



AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MINUTES 23-003 - *REVISED*

9:30 a.m.
February 16, 2023
Council Chambers
Hamilton City Hall

Present: Councillors C. Kroetsch (Chair), T. Hwang (Vice-Chair), J. Beattie, B. Clark, M. Tadeson, and A. Wilson

Absent with Regrets: Councillor M. Wilson– Personal

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. Fraud and Waste Annual Report (AUD23003) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

(Beattie/Hwang)

- (a) That the Fraud and Waste Hotline pilot program be extended through to July 31, 2023 using the existing Council-approved funding allotment (Report AUD18007); and
- (b) That Appendices “A” and “B” to Report AUD23003 be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
 YES - CHAIR Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
 YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
 YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
 YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
 YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
 YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

2. Consent Items (Item 9)

(Tadeson/Hwang)

That the following reports be received:

- (a) Report FCS22050(a)/PW22047(a), respecting Update on Procurement of Liquid Chlorine in Railway Tank Cars for the Woodward Water and Wastewater Treatment Plants (City Wide) (Item 9.1); and

- (b) Report FCS23016, respecting 2020 and 2021 Audited Financial Statements for City of Hamilton Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) (City Wide) (Item 9.2);

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 - Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

3. Committee Against Racism Citizen Committee Report, respecting Citizen Candidates for the Hamilton Police Services Selection Committee (Added Item 10.2)

(Hwang/A. Wilson)

That the appointments of the Community Representatives listed in the Citizen Committee Report respecting Citizen Candidates for the Hamilton Police Services Board Selection Committee be referred to the February 22, 2023 Council meeting for consideration.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 2)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

5. COMMUNICATIONS

- 5.2 Gabriel Nicholson, respecting motion 11.2 Council Access to and Copies of Confidential Records
Recommendation: Be received and referred to Item 11.2, Council Access to and Copies of Confidential Records.

8. STAFF PRESENTATIONS / PRESENTATIONS

8.2 Committee Against Racism - Annual Report (no copy)

9. CONSENT ITEMS

9.4 Committee Against Racism Minutes – January 10, 2023

10. DISCUSSION ITEMS

10.2 Committee Against Racism Citizen Committee Report, respecting Citizen Candidates for the Hamilton Police Services Selection Committee
Refer to Item 14.1 for Confidential Appendix A to Committee Against Racism Citizen Committee Report, respecting Citizen Candidates for the Hamilton Police Services Board Selection Committee.

14. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

14.1 Confidential Appendix A - Committee Against Racism - Citizen Committee Report, respecting Citizen Candidates for the Hamilton Police Services Selection Committee

(Hwang/Tadeson)

That the agenda for the February 16, 2023 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting be approved, as amended.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) February 2, 2023 (Item 4.1)

(Hwang/A. Wilson)

That the Minutes of the February 2, 2023 meeting of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee be approved, as presented.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES – CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

(d) COMMUNICATIONS (Item 5)

(Hwang/Tadeson)

That the following Communications Items, be approved, as presented:

- (i) Julie Turner, respecting her resignation from the Hamilton Women and Gender Equity Committee**

Recommendation: Be received.

- (ii) Gabriel Nicholson, respecting motion 11.2 Council Access to and Copies of Confidential Records**

Recommendation: Be received and referred to consideration of Item 11.2, Council Access to and Copies of Confidential Records.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

**ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson**

(e)(d) STAFF PRESENTATIONS / PRESENTATIONS (Item 8)

- (i) Fraud and Waste Annual Report (AUD23003) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)**

Charles Brown, City Auditor, addressed Committee respecting the Fraud and Waste Annual Report, with the aid of a presentation.

(Hwang/Beattie)

That the presentation from Charles Brown, City Auditor, respecting the Fraud and Waste Annual Report, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1.

(ii) Committee Against Racism - Annual Report (Added Item 8.2)

Taimur Qasim, Co-Chair, Committee Against Racism, addressed the Committee respecting the Committee Against Racism Annual Report.

(Tadeson/A. Wilson)

That the presentation from Taimur Qasim, Co-Chair, Committee Against Racism, respecting the Committee Against Racism Annual Report, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

(f)(e) CONSENT ITEMS (Item 9)

(i) Advisory Committee Minutes

(Hwang/Tadeson)

That the following Advisory Committee Minutes, be received:

1. Hamilton Women and Gender Committee - December 23, 2022 (Item 9.3)
2. Committee Against Racism - January 10, 2023 (Added Item 9.4)

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch

YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

(g)(f) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 10)

- (i) Hamilton Women and Gender Equity Committee, Citizen Committee Report, respecting Applying a gender lens to the City of Hamilton for the Operational Budget (Item 10.1)**

(A. Wilson/Tadeson)

That the Hamilton Women and Gender Equity Committee, Citizen Committee Report, respecting Applying a gender lens to the City of Hamilton Budget, be received and referred to staff for report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee in advance of the 2024 budget process on how a gender-based lens can be applied through a municipal budgeting process.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

(h)(g) MOTIONS (Item 11)

- (i) Constituent Management Software (Item 11.1)**

(Clark/Beattie)

WHEREAS, Councillors and their staff are currently not provided with supported database software that helps track actionable items based on contact with constituents;

WHEREAS, Information Technology staff must be directed by Council to explore database software options that can be supported;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That Information Technology staff be directed to explore user friendly database software options and report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee with those options, complete with any costs associated with adopting such software for use by Councillors and their administrative staff.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

Councillor Kroetsch relinquished the Chair to Councillor Hwang to introduce the following Motion and Notice of Motion:

(ii) Council Access to and Copies of Confidential Records (Item 11.2)

(Kroetsch/A. Wilson)

That the motion respecting Council Access to and Copies of Confidential Records be referred to staff for report back to the Governance Review Sub-Committee at a future meeting.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
ABSENT - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

(i)(h) NOTICES OF MOTION (Item 12)

(i) Feasibility of a Bring Your Own Device Policy (Item 12.1)

Councillor Kroetsch introduced the following Notice of Motion:

WHEREAS, the Council-approved *City of Hamilton E-mail, Internet, and Computer Acceptable Use Policy* and *IT Security Policy* strictly prohibit the use of personal devices in any form to conduct City of Hamilton business;

WHEREAS, the ability to use a range of technology, including software, to accommodate social media and graphic design would enable Councillors and their staff to optimize their office work;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That Information Technology staff investigate the feasibility of implementing a bring-your-own-device policy that would allow Councillors and their staff to use personal computers, mobile phones and other personal devices to

conduct City of Hamilton business and report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee on the following:

- (a) the risks, operational impacts, and cost implications of implementing a bring-your-own-device policy;
- (b) the possible implementation of a pilot for a bring-your-own-device policy, that shall be limited to Councillors and their administrative staff; and
- (c) an investigation of other direct paths to allow Councillors and their staff to use a range of personal technology to meet their individual needs.

Councillor Kroetsch assumed the Chair.

(j)(#) GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS (Item 15)

(i) Amendments to the Outstanding Business List (Item 13.1)

(Tadeson/Hwang)

That the following amendments to the Outstanding Business List, be approved:

- (a) Items Requiring a New Due Date
 - 1. Transportation Operations Inventory Audit, Fraud and Waste Investigation, and Follow Up to Audit Report 2013-17 - Public Works - Traffic Inventory
Item on OBL: 22-G
Current Due Date: May 2023
Proposed New Due Date: September 21, 2023
- (b) Items Considered Complete and to be Removed
 - 1. Procurement of Liquid Chlorine in Railway Tank Cars for the Woodward Water and Wastewater Treatment Plants
Item on OBL: 22-F
Addressed as Item 9.1 on today's agenda

(k)(#) ADJOURNMENT (Item 15)

(Hwang/Tadeson)

That, there being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee, be adjourned at 11:41 a.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

ABSENT - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - CHAIR Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang

YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor Cameron Kroetsch, Chair
Audit, Finance and Administration
Committee

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk