Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee (HPRS) Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, September 19, 2023 City of Hamilton, Webex Virtual Meeting

Present: Tim Ritchie (Chair), Karen Burke (Vice Chair), Graham Carroll, Diane

Dent, Andy MacLaren, Carol Priamo, Melissa Alexander, Stefan

Spolnik

Staff Present: Alissa Golden (Cultural Heritage Program Lead), Lisa Christie (Cultural

Heritage Planner), Caylee MacPherson (Assistant Cultural Heritage

Planner), Chloe Richer (Senior Planner)

Regrets: Steve Wiegand

The meeting was called to order by Alissa Golden, Cultural Heritage Program Lead, City of Hamilton, at 5:00pm

1. Appointment of Chair

(Carroll/Priamo)

That Tim Ritchie be nominated to act as Chair of HPRS for the remainder of the term.

Tim Ritchie accepted the nomination.

(Carried)

2. Appointment of Vice Chair

(MacLaren/Spolnik)

That Graham Carroll be nominated to act as Vice Chair of HPRS for the remainder of the term.

Graham Carrol accepted the nomination.

(Priamo/Carroll)

That Karen Burke be nominated to act as Vice Chair of the HPRS for the remainder of the term.

Karen Burke accepted the nomination.

Karen Burke was appointed Vice Chair in a called vote of 4 to 3.

Alissa Golden passed over the Chair to Tim Ritchie.

3. Approval of Agenda:

(Carroll/MacLaren)

That the Agenda for September 19, 2023 be approved as presented.

(Carried)

4. Approval of Minutes from Previous Meetings:

(Priamo/Spolnik)

That the Minutes of August 29, 2023 be approved, as presented.

(Carried)

5. Heritage Permit Applications

- a) **HP2023-037** 71 Main Street West, Hamilton (Part IV, City Hall)
 - Installation of permanent tactile walking surface indicators at the top of the two second-floor landings of the internal open floating staircase, including:
 - Drilling approximately 192, 1-inch deep holes in an area 300 mm (11.8 in) by 1905 mm (75") into the existing terrazzo flooring at each landing; and,
 - o Installation of marine-grade stainless steel domes.

Note: HPRS considered a previous application for this scope of work in 2020, which was withdrawn to allow the applicant to conduct further research in best practices for these types of accessibility installations.

Melissa McGinnis, Facilities Accessibility & Compliance Coordinator for the City of Hamilton, spoke to the Subcommittee. The Subcommittee considered the application and together with input from the applicant and advice from staff, passed the following motion: (Carroll/Priamo)

That the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee advises that Heritage Permit Application HP2023-037 be consented to, subject to the following conditions:

- That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations; and,
- ii. That implementation / installation of the alteration(s), in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than September 30, 2025. If the alteration(s) are not completed by September 30, 2025, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.

(Carried)

- b) HP2023-044 211 Mill Street North, Flamborough (Mary Hopkins School, Part V, Mill Street Heritage Conservation District) Retroactive Application
 - Removal of deadwood and dying Norway Maple trees fronting Mill Street North.

Marc Davidson from the Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board, spoke to the Subcommittee.

The Subcommittee considered the application and together with input from the applicant and advice from staff, passed the following motion:

(Burke/Carroll)

That the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee advises that Heritage Permit Application HP2023-044 be consented to, subject to the following conditions:

- That the location of any replacement trees and species type shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to planting; and,
- ii. That any minor changes to the plans following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to the commencement of any alterations.

(Carried)

c) HP2023-038 – 21 Mill Street North, Flamborough (Part V, Mill Street Heritage Conservation District)

- Exterior alterations, including:
 - Replacement of the six existing wood exterior doors, in various locations on the front elevation;
 - Replacement of existing wood windows on all elevations;
 - Removal and reinstallation of the concrete stairs, along the front (east) and side (north and south) elevations, incorporating new handrails where necessary;
 - Partial removal of the existing contemporary chimney on the rear (west) elevation, to the roofline;
 - Full removal of the existing contemporary chimney located on the side (north) elevation; and
 - Reconfiguration and addition of curbing and bollards in the north and south parking lots.

Note: This property received conditional approval from HPRS for a heritage permit which included a similar scope of work in 2020. HP2020-009 was approved in April 2020 and expired April 30, 2022.

Scott and Christina Birmingham, property owners, and Lindsay Reynolds, Hancock & MacArthur Inc, applicant, spoke to the Subcommittee.

The Subcommittee considered the application and together with input from the applicant and advice from staff, passed the following motion: (Dent/Priamo)

That the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee advises that Heritage Permit Application HP2023-038 be consented to, subject to the following conditions:

- That the final details of the proposed windows be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to installation;
- ii. That the final details of the proposed replacement doors be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to installation;
- iii. That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations; and
- iv. That implementation / installation of the alteration(s), in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than September 30, 2025. If the alteration(s) are not completed by September 30, 2025, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.

(Carried)

d) HP2023-041 – 79 Markland Street, Hamilton (Part V, Durand-Markland Heritage Conservation District)

- Construction of a detached garage structure at the front yard of the property, including:
 - Removal of existing parking pad;
 - New concrete pad and foundation;
 - New hip roof on north elevation with a hip roofed dormer and a west facing gable, clad in asphalt shingles; and,
 - New stucco siding to match existing house.

Note: The HPRS considered an earlier version of this application as part of HP2023-025, which was withdrawn by the applicant and the proposal revised and resubmitted for consideration.

Michael I. Baytman, Architect, spoke to the Subcommittee.

The Subcommittee considered the application and together with input from the applicant and advice from staff, passed the following motion: (Spolnik/Burke)

That the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee advises that Heritage Permit Application HP2023-041 be consented to, subject to the following conditions:

- That the final details for the proposed stucco be submitted to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to installation;
- ii. That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations; and
- iii. That implementation / installation of the alteration(s), in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than September 30, 2025. If the alteration(s) are not completed by September 30, 2025, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.

(Carried in a vote of 5-4)

e) HP2023-042 – 1541 Fiddler's Green Road, Ancaster (Part IV, Forest Land Farms House)

• Demolition of ruins of the fire-damaged brick dwelling

Note: This application requires a decision of Council. Following review by HPRS, staff will prepare a report to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee for their advice before consideration by Planning Committee and final decision of Council.

Nathan Morgenstern, Lawyer, Sullivan Festeryga, spoke to the Subcommittee.

The Subcommittee considered the application and together with input from the applicant and advice from staff, passed the following motion: (Carroll/Dent)

That the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee advises that Heritage Permit Application HP2023-042 be consented to, subject to the following condition:

(i) That the applicant make every reasonable effort to facilitate salvaging any remaining heritage features as part of the demolition process as may be safely permitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner.

(Carried)

f) HP2023-045 – 828 Sanatorium Road / 870 Scenic Drive, Hamilton (Part IV, Mountain Sanatorium Brow Site)

- Exterior alterations to the Long & Bisby Building to facilitate its adaptive reuse, including:
 - Repair of the existing front porch and portico, including replication of the missing column to match and restoration of the aluminum cresting;
 - Replacement of the front door, including the sidelights and transom within the existing opening;
 - Selective repointing and cleaning of the exterior masonry;
 - Reconstruction of the rear sunroom on the existing brick base, to be repaired, with a walk-out balcony above and new aluminum railing to match the historic front portico cresting design;
 - o Modifications to the window openings, including:
 - Filling in the first-storey centre wing window of the side (north) elevation with brick;
 - Conversion of two rear second storey windows into doors to access the sunroom roof balcony;
- Alterations to the open, park-like setting surrounding the Long & Bisby Building to facilitate new development, including the removal of mature trees, regrading, the introduction of a trail and landscaping enhancements.

Chloe Richer, City of Hamilton, spoke to an additional scope of work to consider as part of this application not identified in the agenda, to replace the existing wood and metal horizontal banding.

Matt Johnston, UrbanSolutions, agent and Amber Lindsay representing the owner, Valery Browlands Inc., spoke to the Sub-Committee. Matthew LeBlanc, UrbanSolutions, was also present.

The Sub-Committee considered the application and together with input from the applicant and advice from staff, passed the following motion: (Burke/Carroll)

That the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee advises that Heritage Permit application HP2023-045 be consented to, subject to the following conditions:

- i. That the final details and specifications for the replacement horizonal banding (originally an overhanging cornice course) be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations:
- ii. That the final details and specifications for the portico repairs be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- iii. That the final details of the replacement front door be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations;
- iv. That the proposed masonry repairs be implemented in accordance with the City of Hamilton's Masonry Restoration Guidelines;
- v. That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of the Director of Planning and Chief Planner, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit and / or the commencement of any alterations; and
- vi. That should a Building Permit for the alterations to the Long & Bisby Building, in accordance with this approval, not be obtained by September 30, 2026, then this approval expires as of that date and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.

(Carried)

6. **Adjournment**

(Dent/Carroll)
That the meeting be adjourned at 7:30pm.
(Carried)

7. **Next Meeting**: Tuesday, October 17, 2023 at 5:00pm