (a) Council shall meet as necessary to complete such business as would normally be completed by a Board of Health and as required pursuant to the Health Protection and Promotion Act, 1990 and its Regulations, any Public Health Standards published by the Minister, and any other applicable law including municipal by-laws and policies governing a Board or Health; and
- (b) the Mayor and Clerk are authorized, upon approval by Council operating as a Board

of Health, to sign any necessary resolutions.

3. That the draft By-law attached as Appendix 'A' to Report FCS23031, respecting amendments to By-law 21-021, A By-Law To Govern The Proceedings of Council and Committees of Council, be enacted by Council.

(vi) Fixing Long-Term Care Act – Governance Requirements (FCS23033 / HSC23025) (Item 10.4)

1. That in accordance with the requirements of the *Fixing Long-Term Care Act, 2021* and Ontario Regulation 246/22 (as amended) which requires the municipality to establish a committee of management, and the corresponding qualifications for same, from among members of council for its Long Term Care Homes, that the Emergency and Community Services Committee comprised of members of Council who have completed the required screening measures as mandated in the legislation shall be the Committee of Management for the City of Hamilton's Long Term Care Homes; and
2. That the draft By-law attached as Appendix "D" to Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, respecting amendments to By-law 21-021, A By-law to Govern the Proceedings of Council and Committees of Council, to establish a Long-Term Care Homes Committee of Management for the City of Hamilton be enacted by Council.

(vii) Code of Conduct and Conflict of Interest Education and Communications (HUR22011(a)/CM22018(a)) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) (Item 10.5)

1. That City of Hamilton employees not be permitted to sell goods and services to the City, or to bid on City contracts unless there are specific circumstances where it can be demonstrated that employee bids are in the best interest of the organization. Circumstances that would give rise to an exemption may include, but are not limited to, contracts tendered during a declared state of emergency or contracts tendered to purchase products whereby the employee is the sole source (no other vendor provides the same or equivalent product).
2. That a review of a potential exemption, as outlined above, would be initiated through the following process:

- (aa) Employees will be required to submit a Code of Conduct Disclosure Form that outlines all perceived and real conflicts of interest.
 - (ab) Disclosure Forms will be reviewed to determine if any conflicts of interest should disqualify the employee from selling goods and services or from participating in the bid process, despite the extenuating circumstances.
 - (ac) Staff involved in reviewing Disclosure Forms and confirming that the extenuating circumstances exist will include Legal, Procurement and Human Resources.
 - (ad) Any employee bids that are approved by Legal, Procurement and Human Resources due to extenuating circumstances, require City Manager approval when the value of the contract exceeds \$25,000.
3. It is further recommended, that notwithstanding any extenuating circumstances, employees would be precluded from consideration for an exemption for the following reasons:
- (aa) Access to confidential or proprietary information that could give them an unfair advantage in the bidding or sale process,
 - (ab) Direct or indirect involvement in the procurement process or the decision-making process by virtue of their position with the City.
4. That the Code of Conduct, Schedule D Outside Activity, attached as Appendix 'E' to Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, be approved, as amended with the recommendations noted above.
5. That this item be removed from the Governance Review Sub-Committee Outstanding Business List.
- (viii) Integrity Commissioner Contract Extension (FCS22074 (a)) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) (Item 10.6)**
1. That Council approve the extension to Contract C2-06-19, Provision of Services of an Integrity Commissioner and Lobbyist Registrar for the City of Hamilton from June 1, 2023 until **September 30, 2023** and that the City Clerk be authorized to negotiate, enter into and execute the extension and any ancillary documents required to give effect thereto with Principles Integrity, in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor;

2. That staff be directed to take the alternative action set out in Report FCS22074 (a)), attached as Appendix F to Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001 to conduct a competitive procurement process to secure the services of an Integrity Commissioner and Lobbyist Registrar in accordance with the City's Procurement Policy By-Law 20-205, as amended, with the addition of the Auditor General as a member of the Selection Committee; and
3. That Appendix G to Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, be approved.

(ix) Restructuring the Board of Health Standing Committee (Item 11.1)

WHEREAS, Council, believes that the current composition of the City's Board of Health Standing Committee (recommendation to change name to "Public Health Committee" as per FCS23031) should be adjusted;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

1. That the composition of the Public Health Committee be approved as follows:
 - (aa) 6 members of Council;
 - (ab) 6 community health professionals (can be from either a regulated profession (i.e. doctor, nurse, social worker) or an unregulated profession (i.e. harm reduction worker, outreach worker, disability justice advocate); and
 - (ac) 1 education representative
2. That By-law No. 21-021, as amended, A By-Law to Govern the Proceedings of Council and Committees of Council (Procedural By-law), be **amended** as follows with the renumbering of the remaining sub-sections accordingly:
 - (aa) the definition of "Selection Committee", be **amended** as follows:

"Selection Committee" means a Committee established by Council, comprised entirely of Members of Council, to interview and report back to Council on the appointment of citizen representatives to agencies, boards and Committees, and reports directly to Council, with the exception of the Hamilton Police Services Board Selection Committee for the recruitment of the one person appointed by resolution

of council to the Hamilton Police Services Board which is comprised of six (6) community representatives and six (6) Council representatives with full voting privileges and with the exception of the Public Health Committee Selection Committee for the recruitment of the 6 community health professionals and the 1 education representative which is comprised of six (6) members of Council and six (6) community representatives with full voting privileges.

(ab) the Public Health Committee Terms of Reference (Appendix 'B' to By-law 21-021, as amended), be **amended**, as follows:

(i) The Public Health Committee shall be comprised of:

1. 6 members of Council;
2. 6 community health professionals (can be from either a regulated profession (i.e. doctor, nurse, social worker) or an unregulated profession (i.e. harm reduction worker, outreach worker, disability justice advocate); and
3. 1 education representative

(ac) Section 5.2 "Appointment of Committee Chairs and Vice Chairs" be **amended**, as follows:

5.2 Appointment of Committee Chairs and Vice Chairs

(2) Despite subsections 5.2(1)(a) and (b):

(a) the Mayor may stand as the Chair of the General Issues Committee for the term of Council or the Chair of the General Issues Committee may be rotated amongst the Deputy Mayors.

(ad) Section 5.3 "Standing Committee Membership" be **amended**, as follows:

5.3 Standing Committee Membership

(1) General Issues Committee shall be comprised of all Members of Council.

(2) Public Health Committee shall be comprised of 6 Members of Council, 6

community health professionals (can be from either a regulated profession (i.e. doctor, nurse, social worker) or an unregulated profession (i.e. harm reduction worker, outreach worker, disability justice advocate); and 1 education representative;

- (7) Each Member of Council shall sit on a minimum of 3 Standing Committees, in addition to the General Issues Committee.

3. That the Selection Process for the appointment of the 6 community health professionals and the 1 education representative to the Public Health Committee, be approved, as follows:
- (aa) That the Public Health Committee Selection Committee for the recruitment of the 6 community health professionals (can be from either a regulated profession (i.e. doctor, nurse, social worker) or an unregulated profession (i.e. harm reduction worker, outreach worker, disability justice advocate); and the 1 education representative to the Public Health Committee, be comprised of the six (6) members of Council and six (6) community representatives;
 - (ab) That the Greater Hamilton Health Network (GHHN), GHHN Health Equity Council, Hamilton Trans Health Coalition, Woman Abuse Working Group (WAWG), Refugee Newcomer Health, and the Hamilton Anti-Racism Resource Centre (HARRC) recommend the appointment of the six (6) community representatives on the Public Health Committee Selection Committee for the recruitment 6 community health professionals and the 1 education representative to the Public Health Committee for the 2022-2026 term of Council for Council's consideration;
 - (ac) That the six (6) community representatives appointed to the Public Health Committee Selection Committee for the recruitment of 6 community health professionals and the 1 education representative to the Public Health Committee, be required to complete and adhere to a confidentiality agreement as well as the Code of Conduct for Local Boards.

- (ad) That the Corporate Policy - Hamilton City Council - Appointment of Citizens to the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Advisory (Volunteer) Committees and Sub-Committees, be **amended**, by adding the following new sub-section 16 and renumbering the remaining sub-sections accordingly:

Selection Process for the Appointment of the 6 community health professionals and the 1 education representative to the Public Health Committee

16. Six (6) members of Council and six (6) community representatives are appointed to the Public Health Committee Selection Committee whose mandate will be to:
- (i) Review applications for the appointment of the 6 community health professionals (can be from either a regulated profession (i.e. doctor, nurse, social worker) or an unregulated profession (i.e. harm reduction worker, outreach worker, disability justice advocate); to the Public Health Committee;
 - (ii) Shortlist the applicants with assistance of staff, where appropriate, based on the applicant information provided;
 - (iii) Request that the following Advisory Committees submit confidential interview questions:
 - (a) Hamilton Women and Gender Equity Advisory Committee
 - (b) Indigenous Advisory Committee
 - (c) LGBTQ Advisory Committee
 - (d) Committee Against Racism Advisory Committee
 - (e) Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities
 - (iv) Request that the Hamilton District School Board and the Hamilton Catholic District School Board nominate a candidate(s) as the 1 education representative to be appointed to the Public Health Committee for the Public Health Committee Selection Committee consideration;

- (v) Interview applicants and nominated candidates, if necessary, who have met the criteria (below), ensuring that they are not ineligible (below);

Preference will be given to applicants who meet the following criteria:

- a resident of, or owner of a business in, the City at least 18 years of age;
- an owner or tenant of land in the City, or the spouse of such a person;
- not employed by the City of Hamilton;
- interest or background in issues affecting municipal public health programs and services
- interest or skills in planning and policy development leading to a comprehensive municipal public health agenda that meets local community needs experience in organizational activities, such as committees, non-profit groups, voluntary societies, occupational associations skills in leadership and management
- experience in administration and budget development
- demonstrated skills in conflict management, negotiation and mediation
- ability to make a commitment to monthly involvement in Public Health Committee meetings and related committees or other activities
- a youthful perspective, defined as an individual in the 18-30 age range, a desired qualification for at least one public member
- a frontline worker perspective

- (b) That the Revised Appendix C to Report FCS23034, as requested by Committee, be received. (Added Item 10.4(a))

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch

YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

7. Grants Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 31, 2023 (Added Item 10.5)

(Kroetsch/A. Wilson)

(a) Funding Recommendations for the One-Time Enhancement Grant (GRA22001(b)) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

- (i) That, the funding allocation, earmarked for potential matching opportunities in the City Enrichment Fund reserve #112230 be approved to fund the One-Time Enhancement Grant in the amount of \$500,000; and,
- (ii) That, the distribution of funds to recommended organizations as outlined in Appendix "A" to Grants Sub-Committee Report 23-001, be approved.
- (iii) *That any funds allocated and distributed through the One-Time Enhancement Grant Relief Program be exempt on a one-time basis and not be counted toward any formula that restricts regular funding from the City including the City Enrichment Fund (e.g. the City's 30% formula).***

Result: Main Motion, As Amended Item 2 of the Grants Sub-Committee Report 23-001, CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(Spadafora/Beattie)

(b) Appointment of Committee Chair and Vice-Chair (Item 1.1)

- (i) That Councillor Nrinder Nann be appointed as Chair of the Grants Sub-Committee for the remainder of the 2022-2026 term.
- (ii) That Councillor Cameron Kroetsch be appointed as Vice-Chair of the Grants Sub-Committee for the remainder of the 2022-2026 term.

Result: Motion, on the balance of the Grants Sub-Committee Report 23-001, CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

8. Committee Report Referral (FCS23051) (Added Item 14.2)

(A. Wilson/M. Tadeson)

- (a) That Report FCS23051, respecting Committee Report Referral, be received; and
- (b) That Report FCS23051, respecting Committee Report Referral remain confidential.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 2)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

5. COMMUNICATION ITEMS

5.2 Sjanita Harrison, respecting Restructuring the Board of Health

Recommendation: Be received and referred to Item 9 of Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 27, 2023 (Item 10.4 on today's agenda)

6. DELEGATION REQUESTS

- 6.1 Mark A. McNeil, Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities, respecting Motion to reorganize the Board of Health (for today's meeting)
Subsequently WITHDRAWN

10. DISCUSSION ITEMS

- 10.3 HMRF-HWRF Pension Administration Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 30, 2023
- 10.4 Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 27, 2023
- 10.5 Grants Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 31, 2023

11. MOTIONS

- 11.1 Fair Wage Policy Review

13. GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS

- 13.1 Amendments to the Outstanding Business List
- a. Items Considered Completed and to be Removed
- a. Use of External Services for Tax Assessment & Appeals
Item on the OBL: 21-Q
Addressed as Item 10.1 on the March 23, 2023 agenda
- b. Delegated Authority to Staff Relating to Water Service Line Leaks
Item on OBL: 23-A
Addressed as Item 10.2 on today's agenda.

(Hwang/Tadeson)

That the agenda for the April 6, 2023 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting, be approved, as amended.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) March 23, 2023 (Item 4.1)

(M. Wilson/Tadeson)

That the Minutes of the March 23, 2023 meeting of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee, be approved, as presented.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(d) COMMUNICATIONS (Item 5)

(i) (M. Wilson/Hwang)

That staff be directed to develop a process through which letters of appreciation are sent to members of volunteer Advisory Committees on their resignation or at the end of their term.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(ii) (M. Wilson/Spadafora)

That Communications Items 5.1 to 5.2, be approved, as presented, as follows:

1. Heather Platt, respecting Resignation from the Hamilton Women and Gender Equity Committee (Item 5.1)

Recommendation: Be received.

2. Sjanita Harrison, respecting Restructuring the Board of Health (Added Item 5.2)

Recommendation: Be received and referred to Item 9 of Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 27, 2023 (Item 10.4 on today's agenda).

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
ABSENT - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(e) STAFF PRESENTATIONS / PRESENTATIONS (Item 8)

- (i) **Accessible Transit Services: DARTS Fleet Management and Vehicle Safety Audit (Report 50695) Management Action Plans (AUD22007(a)) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)**

Charles Brown, Auditor General, addressed Committee respecting the DARTS Fleet Management and Vehicle Safety Audit (Report 50695) Management Action Plans, with the aid of a presentation.

(Beattie/Spadafora)

That the presentation from Charles Brown, Auditor General, respecting DARTS Fleet Management and Vehicle Safety Audit (Report 50695) Management Action Plans, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1.

(f) CONSENT ITEMS (Item 9)

(i) Quarterly Emergency and Non-competitive Procurements Report (Item 9.1)

(Kroetsch/Tadeson)

That staff include descriptions of and rationale for purchases identified in the quarterly Emergency and Non-competitive Procurements Report.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(g) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 10)

Councillor Kroetsch relinquished the Chair to Councillor Hwang to introduce the following amendment to Item 2 of the Grants Sub-Committee Report 23-001:

(i) Grants Sub-Committee Report 23-001, March 31, 2023 (Added Item 10.5)

2. Funding Recommendations for the One-Time Enhancement Grant (GRA22001(b)) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

(Kroetsch/Tadeson)

That the recommendations in Report GRA22001(b), be *amended* to add a new subsection (c) as follows:

(c) *That any funds allocated and distributed through the One-Time Enhancement Grant Relief Program be exempt on a one-time basis and not be counted toward any formula that restricts regular funding from the City including the City Enrichment Fund (e.g. the City's 30% formula).*

Result: Amendment CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang

YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 7.

(h) MOTIONS (Item 11)

Councillor Kroetsch relinquished the Chair to Councillor Hwang to introduce the motion.

(i) Fair Wage Policy Review (Item 11.1)

(Kroetsch/Tadeson)

WHEREAS, the Fair Wage Policy has not been updated recently, especially in light of the serious changes to the industry as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic;

WHEREAS, there are record-level investments in building and a renewed interest in health, hygiene, and safety on job sites; and

WHEREAS, the City and other employers are contending with an underground economy which is destabilizing the associated job markets.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That Human Resources and Finance and Corporate Services staff be directed to engage in a review of the Fair Wage Policy and any related schedules through stakeholder meetings for report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee by the end of Q3 2023 with recommendations; based on stakeholder feedback;
- (b) That the following stakeholder groups be included in the consultation: Christian Labour Association Canada; Electrical Construction Association Hamilton; Hamilton Brantford Ontario Building & Construction Trades Council; Golden Horseshoe General Contractors Association; Greater Hamilton & Niagara Construction Association; Hamilton Halton Construction Association; Mechanical Contractors Association Hamilton Niagara; Labourers' International Union of North America; and Merit OpenShop Contributors Association of Ontario;
- (c) That there be two stakeholder meetings, inviting all stakeholders to each, at the beginning of Q3 2023; and
- (d) That members of City Council be permitted to attend as guests to hear stakeholder feedback directly.

At the request of Committee, sub-section (d) was voted on separately.

- (d) That members of City Council be permitted to attend as guests to hear stakeholder feedback directly.

Result: Motion on sub-section (d) CARRIED by a vote of 5 to 3, as follows:

NO - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
NO - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
NO - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

- (a) That Human Resources and Finance and Corporate Services staff be directed to engage in a review of the Fair Wage Policy and any related schedules through stakeholder meetings for report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee by the end of Q3 2023 with recommendations; based on stakeholder feedback;
- (b) That the following stakeholder groups be included in the consultation: Christian Labour Association Canada; Electrical Construction Association Hamilton; Hamilton Brantford Ontario Building & Construction Trades Council; Golden Horseshoe General Contractors Association; Greater Hamilton & Niagara Construction Association; Hamilton Halton Construction Association; Mechanical Contractors Association Hamilton Niagara; Labourers' International Union of North America; and Merit OpenShop Contributors Association of Ontario;
- (c) That there be two stakeholder meetings, inviting all stakeholders to each, at the beginning of Q3 2023; and

Result: Motion on sub-sections (a) to (c) CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 1, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
NO - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(i) GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS (Item 13)

(i) Amendments to the Outstanding Business List (Added Item 13.1)

(A. Wilson/Spadafora)

That the following amendments to the Outstanding Business List, be approved:

(a) Items Considered Complete and to be Removed

1. Use of External Services for Tax Assessment & Appeals

Item on OBL: 21-Q

Addressed as Item 10.1 on today's agenda

2. Delegated Authority to Staff Relating to Water Service Line Leaks

Item on OBL: 23-A

Addressed as Item 10.2 on today's agenda.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch

YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang

YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie

YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson

YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(j) PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL (Item 14)

(i) Closed Minutes – March 23, 2023 (Item 14.1)

(Tadeson/Spadafora)

(a) That the Closed Session Minutes of the March 23, 2023 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting, be approved as presented; and

(b) That the Closed Session Minutes of the March 23, 2023 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting, remain confidential.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch

YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(Spadafora/Hwang)

That the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee move into Closed Session respecting Item 14.2, pursuant to Section 9.3, Sub-section (b) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021, as amended, and Section 239(2), Sub-section (b) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to personal matters about an identifiable individual, including City or local board employees.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(ii) Committee Report Referral (FSC23051) (Added Item 14.2)

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 8.

(k) ADJOURNMENT (Item 15)

(Spadafora/Tadeson)

That, there being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee, be adjourned at 1:18 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor Cameron Kroetsch, Chair
Audit, Finance and Administration
Committee

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk