



CITY OF HAMILTON
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
Transportation Planning and Parking Division

| | |
|-----------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| TO: | Chair and Members Planning Committee |
| COMMITTEE DATE: | September 7, 2021 |
| SUBJECT/REPORT NO: | Final Parking Master Plan Recommendations (PED20051(b)) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) |
| WARD(S) AFFECTED: | City Wide |
| PREPARED BY: | Amanda McIlveen (905) 546-2424 Ext. 6009 |
| SUBMITTED BY: SIGNATURE: | Brian Hollingworth Director, Transportation Planning and Parking Planning and Economic Development Department |

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That the Final Parking Master Plan (PMP) attached as Appendix “A” to Report PED20051(b) be adopted;
- (b) That Item 21F, directing staff to consult with the public on the Draft Parking Master Plan (PMP) and to report back on the results of the public consultation, with the recommended Final PMP, be identified as complete and removed from the Planning Committee Outstanding Business List.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The City’s Parking Master Plan (PMP) is a comprehensive review and update of previous downtown parking studies completed in 2005 and 2013. Taking into account needs across the entire City, the plans primary objective is to create a framework to guide future activities of the Hamilton Municipal Parking System (HMPS) and ensure the sustainability of the Parking System. Ultimately, the PMP is a long-term planning document inclusive of 24 high-level recommendations that provide guidance toward achieving positive outcomes that align with the City’s Strategic Plan and informed by several City-wide policy documents including the Transportation Master Plan (TMP), the Official Plan, and various Secondary Plans.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Final Parking Master Plan Recommendations (PED20051(b)) (City Wide) - Page 2 of 10

The purpose of this Report is to provide a summary of the final PMP and its 24 recommendations. The development of the PMP and its recommendations has been a collaborative initiative with the consulting team and staff in order to ensure that the recommendations reflect local needs and opportunities but are also grounded by industry best practices.

The Draft PMP was presented to the Planning Committee on April 20, 2021. Through Report PED20051(a), Council approved the direction to staff to further consult with the public and relevant stakeholders on the draft plan and its recommendations, and report back to the Planning Committee with the results through the Final PMP. Staff hosted the second and final Public Information Centre (PIC) virtually on May 26, 2021. Further, staff met with the Waterdown BIA to discuss the proposed strategies on May 27, 2021 and the BIA Advisory Committee on June 8, 2021 and July 13, 2021.

In response to the draft recommendations, both the public and stakeholders were generally supportive of the Plan's four key principles: Financial Sustainability; Economic Development; Environmental Sustainability; and, Resiliency. From a public perspective, improvements to wayfinding signage, increases in customer accessibility through technology and supporting more sustainable transportation options as detailed throughout the Plan's recommendations were well supported by the public and stakeholders. Direct responses from the Waterdown BIA, International Village BIA, and Dundas BIA were received, and while there was a shared hesitancy towards the extension of paid parking during weekends, there was support for a majority of the recommendations inclusive of working with developers to pursue joint opportunities for publicly accessible parking supply, adopting pricing structures to encourage sustainable modes of transportation, and the promotion of digital tools.

Since the Draft Plan was presented to Committee and Council, there has also been further advancements on the Downtown Entertainment Precinct Plan which includes the redevelopment of the York Parkade, and the Vine Street surface parking lot.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 10

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: There are no financial implications associated with this Report. Recommendations included in the PMP will be used to develop annual work plans and associated Operating and Capital Budget needs. Any undertakings requiring Capital or having operational cost impacts, as well as any changes affecting parking pricing, would be subject to future Council approval as part of the annual City-wide budgeting process. As HMPS is a self-funding entity, all Capital projects are currently funded by parking revenues. Based on projections prepared for the PMP, HMPS will

retain its ability to be self-funded over the next decade, assuming parking pricing is adjusted based on the policies recommended in this Plan.

Staffing: There are no staffing implications associated with this Report. No immediate staffing enhancements are being requested at this time, however, through continuous improvement, the consideration for the future re-allocation of staff and/or resources may be considered or requested through a future business case.

Legal: N/A

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The City of Hamilton PMP commenced in 2019 to examine existing public parking operations, and provide direction for parking policy, planning, operations, and enforcement that will align with other City-wide transportation and planning policies. The consulting firm, IBI Group, was retained to undertake the PMP following a comprehensive scope including data collection, review of best practices, consultation and engagement, policy development, and financial analysis.

In October 2019, a comprehensive exiting conditions assessment was performed by IBI Group of all BIA areas, inclusive of a supply and demand analysis, turnover and utilization rates, operational hours, parking fee structures, and specific parking usage-type (i.e. commercial/delivery vehicles, personal/customer vehicles, connected and autonomous vehicles (CAVs), etc.). Existing parking operations were also surveyed to evaluate the health of the current parking system and benchmark against industry standards.

In January 2020, the first PIC meeting was held at City Hall in a drop-in format. Feedback tools such as web and email-based surveys, BIA meetings, a GIS mapping tool were released, and targeted interviews with various stakeholders were completed.

In March 2020, the Phase 1 Summary Memo was completed by IBI Group to showcase the results of the conditions assessment and public and stakeholder feedback.

In June 2020, Report PED20051 Parking Master Plan Review/Update was presented to the Planning Committee and provided an interim update on the PMP. Several issues were raised for consideration by Committee members at this time, including the increased need for curb-side parking, as well as the financial impacts of COVID 19 on the Parking System.

In January 2021, the Phase 2 Summary Memo was completed by IBI Group which provided a proposal on future conditions and a financial assessment, inclusive of the 24 proposed recommendations.

In April 2021, Report PED20051(a) Draft Parking Master Plan was presented to the Planning Committee for consideration of draft recommendations and for approval to further engage stakeholders in another round of consultation.

In May 2021, the second PIC to receive feedback on the draft recommendations was held virtually, with several additional meetings with the BIAs involving further discussion on the Financial recommendations.

In June 2021, Report PED18168(g) Downtown Entertainment Precinct Master Agreement included the deposition of the York Boulevard Parkade and Municipal Car Park #62 (14 Vine Street) as part of the execution of the Master Agreement between Hamilton Urban Precinct Entertainment Group L.P. (HUPEG) and the City. This results in a significant change in parking supply in the Downtown Core and has an impact on the supply and demand analysis as surveyed in the PMP.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The PMP is a strategic document informed by several City-wide policy documents including the TMP, the Official Plan, the Climate Action Plan, the Mayor's Task Force on Economic Recovery, and various Secondary Plans.

The TMP indicates that "parking influences both transportation and land use patterns. Having effective parking management strategies can support modal choice and active modes of travel, transit-oriented development, and ultimately economic growth. Pricing strategies, Zoning By-Law requirements, and the application of emerging technologies can improve the efficiency of the municipal parking system and improve customer experience. As Hamilton shifts towards a balanced approach to transportation, there is a need to integrate parking through the development of a City-wide parking master plan".

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

The PMP was designed to provide public and stakeholder engagement through a three-phased approach, including opportunities to learn about the study, provide insights into existing issues, and provide a platform for feedback on desired future outcome. The engagement approach has followed the core principles of public engagement identified in the City's Public Engagement Charter and has provided the public and external stakeholders with well-balanced and objective information, as well as, an opportunity for all parties to ensure their concerns have been addressed and heard.

SUBJECT: Final Parking Master Plan Recommendations (PED20051(b)) (City Wide) - Page 5 of 10

The first two phases inclusive of surveys, mapping tools, the first PIC, and individual interviews were conducted near the beginning of the study to obtain feedback regarding existing parking operations. In April 2021, staff Report PED20051(a) Draft Parking Master Plan sought approval for further consultation (Phase Three) on the 24 draft recommendations per Appendix “A” Draft Parking Master Plan.

The second PIC was held virtually on May 26, 2021. The information was presented in the form of a presentation that consisted of the four key themes and 24 draft recommendations. Communications tools were also developed in order to engage interest in the final PMP, inclusive of an interactive Engage EQ page, emails to stakeholders about the information centre and various social media posts.

During the discussion period following the presentation, many of the attendees agreed that the future financial system of HMPS must continue to be paid for by its users and remain self-funding, and that adopting predictable rate increases, maintaining higher prices on-street than off-street, and introducing dynamic pricing models where appropriate was a reasonable strategy in order to manage parking effectively.

Both the public and other stakeholders supported the idea of continuing to support local business through the expansion of on-street parking supply, increasing end-user improvements such as wayfinding signage and digital tools, and pursuing joint parking opportunities with private developments to increase publicly accessible supply.

Reducing the climate impact and supporting sustainable transportation mode choices was agreeable to all parties. Several stakeholders suggested that ongoing discussions would be helpful in terms of utilizing pricing structures to disincentivize Single Occupant Vehicles (SOVs), but also noted not all areas have equal transit opportunities and therefore area-specific strategies would be desired. Further collaboration through the TMP and applicable Secondary Plans was also encouraged in relation to how parking could support the City’s multi-modal transit strategy.

Developing a City-wide curbside management strategy was important to many stakeholders in order to establish short-term curbside pickup zones, loading areas for businesses, parking for customer vehicles, kiss and ride areas, and other non-vehicle uses. Both the public and external stakeholders agreed that new municipal parking supply should be pursued through new developments with the ability to be converted to other uses in the future, such as commercial, residential, or cultural/recreational.

A meeting with the Waterdown BIA was held on May 27, 2021 to discuss the PMP recommendations in more detail and discuss parking concerns in Waterdown. The Waterdown BIA noted that a unique approach should be taken with different business areas in the City, and that policies should be flexible to address specific area needs. There was strong opposition to the implementation of paid parking in Waterdown,

however, there was support for pursuing joint opportunities with developers for publicly accessible parking and better signage with increased wayfinding.

Meetings with the BIA Advisory Committee took place on June 8, 2021 and July 13, 2021. It was noted by members of the Committee that changes to operational hours required further discussion between HMPS and the BIAs, and that evaluating the feasibility of extending paid parking to seven days per week would be more appropriate. At the July 13, 2021 BIA Committee Meeting, a motion was approved by members that proposed that there be no changes to the current paid parking schedule for Monday to Sunday, that the current paid parking hours remain in effect, and that the free Saturday and Sunday Parking Program be extended to those BIAs that wish to partake. The BIAs also noted that further consultation on updates/changes to the current revenue sharing formula would be appreciated to increase contributions over the next decade. Changes were made to the PMP as a result of this motion as addressed further in the next section.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

Since the last Downtown focused parking review in 2013, Hamilton has undergone an economic revival with an influx of new residents and businesses. Land use downtown has evolved towards higher density developments while maintaining and restoring many of the heritage structures that make Hamilton unique. In many cases, these new developments have replaced existing surface parking lots which in turn has impacted parking supply and demand over a short time. At the same time, outlying communities in Waterdown, Dundas, Ancaster, Binbrook, and Stoney Creek have expanded steadily, and, in some cases, are experiencing increased parking pressures.

The City of Hamilton initiated the PMP to address these developments, provide direction on a strategic approach to parking policy, planning, financial sustainability, and enforcement that will align with other City-wide transportation and land use planning policies, and help address the changing needs faced by HMPS.

The overarching vision for parking in the City recognizes that parking is a valuable resource tool that heavily influences transportation mode choice, residential development, and economic development. Parking demand in Hamilton is expected to grow in the future despite shifts away from auto use, both due to population growth creating a larger customer base for businesses, and general commercial and retail growth in responding to the needs of the City's future residents.

Guiding Principles and Recommendations

Four guiding principles, inclusive of 24 recommendations, have been established to address existing parking issues, and meet future needs through a detailed supply and

demand analysis, existing conditions assessment, best practices assessment and feedback received through stakeholder engagement and feedback. These recommendations are intended to be achieved City-wide with the understanding that the principles can be applied differently in the different areas of the City and are detailed in Report PED20051(a).

The guiding principles and recommendations are summarized below with more details and explanation provided in the Final PMP attached as Appendix “A” to this Report:

1. Financial Sustainability – Operate the Parking System as a Self-Funded Organization with Fair and Transparent Pricing Policies

- Adopt predictable rate increases;
- Manage utilization in all HMPS off-street parking facilities through pricing;
- Evaluate the feasibility of seven day-per-week paid parking;
- Maintain higher on-street pricing than off-street;
- Implement performance-based pricing in high demand areas; and,
- Implement dynamic based pricing in response to events.

It is imperative that HMPS remains financially sustainable over the next ten years and utilizes pricing strategies to manage increasing demand and to support continued investment in facilities and technologies. This can be accomplished through a pricing framework that contains inflationary increases coupled with additional modest rate increases equating to approximately 4% annually. This pricing strategy would result in a continued net surplus that is used to maintain a stable Capital reserve and continue the practice of contributing to the net levy.

Through consultations with BIAs on the draft recommendations through Report PED20051(a), it was clear there was hesitancy regarding “Recommendation Number Three – Extend Paid Parking to seven-day-a-week Operations”. As a result, this recommendation was modified to reflect a more measured approach, however, increasing operational hours remains a preferred long-term strategy based on best practices. Specifically, the implementation of paid parking on Saturdays has been requested by some BIAs in the past (e.g. Locke Street) to avoid situations where employees take advantage of free on-street parking resulting in less parking for customers. In addition, the expansion of paid parking on weekends would support an enhanced enforcement strategy. There are increasing demands for parking enforcement in the BIAs on weekends but in the absence of paid parking, it is difficult to justify added staff time.

Other key recommendations under Financial Sustainability include implementing both performance and dynamic based pricing. Performance-based pricing, in particular, recognizes that all areas are not the same. In higher demand areas, a higher price for

parking could help to ensure turn-over of spaces. Conversely, in lower demand areas, a more modest price could incentivize parking. Similarly, adopting dynamic pricing strategies during times such as special events, film operations, or construction, gives HMPS the flexibility to distribute demand and maintain efficient operations by increasing parking pricing in a given area. Ultimately, the goal of each of performance-based pricing and dynamic pricing is to maximize the efficiency of a finite parking supply.

2. Economic Development – Support Local Business and Stimulate Development by Efficiently Managing Parking Supply

- Expand the supply of on-street paid parking;
- Increase HMPS contribution to BIAs using revenue from increased parking fees;
- Provide better information in the form of improved signage, wayfinding and digital tools;
- Allow public use of private facilities during off-peak times;
- Pursue joint parking opportunities with private development;
- Manage on-street parking in future residential areas;
- Implement license plate recognition software to improve enforcement efficiency; and,
- Continue to identify opportunities to leverage City-owned surface parking lots for new, integrated development.

Parking management is a valuable tool for economic development and can assist the City as it continues to experience intensification and changes to land use patterns. Joint parking opportunities within private developments is an effective strategy to gain additional publicly accessible parking supply without placing financial strain on the City to build additional parking. Since Report PED20051(a) Draft Parking Master Plan, Report PED18168(g) Downtown Entertainment Precinct Master Agreement was approved by Council. Under the Master Agreement, both the York Parkade and Vine Street lot are to be sold to HUPEG and, in turn, developed into mixed use purposes. Combined, these facilities currently have approximately 907 municipally owned parking spaces. Thus, the relinquishing of these facilities would represent a significant reduction in the number of spaces operated by HMPS. With the relinquishing of these facilities, HMPS would control approximately 22% of the publicly-available off-street supply in the Downtown. The loss of these spaces for municipal parking purposes places a greater onus on the City to pursue shared opportunities with private partners. This would include HUPEG given the shared objective of ensuring a reasonable amount of parking is available to support the Entertainment Precinct concept.

Further, “Recommendation Number Nine – Provide better information in the form of improved signage, wayfinding and digital tools” is imperative to support the loss in

supply as it allows HMPS to efficiently manage current supply levels by assisting in evenly distributing demand.

3. Environmental Sustainability – Reduce Climate Impact by Supporting Sustainable and Environmentally Friendly Transportation Mode Choices

- Adopt pricing structures that support environmentally sustainable transportation mode choices;
- Introduce flexible multi-use passes;
- Expand parking reserve and cash-in-lieu (CIL) policies to support TDM and sustainable mobility initiatives;
- Limit residential boulevard parking agreements;
- Apply low-impact materials and sustainable design in City-owned surface lots;
- Develop a comprehensive plan for Electric Vehicle (EV) charging; and,
- Continue to expand bicycle and other micro-mobility parking.

As noted in Report PED20051(a) Draft Parking Master Plan, there are seven recommendations to support sustainable mobility that align with the TMP. Many of these recommendations assist HMPS in meeting the City's Corporate Climate Change goals by reducing greenhouse gas emissions, incorporate green design in existing parking facilities, and support sustainable modes of transportation through pricing strategies that incentivize alternate modes.

The City is already starting to implement many of these recommendations such as expanding EV charging infrastructure in municipal parking facilities and the adoption of the PMP will support continued improvements in the area of environmental sustainability with the expectation that funding programs by the Province and Federal Governments will also continue.

4. Resiliency – Prepare for an Uncertain Future

- New municipal parking should be integrated within developments and have the ability to be converted to alternative uses in the future;
- Develop policies and regulations for managing curbside use and payment; and,
- Monitor how CAVs evolve related to the impact on parking operations.

The future of parking patterns and behaviours is changing rapidly as a result of new shared mobility options, disruptions in retail, and potentially connected and autonomous vehicles; and, also, COVID-19 which has changed how people move within urban centres and how services are delivered. As discussed with the BIAs, there is a critical need to develop a holistic Curbside Management Plan that prioritizes various curb uses

to maximize the use of the curbside City-wide. As such, this will be an early priority for staff following the completion of the PMP.

Overall, the above four principles and their recommendations are intended to guide the evolution of the parking system over the coming decade, and to provide an overall framework for the many day-to-day operational decisions around parking that will need to be made as the City transforms.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Council could choose to support portions of the PMP. This alternative is not recommended since it will not adequately address the breadth of the PMP recommendations across the City of Hamilton. It may or may not contribute to achieving the desired outcomes consistent with the Strategic Plan.

ALIGNMENT TO THE 2016 – 2025 STRATEGIC PLAN

Community Engagement and Participation

Hamilton has an open, transparent and accessible approach to City government that engages with and empowers all citizens to be involved in their community

Economic Prosperity and Growth

Hamilton has a prosperous and diverse local economy where people have opportunities to grow and develop.

Clean and Green

Hamilton is environmentally sustainable with a healthy balance of natural and urban spaces.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

Hamilton is supported by state-of-the-art infrastructure, transportation options, buildings and public spaces that create a dynamic City.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix “A” to Report PED20051(b) – Final Parking Master Plan

AM:cr