

CITY OF HAMILTON PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT Planning Division

TO:	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	October 20, 2023
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (PED23187) (Ward 2)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 2
PREPARED BY:	Meg Oldfield (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7163 Alissa Golden (905) 546-2423 Ext. 1202
SUBMITTED BY:	Anita Fabac Acting Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

That the City Clerk be directed to give notice of Council's intention to designate 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED23187, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23187, subject to the following:

- (i) If no objections are received to the notice of intention to designate in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to introduce the necessary by-law to designate the property to be of cultural heritage value or interest to City Council;
- (ii) If an objection to the notice of intention to designate is received in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to report back to Council to allow Council to consider the objection and decide whether or not to withdraw the notice of intention to designate the property.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23187) (Ward 2) - Page

2 of 7

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report recommends designation of the significant built heritage resources located at 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The subject property is currently listed on the City's Municipal Heritage Register (Register). Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property using *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and determined that is has sufficient cultural heritage value or interest to warrant designation, as per the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23187. The owner of the property requested its designation and is supportive of the staff recommendation, including the identification of interior heritage attributes for designation.

Alternatives for Consideration - See Page 6

FINANCIAL - STAFFING - LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: N/A

Staffing: N/A

Legal:

The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the properties. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and considered by Council before either withdrawing the notice of intention to designate or passing a designation by-law. Once a designation by-law has been passed, any further objection would be heard before the Ontario Land Tribunal.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the *Act*.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)).

The City of Hamilton also provides financial incentive programs, including development charge exemption and heritage grants and loans, to assist in the adaptive re-use and continued conservation of properties once they are designated.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23187) (Ward 2) - Page 3 of 7

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property located at 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED23187, is comprised of two-and-one-half-storey stucco clad brick building constructed circa 1911. The subject property was first surveyed for potential heritage interest in the 1980s.

In 2002, 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue was acquired by new owners who sought to restore the property. As part of that project, Nina Chapple, of Chapple Heritage Services, was hired to prepare a report documenting the history of the property. A copy of this report, "The Barton: An Architectural History," was given to Planning staff, and was utilized in the writing of this report (see the Research Sources attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED23187).

In June 2011, staff received a request from the owner to designate the subject property. In response, staff prepared Report PED11164, recommending that the property be listed on the Municipal Heritage Register (Register) and added to staff's designation workplan for further research and assessment of the property at a later date. The recommendations were approved by City Council as part of Planning Committee Report 11-017 in October 2011.

As a result of the recent *Bill 23* changes to the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the former staff workplan for designation was rescinded and replaced with a new public list of Candidates for Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (see Report PED22211(a)), at which time 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue was reprioritized for review for designation by January 1, 2025. In a letter dated June 2, 2023, Cultural Heritage Planning staff notified the property owner of the changes to the City's heritage designation process and the reprioritization of staff's review of the property for designation. Staff conducted a site visit to the property on July 26, 2023, at which time the owner expressed their continued interest in the designation of both external and internal heritage features of the property.

In an email dated August 18, 2023, staff advised the owner of the heritage evaluation and recommendation to designate and provided them with a copy of the draft Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes (attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23187).

Ravenscliffe Avenue

In May of 2017, as part of Durand Neighbourhood Built Heritage Inventory project (PED17092), staff recommended that the feasibility of conducting a heritage conservation district study of Ravenscliffe Avenue be assessed, including consultation with all relevant property owners to determine their interest in pursuing a district

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23187) (Ward 2) - Page 4 of 7

designation, and that the findings be reported to Planning Committee for further direction. Staff will be reporting back by the fourth quarter of 2023 with a Heritage Conservation District Strategy and Work Plan, including anticipated timing of the review of Ravenscliffe Avenue as a potential heritage district.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The Recommendations of this Report are consistent with Provincial and Municipal legislation, policy and direction, including:

- Determining the cultural heritage value or interest of a property based on design/physical value, historical/associative value and contextual value criteria (Ontario Heritage Act, Ontario Regulation 9/06);
- Ensuring significant built heritage resources are conserved (*Provincial Policy Statement*, 2020, Sub-section 2.6.1); and,
- Designating properties of cultural heritage value under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Urban Hamilton Official Plan, Section B.3.4.2.3).

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

External

- Property Owner; and,
- Inventory and Research Working Group of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

In addition, Planning staff have notified the Ward Councillor (Councillor C. Kroetsch) for Ward 2 and provided an overview of the reasons for designation and the process for designating a property.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of significant cultural heritage resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality can manage change to a property through the Heritage Permit process to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained.

Section 29(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets two or more of the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest prescribed in *Ontario Regulation 9/06*, as amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22*, which identifies nine criteria in three broad categories: Design / Physical Value; Historical / Associative

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23187) (Ward 2) - Page 5 of 7

Value; and, Contextual Value. The evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the subject property was completed by Cultural Heritage Planning staff based on a site visit of the exterior of the property conducted on July 26, 2023 (see photographs attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED23187) and available secondary and primary research sources (attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED23187). As outlined below, based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation, it was determined that the subject property meets six of the nine criteria contained in *Ontario Regulation 9/06* in all three categories.

Design / Physical Value

- 1. The property is comprised of a two-and-one-half storey stucco-clad brick residence constructed circa 1911 in the Italian Renaissance Revival architectural style. The property has design value as a representative example of residential Renaissance Revival style of architecture. The architectural features typical of, and influenced by, Italian Renaissance Revival architectural style include the: low-hipped roof, red clay tiles, paired bracketed eaves, stucco façade, balconets, belt course, pilasters, and Tuscan columns. The front façade features an enclosed portico with plain architrave and pilasters, and an arched entryway with French doors.
- 2. The property displays a high degree of craftsmanship as demonstrated by the interior wood and plaster features in the front foyer, library, and first and second storey staircase, and the exterior features including the moulded entablature, double bracketed eaves, and Tuscan columns.
- 3. The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

Historical / Associative Value

- 4. The property has historical value for its association with the original owner and prominent Hamiltonian Harry Blois Witton (1865-1927). Witton practiced as a lawyer in Hamilton for 11 years until he was named the vice-president of Tuckett Tobacco Company Ltd. in 1896, and the president in 1915. Between 1894 and 1896, Witton served on the Hamilton City Council, and from 1911 until his death in 1927, he served as the Board of Education's appointment to the Library Board. 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue was owned by the Witton family from its construction in circa 1911 until 1949.
- 5. The property does not appear to yield or have the potential to yield, information that contributes to the understanding of a community or culture.

6. The property reflects the work and ideas of the prominent Hamilton architectural firm, Stewart & Witton, who were commissioned by Harry Blois Witton to design the home in 1909. Walter Stewart (1871-1917) was the son of Hamilton architect William Stewart. Walter Stewart partnered with his father in 1893, forming W. & W. Stewart. Upon his father's retirement in 1904, Walter Stewart formed a partnership with William Witton (1871-1947), brother of Harry Blois Witton, who had trained at the prominent Chicago architectural firm of Adler & Sullivan. Stewart and Witton practiced together until Stewart's death in 1917. The pair designed a number of residential and institutional buildings in Hamilton and beyond, however some of their best-known and extant works include 6 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Herkimer Apartments, King George Public School, and St. Giles Presbyterian Church.

Contextual Value

- 7. The property is considered important in defining the character of the area. The setting of the property helps define the historic and distinctive character of Ravenscliffe Avenue, known for its substantial houses. While Ravenscliffe Avenue features homes predominantly constructed in the Victorian and Edwardian styles of architecture, 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue and adjacent 6 Ravenscliffe Avenue, also constructed by Stewart & Witton, standout from the surrounding streetscape as representative examples of Italian Renaissance Revival style of architecture.
- 8. The property is historically and visually linked to its surroundings as part of the surviving late-nineteenth to early-twentieth century residential Ravenscliffe Avenue streetscape that makes up one of Hamilton's most prominent and distinguished neighbourhoods, the Durand.
- 9. The property is not considered to be a local landmark.

Staff have determined that 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton is of cultural heritage value or interest sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and recommend designation according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED23187. The location of the proposed interior heritage attributes are identified in Appendix "E" attached to Report PED23187.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may decide to designate property or decline to designate property.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Ravenscliffe Avenue, Hamilton, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED23187) (Ward 2) - Page 7 of 7

Decline to Designate

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant cultural heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's financial incentives for heritage properties, including development charge exemption and grant and loan programs. Designation alone does not restrict the legal use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or been demonstrated to affect its resale value. However, designation does allow the municipality to manage change to the heritage attributes of a property through the Heritage Permit process. Staff does not consider declining to designate any of the properties to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report PED23187 – Location Map

Appendix "B" to Report PED23187 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes

Appendix "C" to Report PED23187 – Photographs

Appendix "D" to Report PED23187 – Research Sources

Appendix "E" to Report PED23187 – Location of Proposed Interior Attributes

MO/sd